


Phabongkha Dechen Nyingpo: His Collected Works and the Guru-Deity-Protector Triad¹

Joona Repo
(University of Helsinki)

*Fully complete mandala of love [Jampa (byams pa)] and compassion,
Crowning ornament of the holders of the teachings [Tenzin (bstan 'dzin)],
the source of bliss,
The manifestation of your activities [Trinle ('phrin las)] pervades the earth,
[You are the] lord of an all-pervading ocean [Gyatso (rgya mtsho)] of
victors!²*

he above verse, which in the Tibetan weaves within it the names of the teacher it praises, Phabongkha Jampa Tenzin Trinle Gyatso (byams pa bstan 'dzin 'phrin las rgya mtsho, 1878-1941), also known as Dechen Nyingpo (bde chen snying po), are attributed to Gendun Choephel (dge 'dun chos 'phel, 1903-1951). The praise (*bstod bsngags*) was composed as an inscription (*rgyab yig*) to a drawing that Gendun Choepel made of the teacher, and demonstrates the high esteem in which Phabongkha was once held by one of the most forward-thinking Tibetan figures of the early twentieth century. The writings of Phabongkha contained within his *Collected Works* (*gsung 'bum*) are today widely available in eleven volumes, together with a supplementary volume. The subjects of Pha-

¹ The research for this article was undertaken at the Department of World Cultures, University of Helsinki and was made possible by a grant from the Finnish Cultural Foundation.

² "byams brtse'i dkyil 'khor rnam rdzogs pa/ bstan 'dzin bde 'byung gtsug gi rgyan/ 'phrin las snang bas gser ldan khyon/ kun khyab rgyal ba rgya mtsho'i mgon" (ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje, ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje, rigs dan dkyil 'khor rgya mtsho'i khyab bdag he ru kah dpal nur smrig gar rol skyabs gcig pha boñ kha pa bde chen sñin po pal bzañ po'i rnam par thar pa don ldan tshans pa'i dbyans sñan: *The detailed biography of Rje Pha-boñ-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las-rgya-mtsho*, Vol. 1 of 2, p. 587). For Donald S. Lopez Jr.'s translation of this praise, based on the same stanza as found in Gendun Chopel's biography (instead of Phabongkha's), see Gendun Chopel, *In the Forest of Faded Wisdom: 104 Poems by Gendun Chopel*, pp. 44-45.

bongkha's writings, and of his immediate teachers and students are diverse, reflecting both the conservative continuation of Tsongkhapa's (tsong kha pa, 1357-1419) Gelug (dge lugs) tradition as well as a unique development of the same. Central to his teachings and writings were those of the Stages of the Path (*lam rim*) genre exemplified by his most famous teaching, *Liberation in Your Hand* (*rnam grol lag bcangs*)[11.1].³ These were then supplemented at more advanced levels by tantric practices, which form the bulk of Phabongkha's *Collected Works*, with an emphasis on the secret teachings of the Gelug tradition's orally transmitted Ganden Hearing Lineage (*dga ldan snyan brgyu*), as well as a number of newer revealed teachings, or "pure visions" (*dag snang*).

Phabongkha is undoubtedly a highly contested and perhaps often misunderstood historical figure. As an important lineage holder of the Dorje Shugden (rdo rje shugs ldan)-cycle of teachings within the Gelug tradition, he has been reviled as a sectarian spirit-worshipper by some and lauded as a pivotal guardian and interpreter of Tsongkhapa's lineage by others. The controversy surrounding the deity, who has today been abandoned by most Gelugpas, has already been documented in several important seminal studies by scholars such as Georges Dreyfus and Donald Lopez and thus this article will not touch upon these contemporary issues and developments.⁴ Numerous publications produced by both sides of the heavily polarized debate also exist, however within this article I have largely avoided critiquing or analyzing these, even with regard to accounts of Phabongkha. The historical facts and arguments presented by both are often far too overshadowed by a clearly biased agenda and interpretation or a general lack of usage or citation of Tibetan textual sources, resulting in inaccuracies too numerous to address here.⁵

Phabongkha, due to his promotion of Shugden, is often blamed for attacking the Bon (bon) tradition and fomenting sectarian discord against the Nyingma (rnying ma) lineage, especially in Kham (khams). It remains, however, to be established whether he was personally responsible for ordering any violent or sectarian acts or not,

³ For ease of reference, the titles of texts from Phabongkha's *Collected Works* are noted in-text together with their location in the contents as listed in the Appendix, in the following format: [volume number: work number].

⁴ Georges Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair: History and Nature of a Quarrel", pp. 227-270 and Donald S. Lopez Jr., *Prisoners of Shangri-la: Tibetan Buddhism and the West*, pp. 188-201.

⁵ Several recent anti-Shugden publications include: The Dolgyal Shugden Research Society, *Dolgyal Shugden: A History* and Raimondo Bultrini, *The Dalai Lama and the King Demon: Tracking a Triple Murder Mystery Through the Mists of Time*, both published by Tibet House US. A widely distributed pro-Shugden publication is the Western Shugden Society's *A Great Deception: The Ruling Lamas' Policies*.

or if these were instead instigated and carried out independently by zealous extremist students.⁶ Certainly many of Phabongkha's students and followers from the period, and many modern Gelug teachers, hold the view that Phabongkha has been unfairly accused.⁷ Thus although they do not deny that cases of sectarian discord may have taken place, they are adamant that these were not instigated or ordered by Phabongkha himself, who they say was a victim of baseless accusations due to his growing popularity.⁸ Phabongkha's direct role with regard to these unfortunate events thus remains unclear due to the lack of unbiased or independent accounts.

Phabongkha certainly held strong views and did not hold back from expressing them. He strongly believed that Tsongkhapa possessed a superior interpretation of the Buddhist path, especially with regard to Madhyamaka. However, whether or not he was uniquely sectarian when considering historical Tibetan religious figures as a whole is arguable, especially as his written works present both cases of polemical attacks on other traditions, while at other times stating the importance of being non-sectarian.⁹ Far more research is certainly

⁶ For an account of such persecution in the Chamdo (chab mdo) region see Chagdud Tulku, *Lord of the Dance*, p. 107. Similar accounts have been recorded by other Khampa Nyingma teachers as well. Gelek Rimpoche (dge legs rin po che, b.1939) however, noted that Trinle Dhargye ('phrin las dar rgyas, d.u.), who worked as Phabongkha's manager (*phyag mdzod*), stated that he and a group of other disciples went around in Kham and "showed their muscles" without the knowledge of the teacher (interview, 2014).

⁷ Lama Zopa Rinpoche (bla ma bzod pa rin po che, b.1946), for example, says that "There's no way he [Phabongkha] could have done the negative things they say he did." (Lama Zopa Rinpoche, "Kyabje Trijang Rinpoche, His Holiness the Dalai Lama and Dorje Shugden", in *Lama Yeshe Wisdom Archive*). A similar opinion is shared by Gelek Rimpoche (interviewed, 2014). Both teachers have publically renounced the practice of Shugden.

⁸ Anonymous student of Phabongkha (interview, 2014). Due to the sensitivity of the subject, unless I have received explicit permission to reproduce an interviewee's name, their identity has been kept anonymous. Interviews for this article took place in several European countries, the US, Nepal and the Tibet Autonomous Region, primarily with senior Gelug lamas as well as other Gelug practitioners.

⁹ In *Liberation in Your Hand*, for example, Phabongkha is noted as saying "Firstly, you abandon Dharma when, on account of the Mahāyāna, you deprecate the Hīnayāna, on account of the Hīnayāna you deprecate the Mahāyāna, or similarly when you deprecate sutra, tantra, one the four classes of tantra, or the Sakya (sa skya), Gelug, Kagyu (bka' rgyud) or Nyingma [traditions] on account of your own school... (*dang po chos spong ba ni/ theg chen rgyu mtshan du byas nas theg dman la smod pa dang/ theg dman rgyu mtshan du byas nas theg chen la smod pa/ de bzhin du mdo dang sngags/ rgyud sde bzhi/ sa dge/ ka [sic] rnying sogs rang rang gi grub mtha' rgyu mtshan du byas nas gzhan la smod pa mtha' dag yin/...*)" (pha bong kha bde chen snying po, "rnam grol lag bcangs su gtod pa'i man ngag zab mo tshang la ma nor ba mtshungs med chos kyi rgyal po'i thugs bcud byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i

needed for us to have a clearer understanding of not only Phabongkha's views of other sects, but also about the sectarian discord that took place in the eastern parts of Tibet. What is definitely unique, however, is how this Gelug-protectionism manifested in the belief that Shugden would specifically shield the lineage from being "corrupted" (*log par spyod pa*) by "the views and tenets of others" (*gzhan phyogs pa'i lta grub*) through engaging in often very wrathful activities.¹⁰ Thus apart from the usual functions of a protector, Shugden perhaps also became an attractive deity-figure for those disposed to sectarianism.

Due to the contested nature of Phabongkha's legacy amongst Tibetan Buddhist practitioners, it is perhaps impossible to empirically present a face of Phabongkha that will satisfy everyone. The current controversy is so polarizing that it has led to a distortion of facts from many different sides, especially in regards to what Phabongkha's actual teachings consisted of. These strong and varying views of Phabongkha are certainly rooted in faith and the tantric interpretation of guru-devotion, which demands unfailing loyalty to one's own

nyams khrid kyi zin bris gsung rab kun gyi bcud bsduḡs gdams ngag bdud rtsi'i snying po", p. 172.) However there are numerous textual sources attributed to Phabongkha which appear to present a different view, for instance that presented in a collection of notes based on Phabongkha's talks given in Chamdo (Idan ma blo bzang rdo rje, "skyabs rje pha bong kha pa chab mdor bzhugs skabs snyan sgron du gsol zer ba'i yig rdzus kyi dpyad don mchan bus bkrol ba dpyod ldan bzhin 'dzum dḡod ba'i thal skad rḡga chen bskul ba'i dbyu gu"). The text includes discussions on Nyingma *terma* (*gter ma*) teachings, of which many were considered by him and his followers to be "absolutely false Dharmas that are unworthy of being practiced" ("*mtha' gcig tu rdzun chos yin pas nyams su len mi rung*") (Ibid., p. 26). It thus appears, as also pointed out by one Gelug practitioner (interviewed in Nepal, 2015), that Phabongkha and his students are making a distinction between the Nyingma tradition, its originators and their teachings, who are to be respected, and a selection of *terma* cycles that he considers degenerate. A number of such *terma* are mentioned throughout the text, including the famous *Namchö* (*gnam chos*) cycle, and several cycles of the Peaceful and Wrathful Deities (*zhi khro*) practice, many of which are accused of corrupting the Buddhist teachings with heretical (*mu stegs*) views derived, for example, from Brahmanical and Bon sources (Ibid., pp. 26, 34-35). These types of accusations and condemnations of specific *terma* cycles as being inauthentic are certainly not unique to Phabongkha and his students and have been expressed in relation to other teachings by previous Buddhist scholars. In this specific work, Phabongkha cites a number of earlier Buddhist scholars who denounced such "false" *terma* cycles. For a discussion of earlier denunciations of *terma* literature by Tibetan Buddhist figures of various traditions see, for example, Andreas Doctor, *Tibetan Treasure Literature: Revelation, Tradition and Accomplishment in Visionary Buddhism*, pp. 31-38.

¹⁰ See the brief description of Shugden's wrathful activities in pha bong kha, "rgyal chen srog gtad kyi sngon 'gro bshad pa'i mtshams sbyor kha skong", pp. 534-535. A section of this has been translated in Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", pp. 249-250.

teachers and their interpretations and presentations of their lineage history.

This article is not concerned with interpreting, refuting or defending Phabongkha's views of other traditions or even with Shugden per se. Instead it aims at presenting an alternative view of Phabongkha's works and what Phabongkha considered, or rather what he didn't consider, as the central emphasis of his teachings. Lopez writes about Phabongkha, that:

"Under his influence something of a charismatic movement occurred among Lhasa aristocrats and in the three major Geluk monasteries in the vicinity of Lhasa..., with Vajrayoginī as the tutelary deity (*yi dam*), Shugden as the protector, and Phabongkha pa as the lama".¹¹

Through introducing and demonstrating the variety and richness of material composed by Phabongkha, this article will present a different view from this often-repeated and held perception, which is certainly an over-simplification, even if Phabongkha did undoubtedly play a seminal role in the dissemination of the practices of Vajrayoginī and Shugden in the twentieth century.¹² I will suggest that Phabongkha's vision was not a simplified trinity, or a revisionist presentation of Tsongkhapa's practice lineages, as is often claimed or suggested. Shugden and Vajrayoginī were part of a wider program, became elevated in importance, but they did not displace or relegate other practices to a lower status, or form a central pool of practices. Although the opposite may be true today in the case of several Gelug or Gelug-derived lineages which claim to follow Phabongkha's lineage, this does not necessarily mean that this was the situation during Phabongkha's lifetime, or in line with his original intentions.

Much information remains to be uncovered about Phabongkha, the understanding of whom this article hopes to make a small contribution to. Indeed how can we presume to understand such a significant historical figure from the very limited published research available today? In order to demonstrate that Phabongkha's emphasis in terms of religious practice lay not only with Shugden and Vajrayoginī, this article will also begin with a brief history of the compilation and a discussion of the rich variety of literature produced by

¹¹ Lopez, *Prisoners*, p. 190.

¹² The same understanding of the Phabongkha-Vajrayoginī-Shugden trinity is observed in Georges Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", p. 246, as will be discussed below, and perpetuated in, for example, The Dolgyal Shugden Research Society, *Dolgyal Shugden: A History*, p. 50 and Simon Francis Stirling Daisely, *Exorcising Luther: Confronting the Demon of Modernity in Tibetan Buddhism*, 2012, pp. 162-163.

this teacher as embodied in his *Collected Works*, which is often ignored or overshadowed by the emphasis placed on the authors' Shugden-related works. It should be noted that considering the breadth of Phabongkha's works and the topic, the current article can only present an extremely brief introduction to his *Collected Works*, which will also be compared to the contents of the collected works of his closest student, Trijang Rinpoche Lobsang Tenzin Gyatso (khri byang rin po che blo bzang ye shes bstan 'dzin rgya mtsho, 1901-1981). This brief presentation of these works will serve as a basis for the rest of the article and particularly its discussion of Vajrayoginī and Shugden. Finally, the full contents of the *Collected Works* and the supplementary volume are listed and translated into English in the Appendix. The presentation of the contents in English will allow non-Tibetan readers a chance to browse the titles attributed to this important twentieth-century teacher as well as clearly demonstrate the breadth of Phabongkha's work.¹³

Phabongkha's *Collected Works*

Phabongkha's *Collected Works* in their two most widely available forms are: a reproduced edition published by Chopel Legdan in the 1970s in Delhi and the original Lhasa (lha sa) woodblock edition made available through the Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center (TBRC), both of which make up eleven volumes (see Appendix).¹⁴ A supplementary volume was also later added to the Delhi edition.¹⁵ The Lhasa edition of the eleven volume set comprises of 122 separate titles, a number that could be expanded if several smaller works subsumed under one title are taken into account. For example the second work of the sixth volume (*cha*), *A Collection Regarding the Sādhanas of the Highest Deities such as "Guide to the Lifespan of Kurava" and Other Easy-to-Perform Recitation Practices* [6.2], is composed of ten

¹³ Many of Phabongkha's works, and those of his students, have been translated into English. These works, of which several have been translated more than once by different translators, are largely *sādhana*s, their commentaries, as well as several longer works on the *lamrim*. In the material presented here I have chosen to always refer to the original Tibetan sources cited, when available.

¹⁴ For the Chopel Legdan edition see Pha-bong-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las rgya-mtsho, *Collected Works of Pha-bong-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las rgya-mtsho*. For the Lhasa edition see pha bong kha, *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum*.

¹⁵ For the supplementary volume see Pha-boñ-kha-pa Bde-chen-sñin-po, *A Collection of Supplemental Works of Skyabs-rje Pha-boñ-kha-pa Bde-chen-sñin-po reproduced from blockprints recently found by Ven. Khri-byañ Rin-po-che*.

sādhanas of various deities.¹⁶ Furthermore a number of Phabongkha's compositions are today also missing from both the Delhi and Lhasa editions, as will be shown below.

Included in the *Collected Works* are teachings and notes on philosophical topics such as *pramāṇa* (valid cognition), records of teachings he received, his correspondences, advice and even a biography he composed of his principal teacher [10.1], Dagpo Lama Lobsang Jamphel Lhundrup Gyatso (dwags po bla ma blo bzang 'jam dpal lhun grub rgya mtsho, 1845-1919). Thus, the contents represent a variety of written materials which bring together not only Phabongkha's own writings, but also works and notes on Phabongkha's life, activities and teachings. The most famous example of a text penned by his students based on his oral discourses is *Liberation in Your Hand* [11.1], a teaching of Phabongkha's compiled and edited by Trijang Rinpoche, and which takes up the entire eleventh volume (*da*) of the set.

On top of *Liberation in Your Hand*, around ten other *Stages of the Path*-related titles are listed in the contents of the *Collected Works* and the Delhi supplement, including instructions on the preliminary practices of the *Stages of the Path* (*lam rim sngon 'gro sbyor chos*) [5.2, 5.3], an important set of explanations on the *Four Interwoven Annotations of the Great Stages of the Path* (*lam rim chen mo mchan bu bzhi sbrags ma*) [5.1] and a commentary on a combination of both Panchen Lobsang Yeshe's (paN chen blo bzang ye she, 1663-1737) *Swift Path Stages of the Path* (*lam rim myur lam*) text and Tsongkhapa's *Middling Stages of the Path* (*lam rim 'bring ba*) [9.4].

The majority of Phabongkha's works, however, concern tantric topics, ranging from subjects such as *chod* (*gcod*), for which he composed a text that is still used widely today by Gelug *chod* practitioners [5.10], to quintessential guru yoga texts. In terms of the latter, Phabongkha created an expansion of Panchen Lobsang Chokyi Gyaltsen's (paN chen blo bzang chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 1570-1662) *Six-Session Guru Yoga* (*thun drug bla ma'i rnal 'byor*) [9.3] manual and, for example, composed a secret variant of the standard Gelug guru yoga practice, *Hundred Deities of Tushita* (*dga' ldan lha rgya ma*) [2.9], as

¹⁶ See pha bong kha, "sgra mi snyan gyi tshe khrid kyi 'don chog khyer bde sogs lhag lha'i sgrub thabs skor phyogs bsgrigs", pp. 27-57. The works included under this title include the practice of Amitāyus entitled "Guide to the Lifespan of Kurava" (pp. 28-35), as well as short practices of Sita Tārā (pp. 35-36), Sita Manjuśrī (pp. 36-39), Kurukullā (pp. 39-40), Avalokiteśvara Jinasagāra (pp. 40-42), Vajrapāṇi-Hayagrīva-Garuḍa (pp. 42-43), Samayavajra (pp. 43-44), a combined practice of Clear-dream Tārā (*rmi lam gsal ba'i sgrol ma*) and Śramaṇī (pp. 45-46), Five-deity Cakraṣaṃvara (pp. 49-52) and finally a short daily Vajrayoginī sādhana (pp. 52-57).

well as a related transference of consciousness ('pho ba) practice [2.11]. The *Guru Pūjā* (*bla ma mchod pa*), another essential guru yoga text that is particularly central to the Ganden Hearing Lineage, likewise received Phabongkha's attention. The text was used as a basis for the composition of, for example, a long-life ritual [2.6] as well as a unique rendition of the text focused on the deity Cakrasaṃvara [2.3].

The cycle of teachings related to Cakrasaṃvara was the single most important subject of Phabongkha's writings. For example, one of Phabongkha's additions to Chokyi Gyaltzen's *Six-Session Guru Yoga* text was the inclusion of sixteen lines of praise to Cakrasaṃvara and his consort, Vajravārāhī.¹⁷ While most of Phabongkha's writings on Cakrasaṃvara focus on the body mandala practice of the Ghaṅṭāpa Lineage, he also composed texts on other forms of the deity, most notably the White Cakrasaṃvara long-life practice [3.13-15], an uncommon transmission intimately connected to the Ganden Hearing Lineage and originating from Tsongkhapa's vision-based *Dharma Cycle of Mañjuśrī* ('*jam dbyangs chos skor*), received via his teacher Lama Umapa Pawo Dorje (*bla ma dbu ma pa dpa' bo rdo rje*, c.14th century).¹⁸

The majority of Phabongkha's compositions on the Cakrasaṃvara cycle, however, relate to Vajrayoginī Naro Kechari, a form of Cakrasaṃvara's consort Vajravārāhī. His compositions on the solitary female deity comprise a complete corpus of ritual texts including long and abbreviated *sādhana*s [4.1, 4.2], several *gaṇacakra* texts [4.1, 4.12], a self-entry ritual (*bdag 'jug*) [4.3], burning offering (*sbyin sreg*) ritual texts [4.6-8, 4.10, 4.13], transference of consciousness instructions [4.14] as well as an important commentary on the generation (*bkskyed rim*) and completion stages (*rdzogs rim*) [10.5]. Indeed Phabongkha wrote more individual texts on Vajrayoginī than any other deity, although Vajrabhairava and Cakrasaṃvara come in close second. Cakrasaṃvara was apparently the principal practice of the lineage holders of the Southern Stages of the Path Lineage (*lho rgyud lam rim*), a *Stages of the Path* transmission which was not very widely

¹⁷ The lines are considered a recitation commitment for those who have received a Mother Tantra (*ma rgyud*) empowerment. See pha bong kha, "thun drug bla ma'i rnal 'byor dang /sdom pa nyi shu pa/ bla ma lnga bcu pa/ sngags kyi rtsa ltung sbom po bcas kyi bshad khrid gñang ba'i zin tho mdor bsdus/", p. 115.

¹⁸ The cycle consists largely of different manifestations of Mañjuśrī in his outer, inner and secret (*phyi nang gsang*) forms, as well as other deities such as Krodhakālī (*khros ma nag mo*). Several variant names exist for the Ganden Hearing Lineage, including the "Hearing Lineage of Protector Mañjuśrī" ('*jam mgon snyan brgyud*), which is used in relation to the transmission of this cycle in *bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan*, "jam dbyangs chos skor gyi rjes gñang gi zin tho nyung bsdus", p. 3108.

practiced in Central Tibet and which Phabongkha had presumably received from Dagpo Jamphel Lhundrup.¹⁹ This reason may well have contributed to Phabongkha's devotion to the Cakrasaṃvara cycle.

It is interesting to note that although Phabongkha mentions Cakrasaṃvara, Guhyasamāja and Vajrabhairava, the three principal meditational deities promoted by Tsongkhapa, numerous times in his *Liberation in Your Hand*, Vajrayoginī appears to get no mention. Phabongkha's teachings that were subsequently transcribed by Trijang Rinpoche, eventually to be published as *Liberation in Your Hand*, were given in 1921. By this time Phabongkha was already enthusiastic about transmitting Vajrayoginī teaching as is evident from his biography, *The Melodious Voice of Brahma* (*tshangs pa'i dbyangs snyan*), and the colophons of some of his texts. The colophon of Phabongkha's Vajrayoginī self-entry text, *Festival of Great Bliss* (*bde chen dga' ston*), mentions that Phabongkha gave a teaching on the deity in 1910.²⁰ As is also mentioned in Phabongkha's biography, at that time Lady Dagbhrum Jetsunma Thubten Tsultrim Drolkar (dwags b+h+ruM sku ngo rje btsun ma thub bstan tshul khriims sgröl dkar, d.u.) and one of Phabongkha's managers (*phyag mdzod*), Ngawang Gyatso (ngag dbang rgya mtsho, ?-1936), both requested him to edit several Vajrayoginī texts. Ngawang Gyatso requested for him to review a mandala-rite from the Ngor lineage (*ngor mkha' spyod sgrub dkyil*) and Lady Dagbhrum, who wanted to produce new printing blocks of a Shalu commentary on Vajrayoginī (*zhwa lu khrid yig*), requested Phabongkha to edit this.²¹ Although a date is not

¹⁹ pha bong kha, "rnam grol lag bcangs", p. 76. The lineage is associated with a specific transmission of the Fifth Dalai Lama Ngawang Lobsang Gyatso's (ngag dbang lo bzang rgya mtsho, 1642-1682) work, *The Words of Manjuśrī* ('jam dpal zhal lung).

²⁰ pha bong kha, "rdo rje rnal 'byor ma nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i dkyil 'khor gyi cho ga bde chen dga' ston", p. 128.

²¹ ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje, *tshans pa'i dbyans sñan*, Vol. 1 of 2, pp. 377-378. It is important to note that both a one-volume and a two-volume edition of the biography composed by Denma Lobsang Dorje (ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje, 1908-1975) exist. The well-known two-volume version cited above is today relatively widely available as it is a Delhi reprint of the original Lhasa manuscript (presumably of the single-volume edition). This Delhi reprint, together with its new introduction by Trijang Rinpoche, contains a number of significant edits, with the majority located in the second volume. For example, letters of correspondence between Phabongkha and the Thirteenth Dalai Lama Thubten Gyatso (thub bstan rgya mtsho, 1876-1933), in which the Dalai Lama chastises Phabongkha for his propitiation of Shugden, and Phabongkha in turn promises to renounce the practice, can be found quoted within the one-volume edition (ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje. *rigs dang dkyil 'khor rgya mtsho'i khyab bdag he ru kah dpal ngur smrig gar rol skyabs gcig pha bong kha pa bde chen snying po pal bzang po'i rnam par thar pa don ldan tshangs pa'i dbyangs snyan*, 1 vol., pp. 939-940), but not in the later edition. In the

given, the colophon of the *Festival* self-entry further adds that Lady Dagbhrum also later requested a new self-entry text to be written.²² This tells us that the daily *sādhana* practice associated with the deity, *Swift Path to Great Bliss* (*bde chen nye lam*), was already composed before this, as it forms a basis for the self-entry text and indeed both the *Swift Path* and *Festival* are mentioned together in Phabongkha's biography, in connection with this story.²³

Phabongkha's controversial Shugden material is all collected into the seventh volume (*ja*) of the set. The specific cycle of teachings associated with Shugden that Phabongkha taught to his students was believed to be based on the pure visions (*dag snang*) of his teacher, Tagphu Pemavajra Jamphel Tenpai Ngodrub (stag phu pad ma ba dzra 'jam dpal bstan pa'i dnogs grub, 1876-1935), more commonly known as Tagphu Dorjechang (stag phu rdo rje 'chang). Tagphu Pemavajra is believed by practitioners of this deity to have travelled to the pure land of Tuṣita and received the complete cycle of teachings related to this protector from Tsongkhapa and Duldzin Dragpa Gyaltsen ('dul 'dzin grags pa rgyal mtshan, 1357-1419).²⁴ The lineage then passes on to Phabongkha and then to Trijang Rinpoche, who then spread this even more widely throughout the Gelug tradition.

Interestingly, out of the complete collection of Phabongkha's writings, only five are concerned exclusively with the propitiation of Dorje Shugden: two texts related to the life-entrustment (*srog gtad*) [7.11, 7.12], or rather life-initiation (*srog dbang*), of the protector, an extensive and middle-length fulfillment ritual (*bskang chog*) [7.14, 7.15]

Delhi reprint this material has been removed and the relevant original wood-block-printed folios replaced by copies of newly edited and handwritten material (*tshans pa'i dbyans sñan*, Vol. 2 of 2, pp. 54-57), clearly intentionally missing out this specific uncomfortable exchange. This patch-like editorial work is also evident elsewhere, for example on p. 52, Vol. 2 of the same Delhi reprint, where only several sentences have been removed and clearly re-written. The two-volume edition in its Delhi reprint further demonstrates unusual variation with regard to the illustrations of enlightened beings and protectors (including Shugden) placed at the beginning and end folios of the manuscript. The images of protectors at the end of the biography are the same in both editions, whereas those at the beginning differ, although the actual blocks from which the *text* was printed are clearly the same. From a comparison it is obvious that the images in the initial pages of the one-volume edition are those of the original xylographs, whereas those in the two-volume Delhi reprint are new drawings which were superimposed over the original images.

²² pha bong kha, "rdo rje rnal 'byor ma nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i dkyi 'khor gyi cho ga bde chen dga' ston", pp. 128-129. The colophon of the self-entry gives a more detailed history of the text than the biography does.

²³ ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje, *tshans pa'i dbyans sñan*, Vol. 1 of 2, pp. 377-378.

²⁴ An account of this story can be found in pha bong kha, "rgyal chen srog gtad kyi sngon 'gro", pp. 539-540.

and a presentation of related explanations and ritual activities [7.13]. Fulfillment rituals are the central practices of Shugden, as they are of other protectors, and function to bond the practitioner with the fierce deity and to exhort them to fulfill their role as guardians of the Buddhist teachings. A brief libation (*gser skyems*) is also included under a title that incorporates practices of several deities [7.10]. Phabongkha's actual contribution to the body of Dorje Shugden literature was therefore relatively small when compared to those of his students, specifically that of Trijang Rinpoche, who carried on Phabongkha's lineage by composing nine separate texts uniquely devoted to the protector. This is fractionally a far larger amount considering that Trijang Rinpoche's *Collected Works*, according to the content pages of the volumes, comprise of only sixty-eight titles.²⁵ Although this numerical comparison certainly gives us a rough idea of the relative amounts of Shugden texts composed by these authors, it is also important to bear in mind that Trijang Rinpoche, in the colophons to his Shugden works, in keeping with the concept of lineage in Tibetan Buddhism, often cites Phabongkha as the source of the teachings which form the basis of his writings. It is unlikely, however, that the various texts were placed whimsically within the two collected works. Instead, I would suggest, the process was very much informed by those works that were actually composed, either orally or in writing, by the teacher whose collected works they were placed inside of.

Trijang Rinpoche's works combine with Phabongkha's to create a comprehensive set of Shugden ritual texts. All of these texts are contained within the fifth volume (*ca*) of Trijang Rinpoche's *Collected Works*, which is almost completely devoted to Shugden, although an offering and invocation ritual of Namkha Bardzin (*nam mkha' sbar 'dzin*) who is linked to Shugden's retinue and is a protector of Dungkhar Monastery (*dung dkar dgon*) in Dromo (*gro mo*), is also found, along with the method for performing a life-energy ransom (*srog glud gtong tshul*) ritual of Hayagriva.²⁶ Trijang Rinpoche's works on Shugden include a number secondary ritual texts, for example burning offering rituals related to pacification, controlling, increasing and wrathful activities. He also composed several instructions on the preparation of supporting (*rten*), protective (*bskyang*) and repelling (*bzlog*) thread-cross structures of the deity (*mdos*). These include associated ritual recitations and drawings of Shugden's manifestations,

²⁵ khri byang rin po che blo bzang ye shes bstan 'dzin rgya mtsho, *yongs rdzogs bstan pa'i mnga' bdag skyabs rje yongs 'dzin khri byang rdo rje 'chang chen po'i gsung 'bum*, 8 vols.

²⁶ khri byang rin po che, *yongs rdzogs bstan pa'i mnga' bdag skyabs rje yongs 'dzin khri byang rdo rje 'chang chen po'i gsung 'bum*, Vol.5.

retinue and other related paraphernalia needed for the construction of the supporting thread-cross structure (*rten mdos*). Perhaps his most important work on Dorje Shugden, however, was *Music Delighting an Ocean of Oath-Bound Protectors* (*dam can rgya mtsho dgyes pa'i rol mo*), a descriptive text on the activity of the deity that also includes a history of his previous incarnations.²⁷

While the two main deities focused on in Phabongkha's *Collected Works* were Cakrasamvara and Vajrayoginī, the two main deities on which Trijang Rinpoche's *Collected Works* focus are both pure vision teachings stemming from the Tagphu incarnation lineage: Shugden and Tārā. The Tagphu incarnations were famed as *mahāsiddhas* and were believed to have a close relationship to Tārā, especially in her Cittamani, or "Heart-Jewel", form. Trijang Rinpoche himself received the initiations into the practice of the Cittamani Tārā cycle not only from Phabongkha but also directly from Tagphu Pemavajra.²⁸ While Phabongkha is included as a lineage holder of this practice, his *Collected Works* in their current widely available format only contain one single stand-alone work on the deity, *Garland of Cittamani* (*tsit+ta ma Ni'i do shal*) [3.16], a commentary on the generation and completion stages. Trijang Rinpoche's *Collected Works*, however, devote eleven titles to Cittamani Tārā, which, as is the case with his Dorje Shugden works, together form a comprehensive set of ritual texts to complement Phabongkha's contributions and those of past Tagphu incarnations.

Trijang Rinpoche's Cittamani works include a burning offering ritual, a *gañacakra* text, extensive and brief versions of the four-mandala offering and a self-entry ritual amongst others. In the colophon to a set of instructions on how to engage in the Cittamani approximation retreat (*bsnyen pa*) and its preliminary rituals, Trijang Rinpoche notes that this text, which he composed, is based on the works of various teachers, including Phabongkha's instruction manuals on the generation stage of the deity, of which he says there are two, one presumably being the *Garland of Cittamani*.²⁹ Thus, as a con-

²⁷ khri byang rin po che, "dge ldan bstan pa bsrung ba'i lha mchog sprul pa'i chos rgyal chen po rdo rje shugs ldan rtsal gyi gsang gsum rmad du byung ba'i rtogs pa brjod pa'i gтам du bya ba dam can rgya mtsho dgyes pa'i rol mo", pp. 5-159.

²⁸ According to khri byang rin po che, "dga' ldan khri chen byang chub chos 'phel gyi skye gral du rlom pa'i gyi na pa zhig gis rang gi ngag tshul ma bchos lhug par bkod pa 'khrul snang sgyu ma'i zlos gar", p. 99, in 1922 he received, for example, the Cittamani Tārā heart-entry permission initiation (*nying zhugs rjes гуang*) and a long-life initiation from the Thangtong Hearing Lineage (*thang stong snyan brgyud*) called the "Glorious Grant of Immortality" (*'chi med dpal ster*), directly from Pemavajra.

²⁹ khri byang rin po che, "rje btsun ma sgrol ma'i sgrub thabs tsit+ta ma Ni dang 'brel ba'i bsnyen yig 'phags ma snying gi khab tu bsu ba'i yid 'phrog dri za'i

tinuation of a type of successive lineage effort, it was Trijang Rinpoche who brought to completion the textual cycles of these two visionary cycles received from the Tagphu lineage, although Gelug teachers before both Trijang and Phabongkha Rinpoche had already composed works on the two deities concerned.³⁰

Finally, as noted earlier, although here the focus has been on Phabongkha's guru yoga and tantric texts, Phabongkha also taught and authored extensively on many other non-esoteric topics apart from the *Stages of the Path*, including the *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* [4.18-20] and the Seven-Point Mind Training (blo sbyong don bdun), of which he released a well-known edition [5.9].

The Compilation and Publication of Phabongkha's *Collected Works*

The compilation of Phabongkha's *Collected Works* took a number of years and was spearheaded by Trijang Rinpoche together with Denma Lobsang Dorje, who was not only the author of Phabongkha's biography, but also his close student and secretary.³¹ Both of these figures also disseminated the oral transmission lineage of the *Collected Works*.

After Phabongkha's death a search began to collect scattered notes based on Phabongkha's oral teachings, and any works penned by him. Various texts were found, although not all of them could be trusted and thus Denma Lobsang Dorje went through all the texts to check their condition.³² Any notes and other writings that were found or believed by the team to be inaccurate were then corrected. Although the texts are included in Phabongkha's *Collected Works*, it was not unusual for the notes of students to form the basis for the creation of works which were then attributed to the teacher, as was the case with *Liberation In Your Hand*.

The creation of the *Collected Works* was also a costly affair, as is evident from Trijang Rinpoche's introduction to the set, which men-

gling bu", pp. 175. I have been unable to locate the other text within the contents of Phabongkha's *Collected Works*.

³⁰ Two works on Cittamani can be found, for example, in 'jigs smed bsam gtan, "mkhas grub chen po khyab bdag stag phu rin po ches gsungs pa'i rje btsun sgröl ma'i bdag 'jug mkhas grub dam pa'i zhal lung", pp. 803-836 and *Ibid.*, "khyab bdag stag phu'i dag snang rje btsun sgröl ma'i me lha'i bsnyen pa dang bsnyen sgrub sbrags ma bcu cha'i sbyin sreg rnams kyi tho tsam bkod pa dngos grub 'gugs pa'i lcags kyu", pp. 851-865.

³¹ See khri byang rin po che, "khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum pod ka pa'i dkar chag", pp. 2-7.

³² *Ibid.*, p. 5

tions donations given during the carving of woodblocks for volumes one to eight (*ka-nya*), the first to be created.³³ Phabongkha's influence and popularity was largely focussed on Lhasa and pockets of Kham and thus sponsors, who included incarnate lamas, geshe and other important religious figures, aristocrats and other officials, tended to be mainly from these regions. Sponsors from Eastern Tibet hailed from areas such as Dragyab (*brag g.yab*), Lithang (*li thang*) and Barkham (*bar khams*). A number of sponsors also came from different parts of both Ü (*dbus*) and Tsang (*gtsang*). The introduction lists with transparency how much each sponsor donated, listing the most illustrious donor first- the Fourteenth Dalai Lama Tenzin Gyatso's (*ta la'i bla ma bstan 'dzin rgya mtsho*, 1935-) senior tutor Ling Rinpoche Thubten Lungtok Namgyal Trinle (*gling rin po che thub bstan lung rtogs nam rgyal 'phril las*, 1903-1983), who offered 1000 silver coins (*ngul srang*). Trijang Rinpoche includes himself at the end of the list, and donated 4000 silver coins. He also makes a special mention of the aristocrats Lhalu Tsewang Dorje (*lha klu tshe dbang rdo rje*, 1914-2011) and Lhalu Lhacham Yangdzom Tsering (*lha klu lha lcam g.yang 'dzoms tshe ring*, d.u.), who were devoted students of Phabongkha and not only offered 2321 silver coins but also other necessities required for the creation of the new printing blocks as well as earlier work on the collection which took place at Tashi Choeling Hermitage (*bkra shis chos gling ri khrod*). These two central patrons also receive a special dedicatory mention by Trijang Rinpoche, who, amongst many other aspirations, hopes that through the merit the sponsors accumulate through their offerings, they will always be cared for by Guru Vajradhāra (i.e. Phabongkha), and that they may never be parted from Tsongkhapa's "stainless teachings".³⁴

The carving of the wood blocks for volumes one to eight had begun by 1948 and appears to have carried on through until 1951 and beyond.³⁵ This means that the collection and checking of texts, which began after Phabongkha's death in 1941, would have taken more than eight years to complete considering that the remaining volumes following the eighth volume, also had to be prepared.

According to a student of Phabongkha, the original *Collected Works* was composed of more than the eleven volumes which are currently widely available.³⁶ Woodblocks for a twelfth volume (*na*) were carved and texts printed from these. A thirteenth and fourteenth volume was also planned, although these were never published. The twelfth volume, however, appears to not have been included into the public-

³³ Ibid., pp. 2-5.

³⁴ Ibid., p. 6.

³⁵ Ibid., p. 7.

³⁶ Anonymous student of Phabongkha (interview, 2014).

ly distributed editions of the *Collected Works* due to the inauspicious connotations related to the term “na”, which in Tibetan is a homonym for the word “illness”.³⁷ This discarded volume and its blocks, along with any of the material intended for the two additional volumes were thought to have been lost during the Cultural Revolution, although it now appears that a copy of the twelfth volume, or rather, what had originally been planned to be released as a twelfth volume, did survive in the Potala Palace's collection.³⁸ Although currently I have been unable to definitely ascertain what works were intended for the never-published thirteenth and fourteenth volumes, it may be that the other of the two works by Phabongkha on which Trijang Rinpoche's Cittamani Tārā approximation retreat manual was based (one being *Garland of Cittamani*) was amongst these texts.³⁹

The twelfth volume's contents are also significant due to the fact that out of eight texts, four are on Vajrabhairava. These include a text for the Vajrabhairava approximation retreat's preliminary ritual [12.6], a burning offering ritual [12.5] as well as a related explanatory work [12.7], and a self-entry ritual [12.8]. Added to the Vajrabhairava works in the other volumes, these come together to create a comprehensive set of practice texts related to this deity, showing how Phabongkha placed a significant emphasis on this particular practice, which had also been emphasised by Tsongkhapa.

Following the upheavals of the late 1950s and 1960s, the eleven volume Lhasa edition-*Collected Works* was eventually republished under the title of *Collected Works of Pha-bong-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las rgya-mtsho*, between 1973 and 1974 in New Delhi by Chopel Legdan under the guidance of Trijang Rinpoche.⁴⁰ This reproduction was based on surviving copies of the various xylographs printed from the Lhasa woodblocks. Several texts, which had originally been included in the tenth volume, *tha*, but which had been omitted from the republished Delhi edition, were later collected, along with other texts, into an additional volume: *A Supplement to the*

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ For a listing and translation of the contents of the volume see the Appendix. The contents of the volume are catalogued in “pha bong kha rje btsun byams pa bstan 'dzin 'phrin las kyi gsung 'bum (dkar chag)”, pp. 865-874. The Potala's set is the most complete copy of Phabongkha's *Collected Works* that I know of. A twelve-volume edition of the *Collected Works* is listed in the catalogue of the Bibliothèque du Collège de France, however the twelfth volume of this set is simply a copy of Phabongkha's biography, *tshangs pa'i dbyangs snyan*, which is not a part of the actual *Collected Works* set.

³⁹ The retreat manual has already been discussed above (khri byang rin po che, “phags ma snying gi khab tu bsu ba'i yid 'phrog dri za'i gling bu”, pp. 175).

⁴⁰ Pha-bong-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las rgya-mtsho, *Collected Works of Pha-bong-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las rgya-mtsho*.

Collected Works of the Lord of Refuge, Phabongkha Dechen Nyingpo (skyabs rje pha bong kha pa bde chen snying po'i gsung 'bum kha skong), published in 1977 by Ngawang Sopa in New Delhi.⁴¹ The contents of the 1977 supplementary volume are as follows:

1. A Collection of The Lord of Refuge, Kyabdag Dorjechang Phabongkha's Minor Compositions and Instructions

khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa'i bka' rtsom dang phyag bzhes phran tshogs skor phyogs su bkod pa/

2. Bestowing the Supreme All-Illuminating Wisdom: The Recitation Rituals of the Sādhana of Venerable White Mañjuśrī Set Together Side by Side

rje btsun 'jam dbyangs dkar po'i sgrub thabs kyi 'don chog zur du bkod pa kun gsal shes rab mchog sbyin/

3. Extensively Elucidated Outlines of the Essential Instructions of the Stages of the Path to Enlightenment Together with Notes which Easily Point Out the Pith Instructions of the Essential Points

byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i dmar khrid kyi sa bcad rgyas par bkral ba/ nyer mkho'i man ngag 'tshol bde'i mchan dang bcas pa/

4. An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom: An Explanation of the Make-up of the Vairocana-Abhisambodhi⁴²

rnam snang mngon byang gi thig 'grel sher 'byung dgongs rgyan

5. The Way to Perform the Long-Life Accomplishment Ritual Related to Sita-Tārā Cintācakra

sgrol dkar yid bzhin 'khor lo'i sgo nas tshe sgrub bya tshul/

6. The Essence of the Nectar of Holy Dharma: The Way to Practice the Profound Instructions of the Stages of the Path to Enlightenment, Explained in Verse

⁴¹ The supplement was published as *Pha-boñ-kha-pa Bde-chen-sñin-po, A Collection of Supplemental Works of Skyabs-rje Pha-boñ-kha-pa Bde-chen-sñin-po reproduced from blockprints recently found by Ven. Khri-byañ Rin-po-che.*

⁴² Note that the contents of the volume are as given on the Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center's (TBRC) website (Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center. "Outline: skyabs rje pha bong kha pa bde chen snying po'i gsung 'bum kha skong"). However, the website lists another title, *An Appendix to the Composition of the Vairocana-Abhisambodhi (rnam snang mngon byang gi thig rtsa'i zur 'debs)*, following this first Vairocana text. However within the volume itself this text is not given its own title page and is instead incorporated into *An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom.*

byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i gdams pa zab mo rnams tshigs su bcad pa'i sgo nas nyams su len tshul dam chos bdud rtsi'i snying po/

7. Newly Arranged Diagrams for the Stages of Śamatha as Taught in Lord Maitreya's Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra

byams mgon gyis mdo sde rgyan las gsungs pa'i zhi gnas kyi dmigs rim rnams re'u mig tu gsar bskrun/

8. The Calling the Guru from Afar [Practice Entitled] "The Inseparable Three Bodies": A Song of Longing Swiftly Drawing the Blessings of the Guru

bla ma rgyang 'bod sku gsum dbyer med bla ma'i byin rlabs myur 'dren gdung dbyangs/

The three texts that were already included in the tenth volume (*tha*) of the original Lhasa edition of the *Collected Works* but were not included in the 1973-1974 New Delhi edition of the eleven volume set were the collection of minor writings, the Vairocana text (*An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom*), and the Sita-Tārā ritual. This is clear as the folios of each of these works, which were collected by Trijang Rinpoche from surviving manuscripts of the original Lhasa edition, are marked by the letter *tha*.⁴³

Furthermore, two of the works from this supplement, namely the first work, *A Collection of The Lord of Refuge, Kyabdag Dorjechang Phabongkha's Minor Compositions and Instructions* [10.3, 12.2] and *An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom* [10.4, 12.3], are both listed in the Potala's catalogue as being part of the twelfth "na" volume of the Potala's edition. These two texts then, can today be found in three separate volumes: the Delhi supplement, the tenth volume of the widely known Lhasa edition, and the twelfth volume of the rare edition in the Potala's collection. The Sita-Tārā text [10.8], however, is only found in the Delhi supplement and in the tenth volume of the Lhasa edition.

The fact that the *Minor Compositions* and *An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom* are found in the widely known eleven-volume Lhasa edition, gives credence to the fact that the twelfth volume, as held today in the Potala, was never released to a wider audience. For whatever reason, both works were instead selected to be moved from the planned twelfth volume into the tenth volume of the official Lhasa edition, because, as mentioned above, publishing and distributing a "na" volume would have been inauspicious in this case. As a result,

⁴³ Each folio of the Lhasa edition of Phabongkha's *Collected Works* is marked with the Tibetan letter denoting which volume the page and work as a whole is from.

two texts which were already positioned as the third and fourth works of the tenth volume, *The Mirror of the View* (*lta ba'i me long*), a commentary to a Kadampa (*bka' gdams pa*) transference of consciousness practice, and a text entitled *Abbreviated Rites to Protect Harvests from Rain, Frost, Hail, Disease, Drought and So Forth* (*lo tog gi rim 'gro dang/ char 'bebs/ sad ser btsa' than sogs srung thabs mdor bsdus la/*) were removed from the volume, replaced by *Minor Compositions* and *An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom*, and are thus today no longer included in the widely available Lhasa edition. A comparison with the Potala catalogue likewise reveals that a Vajrayoginī *gaṇacakra* ritual text was removed to make place for the Sita-Tārā Cintācakra longevity practice [10.8], although the work did not come from the twelfth volume. The tenth (*tha*) volume in the eleven-part Lhasa set contains no contents pages, the only multi-work volume without one, which also points towards a reconfiguration of the volume's original contents.⁴⁴ We know that the volumes were carved and printed gradually and thus volumes one to nine were probably already printed and set at the time that the *Minor Compositions* and *An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom* were transferred into the tenth volume. The tenth was probably deemed as a more suitable location for these texts than the eleventh volume, which was reserved exclusively for *Liberation in Your Hand*.⁴⁵

The remaining texts in the supplementary Delhi volume were most likely drawn from material which would have been included in the thirteenth or fourteenth volumes, should they ever have been published, and thus the folios do not contain any Tibetan letters marking them as belonging to any specific volume.

Some texts that are in wide circulation and use today may also well have been planned to be included in the never-released thirteenth and fourteenth volumes, but were omitted from both the Lhasa and Delhi eleven-volume editions as well as the Delhi supplement. For example, Phabongkha's re-composition of the common sixty-four part tormā offering to the protector Kālarūpa, *The Accomplishment of*

⁴⁴ The eleventh volume also contains no contents page, however this is explained by the fact that the volume is made up of one single text.

⁴⁵ I have not been able to access the Potala's set to ascertain whether or not all the texts in the twelfth volume are marked with the letter "na", which would suggest they were printed as one definitive volume. This is unlikely, however, as it appears that before the official Lhasa edition was finalised and released to a wider readership the texts within the twelfth volume were dispersed, as noted above, with several entering the tenth volume, and being denoted as such with the engraving of the letter *tha*. The Potala's holding thus seems to represent an early working version of the *Collected Works*, one which was acquired by the palace library before the wider release of the set, and the reconfiguration of its final volumes.

the Four Activities: A Recitation Arrangement of the Sixty-Four Part [Torma Offering Ritual] Organised for Easy and Convenient Recitation (drug cu ma'i 'don bsgrigs 'khyer bde nag 'gros su bkod pa las bzhi'i 'phril las myur 'grub), which is widely used and found in numerous Gelug prayer books, appears to be excluded from both the Delhi and Lhasa editions of the *Collected Works* and is not listed amongst the twelve volumes available in the Potala's collection.⁴⁶ Also excluded from the *Collected Works* are polemical notes compiled by Denma Lobsang Dorje based on teachings given by Phabongkha in Chamdo, discussing the views of other Tibetan Buddhist schools, as well as Bon.⁴⁷

Another text that does not appear to have been included in the original Lhasa edition of the *Collected Works*, its later reproductions and reprints, the Delhi supplement, or the Potala edition, is a new initiation ritual manual composed by Phabongkha for the Thirteen Pure Visions of Tagphu (stag phu'i dag snang bcu gsum), also known as the Thirteen Secret Dharmas (gsang chos bcu gsum) or Thirteen Secret Visions (dag snang gsang ba bcu gsum). These "Thirteen Secret Dharmas" refer to a cycle of visionary teachings originating from Tagphu Tulku Lobsang Chokyi Wangchuk (stag phu sprul sku blo bzang chos kyi dbang phyug, 1765-c.1792) and transmitted through his incarnation lineage, down to Tagphu Pemavajra and from him to Phabongkha. The cycle contains practices of deities such as Amitāyus, Vajravārāhī, Hayagrīva, Avalokiteśvara and, most importantly, Cittamani Tārā. The new initiation manual, entitled *The Power to Magnificently Fully Gather The Fruit of the Two Aims: The Rain-fall-Array of Ripening Initiation Rituals of The Thirteen Sealed Secret*

⁴⁶ The fact that the *Sixty-Four Part Offering* was published separately from the *Collected Works* is noted in the colophon of pha bong kha, *drug cu ba'i 'don bsgrigs 'khyer bde nag 'gros su bkod pa las bzhi'i 'phrin las myur 'grub*, 2014, printed as a separate text in Lhasa. The same colophon can be found in several prayer books containing the ritual text. The text's exclusion from the *Collected Works* is also noted in Sharpa Tulku and Richard Guard, *Meditations on Vajrabhairava*, p. 113. It appears that this text was intended to be included in one of the unpublished volumes, as suggested by an anonymous student of Phabongkha (interviewed, 2014). Although the sixty-four part torma offering receives attention in Vol. 3 of the currently available Lhasa edition of the *Collected Works* [3.6], this is not the same text being discussed here. The 2014 Lhasa print of the text adds that it was published by the Sandutsang (sa 'du tshang) family, a Khampa trading family whose members included several government officials.

⁴⁷ The text was published with two other works in a compilation put together by Phabongkha's students, however I have seen or received no indication that this was amongst the texts that would have been destined for Phabongkha's *Collected Works*. See Idan ma blo bzang rdo rje, "skyabs rje pha bong kha pa chab mdor bzhugs skabs snyan sgron du gsol zer ba'i yig rdzus kyi dpyad don mchan bus bkrol ba dpyod Idan bzhin 'dzum dgod pa'i thal skad rnga chen bskul ba'i dbyu gu".

Dharmas of the Glorious Tagphu, however, appears to have been included in the collected works of Tagphu Pemavajra instead, most likely because the work is directly related to Phabongkha's teacher's visionary lineage.⁴⁸ It is recorded in Phabongkha's biography that in the Fire-Horse Year (1906) he requested permission from Tagphu Pemavajra to compose a new initiation manual on the Thirteen Secret Dharmas, the permission-initiations of which he then subsequently bestowed upon a gathering of fifteen high-ranking incarnate lamas over a period of about a week.⁴⁹ The woodblocks for the text were apparently only carved in 1935.⁵⁰

The Guru-Deity-Protector Triad

The life-entrustment ritual of Dorje Shugden, *The Chariot of the Jewel of Faith Drawing Together a Precious Mass of Blessings* [7.11], composed by Phabongkha dates from 1935, when he was visiting Tagphu Dorjechang at the latter's monastery of Tagphu Drubde Geden Lugzang Kunphelling (stag phu sgrub sde dge ldan lugs bzang kun 'phel gling) in Nagshoe (nags shod), Kham. The colophon to the text states that it was both Phabongkha, as well as his visionary teacher, who together brought the "profound words" of the ritual to maturation.⁵¹ Phabongkha's close affinity to Shugden, however, does not appear to have been confined to the final years of his life. In the colophon to *The Melodious Drum Victorious in All Directions* [7.14], Phabongkha's seminal fulfillment ritual of Dorje Shugden, he describes how he had been lovingly cared for by Shugden, who was compassionately attached to him like "the body is to a shadow", since his youth ("lus

⁴⁸ pha bong kha, "dpal stag phu'i gsang chos rgya can bcu gsum gyi smin byed dbang chog chu 'babs bkod pa don gnyis 'bras bus brjid pa'i yongs 'du'i dbang po". The work is also available today as a separate text. The only widely known extant copy of the Tagphu *Collected Works* is in the Potala collection and although this initiation text is listed in the contents given in "stag phu 'jam dpal bstan pa'i dngos grub bam pad+ma bdzra'i gsung 'bum (dkar chag)", pp. 860-861, it has been impossible to compare the contents with the widely available version.

⁴⁹ ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje, *tshañs pa'i dbyañs sñan*, Vol. 1 of 2, p. 359.

⁵⁰ This is mentioned in the colophon of the stand-alone edition of the text, Pha-boñkha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-phrin-las-rgya-mtsho, *dpal stag phu'i gsañ chos rgya can bcu gsum gyi dbañ chog chu 'babs su bkod pa don gñis 'bras bus brjid pa'i yoñs 'du'i dbañ po: Initiation texts for the practice of the visionary teachings received by the Second Stag-phu Sprul-sku Blo bzañ-chos-kyi-dbañ-phyug (gar-dbañ-padma-śvara)*, p. 439.

⁵¹ pha bong kha, "'jam mgon bstan srung yongs kyī thu bo mchog/ / rdo rje shugs ldan srog dbang zab mo'i tshul/ / byin rlabs rin chen phung po 'dren ba yi/ / yid ches nor bu'i shing rta", p. 523

dang grib ma bzhin du brtse bas bskyangs bskul").⁵² The composition of the text in question, whose block prints for the *Collected Works* are dated 1948, thus amongst the first to be carved, was begun in the Wood-Ox Year of 1925 when Phabongkha was in his late 40s, but the complete text with its colophon and its verses of auspiciousness appears to have only been finalized by Phabongkha in 1929.⁵³

Shugden, as is obvious from the epithets that Phabongkha used in relation to the deity: "Protector of Lord Mañjuśrī [Tsongkhapa]'s Teachings ('jam mgon bstan srung)" and "Protector of the Virtuous [Gelug] Teachings (dge ldan bstan srung)", was indeed considered by Phabongkha as an important protector of the Gelug tradition.⁵⁴ Without Phabongkha's efforts and writings based on the revelation of the cycle by Tagphu Pemavajra, the cult of the deity would most likely not have become as widespread as it is today. Yet, based on what we can deduce from his *Collected Works*, did Phabongkha lead a "charismatic movement", or similar, centred on Shugden, Vajrayoginī and himself as a sacred triad of esoteric Gelug doctrine, as Donald Lopez suggests? Georges Dreyfus agrees and writes, perhaps more strongly, that Phabongkha "created a new understanding of the Ge-luk tradition focused on three elements: Vajrayoginī as the main meditational deity (*yi dam*), Shuk-den as the protector, and Pa-bong-ka as the guru".⁵⁵ Although this is a commonly held view, here I would like to suggest that Phabongkha created no such understanding.

Despite the epithets that Phabongkha used in relation to Shugden in his works, he was not exclusively focused on Shugden as the only protector worthy of writing on. Most Tibetan Buddhist works bestow superlative epithets to the deities they are focused on and thus these titles alone cannot tell us how important or central a specific deity was. Compiled together with Phabongkha's Shugden works in the same volume is another set of five texts, these being focused on "The Glorious Four-Faced Protector" (dpal mgon gdong bzhi pa), Caturmukha Mahākāla, who in the Gelug tradition is a protector of the Cakrasaṃvara cycle.⁵⁶ These include a long ritual text of permission

⁵² pha bong kha, "dge ldan bstan srung dgra lha'i rgyal po srid gsum skye dgu'i srog bdag dam ldan bu bzhin skyong ba'i lha mchog sprul pa'i rgyal chen rdo rje shugs ldan rigs lnga rtsal gyi sger bskang rgyas pa phyogs las rnam par rgyal ba'i rnga dbyangs", pp. 665-666.

⁵³ Ibid. pp. 666-667.

⁵⁴ These two epithets can be found, for example, in the titles of several of Phabongkha's works. See pha bong kha, "yid ches nor bu'i shing rta", p. 505 and pha bong kha, "rnam par rgyal ba'i rnga dbyangs", p. 611. Also see Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", p. 247.

⁵⁵ Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", p. 246.

⁵⁶ Note that in the content pages to the seventh printed volume, one of the works, *The Increasing and Auspicious Akṣara Garland (ak+Sha ra'i phreng ba)* [7.6] is not

initiations (*rjes gnang*) for the different manifestations of the deity, and various other works [7.5-7.9]. It is not surprising, considering Phabongkha's emphasis on Cakrasaṃvara, that he would compose a substantial set of texts on this form of Mahākāla, which in simple terms of page numbers, is considerably larger than his writings on Shugden. This demonstrates that while Phabongkha himself promoted Shugden as an important protector, the deity nevertheless remained within a wider pantheon of wrathful deities that Phabongkha considered important. Interestingly Phabongkha's writings on Shugden, based on Tagphu Pemavajra's pure visions, prescribe a life-entrustment initiation, usually reserved for more lowly worldly protectors (*'jig rten pa'i srung ma*), instead of a permission initiation, such as those bestowed for the different manifestations of Caturmukha Mahākāla and other deities categorized as enlightened. Clearly Phabongkha did not take that one step further and promote Shugden directly to the level of an enlightened protector, which may well have been too obtrusive a move, but instead kept him ranked at the level of a worldly protector, who nevertheless, in reality, is an emanation of Mañjuśrī simply appearing as a *gyalpo*, or "king"-spirit (*rgyal po*), as a manifestation of his enlightened activities.⁵⁷ Shugden, as numerous textual sources attest, certainly existed within the Gelug and other lineages, specifically those of the Sakya sect, before Phabongkha and his teachers, and appears to have been consistently classed as a *gyalpo*.

Shugden's ranking as a worldly being is clear from a comparison with another popular protector, Pehar (*dpe har*). Like Shugden, Pehar is classed as a *gyalpo* being, and both are often referred to with the titles of either "Gyalpo" or "Gyalchen" (*rgyal chen*), meaning "great king"- although the titles can also be used as an honorific and not necessarily to refer to a class of spirit. The same is true for Pehar's five manifestations, the Five Gyalchen (*rgyal chen sku lnga*), who, like Shugden, have an associated life-entrustment ritual instead of a

listed separately, possibly because it is a very brief work of only three pages. The text is, however, included on the contents listing prepared by the TBRC.

⁵⁷ The belief that Shugden's actual nature is Mañjuśrī is noted for example, in *khri byang rin po che*, "dam can rgya mtsho dgyes pa'i rol mo", p. 7-8, where Shugden is called "Wrathful Mañjuśrī" (*'jam dpal drag po*) and as being indivisible from the meditational deity Yamāntaka (*gshin rje gzhed dang dbyer med*), who is also considered a wrathful manifestation of Mañjuśrī. Nevertheless Trijang Rinpoche still distinguishes between wisdom-being dharma protectors (*chos skyong ye shes pa*) such as Dharmarāja (*chos kyi rgyal po*) and dharma protectors who appear in a mundane aspect (*'jig rten pa'i rnam pa ni chos skyong*), such as Shugden (*ibid.*, p. 15).

permission initiation.⁵⁸ Pehar is a protector of the Tibetan Government hailing from the Nyingma tradition who through his minister, Dorje Drakden (rdo rje grags ldan), makes himself manifest through the Nechung Oracle (gnas chung sku rtan), a human medium who in turn functions as the primary state oracle. Shugden likewise manifests through human mediums, relegating his outward ranking to that of a worldly deity in the eyes of most Tibetan Buddhists, as enlightened protectors are generally understood not to take possession of mediums, an activity reserved for worldly spirits and protectors. Shugden's actual nature as a manifestation of Manjuśrī is likewise highly contested by most Tibetan Buddhists, however a number of other protectors, including Pehar, are also the subject of disagreements (as to whether or not they are truly enlightened), although certainly not as heated.⁵⁹

Phabongkha's promotion of Vajrayoginī as a meditational deity is not unique within the Gelug tradition and has an established history within the lineage. Tagphu Lobsang Tenpai Gyaltzen (stag phu blo bzang bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan, 1714-1762), for example, composed a commentary on the two stages (*rim gnyis*) and Tuken Lobsang Chokyi Nyima wrote a large collection of practice texts and instructions on the deity that rival Phabongkha's in breadth, and which Phabongkha himself used as a basis for his own compositions, along with the related works of Ngulchu Dharmabhadra (dngul chu

⁵⁸ See, for example, a life-entrustment ritual of the five forms of Pehar by Tuken Lobsang Chokyi Nyima (thu'u bkwan blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, 1737-1802), whose ritual type (i.e. a life-entrustment) suggests the protectors are worldly deities, but are nonetheless described as being manifestations of Hayagrīva, an enlightened wrathful deity: blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, "rta mgrin gsang sgrub kyi chos skor las/ bka' srung rgyal po sku lnga'i srog gtad bya tshul ches gsal ba/ 'phrin las sgo 'byed/", pp. 775-789. Another example of a protector that is considered outwardly to be a worldly being but in reality believed to be enlightened, is Setrab Chen (bse khrab can), who is generally categorized as a *gyalpo*, *yaksha* (*gnod sbyin*) or *tse* (*bitsan*) spirit, but is also believed to be an emanation of Buddha Amitābha by Ganden *Shartse* Dratsang (dga' ldan shar rtse grwa tshang), for example, who continue to propitiate the deity as their special protector. This is also mentioned in khri byang rin po che, "dam can rgya mtsho dgyes pa'i rol mo", p. 8, along with several other protectors who play such dual roles, including the "Five Gyalpos who Show a Worldly Form" (*'jig rten par bstan pa rgyal po sku lnga*), i.e. the five forms of Pehar, who here are described as actually being manifestations of the heads of the five buddha clans (*rgyal ba rigs lnga*) (Ibid. p. 8-9).

⁵⁹ The Five Long-life Sisters, Tsering Chenga (tshe ring mched lnga) are yet another example of a contested type of protector. See Réne de Nebesky-Wojkowitz, *Oracles and Demons of Tibet: The Cult and Iconography of the Tibetan Protective Deities*, p. 177.

d+harma b+ha dra, 1772-1851) and others.⁶⁰ Art historical evidence also confirms the existence of Vajrayoginī in the Gelug tradition in the eighteenth century, as can be seen from a number of *thangka* (*thang kha*) paintings and other works produced at the Qing court during the period of the Qianlong Emperor (r. 1735- 1796), and his guru Changkya Rolpai Dorje (lcang skya ro pa'i rdo rje, 1717-1786), for example, who was also a Vajrayoginī practitioner, as well as many other instances.⁶¹ Thus while the Vajrayoginī Naro Kechari lineage was passed into the Gelug tradition from the Sakya (sa skya) lineage, and all evidence points to the fact that the practice of the deity and all of these works in the Gelug tradition are certainly post-Tsongkhapa, it is clear that Phabongkha was drawing from an already well-established practice within his own lineage. Despite the unique Vajrayoginī lineage stemming from Phabongkha being the most well-known today, it appears that another lineage or lineages of practice stemming from Amdo (a mdo)-based teachers such as Tuken were previously widely practiced, at least in their native regions. Although today these lineages have become rare, they are apparently not extinct.⁶²

Phabongkha's many compositions on Vajrayoginī do not mean that he had a calculated plan for the practice to become an institutionalized central facet of the Gelug tradition. It is obvious from the colophons of a number of his compositions on the deity that requests came from many of his close students, including several high-ranking aristocratic women. A number of female practitioners were understandably attracted to this solitary female deity, whose teachings and

⁶⁰ For the Tagphu commentary see blo bzang bstan pa'i rgyal tshan, "rje btsun rdo rje rnal 'byor ma nA ro mkha' spyod kyi rim gnyis zab mo'i nyams len bai DU r+ya zhun ma'i them skas sogs chos tshan khag cig", for Tuken's Vajrayoginī works see those in blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, *rje bstun bla ma dam pa thu'u bkwan blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum*, Vol. 8, and for Dharmabhadra's works, see dngul chu d+harma b+ha dra, *Collected Works (gsung 'bum) of ñul-chu dharma-bhadra*, Vols. 2, 4 and 6. For a mention of how the works of these authors were used by Phabongkha in his own writings, see pha bong kha, "dkyil 'khor gyi cho ga bde chen dga' ston", pp. 128-130. Even the Fifth Dalai Lama composed a work which can be found in his *Collected Works* (ngag dbang blo bzang rgya mtsho, "nA ro mkha' spyod kyi rnal 'byor bcu gcig gi nyams len la sgro 'dogs gcod pa dang sems 'dzin zung 'brel du gtong tshul mthong grol lde mig", pp. 355-368.)

⁶¹ Tuken, Rolpai Dorje and Lobsang Tenpai Gyaltzen were contemporaries who also had student-teacher relationships between each other. The Qianlong Emperor himself received the Cakrasaṃvara and Vajrayoginī initiations (Elizabeth Benard, "The Qianlong Emperor and Tibetan Buddhism", pp. 125-126).

⁶² This is according to the late Lama Lobsang Darjy (bla ma blo bsang dar rgyas, 1967-2010), a former vajrācārya of Ragya Monastery (ra rgya dgon). Several sacred sites associated with Vajrayoginī continue as functioning pilgrimage sites in Amdo, although I do not have the space to discuss them here.

practice, furthermore, are relatively simple compared to those of the three main Gelug meditational deities, including Cakrasaṃvara, and in particular the sixty-two deity body mandala (*lus dkyil*) form emphasized by Phabongkha. Women, lay or ordained, did not have access to religious education as monks or even lay men did, and thus Vajrayoginī presented them with a simple and efficacious alternative. Even today all of the Gelug nunneries in Lhasa, as well as many in India and Nepal, continue to practice Phabongkha's Vajrayoginī *gaṇacakra* and/or self-entry rituals communally in their assembly halls on a monthly basis, whereas this is unheard of in male Gelug monastic institutions. This analysis, however, does not exclude men, who would also of course have benefited from such a concise yet profound practice, making the attraction of the deity to a large following of adherents easy to understand. Phabongkha clearly had a connection on a spiritual level with the deity (as he did with Shugden) and the reasons for his composition of works on Vajrayoginī's practice may not have been any more unusual than those of previous Gelug teachers who taught and wrote on the deity, and indeed on any deity- being that they were requested by students and saw a need for new texts. In fact some of these reasons are included within the colophons or introductions to his texts.⁶³ Texts that were written by a teacher out of his own accord or for his own personal practice are often noted as such in the colophon. However it was common for Tibetans to request their own teachers to re-write existing *sādhana*s, usually resulting in minor differences.⁶⁴ Phabongkha's Vajrayoginī *sādhana*, *The Swift Path to Great Bliss (bde chen nye lam)*, was based on existing Gelug examples, most obviously Tuken's *sādhana*, which has the same title, and follows the same schemata and essential visualizations, however Phabongkha clearly expanded on the work.⁶⁵

In relation to Phabongkha's promotion of Vajrayoginī, Dreyfus writes that "The novelty of his approach is even clearer when we consider Pa-bong-ka's emphasis on Tārā Cintāmaṇi [*sic*] as a secondary meditational deity, for this practice is not canonical in the strict sense of the term but comes from the pure visions of one of Pa-bong-

⁶³ As was the case with the history of the composition of the self-entry text *Festival of Great Bliss*, attributed to requests by Lady Dagbhrum and Ngawang Gyatso, as has already been discussed.

⁶⁴ This common practice was confirmed by Gelek Rimpoche (interview, 2014).

⁶⁵ For Tuken's *sādhana* see blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, "nA ro mkha' spyod kyi sgrub thabs thun mong ma yin pa bde chen nye lam". Although it is not mentioned in the colophon of Phabongkha's *sādhana* that it was composed based on a request, his biography mentions that it was Lady Dagbhrum who implored her teacher to review the practice text (*Idan ma blo bzang rdo rje, tshans pa'i dbyans sñan*, Vol. 1 of 2, pp. 377-378). These Gelug *sādhana* texts were of course ultimately largely based on Sakya compositions.

ka's main teachers, Ta-bu Pe-ma Baz-ra (*sta bu padma badzra*) [sic]"⁶⁶ Dreyfus goes on to say that although Phabongkha did not introduce these deities into the tradition himself, but rather received them from his teachers, it is his unprecedented promotion of these "secondary practices" by making them "widespread and central to the Ge-luk tradition and claiming that they represented the essence of Dzong-ka-ba's [Tsongkhapa's] teaching" which made him innovative.⁶⁷ This statement is only partly true. For example, Phabongkha appears to have only composed one or two texts on Cittamani Tārā, i.e. the commentary on the generation and completion stages mentioned earlier, which does not suggest an emphasis on the practice.⁶⁸ Vajrayoginī, as has already been noted, was already a very popular deity amongst a number of highly influential eighteenth century scholars such as Tuken, who wrote on the practice extensively. More importantly it is clear from the works of these scholars that Vajrayoginī was already considered by a number of leading teachers as the "uncommon secret dharma hidden in the mind" of Tsongkhapa, i.e. his secret meditational deity.⁶⁹ If this belief was already extant in the eighteenth century amongst high-ranking religious figures, then it is certainly understandable as to why Vajrayoginī was considered so important and why Phabongkha would follow the same tradition and its interpretations. In this sense, Phabongkha was far from innovative.

Dreyfus also repeats, specifically in relation to Shugden, that Phabongkha "transformed a marginal practice into a central element of

⁶⁶ Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", p. 246. It would be worth noting here that no works on a deity known as "Tārā Cintāmaṇi" (i.e. *sgrol ma yi bzhiñ nor bu*) are listed in Phabongkha's *Collected Works*, although both Sita Tārā Cintāchakra (*sgrol dkar yi bzhiñ 'khor lo*), the popular long-life deity, and Tārā Cittamani (*sgrol ma tsit+ta ma Ni*) appear. Out of these, Dreyfus is referring to the Cittamani Tārā lineage, which Phabongkha received from Tagphu (n.b. *stag phu*) Pemavajra, and which, although indeed having its origins in the Tagphu incarnation lineage, stems back further than Phabongkha's immediate teacher. The cycle is attributed to the visions of Tagphu Lobsang Tenpai Gyaltzen (*stag phu blo bzang bstan pa'i rgya mtshan*, 1714-1762) and his reincarnation Tagphu Lobsang Chokyi Wangchuk (*stag phu blo bzang chos kyi dbang phyug*, 1765-1792), often considered, respectively, the first and second Tagphu incarnations. Lobsang Chokyi Wangchuk was also known as Gargyi Wangpo (*gar gyi dbang po*) and composed the widely used generation stage *sādhana* of Cittamani Tārā (*blo bzang chos kyi dbang phyug, sgrol ma tsit+ta ma Ni la brten pa'i thun mong ma yin pa'i bla ma'i rnal 'byor thar par bgrad pa'i them skas*).

⁶⁷ Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", p. 246.

⁶⁸ Although only one text is apparent in the contents of the *Collected Works*, as discussed earlier, a second manual composed by Phabongkha on Cittamani may exist.

⁶⁹ *blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma, "nA ro mkha' spyod ma'i sgrub thabs rgyas pa pad+ma rA ga'i them skas"*, p. 2a.

the Ge-luk tradition. This transformation is illustrated by the epithets used to refer to Shuk-den".⁷⁰ Although these epithets have already been mentioned above, here it is also necessary to point out that epithets like "Protector of Lord Mañjuśrī [Tsongkhapa]'s Teachings", like the view of Vajrayoginī as Tsongkhapa's secret meditational deity, far predate Phabongkha, and thus do not in themselves prove his elevation of Shugden into a "central element". In fact one of the exact same epithets used by Phabongkha, i.e. "Protector of Lord Mañjuśrī [Tsongkhapa]'s Teachings" can be found in the title of a text by the seventeenth to eighteenth century teacher Dragyab Lobsang Norbu Sherab (brag g.yab blo bzang nor bu shes rab, d.u.), entitled *The Way to Perform the Invocation of Gyalchen Dorje Shugden Tsal, Protector of Lord Mañjuśrī [Tsongkhapa]'s Teachings*, one of the earliest instances of the usage of the title.⁷¹ A number of other later usages of this or similar titles pre-dating Phabongkha do exist, suggesting that Phabongkha was following the example of select previous Gelug teachers in his propitiation of Shugden. It is almost impossible to estimate the popularity of Shugden in the various regions of Tibet and Mongolia before the twentieth century. The major difference with these earlier teachers and Phabongkha, however, was the latter's popularity, which resulted in a wider dissemination of anything he taught, often to an audience of politically and religiously influential figures. This, as with the case of Vajrayoginī, however, should not necessarily be taken to mean that he purposefully conceived of disseminating the practice of the protector more than his predecessors.

While Phabongkha's teachings certainly diffused the practice of Vajrayoginī, as well as Dorje Shugden, making them more popular amongst Gelug practitioners in Central Tibet and Kham than they were before, apart from upholding the traditional view of Vajrayoginī being Tsongkhapa's secret meditational deity, it is unclear to what extent he saw these practices as "central" to the Gelug teachings at large. As has already been noted, Vajrayoginī gets no mention in the *Liberation in Your Hand*, while Phabongkha instead emphasizes the importance of focusing on Cakrasaṃvara, Guhyasamāja and Va-

⁷⁰ Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", p. 246-247.

⁷¹ blo bzang nor bu shes rab, "jam mgon bstan srung rgyal chen rdo rje shugs ldan rtsal gyi 'phrin bcol bya tshul", pp. 241-250. Two other Shugden invocation texts are included in the same volume. Unfortunately the actual works appear to have been removed from the set before the edition was acquired and made available by the TBRC. The titles of these works are still listed on p. 4 of the same volume, in the contents list. Trinley Kalsang, in the introduction to his webpage (Trinley Kalsang, "Among Shugden Texts", in *Dorje Shugden History*), notes that this type of elevated title for Shugden was "coined in the 18th or 19th century". I, however, would suggest that it was perhaps coined even earlier, in the seventeenth or eighteenth century.

jrabhairava numerous times, and recommends these as the initiations and practices for the audience to receive and adopt in their practice of tantra.⁷² In his autobiography, Trijang Rinpoche likewise calls Guhyasamāja the “very pure essence, the most sublime, ultimate pinnacle of all classes of tantra”, suggesting that the cycle, which is most commonly regarded as the mainstay of Tsongkhapa, was at least symbolically central to the lineage.⁷³ Publicly and institutionally there was no obvious effort made to officially elevate Vajrayoginī to the same level as the three principal meditational deities, which remained the focus of study and practice at the two principal Gelug tantric universities, along with the traditional Gelug protectors prescribed by Tsongkhapa. Vajrayoginī, Cittamani Tārā and Dorje Shugden were never incorporated into the curriculums of the tantric institutions and, apart from a few exceptional cases, they had to be studied or practiced privately.

In Rilbur Tulku's (ril 'bur sprul sku, 1923-2006) introduction to Michael Richards' translation of Phabongkha's *Liberation in Your Hand*, he notes that when visiting Phabongkha's residence at Tashi Choeling (bkra shis chos gling) for the first time in c.1937, Phabongkha introduced him to all the statues on the altar of his meditation room: Tsongkhapa, Cakrasaṃvara, Vajrabhairava, Vajrayoginī and Palgon Dramdze (dpal mgon bram ze).⁷⁴ Interestingly, Palgon Dramdze, whose full name is Palgon Dramdzei Zug (dpal mgon bram ze'i gzugs), or Brahmarūpa Mahākāla, is a manifestation of Caturmukha Mahākāla, the protector of the Cakrasaṃvara cycle. This protector, with his *sādhu*-like appearance, takes the form of an elder Brahmin. The manifestation of the deity in this form is apparently an alternative to the actual four-faced wrathful form of Caturmukha Mahākāla, whose actual image was not allowed to be shown to the uninitiated, according to strict tantric prescriptions.⁷⁵ Tashi Choeling was an important retreat hermitage for Phabongkha and his collection of per-

⁷² See, for example, pha bong kha, "rnam grol lag bcangs", p. 758.

⁷³ "...rgyud thams cad kyi snying po rab dang phul dang rtse mo mthar thug pa". khri byang rin po che, "dga' ldan khri chen byang chub chos 'phel gyi skye gral du rlom pa'i gyi na pa zhig gis rang gi ngag tshul ma bchos lhug par bkod pa 'khrul snang sgyu ma'i zlos gar", p. 190.

⁷⁴ Rilbur Rinpoche. "Pabongka Rinpoche: A Memoir by Rilbur Rinpoche", p. 12. It is unclear if the site being referred to is indeed Tashi Choeling or not as Rilbur Rinpoche says the site was a "cave". Tashi Choeling was one of Phabongkha's principal residences, although it did not contain a cave. A separate sacred cave site, associated with Phabongkha and known as Takten Dragphuk (rtag brtan brag phug), however, is located up the mountain from Tashi Choeling. Thus the site being referred to could be either one of these locations, both of which were owned by Phabongkha.

⁷⁵ "Mahakala: Brahmarupa (Brahmin Form)" in *Himalayan Art*.

sonal statues is revealing due to the variety of deities on the altar, especially as the visit takes place in the last few years of Phabongkha's life. Although we cannot know if the account by Rilbur Tulku purposefully omits any deities, his observations cannot be dismissed and thus it is interesting to note that although Vajrayoginī is present on Phabongkha's altar along with two of Tsongkhapa's prescribed meditational deities, Shugden is not. Instead Brahmārūpa Mahākāla takes the place of protector, representing none other than Caturmukha Mahākāla, on whom, as has been noted, Phabongkha composed more pages and larger works than on Shugden. These facts suggest that while Phabongkha did place importance on Shugden, Caturmukha Mahākāla, as the protector of the all-important Cakrasaṃvara cycle, may have likewise been very central to him personally.⁷⁶ Thus while Phabongkha was undoubtedly extremely close to Shugden, he was one of at least several important protectors that Phabongkha propitiated.

Phabongkha's teachings on Vajrayoginī and Shugden were perhaps not intended for a mass audience, and would explain why he did not mention Vajrayoginī, traditionally considered a very secret practice, at the large gathering where he taught *Liberation in Your Hand*. Indeed the nature of the transmission of the Shugden life-entrustment and teachings themselves already place certain restrictions on the full-scale public diffusion of the practice. While the main rituals associated with the deity- the extensive and middle-length fulfillment rituals (*bskang chog*), like the fulfillment rituals of most other Gelug protectors, can be practiced on the basis of having received a Vajrabhairava initiation, in order to fully enter the practice of the approach, accomplishment and various activities (*bsnyen sgrub las gsum*) of the deity one must not only receive a Vajrabhairava initiation, but furthermore on the basis of that one must engage in a full retreat of serviceability (*las rung*), along with concluding practices such as a burning offering, receive the Shugden life-entrustment,

⁷⁶ Caturmukha Mahākāla is commonly known to have been one of Tulku Dragpa Gyaltzen's (*sprul ku grags pa rgyal mtshan*, 1619-1656) important protector deities and was also associated with Shugden in both the Sakya and Gelug traditions (interview, Lhasa, 2015). Dragpa Gyaltzen is the historical figure believed to have arisen as Shugden after his death. Indeed, a statue of Brahmārūpa continues to be displayed today next to the principal statue of Shugden at Lhasa's main Dorje Shugden temple, Trode Khangsar (*spro bde khang gсар*). While these links to Shugden do exist, this form of Mahākāla was also known to Tsongkhapa and indeed far pre-dates Shugden and the Gelug tradition as a whole, with its lineage rooted in India in both Gelug and Sakya traditions. Shugden has also been linked to a number of other mainstream Gelug deities such as Vajrabhairava and Mañjuśrī, of whom he is considered a manifestation of, as well as the protector Setrab, with whom he is said to have an affinity with.

keep all vows and pledges, and engage in any given practice commitments.⁷⁷ Although there is again nothing particularly different about this process when compared to other protectors, what is outstanding, however, is the nature of the life-entrustment of the deity, which can only be received by a group of a maximum of "a few" disciples.⁷⁸ Receiving the life-entrustment is of course important for a serious practitioner, but was clearly restricted, and those who were able to receive the Shugden life-entrustment from Phabongkha were thus largely restricted to his closer students, or small groups of followers. This tradition seems to have been closely followed by Trijang Rinpoche, as is apparent from his autobiography. Although Trijang Rinpoche mentions giving the life-entrustment several times, these were given to a maximum of three people at a time, often only one or two.⁷⁹

The guru-deity-protector trinity, which Dreyfus and Lopez state are embodied in Phabongkha, Vajrayoginī and Shugden, is largely a non-Gelug categorization. The guru, meditational deity (or *yidam*) and protector (*bla ma yi dam chos skyong*) or guru, meditational deity and ḍākinī (*bla ma yi dam mkha' 'gro*), both termed the "Three Roots" (*rtsa gsum*), are predominantly Nyingma tantric formulations of the common Three Jewels in which all Buddhists take refuge: buddha, dharma and sangha. Although also found in such refuge groupings in the Kagyu and Sakya traditions, these are generally related to treasure (*gter ma*) cycles and other Nyingma lineages transmitted by the teachers of the two former traditions. While mentions of the "guru, deity and protector" are found in some Gelug texts, these references are largely generic and do not usually specify the names of particular deities.⁸⁰ Indeed Phabongkha does note in one of his Shug-

⁷⁷ The procedure is given in pha bong kha, "shugs ldan gyi bsnyen sgrub las gsum gyi rnam gzahag dgos 'dod yid bzhin re skong phyogs las rnam par rgyal ba'i rgyal mtshan", pp. 543-544

⁷⁸ pha bong kha, "yid ches nor bu'i shing rta", p. 507, explicitly says "*re gnyis tsam*", which could also be interpreted as meaning "one or two". The text itself is sealed (*bka' rgya ma*), and warns that it must not be read by those without pure *samaya*.

⁷⁹ For one of these mentions see khri byang rin po che, "khrul snang sgyu ma'i zlos gar", p. 363. Here, in his autobiography, Trijang Rinpoche specifically notes that he gave the life-entrustment to groups of three monks at a time (*gsum tshan*).

⁸⁰ The most famous such mention in the Gelug tradition can be found in the *Guru Pūjā* (*bla ma mchod pa*): "You are the guru, you are the deity, you are the dakini and dharma protector" ("*khyod ni bla ma khyod ni yi dam khyod ni mkha' 'gro chos skyong ste*") and refers to one's guru in the visualized manifestation of Lama Lobsang Tubwang Dorjechang (*bla ma blo bzang thub dbang rdo rje 'chang*), a form of Tsongkhapa (*blo bzang chos kyi rgyal mtshan, zab lam bla ma mchod pa'i cho ga bde stong dbyer med ma*, p. 35). An example of a more exceptional case that does specify the specific figures identified as the guru, deity and protector is a daily practice text by Lobsang Tamdrin (*blo bzang rta mgrin*, 1867-1937) which

den works that all of one's meditational deities, gurus and protectors (Shugden included) should be viewed as indivisible, a common Tibetan Buddhist devotional belief which is widely practiced in the Gelug tradition as well.⁸¹ Although Shugden is also described by Phabongkha as a manifestation of the guru-deity (*bla ma yi dam sprul pa'i rgyal chen rdo rje shugs ldan*), the implied meaning is that Shugden is a manifestation of the wrathful form of Mañjuśrī, Vajrabhairava, who, as noted above, is also the deity used as the basis for engaging in the protector practice.⁸² Thus it is Vajrabhairava who is the deity-figure associated with Shugden practice by Phabongkha, not Vajrayoginī or even Cakrasaṃvara. Although my reading of Phabongkha's writings has been far from exhaustive due to the sheer magnitude of pages, so far I have not come across a single intentional or even suggested grouping of himself, Vajrayoginī and Shugden into one spiritual guru-deity-protector triad, or indeed into any prescribed "central" doctrinal set.

It would have been unlikely for Phabongkha to have promoted himself as the figurehead of this new trinity. The main guru yoga practices Phabongkha promoted, as is obvious from his *Collected Works*, were those of the *Guru Pūjā* and the *Hundred Deities of Tushita* which focus on Tsongkhapa as the embodiment of the guru- whether this be Phabongkha, Trijang Rinpoche, or any other teacher. There is no evidence that Phabongkha in any way promoted a personality cult focused solely on himself and we know that the vast majority of his eminent students, both lay and ordained, of whose lives we have some kind of record, received both sutra and tantra teachings from a number of teachers, not just Phabongkha.

The concept of Phabongkha having promoted a "new understanding" of the Gelug tradition, circled around the triad of himself, Vajrayoginī and Shugden, is unlikely. Instead he fortified several rarer teachings already present in the Gelug tradition by teaching and composing new textual materials, but certainly not at the cost of abandoning the format and focus of Tsongkhapa's original teachings. As can be gleaned from Phabongkha's *Collected Works*, he composed an array of important texts related to Tsongkhapa's teachings, most importantly those of the three principal meditational deities, but with a clear focus on Cakrasaṃvara and Vajrabhairava. Cakrasaṃvara

gives Tsongkhapa as the guru-figure, Vajrabhairava as the deity and Chamsing (Icam sring) as the protector ("bla ma yi dam chos skyong dbyer med kyi rnal 'byor rgyun 'khyer ma", pp. 71-74). Lobsang Tamdrin was a contemporary of Phabongkha and also composed a number of Shugden ritual texts.

⁸¹ pha bong kha, "shugs ldan gyi bsnyen sgrub las gsum gyi nnam gzhag dgos 'dod yid bzhin re skong phyogs las nnam par rgyal ba'i rgyal mtshan", p. 554.

⁸² pha bong kha, "nam par rgyal ba'i nga dbyangs", pp. 631-632.

appears to have been the deity that Phabongkha had the closest affinity with, which also explains his close affinity to the protector Caturmukha Mahākāla. His biography includes numerous accounts that highlight this relation, including a fantastical incident at a small monastery at Drangsong Sinpori (drang srong srin po ri), located in today's Gongkar County, known for its famous image of the deity (Fig.1), to which Phabongkha had come to offer a *gaṇacakra*.⁸³ Here Phabongkha had a vision of the wisdom beings (*ye shes kyi lha*) of Cakrasaṃvara actually entering the statue, followed by a subsequent flow of nectar ensuing from the statue's mouth. Phabongkha himself is also often referred to in writing as "Heruka", a commonly used name of Cakrasaṃvara, for example in the title of his biography where he is referred to as "Heruka, All-Pervasive Lord of the Ocean of Mandalas and [Buddha] Families (*rigs dang dkyil 'khor rgya mtsho'i khyab bdag he ru ka.*)".⁸⁴

According to one account, Rilbur Tulku stated that Phabongkha himself confirmed that his main practice, on which he spent four hours daily, was none other than the *Guru Pūjā*, performed according to the Cakrasaṃvara rendition mentioned earlier.⁸⁵ The *Guru Pūjā*, a guru yoga text composed by Lobsang Chokyi Gyaltzen (blo bzang chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 1570-1662), the First Panchen Lama, focusing on the form of Tsongkhapa as the embodiment of one's guru(s), combines the practices of all three principal meditational deities. The centrality of Cakrasaṃvara as Phabongkha's principal deity practice has been confirmed by another of his direct students as well, noting that Phabongkha's principal practice was the Stages of the Path teachings and his main deity practice was that of the Cakrasaṃvara body mandala.⁸⁶ The practice of the Cakrasaṃvara *Guru Pūjā*, which includes a special aspirational Stages of the Path prayer by Lobsang Chokyi Gyaltzen, thus combines both of these practices.

Phabongkha was, in a sense, a true heir to the illustrious Lobsang Chokyi Gyaltzen's tradition and the Ganden Hearing Lineage, a Gelug oral transmission lineage that both teachers are considered to have been principal lineage holders of. Even more essentially, Phabongkha is commonly believed to have been the possessor of the *Ganden Emanation Scripture* (*dga' ldan sprul pa'i legs bam*), as was

⁸³ ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje, *tshans pa'i dbyans sñan*, Vol. 1 of 2, p. 368. The site is also commonly known as Demchog Sinpori (bde mchog srin po ri). The statue itself is said to come from India and the mountain behind the monastery is considered sacred to Cakrasaṃvara.

⁸⁴ Ibid., p. 5.

⁸⁵ David Gonsalez, "Translator's Preface", p. 5.

⁸⁶ Anonymous student of Phabongkha (interview, 2014).

Chokyi Gyaltsen.⁸⁷ The *Emanation Scripture* is believed to be a manifestation of Mañjuśrī in the form of a mystic and invisible book, containing all the essential teachings passed on to Tsongkhapa by the bodhisattva, and can only be held and seen by the holders of the Ganden Hearing Lineage, beginning with Tsongkhapa. Chokyi Gyaltsen himself, for example, is said to have been the first person to write down a set of oral instructions on Mahāmudrā passed down in a unique Gelug lineage from Tsongkhapa, which the latter received directly from the bodhisattva Mañjuśrī. The actual words of the text composed by Chokyi Gyaltsen are believed to have originated from the *Emanation Scripture*. The Ganden Hearing Lineage thus maintains that the teachings of not only the Gelug Mahāmudrā, but other important texts like the *Guru Pūjā* not only represent the teachings and lineage of Tsongkhapa, but that they were drawn by Chokyi Gyaltsen from this mystic text.

Phabongkha was certainly not unique in the Gelug tradition in promoting practices with questionable links to Tsongkhapa's original teachings. Roger Jackson has noted that based on the textual material that he was able to examine, we can not currently attribute the source of the lineage of transmission of the Gelug Mahāmudrā to Tsongkhapa, and that the instructions which were written down by Chokyi Gyaltsen in the form of *The Principal Path of the Victors: A Root Text of the Precious Geden Oral Lineage of Mahāmudrā* (*dge ldan bka' brgyud rin po che'i phyag chen rtsa ba rgyal ba'i gzhung lam*), may well have a later origin.⁸⁸ This also calls into question the lineage of a number of other works by Chokyi Gyaltsen drawn from the Ganden Hearing Lineage, such as the *Guru Pūjā*, which are similarly traced to Tsongkhapa, and ultimately to Mañjuśrī, or his manifestation as the *Emanation Scripture*. Thus there is no empirical evidence that a number of central teachings or practices accepted universally as important or even central in the Gelug tradition, originate from Tsongkhapa and it could even be argued that previous Gelug lineage holders like Chokyi Gyaltsen were even more innovative than Phabongkha, as were countless other teachers from the various Tibetan sects.

⁸⁷ For more on the *Emanation Scripture* see Jan Willis, *Enlightened Beings: Life Stories from the Ganden Oral Tradition*, pp. 161-162.

⁸⁸ Jackson, Roger R., "The dGe ldan-bKa' brgyud Tradition of Mahāmudrā: How Much dGe ldan? How much bKa' brgyud?", p. 181. Here "dGe ldan" refers to the Gelug oral transmission lineage. See *Ibid.*, p. 165 for other interpretations of the title.

Conclusion

Geoffrey Samuel observes that “P’awongk’a’s influence was strongest after his death and that of the 13th Dalai Lama, and particularly after the forced resignation of the regent Reting (Ratreng) Rimpoch’e in 1941 and his replacement by Tagtrag Rimpoch’e, who had been a close associate of P’awongk’a”.⁸⁹ He further notes that it was from then on that the students of Phabongkha gradually managed to obtain a dominant status within the Gelug tradition, which lasted up until the 1970s/80s. Although it is not the aim of this article to trace the development of this lineage, I would like to suggest that the emphasis on Shugden and Vajrayoginī continued to grow during this period, with select aspects of Phabongkha’s original teachings becoming conflated, whether intentionally or not, especially in the last quarter of the twentieth century with the emergence of the controversy surrounding the deity.

Phabongkha certainly considered his relationship with Shugden as being extremely close. However, he never promoted Shugden as the sole protector of Tsongkhapa’s tradition. If he had truly put tremendous importance on the diffusion of the practice, it could be argued that he would have composed far more texts himself over the years, instead of leaving a large amount of the work to his student. Instead it appears that Phabongkha’s few Shugden works were composed over a period of around fifteen years or so—more than enough time to compose a larger body of work. As was mentioned above, *The Melodious Drum* was composed in the mid- to late-1920s and the life-entrustment ritual text resulted from Phabongkha’s meeting with Tagphu Dorjechang in Nagshoe in 1935. Out of the Shugden works that he himself composed, the middling fulfillment ritual [7.15] was composed in 1930 and *The Victory Banner Thoroughly Victorious in All Directions* [7.13], was composed in 1939, not long before Phabongkha’s death.⁹⁰ It is clear that Phabongkha himself only wrote the basic texts of the practice, drawing from an already existent tradition. An exception to this is, however, the *Preliminaries for the Life-Entrustment of Shugden* [7.12], which appears to have been compiled by Trijang Rinpoche and scribed by Denma Lobsang Dorje based on Phabongkha’s teachings, yet included in Phabongkha’s *Collected Works*.⁹¹

⁸⁹ Samuel, Geoffrey, *Civilized Shamans: Buddhism in Tibetan Societies*, p. 546.

⁹⁰ pha bong kha, *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum*, Vol. 7, pp. 609, 687.

⁹¹ Although this is the case, clearly this work was included into this corpus and not Trijang Rinpoche’s *Collected Works*, suggesting that the work was considered fit to be attributed directly to Phabongkha and not to Trijang Rinpoche, most likely as

What took place then, was a gradual growth of the Shugden practice, beginning with Tagphu Pemavajra's pure vision, on which Phabongkha based his own select compositions and teachings, and which, in turn, Trijang Rinpoche expanded. Likewise, whatever his motivation for doing so, although teaching on and composing a number of important works on Vajrayoginī, Phabongkha did not emphasise the practice anymore than previous eminent teachers like Tuken, and was thus drawing from an already existent tradition in the Gelug lineage. There is currently no evidence to suggest that any emphasis placed on Vajrayoginī was aimed at de-centralizing the practices of the three main deities prescribed by Tsongkhapa (Guhyasamāja, Vajrabhairava and Cakrasaṃvara), or to designate her as the main deity practice of a guru-deity-protector triad. Indeed Phabongkha's emphasis on Vajrabhairava and Cakrasaṃvara demonstrate the variety he was inclined to. Similarly, he did not aim at replacing the practices of popular Gelug protectors with that of Dorje Shugden. Shugden was certainly not the only protector that Phabongkha propitiated, as has been demonstrated above, and was not even included amongst the enlightened beings in well-known depictions of the *Guru Pūjā* assembly field (*tshogs zhing*) used today, which trace their layout to Phabongkha.⁹² Vajrayoginī however is included, although she can also be found in a number of different renditions of the *Guru Pūjā* assembly field that pre-date Phabongkha's arrangement (Fig.2 and 3). Furthermore at the moment there isn't sufficient textual evidence to support the suggestion of a reinvention of Gelug tradition by Phabongkha, although he did help to create the conditions for this to eventually happen.

The growing popularity of Dorje Shugden was undoubtedly aided by the composition and printing of Trijang Rinpoche's texts on the practice, which represented a major portion of the growing body of works on the protector.⁹³ Trijang Rinpoche's writings clearly com-

it was considered a true record of an oral teaching of Phabongkha's. pha bong kha, "rgyal chen srog gtad kyi sngon 'gro bshad pa'i mtshams sbyor kha skong", p. 540.

⁹² Today it is possible to find depictions of the assembly field that include Shugden, however these post-date Phabongkha, and to my knowledge, even Trijang Rinpoche. For an oral description of the layout of this assembly field by pha bong kha, *nam grol lag bcangs*, pp. 192-203.

⁹³ The numerous well-known teachers who contributed to this include figures such as the Tenth Panchen Lama Chokyi Gyaltsen (chos kyi rgyal mtshan, 1938-1989), who composed a fulfillment ritual (bskang chog) to the deity and his five families (blo bzang 'phrin las lhun grub chos kyi rgyal mtshan, "jam mgon rgyal ba'i bstan srung rdo rje shugs ldan rig lnga drag po rtsal gyi bskang chog las bzhi lhun gyis 'grub pa'i sgra dbyangs", pp. 55-98), adding to the growing corpus of text on this deity.

plement Phabongkha's works but it appears from his autobiography that he was not responsible for any wider or more public dissemination of the practice. Indeed, as has been noted, Trijang Rinpoche was selective in his conferral of Shugden life-entrustments and teachings, suggesting that the wider popularization of the practice appears to have been undertaken by some of his direct students.

Following Trijang Rinpoche's Shugden works, perhaps the most important are those of Zemey Rinpoche Lobsang Palden Tenzin Yargye (dze smad rin po che blo bzang dpal ldan bstan 'dzin yar rgyas, 1927-1996), who further composed several texts on the deity, such as retreat instructions, praises, and of course the infamous 1975 *Sacred Words of the Competent Father-Guru* (*pha rgod bla ma'i zhal lung*), more commonly known as the *Yellow Book*, which caused an uproar due to its sectarian, primarily anti-Nyingma, accounts that subsequently led to the current controversy over the deity.⁹⁴ *Sacred Words*, according to Zemey Rinpoche, was composed based on incidental oral accounts heard from Trijang Rinpoche.⁹⁵ It is important to note that by this time the cult of Shugden was in the early stages of becoming internationally diffused to a growing mass of devotees by Phabongkha's, and especially Trijang Rinpoche's students. As with all living traditions, it continued to evolve. Despite the emphasis placed on an exacting transmission of teachings in all sects of Tibetan Buddhism, there is a tendency for new interpretations, additions, commentaries and other texts to be added to the lineage over time. One cannot however expect the current living tradition to represent fully the intent of its originators.

It is possible that due to the current controversy surrounding Shugden, an even greater polarization has occurred where the most exceptional features of Phabongkha's teachings and his lineage, i.e. those of Vajrayoginī and Dorje Shugden, have been emphasized by all sides of the debate to demonstrate either how much he pushed an extremist pro-Gelug agenda while nonetheless departing from established Gelug tradition, or to demonstrate how he was instead a visionary teacher, promoting the Gelug tradition through his emphasis on a selection of efficacious practices that find their source, one way or another, with Tsongkhapa.

Phabongkha's works were very multifaceted, to the extent that a variety of different approaches and interpretations were and continue to be extracted from his teachings by his direct and indirect fol-

⁹⁴ See blo bzang dpal ldan bstan 'dzin yar rgyas, "mthu dang stobs kyis che ba'i bstan srung chen po rdo rje shugs ldan rtsal gyi byung ba brjod pa pha rgod bla ma'i zhal gyi bdud rtsi'i chu khur brtsegs shing 'jigs rung glog zhags 'gyur ba'i sprin nag 'khrugs pa'i nga ro zhes bya ba bzhus so", pp. 571-650.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 577.

lowers. The almost exclusive devotion to Vajrayoginī and Shugden by some appears to have developed after Phabongkha's death and is an example of this type of selective interpretation. Today the presentation of Phabongkha's complete lineage on both sides of the Shugden debate are arguably often departures from Phabongkha's own original tradition, either because of their complete exclusion of the deity, or by an over-emphasis on certain aspect of Phabongkha's teachings to the detriment of others. This type of over-emphasis on certain aspects is most obvious in relation to Dorje Shugden and Vajrayoginī, which today are synonymous with Phabongkha's legacy, much to the detriment of his other works. Likewise it will simply not do to categorize an emphasis on a simple guru-Vajrayoginī-Shugden triad as being representative of Phabongkha's intentions.

Although Phabongkha did not promote a Phabongkha-Vajrayoginī-Shugden triad, the conception that he did clearly emerged. It is important to note that no Gelug teacher who was a direct student of Phabongkha appears to have grouped or presented Phabongkha, Vajrayoginī and Shugden together as one central doctrinal practice. Trijang Rinpoche taught and passed on the Vajrayoginī and Shugden cycles numerous times, yet in his works there is nothing to suggest that his view and treatment of Phabongkha was anything more than what would result from the usual dynamic between a guru and student. Phabongkha was certainly not elevated to a position in which he displaced Tsongkhapa as the guru-figure of the Gelug tradition.⁹⁶

This conception of a Phabongkha-Vajrayoginī-Shugden triad appears to have taken place during the latter half of the twentieth century and is not traceable to Phabongkha or even to Trijang Rinpoche. It is possible that the designation of this systematic three-fold grouping as the central facet of Phabongkha's teachings by modern scholars and others, may have been informed to a certain extent by the modern praxis of some of the pro-Shugden followers of Phabongkha's lineage, especially the New Kadampa Tradition – International Kadampa Buddhist Union (NKT-IKBU), who David N. Kay notes, "formulate the Buddhist path in terms of the dictum 'one guru, one *yidam* and one Dharma-protector'", and who strongly emphasize the practices of Vajrayoginī and Shugden within this framework.⁹⁷ A

⁹⁶ Although Georges Dreyfus suggests that Phabongkha elevated himself to the position of the guru-figure of the Gelug tradition (Dreyfus, "The Shuk-Den Affair", p. 246) Simon Daisley is even more explicit and interprets Dreyfus' statement as specifically meaning that Phabongkha replaced Tsongkhapa (Daisley, *Exorcising Luther*, p. 163).

⁹⁷ David N. Kay, *Tibetan and Zen Buddhism in Britain: Transplantation, Development and Adaption*, 2004, p. 100. The NKT-IKBU is headed by a student of Trijang

recent publication by the Dolgyal Shugden Research Society does exactly this, rather arbitrarily suggesting that the NKT-IKBU "mirrors clearly" Phabongkha's teachings due to their focus on the guru-deity-protector triad.⁹⁸

The conferring of Shugden initiations, or life-entrustments, to large gatherings of people, instead of a small group of select disciples, is not uncommon today in both Tibet and abroad, and the complete exclusion of other central practices such as Vajrabhairava from the ritual repertoire by some teachers are symptoms demonstrating drastic changes in the tradition espoused by Phabongkha.⁹⁹ Vajrabhairava, after all, was not only one of Tsongkhapa's main practices, but self-generation (*bdag bskyed*) as the deity was prescribed by Phabongkha as the basis for propitiating Shugden. Thus it is important to note that the most popular presentations of Phabongkha's lineage amongst pro- and anti-Shugden groups both in Tibetan communities and amongst large Gelug or Gelug-derived organizations in the west follow selective transmissions of Phabongkha's teachings and thus most cannot be taken to be representative of Phabongkha or even

Rinpoche, Geshe Kelsang Gyatso (dge bshes bkal bzang rgya mtsho, 1931-). Geshe Kelsang Gyatso, *Heart Jewel: The Essential Practices of Kadampa Buddhism*, p. 90, mentions that "Many sadhanas of Dorje Shugdän state that Dorje Shugdän is the embodiment of the 'Guru, Yidam and Protector'", although no sources are listed. The explanation given by Kelsang Gyatso to this line states that the guru refers to Tsongkhapa, and that Shugden is the embodiment of all dharma protectors. Although not stated in this specific explanation, the meditational deities within this NKT-IKBU triad are Cakrasamvara and especially Vajrayogini, as are clear from Kelsang Gyatso's numerous other writings. Tsongkhapa, in turn, is meant to be viewed as the embodiment of one's own guru, in this case Kelsang Gyatso. This presentation of the triad has been interpreted by at least some of Kelsang Gyatso's students to be representative of Phabongkha's views, as one follower writes on a blog created "for the benefit of Kadampa Buddhist practitioners" ("Purpose of this Website" in *Dorje Shugden Debate*): "One of Je Phabongkha's principal innovations was to reduce our Deity practice into the threefold: Guru (Je Tsongkhapa), Yidam (Heruka or Vajrayogini) and Protector (Dorje Shugden)" ("Claim: Dorje Shugden was not taught by Je Tsongkhapa" in *Dorje Shugden Debate*).

⁹⁸ The Dolgyal Shugden Research Society, *Dolgyal Shugden: A History*, pp. 142-143.

⁹⁹ Amongst its many amendments to the tradition as it was received from Trijang Rinpoche, the conferral of mass Shugden initiations as well as the exclusion of the practices of Guhyasamāja, Vajrabhairava and Cittamani Tārā are also facets of the NKT-IKBU, who nevertheless maintain that that they follow the "pure tradition" of Tsongkhapa, Phabongkha and Trijang Rinpoche. The term "pure tradition" is used commonly in material published by the NKT, see, for example, Geshe Kelsang Gyatso, *Heart Jewel*, p. vii. Non-tantric deviations from mainstream Gelug practice include, for example, a unique NKT-IKBU monastic ordination lineage, as noted on the NKT-IKBU website: "The way of granting ordination within the NKT tradition was designed by Geshe Kelsang Gyatso" (NKT-IKBU, *Modern Kadampa Buddhism*, 2014).

Trijang Rinpoche's original or complete corpus of works and instructions. This is not to be regarded as a criticism of these groups as the selective interpretation and practice of transmission lineages, as well as their continual modification, has existed throughout Tibetan Buddhist history. It is, however, important not to impose current trends in Tibetan Buddhist practice onto our attempts to understand the past.

Evolution and changes in lineage teachings and practice take place naturally and continuously, and certainly do not invalidate a tradition, yet it is imperative to notice what changes have taken place. In the end, the results of these misconceptions about Phabongkha's central teachings form a distorted image of this important figure, causing him to be misrepresented instead of remembered for his most famous teachings, such as those on the Stages of the Path genre. Even in terms of tantric teachings and practice, the number of his works on the three main Gelug meditational deities outweighs those on Vajrayoginī or Dorje Shugden, and the focus of his own practice, disregarding what his students practiced, appears to have been on these as well, with specific attention on Cakrasaṃvara.

Although future research may necessitate a review of the interpretations expressed in this article, we can certainly say that Phabongkha presented and authored a far richer variety of works and practices than he is given credit for. Current interpretations of his legacy, which are often highly selective, owe more to later lineage descendants than to him. These interpretations then contribute to the divisive discourse we see today without, perhaps, carefully looking back at Phabongkha's actual writings. Indeed the contents of Phabongkha's *Collected Works* speak for themselves in terms of the variety of subjects, deities and practices towards which he was inclined.



Appendix

The Contents of the Eleven-Volume Lhasa Edition of Phabongkha's *Collected Works*, Together with the Contents of the Twelfth Volume as Found in the Potala Collection

For the sake of brevity, the titles listed below follow those given in the contents pages at the beginning of each volume in the set (pha bong kha. *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s.n., 199-.) and those listed by the TBRC [W3834]. For this reason the titles do not always exactly match the

full titles given in the footnotes and body of the article above, or those given in the bibliography, which generally follow those listed on the title pages of the individual works. As Vol. 11 is a single work, the full title of the text is given.

Preference has been given for the TBRC's listing as it is easily accessible and often more extensive, especially as Vol. 10, for example, has no printed listing of contents. Any important discrepancies between the order and contents of the TBRC's listings and those of the contents pages of the Lhasa edition volumes, as well as the catalogue to the Potala edition are noted in square brackets.

In several cases I have expanded the bibliographical titles, usually by incorporating sections of the full headings as presented on the title pages of the individual works, with the additions in question also enclosed in square brackets. The contents of the twelfth volume are also listed following the presentation given in the catalogue to the Potala's edition.

Vol. 1 (ka)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Ka*
pha bong ka pa'i gsung 'bum pod kha pa'i dkar chag/

1. A Compilation of Only Initiations Drawn from Phabongkha's Records of Received Teachings

pha bong kha pa'i gsan yig las dbang rkyang gi skor phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

2. A Compilation of Combined Initiations and Instructions Drawn from Phabongkha's Records of Received Teachings

pha bong kha pa'i gsan yig las dbang khrid sbrag ma'i skor phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

3. A Compilation of Various Oral Transmissions and Instructions Drawn from Phabongkha's Records of Received Teachings

pha bong kha pa'i gsan yig las lung khrid sna tshogs skor phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

4. A Compilation of Only Oral Transmissions Drawn from Phabongkha's Records of Received Teachings

pha bong kha pa'i gsan yig las lung rkyang gi skor phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

Vol. 2 (kha)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Kha*
pha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod kha pa'i dkar chag/

1. A Compilation of Permission Initiations Drawn from Phabongkha's Records of Received Teachings
pha bong kha pa'i gsan yig las rjes gnang skor phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

2. A Compilation of Text-collections Drawn from Phabongkha's Records of Received Teachings
pha bong kha pa'i gsan yig las be'u bum skor phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

3. The Method for Practicing the Yoga of the *Guru Pūjā* with Cakrasamvara: A Ritual Arranged for Convenient Recitation
bla ma mchod pa 'khor lo sdom pa dang 'brel ba'i rnal 'byor nyams su len tshul gyi cho ga nag 'gros su bkod pa/

4. The Method for Practicing the *Guru Pūjā* with Bhairava: A Recitation Ritual Arranged for Convenient Recitation
bla ma mchod pa 'jigs byed dang 'brel bar nyams su len tshul gyi 'don chog nag 'gros su bkod pa/

5. A Festival of Emanations: A Skillful Ritual Arrangement for the Extensive Way of Taking the Four Initiations According to the Hearing Lineage
snyan brgyud dbang bzhi rgyas pa len tshul gyi chog sgrigs thabs mkhas 'phrul gyi dga' ston/

6. The Image of the Everlasting Vajra: The Way of Offering a Long-life Accomplishment Ritual Through the *Guru Pūjā: Indivisible Bliss and Emptiness*, Combined with the Long-life Practice of the Drubgyal Tradition
bla ma mchod pa bde stong dbyer med ma dang grub rgyal lugs kyi tshe sgrub sbrags ma'i sgo nas brtan bzhugs 'bul tshul rtag brtan rdo rje'i re khA/

7. A Compilation of Guru Yoga Texts [such as the *Treasury of All Desired Blessings-Guru Yoga*, and Others]
bla ma'i rnal 'byor [byin rlabs 'dod dgu'i gter mdzod sogs bla ma'i rnal 'byor gyi rim pa] phyogs gcig tu bsgrigs pa/

8. A Compilation of Lineage Guru Supplication Texts and so forth.
bla brgyud gsol 'debs sogs kyi skor phyogs gcig tu bsgrigs pa/

9. The Storehouse of Precious Treasure: The Way of Practicing the Yoga of *Ganden Lhagyama* According to the Precious Oral Pith Instructions of the Hearing Lineage

dga' ldan lha brgya ma'i rnal 'byor nyams su len tshul snyan brgyud zhal shes man ngag rin chen gter gyi bang mdzod/

10. The Ganden Lhagyama Guru Yoga, [Drawn from the Pith Instructions of the Ganden Hearing Lineage].

[dge ldan snyan brgyud kyi man ngag las byung ba'i] bla ma'i rnal 'byor dga' ldan lha brgya ma/

11. The Staircase for the Fortunate to Travel to Tuṣita: An Instruction Manual for the Recitation-ritual of Consciousness-transference Based on the *Ganden Lhagyama*

dga' ldan lha brgya ma'i 'pho khrid 'don chog skal bzang dga' ldan bgrad pa'i them skas/

12. Fruits of the Wish-fulfilling Divine Tree Which Give Rise to the Two Accomplishments: Notes on Experiential Instructions on *The Way to Rely on a Spiritual Guide*

bshes gnyen bsten tshul myong khrid zin bris grub gnyis 'dod 'jo'i dpag bsam yongs 'du'i snye ma/

13. Notes on the *Graduated Stages of the Tantric Path* [Taken During a Transmission from the Venerable Lama Chone Pandita]

[rje btsun bla ma co ne paN+Di ta rin po che'i zhal snga nas/] sngags rim chen mo'i [bshad lung nos skabs kyi gsung] zin bris/

14. An Amazing Feast of Nectar: Notes of Guidance for Drubde Gegye Thegchog Ling

sgrub sde dge rgyas theg mchog gling gi bca' yig ngo mtshar bdud rtsi'i dga' ston/

Vol. 3 (ga)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Ga*
pha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod ga pa'i dkar chag/

1. A Collection of Notes on Both the Guhyasamāja Generation Stage *Ocean of Accomplishment* and the Completion Stage *Lamp that Illuminates the Five Stages*, Arranged Together

*gsang 'dus bskyed rim dngos grub rgya mtsho dang rdzogs rim rim lnga
gsal sgron gnyis kyi zin tho 'ga' zhig phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/*

2. The Supreme Festival: A Condensed Sādhana of the Ārya Tradition of Guhyasamāja

'dus pa 'phags lugs kyi sgrub thabs mdor bsdus mchog gi dga' ston/

3. Victory Over Māra: The Sādhana of Solitary Hero Bhairava, Conveniently Arranged for Recitation

*'jigs byed dpa' bo gcig pa'i sgrub thabs bdud las rnam rgyal gyi ngag 'don
nag 'gros su bkod pa/*

4. The Way to Practice the Succinctly Condensed Self-generation of the Terrifying Solitary Hero

'jigs mdzad dpa' bo gcig pa'i bdag bskyed cung bsdus te nyams su len tshul/

5. The Extremely Condensed Sādhana of Solitary Hero Bhairava Together with an Extremely Condensed Self-entry

*'jigs byed dpa' bo gcig pa'i sgrub thabs shin tu bsdus dang bdag 'jug shin tu
bsdus pa/*

[This work is not listed in the Potala edition's catalogue]

6. The Method for Engaging in the Approximation Retreat of Serviceability of Solitary Hero Bhairava, [Uncommon] Notes on the *Great Retreat of the Solitary Hero* [by Amdo Deyang Rinpoche], and Notes on *The Wrathful Distribution of the Sixty-Four Torma Offerings*

*'jigs byed dpa' bo gcig pa'i las rung gi bsnyen pa bya tshul dang / dpa' gcig
gi bsnyen chen zin tho [thun mong ma yin pa a mdo bde yangs rin po ches
mdzad pa]/ drug cu ma drag bsngos kyi zin tho bcas/*

7. Compiled Notes from the Transmission of the Cakrasaṃvara Tantra's *Total Illumination of the Hidden Meaning* and the Generation Stage of Kālacakra

*'khor lo sdom pa'i rgyud 'grel sbas don kun gsal gyi bshad lung dang / dus
'khor gyi bskyed rim phyag zin thor bu bcas/*

8. The Swift Path to Great Bliss: The Lineage Prayer of the Ghaṇṭapāda Tradition of Cakrasaṃvara and Thoroughly Increasing Great Bliss: The Sādhanā of the Ghaṇṭapāda Tradition of the [Bhagavān] Cakrasaṃvara [Body Mandala]

*dril bu lugs kyi 'khor lo sdom pa'i bla brgyud gsol 'debs bde chen nye lam
dang/ [dril bu zhabs lugs kyi bcom ldan 'das] 'khor lo sdom pa'i lus dkyil
gyi mngon rtogs bde chen rab 'phel/*

9. The Continuous Rain of Camphor that Compassionately Cleanses the Stains of Downfalls: The Vase Generation of the [Bhagavān] Cakrasaṃvara Body Mandala [in the Tradition of Mahāsiddha Ghaṅṭapāda] and the Brief Self-entry

[grub chen dril bu zhabs lugs bcom ldan 'das] 'khor lo sdom pa'i lus dkyil gyi bum bskyed dang bdag 'jug mdor bsdus nyes ltung dri ma 'khrud pa'i thugs rje'i ga pur char rgyun/

10. A Compiled Ritual for the Great Approximation Retreat Based on the Cakrasaṃvara Body Mandala, Arranged for Oral Recitation.

'khor lo sdom pa lus dkyil gyi gzhi bsnyen chen mo'i bsnyen sgrub sbrags ma'i cho ga bklag chog tu bkod pa/

11. The Festival of Highest Virtue: The Method for Engaging in the Oral Recitation Ritual of External Offerings in Dependence on the [Bhagavān] Cakrasaṃvara Body Mandala [in the Tradition of Mahāsiddha Ghaṅṭapāda]

[grub chen dril bu zhabs lugs bcom ldan 'das] 'khor lo sdom pa lus dkyil la brten pa'i phyi rol mchod pa bya tshul gyi 'don chog bsod nams mchog gi dga' ston/

12. Offering Clouds of the Vajra Body: A Tea Offering of Cakrasaṃvara

'khor lo sdom pa'i ja mchod rdo rje'i lus kyi mchod sprin/

13. [Drop of Essential Nectar of the Hearing Lineage: The Pith Instructions for the Way to Practice the White Long-life Deity Cakrasaṃvara,] a Long-life Accomplishment Ritual Sealed in Secrecy.

[sbyor bde mchog tshe lha dkar po dang sbrags ten nyams su len tshul gyi man ngag snyan brgyud bdud rtsi'i thig le/] tshe sgrub bka' rgyal/

14. The Good Vase of Immortal Nectar: The Way of Performing a Long-life Offering Ritual to a Great Being Based on the White Long-life Deity Cakrasaṃvara, Combined Together with the Repellence of the Dakinis

bde mchog tshe lha dkar po'i sgo nas [yul khyad par can la] zhabs brtan 'bul tshul mkha' 'gro bsun bzlog [dang bcas pa 'chi med bdud rtsi'i bum bzang/]

15. The Hook Which Summons Attainments: The Gaṇacakra Offering of the White Long-life Deity Cakrasaṃvara

bde mchog tshe lha dkar po'i tshogs mchod dngos grub 'gugs pa'i lcags kyu/

16. Garland of Cittamani: The Pith Instructions for the Yogas of the Two Stages of Khadiravani Tārā

seng ldeng nags kyi sgrol ma'i lam rim pa gnyis kyi rnal 'byor nyams len gyi man ngag tsit+ta ma Ni'i do shall

17. Offering of the 'Explanatory' Torma on the Occasion of Teachings on the Two Stages of Guhyasamāja, Vajrabhairava and Cakrasamvara, Together with the Unmistaken Offering of the Illusory Body

gsang bde 'jigs gsum gyi rim gnyis bka' khrid skabs 'grel gtor 'bul tsul skor dang / sgyu lus mchod pa sogs kyi phyag bzhes 'khrul med/

Vol. 4 (nga)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. NGA*

pha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod nga pa'i dkar chag

1. Swift Path to Great Bliss: The Uncommon Sādhanā of [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod kyi sgrub thabs thun min bde chen nye lam/

2. The Way for Meditating on an Abbreviated Version of the *Swift Path to Great Bliss* sādhanā of [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod kyi sgrub thabs bde chen nye lam las bsdus te bsgom tshul/

3. Festival of Great Bliss: The Mandala Ritual of Queen [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i dkyi 'khor gyi cho ga bde chen dga' ston/

4. A Staircase for the Fortunate to Travel to Kechara: The Practice of the Approximation, Accomplishment and Activities of Queen [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i bsnyen sgrub las gsum gyi lag len skal bzang mkha' spyod bgrod pa'i them skas/

5. The Messenger Invoking the Hundred Blessings of the Vajra: The Ritual Text to be Recited as a Preliminary to the [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari Approximation Retreat Together with Notes on the Ritual Practiced During the Approximation and the Way to Practice the Long, Middling and Brief "Tenth-day" Offerings

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod ma'i bsnyen pa'i sngon 'gro'i 'don cha bklaḡ chog zur du bkol ba rdo rje'i byin brgya 'beb pa'i pho nya dang/ bsnyen pa 'dug skabs kyi phyag len dang cho ga'i zin tho/ tshes bcu rgyas 'bring bsdus pa bya tshul/

6. Fulfilling the Wish for Attainments: The Peaceful Burning Offering of Queen [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i sgo nas zhi ba'i sbyin sreg bya tshul dngos grub 'dod 'jo/

7. Swift Invocation of Attainments: The Way of Relying on and Practicing the Invocation of the Worldly God Agni to the Hearth in Dependence on Vajrayoginī Naro Kechari

rdo rje rnal 'byor ma nA ro mkha' spyod ma la brten nas 'jig rten pa'i me lha thab tu 'gugs pa'i bsnyen pa bya tshul dngos grub myur 'gugs/

8. Offerings and Gifts Pleasing the Rishis: The Way of Practicing the Tenth-part Burning Offering in Relation to the Approximation Retreat for the Invocation of the Worldly God Agni to the Hearth, in Dependence on Vajrayoginī Naro Kechari

rdo rje rnal 'byor ma nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i sgo nas 'jig rten pa'i me lha thab tu 'gugs pa'i bsnyen pa'i bcu cha'i sbyin sreg bya tshul drang srong dgyes pa'i mchod sbyin/

9. [The Point of Entry to Kechara Pure Land:] A Recitation Text for the Sindhura Ritual, or Approximation and Accomplishment of Queen [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo la brten pa'i sin+d+hU ra'i sgrub pa'am bsnyen sgrub sbrags ma'i 'don sgrigs [mkha' spyod zhing gi 'jug ngos/]

10. The Meaningful Magical Lasso: The Tenth-part Burning Offering of the [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari Approximation Retreat

[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i bsnyen pa'i bcu cha chen mo'i sbyin sreg don yon 'phrul gyi zhags pa/

11. The Uncommon Golden Dharma: The Pith Instructions for Journeying to Kechara

mkha' spyod bgrod pa'i man ngag gser chos thun min zhal shes chig brgyud ma/

12. Festival of Uncontaminated Joy: The Short Gaṇacakra Offering of Queen [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari

*[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i tshogs mchod mdor
bsdus zag med dgyes rgu'i dga' ston/*

13. The Magical Ritual of Skillful Means: The Way of Performing the Sesame Seed Burning Offering of Vajrayoginī which Purifies All Negativities Without Remainder and The Cloud of Offerings of Virtuous Skillful Means-Food Offering

*rdo rje rnal 'byor ma'i sgo nas til gyi sbyin sreg bya tshul sdig ltung lhag
med spyod pa'i thabs mkhas 'phrul gyi cho ga dang/ zas mchod thabs mkhas
bsod nams mchod sprin/*

14. The Iron Hook of Compassion: The Transference of the Solitary Mother, Together with the Way of Performing the Hand Offering

*yum rkyang gi 'pho ba myur 'dren thugs rje'i lcags kyu dang/ lag mchod
bya tshul/*

15. The Painted Mandala Initiation Ritual of the Eleven-Faced Avalokiteśvara of the Palmo Tradition [Arranged in a Straightforward Manner, which is Similar to the Mandala-rite of the Supreme Victor, The Great Seventh [Dalai Lama]]

*thugs rje chen po bcu gcig zhal dpal mo lugs kyi ras bris kyi dkyil 'khor du
dbang bskur ba'i cho ga [rgyal mchog bdun pa chen po'i dkyil chog ltar nag
'gros su bkod pa/]*

16. Some Notes on Madhyamaka and on Transmissions of the Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra and Madhyamakāvatāra

*mdo rgyan sbyar ba'i bshad lung dang dbu ma la 'jug pa/ dbu ma'i brjed
byang nyung ngu/*

17. Notes on *The Essence of True Eloquence*

drang nges legs bshad snying po'i zin bris/

18. Fragmentary notes on *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*

byang chub sems dpa'i spyod pa la 'jug pa zhes bya ba bka' mchan thor bu/

19. *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* Outline

spyod 'jug sa bcad/

20. *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra* Notes

spyod 'jug zin bris/

Vol. 5 (ca)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Chapha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod ca pa'i dkar chag/*

1. Recollective Notes on the *Four Interwoven Annotations of the Lamrim Chenmo*

lam rim chen mo mchan bu bzhi sbrags kyi skor dran gso'i bsnyel byang/

2. [Chariot of the Mahāyāna:] The Way of Practicing the Jorchoe-preliminaries of the Stages of the Path to Enlightenment

byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i sngon 'gro sbyor chos nyams su len tshul [theg mchog 'phrul gyi shing rta/]

3. The Excellent Path of the Victors: A Compiled Jorchoe Recitation for the Central Tibetan Lineage's Extensive Commentarial Tradition of the Essential Lamrim Instructions of the *The Sacred Words of Mañjuśrī*

lam rim dmar khrid 'jam dpal zhal lung gi khrid rgyun rgyas pa dbus brgyud lugs kyi sbyor chos kyi ngag 'don khrigs chags su bkod pa rgyal ba'i lam bzang/

4. On Outlines from an Experiential Commentary on the Stages of the Path to Enlightenment's Essential Instructions- the *Easy Path* and *Swiftness Path*

[byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i dmar khrid bde myur gyi thog nas nyams khrid stsal skabs kyi] sa bcad skor/

5. Pith Instructions Pointing Out the Way to Train According to an Important Experiential Stages of the Path Commentary, Taught in Everyday Language.

lam rim myong khrid gnad du bkar te skyong tshul gyi man ngag phal tshig dmar rjen lag len mdzub btsugs kyi tshul du bkod pa/

6. Advice Spoken to Kongpo Tre Rabchog Tulku Rinpoche

kong po bkras rab mchog sprul rin po che la stsal ba/

[This work is included together with previous title [5.5] and is not listed separately in the contents of the actual printed volume, or in the catalogue to the Potala edition.]

7. Heart Spoon: Practice Instructions to Bear in Mind [Drawn From] Experiences of the Long Path

shul ring lam gyi myong ba lag len dmar bcang snying gi thur ma/

8. Regarding Advice Presented in the Form of Songs of Realization, such as *All Countless Objects of Refuge* and so forth
rab 'byams skyabs kun ma sogs nyams mgur bslab bya'i skor/

9. The Root Text of the Seven Points of Mind Training
blo sbyong don bdun pa'i rtsa ba/

10. [The Common Jewel of the Ganden Practice Lineage:] Enhancing the Experience of Method and Wisdom by the Practice of Dedicating the Collection of the Illusory Body
sgyu lus tshogs su bsngo ba thabs shes nyams kyi bogs 'don [dga' ldan sgrub brgyud spyi nor/]

11. The Emanated Chariot: The Way to Practice the Generosity of Offering the One Hundred Torma [Which Carries to the Jewel of the Three Bodies]
gtor ma brgya rtsa gtong tshul [sku gsum nor bu 'dren pa'i] mchod sbyin 'phrul gyi shing rta/

12. A Textual Collection of Notes by Various Disciples on the Nectar of Dagpo Lama Rinpoche's Speech, which had been Forgotten and Scattered
dwags po bla ma rin po che'i gsung gi bdud rtsi bsnyel thor gnang ba sogs phyag zin thor bu sna tshogs phyogs gcig tu bsgrigs pa/

13. Brief Notes on Pramāṇa
tshad ma'i bsnyel byang mdor bsdus/

Vol. 6 (cha)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Cha*
pha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod cha pa'i dkar chag/

1. A Guide for those Travelling to the Supreme Field: The Profound Instruction for those Travelling to Shambhala in Dependence on White Mañjuśrī
'jam dbyangs dkar po la brten nas sham+ba+ha lar bgrod pa'i gdams pa zab mo zhing mchog bgrod pa'i sa mkhan/

2. A Collection Regarding the Sādhanas of the Highest Deities
lhag lha'i sgrub thabs skor phyogs bsgrigs/

3. The Way of Practicing the Long-life Accomplishment Ritual of Sita-Tārā Cintācakra for the Sake of Oneself and Others
sgrol dkar yid bzhin 'khor lo'i sgo nas rang gzhan gyi tshe sgrub bya tshul/

4. Festival of the Nectar of Immortality: Praises and Requests to Sita-Tārā Cintācakra
sgrol dkar yid bzhin 'khor lo'i bstod gsol 'chi med bdud rtsi'i dga' ston/

5. Chone Pandita's Sita-Tārā Long-Life-Commentary, the Collected Activity- sādhanā of White Mañjuśrī and Sarasvatī, Together with Lecture Notes
co ne paN+Di ta'i sgröl dkar tshe khrid dang / 'jam dkar/ dbyangs can ma rnam kyī sgrub thabs las tshogs bcas pa'i gsung bshad zin bris/

6. On Sealed Teachings
gsung bka' rgya ma'i skor/

7. Some Scattered Teachings Compiled Together
gsung thor bu ba 'ga' zhig phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

8. A Compilation of Various Questions and Answers on Sutra and Tantra
mdo sngags skor gyi dris lan sna tshogs phyogs gcig tu bsgrigs pa/

9. The Permission Initiations of the Dharma-cycle of Mañjuśrī, and so forth, Arranged Together
'jam dbyangs chos skor sogs kyī rjes gnang bca' sgrigs skor/

10. [Festival of the Victory Over the Three Worlds:] The Nine-floored Iron House Torma Ritual *Victory Over the Three Worlds*, Arranged for Convenient Recitation
lcags mkhar zur dgu pa'i gtor chog srid gsum rnam rgyal gyi 'don cha nag 'gros su bkod pa [srid gsum rnam rgyal dga' ston/]

11. [The Machine of Sky-Iron:] A Supplement to *Festival of the Victory Over the Three Worlds*, which is the Nine-floored Iron House Torma Ritual, *Victory Over the Three Worlds*, Arranged for Convenient Recitation
lcags mkhar zur dgu pa'i gtor chog srid gsum rnam rgyal gyi chog sgrigs srid gsum rnam rgyal dga' ston gyi zur rgyan [gnam lcags 'phrul 'khor/]

12. The Inescapable Dark Belly of Yama: A Subjugation Ritual for Ghosts and Demons, in Dependence on Solitary Hero Bhairava

'jigs byed dpa' bo gcig pa'i sgo nas sgab 'dre'am sgrub sri mnan pa'i cho ga thar med gshin rje'i lto khung/

13. A Brief Subjugation of Demons Which Can Be Modified for Use in Relation to Any Meditational Deity or Dharma Protector Based on the Practice of the Subjugation Ritual for Ghosts- *The Inescapable Dark Belly of Yama*, in Dependence on Solitary Hero Bhairava,

'jigs byed dpa' bo gcig pa'i sgo nas sgab 'dre mnan chog thar med gshin rje'i lto khung gi bca' gshom gyi lag len dang /yi dam chos skyong gang la'ang sbyar du rung ba'i sri mnan mdor bsdus/

Vol. 7 (ja)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Ja*
pha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod ja pa'i dkar chag/

1. The Sun that Enlarges the Lotus of the Three Types of Faith: An Explanation on the Way of Offering the Mandala
maN+Dal bshad pa 'bul tshul dad gsum pad+mo rgyas pa'i nyin byed/

2. A Collection of Long-life Prayers and Swift-return Supplications to Incarnation Lineages
zhabs brtan dang myur byon 'khrungs rabs gsol 'debs kyi rim pa rnam phyogs gcig tu bsdebs pa/

3. [The Melodious Sound of Conviction,] The Roar of Good Faith: An Incarnation Lineage Supplication
'khrungs rabs gsol 'debs skal bzang dad pa'i nga ro [yid ches bden dbyangs/]

4. The Melodious Drum Victorious Over the Terrifyingly Laughter of the Lord of Death: A Long-life Prayer Supplication to Tagtra
stag brag gi brtan bzhugs gsol 'debs 'jigs mdzad bzhad pa'i gad rgyangs 'chi bdag g.yul las rgyal ba'i rnga dbyangs/

5. A Heart Jewel of Offering Clouds of Good Fortune Pleasing the Local Protectors: The Permission Initiation Ritual of the Glorious Four-Faced Protector of Seventeen Expressions
dpal mgon gdong bzhi pa rnam 'gyur bcu bdun gyi rjes gnang gi cho ga zhing skyong dgyes pa'i mchod sprin skal bzang snying nor/

6. The Increasing and Auspicious [Akṣara Garland]: A Ritual of the Glorious Four-Faced Protector of Seventeen Expressions, Together with the Entrustment

dpal mgon gdong bzhi pa rnam 'gyur bcu bdun mngag gtad dang bcas pa'i cho ga spel legs [ak+Sha ra'i phreng ba]

[This work is included together with previous title [7.5] and is not listed separately in the contents of the actual printed volume, or in the catalogue to the Potala edition.]

7. The Rain of Treasure Fulfilling All Needs and Wants: The Yellow Increasing Ritual of the Glorious Four-Faced Protector in Dependence on the Nine Deities, the Quintessential Instruction to Fulfill all Desires

dpal mgon gdong bzhi pa'i ser po rgyas byed lha dgu la brten pa'i 'dod dgu dbang du bya ba'i man ngag dgos 'dod dbyig gi char 'bab/

8. Summer Thunder: A Supplement to *The Rain of Treasure Fulfilling All Needs and Wants: The Increasing Ritual of the Glorious Four-Faced Protector with a Yellow [Expression] in Dependence on the Nine Deities, the Quintessential Instruction to Fulfill all Desires*

dpal mgon gdong bzhi pa'i [rnam 'gyur] ser po rgyas byed lha dgu la brten pa'i 'dod dgu dbang du bya ba'i man ngag dgos 'dod dbyig gi char 'bab kyi lhan thabs dbyar gyi rnga gsang

9. A New Fulfillment Ritual of Glorious Four-Faced Protector Based on that Written by Sakyapa Ngawang Khyenrab, with Exceptional Changes

dpal mgon zhal bzhi pa'i bskang gsar sa skya pa ngag dbang mkhyen rab kyis mdzad par dmigs bsal bsgyur ba gnang pa/

10. Exhortations to Entreat Various Protectors of the Teachings: Serkyem, Gaṇacakra Offerings and so forth, as well as the Cycle of the Wealth Deity

bstan srung khag gi 'phrin bskul gser skyems tshogs mchod sogs dang nor lha'i skor/

11. [The Chariot of the Jewel of Faith Drawing Together a Precious Mass of Blessings:] The Life Entrustment of Shugden Possessing the Seal of Secrecy and Notes on How to Draw the Life-energy Cakra

shugs ldan srog gtad bka' rgya can dang srog 'khor bri tshul gyi zin bris/ [byin rlabs rin chen phung po 'dren ba yi/ lyid ches nor bu'i shing rta/]

12. A Supplement on How to Practice the Preliminaries for the Life-entrustment of Shugden

shugs ldan srog gtad kyi sngon 'gro'i mtshams sbyor kha skong/

13. The Victory Banner Thoroughly Victorious in All Directions: A Presentation of the Approach, Accomplishment and Activities of Shugden, Fulfilling all Needs and Wants

shugs ldan gyi bsnyen sgrub las gsum gyi rnam gzhas dgos 'dod yid bzhin re skong phyogs las rnam par rgyal ba'i rgyal mtshan/

14. The Melodious Drum Victorious in All Directions: The Extensive Uncommon Fulfillment Ritual of the Five Manifest Families of Gyalchen Dorje Shugden

rgyal chen rdo rje shugs ldan rigs lnga rtsal gyi sger bskang rgyas pa phyogs las rnam par rgyal ba'i rnga dbyangs/

15. Swift Summoning of the Deeds of the Four Activities: The Middling Fulfillment Ritual of Gyalchen Dorje Shugden

rgyal chen rdo rje shugs ldan rtsal gyi bskang chog 'bring po las bzhi'i 'phrin las myur 'gugs/

16. On [the Way to Perform the *Swift Summoning of Auspiciousness-Incense Offering to Cakrasaṃvara's Assembly of Mandala Deities and Other*] Incense Offerings

[dpal 'khor lo sdom pa'i dkyil 'khor gyi lha tshogs rnams la bsangs mchod 'bul tshul bde chen phywa g.yang myur 'gugs sogs] bsangs mchod kyi skor/

Vol. 8 (nya)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Nya*
pha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod nya pa'i dkar chag/

1. A Necklace of Increasing, Beautiful Fresh Flowers: A Compilation of Official Correspondences

chab shog gi rim pa rnams phyogs gcig tu bkod pa spel legs me tog gsar pa'i do shal/

2. A Compilation of Requests, Dedications, Supplications, Aspirational Prayers of Printing Colophons and Introductions, Such as Those of [the Contents of the Dharma-cycle of Cakrasaṃvara, *The Heart-Jewel of the Dakinis of the Three Places and So Forth*]

['khor lo sdom pa'i chos skor gyi dkar chag gnas gsum mkha' 'gro'i snying nor sogs] spar byang smon tshig dang/ dbu brjod / 'dod gsol bsngo smon gyi skor rnams phyogs gcig tu bkod pa/

3. Notes on the Experiential Instructions on [the *Consciousness-transference of*] a Single Day [from a Fully-Ripening Profound Com-

mentary on the Profound Path of the *Guru Pūjā*, the Uncommon Guru Yoga of the Ganden Hearing Lineage]

[dga' ldan snyan brgyud kyi bla ma'i rnal 'byor thun mong min pa zab lam bla ma mchod pa'i zab khrid smin rgyas su nos skabs 'pho ba] zhag gcig ma'i nyams khrid brjed byang/

4. "The Swift Path for Travelling to Tuṣita Pure Land:" Teaching Notes Taken During a Profound Commentary on the *Ganden Lhagyama* Guru Yoga [of the Segyu Tradition]

[sras rgyud lugs kyi] bla ma'i rnal 'byor dga' ldan lha brgya'i zab khrid gnang skabs kyi gsung bshad zin bris dga' ldan zhing du bgrod pa'i myur lam/

5. Entryway to the Ocean of Great Bliss: Notes on the First Stage of the Ghaṇṭapāda Cakrasaṃvara Body Mandala

'khor lo sdom pa dril bu lus dkyil gyi rim pa dang po'i zin bris bde chen rgya mtsho'i 'jug ngogs/

[Note that the catalogue of the Potala edition as well as the numbering of the popular Lhasa-edition gives this text as work six of the volume]

6. Opening the Door to the Good Path: Teaching Notes Taken During a Profound Commentary on the *Principal Paths*

lam gtso'i zab khrid bstsal skabs kyi gsung bshad zin bris lam bzang sgo 'byed/

[Note that the catalogue of the Potala edition as well as the numbering of the popular Lhasa-edition gives this text as work five of the volume]

7. The Key of Secrets: Notes on the *Principle Paths*

lam gtso'i zin bris gsang ba'i lde mig/

[This work is included together with the previous title and is not listed separately in the contents of the actual printed volume or in the catalogue to the Potala edition.]

8. The Outline of the Essential Instructions of the Generation and Completion Stages of the Ghaṇṭapāda Cakrasaṃvara Body Mandala

'khor lo sdom pa dril bu lus dkyil gyi bskyed rdzogs gnyis kyi dmar khrid sa bcad/

9. Explanatory Notes on the Root Mantras of Cakrasaṃvara Father and Mother

'khor lo sdom pa yab yum gyi rtsa sngags kyi mchan 'grel/

10. [The Nectar of the Great Bliss-Guru, Droplets of Jamphel Nyingpo's Blessings:] Notes on the Prayer to Meet with the Teachings of Tsongkhapa the Great

tsong kha pa chen po'i bstan pa dang mjal ba'i smon lam gyi zin bris [bde chen bla ma'i gsung gi bdud rtsi 'jam dpal snying po'i byin rlabs kyi zogs ma/]

Vol. 9 (ta)

i. Contents of *Phabongkhapa's Collected Works, Vol. Ta pha bong kha pa'i gsung 'bum pod ta pa'i dkar chag/*

1. Verses for Intervals in the Contents of the Kangyur- Volume One.
bka' 'gyur dkar chag gi bar skabs tshigs bcad stod cha

2. Verses for Intervals in the Contents of the Kangyur- Volume Two.
bka' 'gyur dkar chag gi bar skabs tshigs bcad smad cha

3. Brief Notes from a Commentary Given on the Six Session Guru Yoga, the Twenty Stanzas on the Vows, the Fifty Verses on the Guru and the Root Downfalls Constituting a Gross Contravention

thun drug bla ma'i rnal 'byor dang /sdom pa nyi shu pa/ bla ma lnga bcu pa/ sngags kyi rtsa ltung sbom po bcas kyi bshad khrid gnang ba'i zin tho mdor bsdu/

4. [The Essence of the Vast and Profound: A Concise Compilation of] Notes Taken During a Combined Commentary on Tsongkhapa's *Shorter Stages of the Path to Enlightenment* and the Essential Instructions of the *Swift Path*

rje'i lam rim chung ngu dang / myur lam dmar khrid sbrags ma'i gsung bshad stsal skabs kyi zin bris [mdo tsam du bkod pa zab rgyas snying po]

5. Easy to Understand Instructions on the Sequential Performance of the Rite of Generating the Mind of Bodhicitta, as Given on One Occasion at Tashilhunpo

bkras lhun du sems bskyed mchod pa gnang skabs gzhan kyi gzigs bde'i phyag bzhes 'gros bkod du bstsal ba/

6. Notes Marking Out Whatever Discrepancies Were Found in Various Wordings of the Manuscript Made from the New Printing Boards of the *Great Stages of the Path*

lam rim chen mo par gzhi gsar bskrun gyi ma dpe'i tshig sna mi mthun pa byung ba gang rnyed rnam brjed thor btab pa/

Vol. 10 (tha)

1. The Moon-Vine Increasing the Milk-Lake of Faith: The Biography of Dagpo Bamchoe Lama Lobsang Jamphel Lhundrub Gyatso
dwags po bam chos bla ma blo bzang 'jam dpal lhun grub rgya mtsho'i rnam thar dad pa'i 'o mtsho 'phel byed zla ba'i 'khri shing/

2. Compilation of Notes on Experiential Instructions on *The Sacred Words of Mañjuśrī Stages of the Path*, According to The Abridged Commentarial Tradition of the Southern Lineage, Received from the Unequaled Dagpo Lama, Lord of the Dharma
dwags po bla ma mnyam med chos kyi rje las lam rim 'jam dpal zhal lung gi 'khrid rgyun bsdus pa lho brgyud du grags pa'i nyams 'khrid gsan skabs sogs kyi bsnyel byang phyogs bsdebs

3. A Collection of [Kyabdag Dorjechang Phabongkha's] Minor Compositions and Instructions
[khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa'i] bka' rtsom dang phyag bzhes phran tshogs skor phyogs su bkod pa/
 [The catalogue to the Potala edition lists the third work of the volume as: "The Mirror of the View: Notes Taken During an Explanation of the Profound Commentary on *The Hero Entering Into Battle* - Transference of Consciousness
'pho ba dpa' bo g.yul 'jug gi zab khrid gnang ba'i gsung bshad zin bris lta ba'i me long/"]

4. [An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom:] An Explanation of the Layout of the Vairocana-Abhisambodhi
rnam snang mngon byang gi thig 'grel [sher 'byung dgongs rgyan/]
 [The catalogue to the Potala edition lists the fourth work of the volume as: "Abbreviated Rites to Protect Harvests from Rain, Frost, Hail, Disease, Drought and So Forth
lo tog gi rim 'gro dang/ char 'bebs/ sad ser btsa' than sogs srung thabs mdor bsdus/"]

5. [The Heart Essence of the Dakinis of the Three Places: Extremely Secret] Notes on the Profound Commentary of the Two Stages of Queen [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari.
[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i lam rim pa gnyis kyi zab khrid zin bris [shin tu gsang ba gnas gsum mkha' 'gro'i snying bcud/]

6. The Clear Essence of the Profound Path of Great Bliss: An Accessory to *The Heart Essence of the Dakinis of the Three Places: Notes on [Vajrayoginī] Naro Kechari's Two Stages*

*[rdo rje rnal 'byor ma] nA ro mkha' spyod ma'i rim gnyis zin bris gnas
gsum mkha' 'gro'i snying bcud kyi zur rgyan bde chen zab lam snying po
gsal ba/*

7. The Way to Perform the Increasing Burning Offering at the End of
the Great Tenth-part Burning Offering of Vajrayoginī

*rdo rje rnal 'byor ma'i bcu cha chen mo'i sbyin sreg gi mjug tu rgyas pa'i
sbyin sreg bya tshul/*

8. The Way to Perform the Long-life Accomplishment Ritual [Relat-
ed] to Sita-Tārā [Cintācakra]

sgrol dkar [yid bzhin 'khor lo'i sgo nas] tshe sgrub bya tshul/

[The catalogue to the Potala edition lists the eighth work of the vol-
ume as: "The Way To Perform the Gaṇacakra [of Vajrayoginī]
de'i tshogs 'bul tshul la"]

Vol. 11 (da)

1. [Profound and Completely Unmistaken Pith Instructions for Deliver-
ing Liberation in Your Hand:] Notes on Experiential Instructions on
the Stages of the Path to Enlightenment, [the Heart-Elixir of the Une-
qualed Dharma King,] the Essence of Nectar, Instructions that As-
semble the Elixir of all the Teachings

*[rnam grol lag bcangs su gtod pa'i man ngag zab mo tshang la ma nor ba
mtshungs med chos kyi rgyal po'i thugs bcud] byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i
nyams khrid kyi zin bris gsung rab kun gyi bcud bsdus gdams ngag bdud
rtsi'i snying po/*

[Vol. 12 (na), Present Only in the Potala Collection]

1. The Beautiful Ornament of the Oceans: The Biography of the Yogi
Wangchuk Yabje Dorjechang Lobsang Sangye Palzangpo, Holder of
the Great Unsurpassable Secret Teachings

*gsang chen bla na med pa'i bstan pa'i gdung 'tshob rnal 'byor dbang phyug
yab rje rdo rje 'chang blo bzang sangs rgyas dpal bzang po'i rnam thar rgya
mtsho'i mdzas rgyan/*

2. A Collection of The Lord of Refuge, Kyabdag Dorjechang Pha-
bongkha's Minor Compositions and Instructions

*khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa'i bka' rtsom dang phyag bzhes
phran tshogs skor phyogs su bkod pa/*

3. An Ornament Embellishing Arising Wisdom: An Explanation of the Make-up of the Vairocana-Abhisambodhi
rnam snang mngon byang gi thig 'brel sher 'byung dgongs rgyan/

4. Notes Taken During a Profound Commentary on the *Foundation of All Good Qualities*, the Abbreviated Essence of the Stages of the Path to Enlightenment
byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i snying po bsdus pa yon tan gzhi gyur ma'i zab khrid gnang skabs kyi brjed byang/

5. The Way to Perform the Amending Burning Offering for the Approximation Retreat of Serviceability of the Glorious Solitary Hero Vajrabhairava
dpal rdo rje 'jigs byed dpa' bo cig pa'i las rung gi bsnyen pa'i kha skong sbyin sreg bya tshul/

6. The Preliminary Practice Text for the Solitary Hero Vajrabhairava Approximation Retreat, Arranged for Convenient Recitation
de'i bsnyen pa'i sngon 'gro'i 'don cha nag 'gros su bkod pa/

7. Notes for *Ocean of Attainments: The Burning Offering for Solitary Hero Vajrabhairava*
de'i sbyin sreg dngos grub rgya mtsho'i zin bris/

8. The Hook Which Summons Attainments: The Self-Entry of the Solitary Hero
dpa' bo gcig pa'i bdag 'jug dngos grub 'gugs pa'i lcags kyul/



Bibliography

English Sources

Benard, Elizabeth. "The Qianlong Emperor and Tibetan Buddhism", in James A Millward et al. (eds.), *New Qing Imperial History: The Making of Inner Asian Empire at Qing Chengde*. London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2004, pp. 123-135.

Bultrini, Raimondo. *The Dalai Lama and the King Demon: Tracking a Triple Murder Mystery Through the Mists of Time*. New York: Tibet House US, 2013 [Google play edition].

Chagdud Tulku. *Lord of the Dance*. Kathmandu: Pilgrim's Publishing, 2001 [Padma Publishing edition, 1992].

"Claim: Dorje Shugden was not taught by Je Tsongkhapa", in *Dorje Shugden Debate*, <http://dorjeshugdendebate.wordpress.com/the-debate-on-dorje-shugden-practice/outline-of-main-arguments/2-reasons-stated-by-the-dalai-lama-for-the-ban/2-secondary-reasons/4-dorje-shugden-was-not-taught-by-je-tsongkhapa/>, (accessed 07/05/2014).

Daisely, Simon Francis Stirling. *Exorcising Luther: Confronting the Demon of Modernity in Tibetan Buddhism* [unpublished MA Thesis]. University of Canterbury, 2012, <http://hdl.handle.net/10092/7329>, (accessed 21/05/2014).

De Nebesky-Wojkowitz, Réne. *Oracles and Demons of Tibet: The Cult and Iconography of the Tibetan Protective Deities*. Kathmandu & Varanasi: Book Faith India, 1996 [Second Reprint].

Doctor, Andreas. *Tibetan Treasure Literature: Revelation, Tradition and Accomplishment in Visionary Buddhism*, 2005, Ithaca: Snow Lion, pp. 31-38.

The Dolgyal Shugden Research Society. *Dolgyal Shugden: A History*. New York: Tibet House US, 2014 [Google play edition].

Dreyfus, Georges. "The Shuk-Den Affair: History and Nature of a Quarrel", in *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* (Vol. 21, no. 2). 1998, pp. 227-270.

Gendun Chopel. *In the Forest of Faded Wisdom: 104 Poems by Gendun Chopel*. Donald S. Lopez Jr. (trans., ed.). Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2009.

Geshe Kelsang Gyatso. *Heart Jewel: The Essential Practices of Kadampa Buddhism*. London: Tharpa Publications, 1991 [Motilal Banarsidass edition, 2002].

Gonsalez, David. "Translator's Preface", in Kachen Yeshe Gyaltsen, *Manjushri's Innermost Secret: A Profound Commentary of Oral Instructions on the Practice of Lama Chöpa*. David Gonsalez (trans.). Seattle: Dechen Ling Press, 2013.

Jackson, Roger R. "The dGe ldan-bKa' brgyud Tradition of Mahāmudrā: How Much dGe ldan? How much bKa' brgyud?", in Guy Newland (ed.), *Changing Minds: Contributions to the Study of Buddhism and Tibet in Honor of Jeffrey Hopkins*. Ithaca: Snow Lion Publications, 2001.

Kay, David N. *Tibetan and Zen Buddhism in Britain: Transplantation, Development and Adaptation*. London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2004.

Lama Zopa Rinpoche. "Kyabje Trijang Rinpoche, His Holiness the Dalai Lama and Dorje Shugden", in *Lama Yeshe Wisdom Archive*. <http://www.lamayeshe.com/index.php?sect=article&id=335&chid=1398>, (accessed 01/07/2014).

Lopez Jr., Donald S. *Prisoners of Shangri-la: Tibetan Buddhism and the West*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1998 [paperback edition, 1999].

"Mahakala: Brahmarupa (Brahmin Form)", in *Himalayan Art*, <http://www.himalayanart.org/search/set.cfm?setID=418>, (accessed 08/05/2014).

NKT-IKBU. *Modern Kadampa Buddhism*, <http://kadampa.org/buddhism/modern-kadampa-buddhism/>, (accessed 18/05/2014).

"Purpose of this Website", in *Dorje Shugden Debate*, <http://dorjeshugdendebate.wordpress.com/>, (accessed 07/05/2014).

Rilbur Rinpoche. "Pabongka Rinpoche: A Memoir by Rilbur Rinpoche," in Pabongka Rinpoche, *Liberation in the Palm of Your Hand: A Concise Discourse on the Path to Enlightenment*. Michael Richards (trans.). Boston: Wisdom Publications, 1997 [First Edition, 1991]. pp. 10-15.

Samuel, Geoffrey. *Civilized Shamans: Buddhism in Tibetan Societies*. Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1993.

Sharpa Tulku and Richard Guard. *Meditations on Vajrabhairava*. Dharamsala: Library of Tibetan Works and Archives, 1990 [reprint, 2004].

Trinley Kalsang, "Among Shugden Texts", in *Dorje Shugden History*, <http://www.dorjeshugdenhistory.org/among-shugden-texts.html>, (accessed 17/06/2015).

Western Shugden Society. *A Great Deception: The Ruling Lamas' Policies*. London: Western Shugden Society, 2010.

Willis, Jan. *Enlightened Beings: Life Stories from the Ganden Oral Tradition*. Boston: Wisdom Publications, 1995.

Tibetan sources

'jigs smed bsam gtan. "mkhas grub chen po khyab bdag stag phu rin po ches gsungs pa'i rje btsun sgröl ma'i bdag 'jug mkhas grub dam pa'i zhal lung", in Vol.2 of *'jigs med bsam gtan gyi gsung 'bum* (2 vols.). sku 'bum: sku 'bum byams pa gling, 2000(?), pp. 803-836. [TBRC W5424]

_____. "khyab bdag stag phu'i dag snang rje btsun sgröl ma'i me lha'i bsnyen pa dang bsnyen sgrub sbrags ma bcu cha'i sbyin sreg rnams kyi tho tsam bkod pa dngos grub 'gugs pa'i lcags kyu", in Vol.2 of *'jigs med bsam gtan gyi gsung 'bum* (2 vols.). sku 'bum: sku 'bum byams pa gling, 2000(?), pp. 851-865. [TBRC W5424]

blo bzang 'phrin las lhun grub chos kyi rgyal mtshan. "'jam mgon rgyal ba'i bstan srung rdo rje shugs ldan rig lnga drag po rtsal gyi bskang chog las bzhi lhun gyis 'grub pa'i sgra dbyangs", in Vol. 2 of *skyabs mgon paN chen sku 'phreng bcu pa rje btsun bstan 'dzin 'phrin las 'jigs med chos kyi dbang phyug dpal bzang po'i gsun 'bum* (2 vols.). Delhi: Tashi Lhunpo Monastery, 1998. pp. 55-98 [TBRC W1KG11666]

blo bzang bstan pa'i rgyal tshan. *rje btsun rdo rje rnal 'byor ma nA ro mkha' spyod kyi rim gnyis zab mo'i nyams len bai DU r+ya zhun ma'i them skas sogs chos tshan khag cig*. Delhi: thub btsan tshul khriims sgröl dkar, d.u. [TBRC W1KG5169]

blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma. "nA ro mkha' spyod kyi sgrub thabs thun mong ma yin pa bde chen nye lam", in Vol. 8 of *The Collected Works of thu'u-bkwan blo-bzang-chos-kyi-nyi-ma* (10 vols.). New Delhi: Ngawang Gelek Demo, 1969, pp. 207-226. [TBRC W21506]

_____. "nA ro mkha' spyod ma'i sgrub thabs rgyas pa pad+ma rA ga'i them skas", in Vol. 8 of *rje bstun bla ma dam oa thu'u*

bkwan blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum (10 vols.). Lhasa: zhol par khang gsar pa, 2000. [TBRC W21507]

_____. *rje bstun bla ma dam pa thu'u bkwan blo bzang chos kyi nyi ma dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (10 vols.). Lhasa: zhol par khang gsar pa, 2000. [TBRC W21507]

_____. "rta mgrin gsang sgrub kyi chos skor las/ bka' srung rgyal po sku lnga'i srog gtad bya tshul ches gsal ba/ 'phrin las sgo 'byed", in Vol. 7 of *Collected Works of thu'u-bkwan blo-bzang-chos-kyi-nyi-ma* (10 vols.). New Delhi: Ngawang Gelek Demo, 1969, pp. 775-789. [TBRC W21506]

blo bzang chos kyi dbang phyug. *sgrol ma tsit+ta ma Ni la brten pa'i thun mong ma yin pa'i bla ma'i rnal 'byor thar par bgrod pa'i them skas*. Lhasa: s.n., d.u.

blo bzang chos kyi rgyal mtshan, "zab lam bla ma mchod pa'i cho ga bde stong dbyer med ma" in *bla ma'i rnal 'byor dang yi dam khag gi bdag bskyed sogs zhal 'don gces bsdud bzhugs so*. Lhasa: bod ljongs mi dmangs dpe skrun khang, 2011. pp. 22-43.

blo bzang dpal ldan bstan 'dzin yar rgyas. "mthu dang stobs kyis che ba'i bstan srung chen po rdo rje shugs ldan rtsal gyi byung ba brjod pa pha rgod bla ma'i zhal gyi bdud rtsi'i chu khur brtsegs shing 'jigs rung glog zhags 'gyur ba'i sprin nag 'khrugs pa'i nga ro zhes bya ba bzhugs so", in Vol. 2 of *Collected Works of Kyabje Zemey Rinpoche* (6 vols.). Geshe Thubten Jinpa (ed.). Mundgod: Tashi Gephel House, 1997, pp. 571-650. [TBRC W14376]

blo bzang nor bu shes rab. "'jam mgon bstan srung rgyal chen rdo rje shugs ldan rtsal gyi 'phrin bcol bya tshul", in Vol. 9 of *gzhung lugs mang du thos ba blo bzang nor bu'i gsung 'bum* (9 vols.). brag g.yab: dge ldan bshan sgrub chos 'khor gling, d.u., pp. 221-230. [TBRC W1KG10787]

blo bzang rta mgrin. "bla ma yi dam chos skyong dbyer med kyi rnal 'byor rgyun 'khyer ma", in Vol. 6 of *rje btsun blo bzang rta dbyangs kyi gsung 'bum* (17 vols.). New Delhi: Lama Guru Deva, 1975-1976. pp. 71-74. [TBRC W13536]

bstan pa' rgyal mtshan. "'jam dbyangs chos skor gyi rjes gnang gi zin tho nyung bsdus", in *rje a kya'a bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan gyi gsung 'bum*.

sku 'bum: sku 'bum byams pa gling, 2002, pp. 3107-3125. [TBRC W27882]

dngul chu d+harma b+ha dra. *Collected Works (gsuñg 'bum) of ñul-chu dharma-bhadra* (8 vols.). New Delhi: Champa Oser, 1973. [TBRC W20548]

khri byang rin po che blo bzang ye shes bstan 'dzin rgya mtsho. "dga' ldan khri chen byang chub chos 'phel gyi skye gral du rlom pa'i gyi na pa zhis gis rang gi ngag tshul ma bchos lhug par bkod pa 'khrul snang sgyu ma'i zlos gar", Vol. 4 of *Yongs rdzogs bstan pa'i mnga' bdag skyabs rje yongs 'dzin khri byang rdo rje 'chang chen po'i gsung 'bum* (8 vols.). s.l. : s.n., 199-. [TBRC W14592]

_____. "dge ldan bstan pa bsrung ba'i lha mchog sprul pa'i chos rgyal chen po rdo rje shugs ldan rtsal gyi gsang gsum rmad du byung ba'i rtogs pa brjod pa'i gdam du bya ba dam can rgya mtsho dgyes pa'i rol mo", in Vol.5 of *Yongs rdzogs bstan pa'i mnga' bdag skyabs rje yongs 'dzin khri byang rdo rje 'chang chen po'i gsung 'bum* (8 vols.). s.l. : s.n., 199-, pp. 5-159. [TBRC W14592]

_____. "khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum pod ka pa'i dkar chag", in Vol.1 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s.n., 199-, pp. 1-7. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "rje btsun ma sgröl ma'i sgrub thabs tsit+ta ma Ni dang 'brel ba'i bsnyen yig 'phags ma snying gi khab tu bsu ba'i yid 'phrog dri za'i gling bu", in Vol.2 of *Yongs rdzogs bstan pa'i mnga' bdag skyabs rje yongs 'dzin khri byang rdo rje 'chang chen po'i gsung 'bum* (8 vols.). s.l. : s.n., 199-, pp. 143-176. [TBRC W14592]

_____. *Yongs rdzogs bstan pa'i mnga' bdag skyabs rje yongs 'dzin khri byang rdo rje 'chang chen po'i gsung 'bum* (8 vols.). s.l. : s.n., 199-. [TBRC W14592]

ldan ma blo bzang rdo rje. *rigs dan dkyil 'khor rgya mtsho'i khyab bdag he ru kah dpal ñur smrig gar rol skyabs gcig pha boñ kha pa bde chen sñin po pal bzañ po'i rnam par thar pa don ldan tshañs pa'i dbyañs sñan: The detailed biography of Rje Pha-boñ-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las-rgya-mtsho* (2 vols.). New Delhi: Ngawang Sopa, 1981. [TBRC W23912]

_____. *rigs dang dkyil 'khor rgya mtsho'i khyab bdag he ru kah dpal ngur smrig gar rol skyabs gcig pha bong kha pa bde chen snying po pal bzang po'i rnam par thar pa don ldan tshangs pa'i dbyangs snyan* (1 vol.). Lhasa: par pa dpal ldan, 199?. [TBRC W1KG11704]

_____. "skyabs rje pha bong kha pa chab mdor bzhugs skabs snyan sgron du gsol zer ba'i yig rdzus kyi dpyad don mchan bus bkrol ba dpyod ldan bzhin 'dzum dgod pa'i thal skad rnga chen bskul ba'i dbyu gu", in *Three Texts Reflecting the Views of Pha-boñ-kha-pa Bde-chen-sñin-po on the Question of Heresies and Intersectarian Relations in Tibet*. Ldan-ma Blo-bzañ-rdo-rje and others, New Delhi: Ngawang Topgay, 1977, pp. 1-215. [TBRC W29252]

ngag dbang blo bzang rgya mtsho. "nA ro mkha' spyod kyi rnal 'byor bcu gcig gi nyams len la sgro 'dogs gcod pa dang sems 'dzin zung 'brel du gtong tshul mthong grol lde mig", in Vol. 10 of *zab pa dang rgya che ba'i dan pa'i chos kyi thob yig gang+ga+'a'i chu rgyun* (25 vols.). Beijing: Yellow Pagoda, 199?, pp. 355-368. [TBRC W1KG825]

pha bong kha bde chen snying po. "'jam mgon bstan srung yongs kyi thu bo mchog/ /rdo rje shugs ldan srog dbang zab mo'i tshul/ /byin rlabs rin chen phung po 'dren ba yi/ /yid ches nor bu'i shing rta", in Vol. 7 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s.n., 199-, pp. 505-523. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "dge ldan bstan srung dgra lha'i rgyal po srid gsum skye dgu'i srog bdag dam ldan bu bzhin skyong ba'i lha mchog sprul pa'i rgyal chen rdo rje shugs ldan rigs lnga rtsal gyi sger bskang rgyas pa phyogs las rnam par rgyal ba'i rnga dbyangs", in Vol.7 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s.n., 199-, pp. 611-667. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "dpal stag phu'i gsang chos rgya can bcu gsum gyi smin byed dbang chog chu 'babs bkod pa don gnyis 'bras bus brjid pa'i yongs 'du'i dbang po", in Vol.1 of *stag phu 'jam dpal bstan pa'i dnogs grub bam pad ma ba dzra'i gsung 'bum* (2 vols.). s.l.: s.n., d.u., pp. 1-219(?).

_____. *drug cu ba'i 'don bsgrigs 'khyer bde nag 'gros su bkod pa las bzhi'i 'phrin las myur 'grub*. Lhasa: s.n., 2014.

_____. *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s.n., 199-. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "rdo rje rnal 'byor ma nA ro mkha' spyod dbang mo'i dkyil 'khor gyi cho ga bde chen dga' ston", in Vol.4 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s..n., 199-, pp. 61-131. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "rgyal chen srog gtad kyi sngon 'gro bshad pa'i mtshams sbyor kha skong", in Vol.7 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s..n., 199-, pp. 525-540. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "rnam grol lag bcangs su gtod pa'i man ngag zab mo tshang la ma nor ba mtshungs med chos kyi rgyal po'i thugs bcud byang chub lam gyi rim pa'i nyams khrid kyi zin bris gsung rab kun gyi bcud bsdus gdams ngag bdud rtsi'i snying po", in Vol.11 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s..n., 199-. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "sgra mi snyan gyi tshe khrid kyi 'don chog khyer bde sogs lhag lha'i sgrub thabs skor phyogs bsgrigs", in Vol.6 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s..n., 199-, pp. 27-57. [TBRC W3834]

_____. "shugs ldan gyi bsnyen sgrub las gsum gyi rnam gzhang dgos 'dod yid bzhin re skong phyogs las rnam par rgyal ba'i rgyal mtshan", in Vol.7 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s..n., 199-, pp. 541-609 [TBRC W3834]

_____. "thun drug bla ma'i rnal 'byor dang / sdom pa nyi shu pa/ bla ma lnga bcu pa/ sngags kyi rtsa ltung sbom po bcas kyi bshad khrid gnang ba'i zin tho mdor bsdus/", in Vol.9 of *khyab bdag rdo rje 'chang pha bong kha pa dpal bzang po'i gsung 'bum* (11 vols.). Lhasa: s..n., 199-, pp. 105-149. [TBRC W3834]

Pha-boñ-kha-pa Bde-chen-sñin-po. *A Collection of Supplemental Works of Skyabs-rje Pha-boñ-kha-pa Bde-chen-sñin-po reproduced from blockprints recently found by Ven. Khri-byañ Rin-po-che*. New Delhi: Ngawang Sopa, 1977. [TBRC W1KG9724]

Pha-bong-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las rgya-mtsho. *Collected Works of Pha-bong-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-'phrin-las rgya-mtsho* (11 vols.). New Delhi: Chopel Legdan, 1973.

Pha-boñ-kha-pa Byams-pa-bstan-'dzin-phrin-las-rgya-mtsho. *dpal stag phu'i gsañ chos rgya can bcu gsum gyi dbaṅ chog chu 'babs su bkod pa don gñis 'bras bus brjid pa'i yoṅs 'du'i dbaṅ po: Initiation texts for the practice of the visionary teachings received by the Second Stag-phu Sprulsku Blo bzaiñ-chos-kyi-dbañ-phyug (gar-dbañ-padma-śwara)*. New Delhi: Ngawang Sopa, 1979. [TBRC W3838]

"pha bong kha rje btsun byams pa bstan 'dzin 'phrin las kyi gsung 'bum (dkar chag)", in *po ta la'i gsung 'bum dkar chag: dge lugs pa*. Beijing: mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 2013, pp. 865-874.

"stag phu 'jam dpal bstan pa'i dngos grub bam pad+ma bdzra'i gsung 'bum (dkar chag)", in *po ta la'i gsung 'bum dkar chag: dge lugs pa*. Beijing: mi rigs dpe skrun khang, 2013, pp. 860-861.

Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center, "Outline", in *gsung 'bum/_bde chen snying po*, <http://www.tbrc.org/#!/rid=W3834>, (accessed 09/07/2015).

Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center, "Outline: skyabs rje pha bong kha pa bde chen snying po'i gsung 'bum kha skong", in *skyabs rje pha bong kha pa bde chen snying po'i gsung 'bum kha skong*, <http://www.tbrc.org/#!/rid=W1KG9724>, (accessed 03/04/2014).



Figures



Fig.1- The Cakrasaṃvara statue at Drangsong Sinpori. According to the caretakers the statue is original and was hidden safely during the Cultural Revolution (Photograph by Matt Linden).



Fig.2- Thangka of the *Guru Pūjā* assembly field with a depiction of Vajrayoginī, ranked among the class of enlightened *dākinīs*. This layout of the assembly field differs from that described by Phabongkha. Qing Dynasty, Yonghegong Temple, Beijing (Photograph by Matt Linden).



Fig. 3 - Detail of Vajrayogini from Fig. 2.