

Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines



Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines

numéro vingt-quatre — Octobre 2012

ISSN 1768-2959

Directeur : Jean-Luc Achard

Comité de rédaction : Anne Chayet, Jean-Luc Achard.

Comité de lecture : Ester Bianchi (Università degli Studi di Perugia), Anne Chayet (CNRS), Fabienne Jagou (EFEO), Rob Mayer (Oriental Institute, University of Oxford), Fernand Meyer (CNRS-EPHE), Françoise Pommaret (CNRS), Ramon Prats (Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona), Charles Ramble (EPHE, CNRS) Françoise Robin (INALCO), Brigitte Steinman (Université Paul Valéry, Montpellier III) Jean-Luc Achard (CNRS).

Périodicité

La périodicité de la *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines* est généralement bi-annuelle, les mois de parution étant, sauf indication contraire, Octobre et Avril. Les contributions doivent parvenir au moins six (5) mois à l'avance. Les dates de proposition d'articles au comité de lecture sont Novembre pour une parution en Avril, et Mai pour une parution en Octobre.

Participation

La participation est ouverte aux membres statutaires des équipes CNRS, à leurs membres associés, aux doctorants et aux chercheurs non-affiliés.

Les articles et autres contributions sont proposées aux membres du comité de lecture et sont soumis à l'approbation des membres du comité de rédaction. Les articles et autres contributions doivent être inédits ou leur ré-édition doit être justifiée et soumise à l'approbation des membres du comité de lecture.

Les documents doivent parvenir sous la forme de fichiers Word, envoyés à l'adresse du directeur (jeanluc.achard@sfr.fr).

Comptes-rendus

Les livres proposés pour compte-rendu doivent être envoyés à la *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines*, 22, avenue du Président Wilson, 75016 Paris.

Langues

Les langues acceptées dans la revue sont le français (en priorité), l'anglais, l'allemand, l'italien, l'espagnol, le tibétain et le chinois.

La *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines* est publiée par l'UMR 8155 du CNRS, Paris, dirigée par Annick Horiuchi.





Revue d'Études Tibétaines

numéro vingt-quatre — Octobre 2012

Studies in the Sems sde tradition of rDzogs chen

Edited by Jean-Luc Achard

Sam van Schaik

Dzogchen, Chan and the Question of Influence

page 5

Christopher Wilkinson

The *Mi nub rgyal mtshan Nam mkha' che* And the *Mahā Ākāśa Kārikās*:
Origins and Authenticity

page 21

Dylan Esler

The Exposition of *Atiyoga* in *gNubs-chen Sangs-rgyas ye-shes'*
bSam-gtan mig-sgron

page 81

Karen Liljenberg

On the *Thig le drug pa* and the *sPyi chings*, two of the *Thirteen*
Later Translations of the rDzogs chen Mind Series

page 137

Jim Valby

Five Principles of rDzogs chen Transmission in the
Kun byed rgyal po

page 157

Kurt Keutzer

The Nine Cycles of the Hidden, The Nine Mirrors,
and *Nine Minor Texts on Mind*: Early Mind Section Literature in Bon

page 165




*The Nine Cycles of the Hidden, The Nine Mirrors,
and Nine Minor Texts on Mind:
Early Mind Section Literature in Bon*

Kurt Keutzer
University of California, Berkeley

Abstract

In sGa ston's list of the Southern Treasures discovered by gShen chen Klu dga' a series of texts referred to as the *Facets of Mind, Nine Minor Texts on Mind* are mentioned. The Bon tradition has acknowledged from that time to the present day that these are seminal texts in the literature of Bon. Furthermore, these texts would eventually be classified as the exemplary works of the Mind Section of Bon Dzogchen. Nevertheless, the precise content of these texts has been unclear to modern scholars, both Tibetan and Western, working outside of Tibet. With the publication in 1999 of *Mongyal Lhase's Edition of the Bon Kangyur*, as well as with other subsequent publications, we are now in a better position to identify and understand these works. The aim of this paper is to clearly identify the titles of these texts, to identify the various editions in which they are available, and to begin to understand how they work together with tantric elements to form a holistic system of training.

Introduction

 natural place to begin to understand the history of Mind Section (*sems sde*) literature in Bon Dzogchen, is Karmay's *The Treasury of Good Sayings* (Karmay, 1972), an edition and translation of Shardza's history of the Bon tradition. There Karmay's translation reads: "Although the texts of the Great Perfection (*rdzogs chen*) are innumerable, they can all be reduced to *The Four Cycles of Scriptural Tradition, The Three Cycles of Propagation, and The Nine Cycles of Mind Abatement*."¹ *The Four Cycles of the Scriptural Tradition (bka rgyud skor bzhi)*, can be easily identified with *The Four Cycles of Scriptural Tradition/Transmission of the Aural Tradition of Zhang Zhung (bka' rgyud skor bzhi, 1968 and Kangyur 171)*. Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen (Shar rdza bKra shis rgyal mtshan) identifies this cycle as the exemplar within the Quintessential Instruction Section (*man ngag sde*) of Dzogchen.² In *The Treasury of Good Sayings* Karmay helps us to identify the reference to *The Three Cycles of Propagation* as *The Three Cycles of Propagation of Dzogchen (bsGrags pa skor gsum, Kangyur 174, Tengyur 207)*.³ Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen identifies this cycle as the exemplar within the Great Vastness Section (*klong chen sde*) of Dzogchen.⁴

¹ *The Treasury of Good Sayings*, p. 51. Karmay's translation of Shardza's description of these texts, "*sems smad sde dgu*", as "*Nine Cycles of Mind Abatement*" is misleading. We prefer to render this phrase as "*Nine Cycles of Minor [Texts on] Mind*."

² *dByings rig*, vol. 1, p. 7.

³ *The Treasury of Good Sayings*, p. 15, n3.

⁴ *dByings rig mdzod*, vol. 1, p. 7. However, this association is apparently not entirely shared by either indigenous scholars of the tradition or contemporary scholars such as Jean-Luc Achard. Unfortunately, a consideration of the *The Three Cycles of Propagation* is beyond the scope of this paper.

From the start we should note that the phrase Mind Section (*sems sde*) may be used in three different ways. In the first use Mind Section (*sems sde*) means a section (or text) on Mind. This is the most general use and common in the early instances of the literature that we will examine. The second usage is the use of the term Mind Section (*sems sde*) as a technical term for organizing the sections of the Bon *Kanjur*. Used in this way the Mind Section of the Bon *Kangyur* is descriptively defined as Volume 171–178 as cataloged in the *Handlist of the Tibetan Kangyur and Tengyur* (Keutzer and O'Neill, 2009) or the *Mdzod* section (Section IV) as cataloged in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur* (Martin *et al.*, 2003). The third use of the term Mind Section is as a technical term describing a tri-partition of Dzogchen. Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen's terse description of Dzogchen, as given above, is enough to tell us that the exemplar of the Quintessential Instruction Section, *The Four Cycles of the Scriptural Tradition of the Aural Tradition of Zhang Zhung* (*bKa' rgyud skor bzhi*, 1968 and *Kangyur* 171), and the exemplar of the Vastness Section, *The Three Cycles of Propagation of Dzogchen* (*bsGrags pa skor gsum*, *Kangyur* 174), are each contained with the Mind Section (Volumes 171–178) of the Bon *Kangyur* as described in the *Handlist*. Thus, we must be careful not to confound the use of Mind Section (*sems sde*) as a way of organizing the Bon *Kangyur* with the use of Mind Section (*sems sde*) as a technical term describing a tri-partition of Dzogchen practice.⁵

In phrases such as “*Nine Minor Texts on Mind (Sems smad sde dgu)*,” the word “*sde*” is used very generally to describe a section of a text or an individual text. Early in Volume 1 of the *Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness*, Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen uses the phrase “*sems sde dgu*” in a more technical manner that implies the “*Nine [Texts of] the Mind Section [of Dzogchen]*,” and in this way presents these “*Nine Minor Texts on Mind*” (*Sems smad sde dgu*) as exemplars within the Mind Section (*sems sde*) of Dzogchen.⁶ One might wonder: if “*Nine Texts on Mind*” are precisely the “*Nine [Texts of] the Mind Section*” then isn't this a distinction without a difference? The problem with making these two uses equivalent is that it lulls us into thinking that when early works⁷ use the phrase “*sems sde dgu*” it implies that they are classifying these texts as Mind Section (*sems sde*) literature. In fact the tri-partition of Dzogchen is not a classification scheme that is native to this early literature of Bon. We will discuss again the classification schemes natively applied to these nine texts briefly in Section 1.2. In the meantime we will simply take care to note that although Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen considers these texts to be exemplars of the Mind Section (*sems sde*) literature, the early literature itself has no such self-reference.

⁵ An example of a potentially confusing statement is found in the otherwise enormously useful *A Catalogue of the Bon Kanjur*, page 437: “The mDzod Section (*mDzod sde*) may also be called Sems Section (*Sems sde*), which for present practical purposes means exactly the same thing.” This does help us to understand the criticism, periodically heard in tea stalls in the East and coffee shops in the West, that Bon Dzogchen has no Quintessential Instruction Section (*man ngag sde*).

⁶ *dBying rig mdzod*, vol. 1, p. 7. That these “*nine texts*” mentioned in *The Treasury of Space and Awareness* refer to the same group of texts as mentioned in the *Treasury of Good Sayings* will become clearer in Section 1.4.

⁷ Such as ‘A zha Blo gros rgyal msthan's *bKod pa'i rgyan* (*bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2004).

With these caveats and considerations aside, let us progress to identifying the titles that constitute these *Nine Minor Texts on Mind* (*Sems smad sde dgu*). In another footnote of *The Treasury of Good Sayings*⁸ Karmay enumerates the *Sems smad sde dgu* as [1] *gab pa dgu skor*, [2] *khu byug* and seven smaller texts known as [3—9] *Sems phran sde bdun*. There are a variety of texts containing the phrase *Nine Hidden* (*gab pa dgu*) in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*; our challenge will be finding the precise texts intended. Kapstein breaks new ground in his consideration of the *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* (Kapstein, 2009), but he doesn't seem to share our preoccupation with precisely identifying the root text. As the Bon canon has a number of major titles containing *khu byug* we face a similar challenge of finding the precise text intended.

As we dive in to find the titles of the texts that constitute the remainder of the nine sections (*i.e.*, the *Seven Smaller Texts on Mind* [*Sems phran sde bdun*]), the water becomes even murkier. What may constitute the *Seven Smaller Texts on Mind* (*Sems phran sde bdun*) is not at all clear from either *A Catalogue of the Bon Kanjur* or *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts* (Karmay, 2003). Given that these Mind Section works are treasures of gShen chen Klu dga', we look to the comprehensive treatment of the treasures of that treasure revealer in Martin's book entitled *Unearthing Bon Treasures* (Martin, 2001). In his discussion of the "Nine series of lesser Mental Class Texts" Martin simply reiterates Karmay's terse description cited above.⁹ Annotating a biography of rMe'u dGongs mdzod Ri khrod pa¹⁰ Kvaerne's explanation of "*sems phran*" as perhaps the "*sems phran bdun*" also credits a personal communication from Samten Gyaltsen Karmay. From Karmay onward, not one particular title of a text in the *Seven Smaller Texts on Mind* (*Sems phran sde bdun*) is ever mentioned. In short, while Tibetan authors consider the *Nine Minor Texts on Mind* (*sems smad sde dgu*) to be important works in the Bon tradition, aside from a consideration of only one of these nine texts, *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* (Kapstein, 2009), the totality of what has been published in the West on these texts Mind has been largely confined to the contents of one terse footnote by Samten Karmay.

In order to improve our understanding of these early texts that Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen classifies as the exemplary Mind Section literature in Bon we will work in Section 1 to systematically identify the root text among the collection of works associated with *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden*, as well as to catalog the variant titles of the Minor Texts on Mind as they have occurred over time. To construct this list of variant titles we will use the following five resources:

- The list of gShen chen Klu dga's Southern Treasures found in the *sGa ston gyi gter gyi kha byang* as published in *Collection of Rare Bonpo Texts* (Namgyal, 2009);
- The *gSang ba bsen thub kyi rgyud* (*gSang ba bsen thub*, 2004) together with its commentary, the *bKod pa'i rgyan* (*bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2004), by

⁸ *The Treasury of Good Sayings*, p. 51 n. 8

⁹ In other words, *Unearthing Bon Treasures*, p. 65 n. 42, simply references *The Treasury of Good Sayings*, p. 51 n. 8.

¹⁰ "Bonpo Studies: The A Khrid System of Meditation" (Kvaerne, 1973).

the 13th century author 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan, as published by the Bon Dialectic School;

- Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen's *The Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness* (*dByings rig mdzod*, Volume 1) ; and
- The work on lineage transmission by dBra ston Ngag dbang sKal bzang bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan as quoted in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*.

In Section 2 we will then work to identify instances of the texts themselves among the Bon *Kangyur*, Bon *Tengyur*, and other independently published works. In particular, we will identify editions of this literature in four publications:

- The third edition of the Bon *Kangyur* edited by Mongyal Lhasé (Lhasé, 1999).
- An edition of the *Tengyur* as cataloged in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*.
- A collection of Minor Texts on Mind from Triten Norbutse entitled *The Cycle of the Nine Minor Texts on Mind: Scriptures of the Highest Dzogchen*. (*Sems smad sde dgu*, 2005).
- A text entitled *gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spung sgron ma gsal ba'i tantra las ngang thag bskal pa'i sgron ma ston* that is collected with other texts together in a book entitled *sPyi spungs rin po che a dkar gsang sngags kyi bka' srung drwa ba nag po'i rgyud skor*, (Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974).

In Section 3 we will try to understand how these early texts of the Mind Section of Bon work together with elements from tantra to form a coherent program of practice in Bon as described in a commentary of 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan, as practiced today in the Geshe training of sMan ri Monastery, and as described by Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen in *The Treasury of Space and Awareness*.

1. Clarifying the Titles of the Texts that Constitute the Principal Early Works of the Mind Section of Bon

In our efforts to establish a list of the titles in the Nine Minor Texts on Mind (*Sems smad sde dgu*) we face three challenges. The first is simply to establish a list of candidates for inclusion. The second is to make correspondences among different variations of the titles of the same texts. The third is to reconcile lists of names to some over-arching system of enumeration, such as "the Nine Minor [Texts of the] Mind Section (*Sems smad sde dgu*)."¹ We will begin by an examination of a list of Minor Texts on Mind found in gShen chen Klu dga's Southern Treasures.

1.1 *gShen chen Klu dga's Southern Treasures*

An account of the hiding of the Bon treasures at the time of King Gri gum btsad po and their discovery by *gShen Klu dga'* (996-1035)¹¹ has been published in *Collection of Rare Bonpo Texts* (Namgyal, 2009). This account, attributed to the Bon scholar *sGa ston Tshul khrims rgyal mtshan*, contains a section on the Southern Treasures.¹² The following extract from this account gives an early description of texts discovered by *gShen chen Klu dga'* (formatting added for visual clarity):

“As for the emergence of the Facets of Mind (*sems phyogs*), Nine Minor Texts on Mind (*Sems smad sde dgu*):

1. *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden (Gab pa dgu skor)*
2. *The Golden Weighty¹³ Scripture (gSer gyi lung non)*
3. *The Lesser Scripture (Lung chung)*
4. *Resting Freely of the Mind (Sems kyi cog bzhag)*
5. *The Cuckoo of Mind-Awareness (Rig pa sems kyi khu byug)*
6. *The Continuity of Awareness (Rig pa rgyun thag)*
7. *The Continuity of Transmission (Lung rgyun thag)*
8. *Resting Loosely (Lhug 'jug)*
9. *View and Meditation in One Page (lta sgom shog gcig ma).¹⁴*

While the names of the first eight texts are readily apparent and need relatively little decoding, it was initially unclear how this list constituted Nine Minor Texts on Mind (*Sems smad sde dgu*). We thank Jean-Luc Achard for unravelling the title of the ninth text.

For further identification of the texts of the Mind Section we turn to an important tantric work within the Bon *Kangyur*, the *gSang ba bsen thub*.

1.2 *The Enumeration of the Texts on Mind in the gSang ba bsen thub*

The *gSang ba bsen thub* is not evident in the versions of the *Kangyur* found in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*; however, the tantric cycle may be found as Volume 145 in Mongyal Lhasé's edition of the *Kangyur* as cataloged in the *Handlist*, as well as volume 193 of the *Tengyur* as described in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bon Katen Texts*. For convenience we will use a modern edition of the *gSang ba bsen thub* written in *dbu can* script published by the

¹¹ This date is mentioned incidentally in the biography of Blo gros rgyal mtshan by Jean-Luc Achard at <http://www.treasuryoflives.org/biographies/view/Azha-Lodro-Gyeltsen/13092>.

¹² Namgyal, 2009, p. 94–102. Martin suggests this text belongs to the late 14th century (*Unearthing Bon Treasures*, 2001), p. 280.

¹³ In rendering the Tibetan word “non” as “Weighty” we attempt to give the dual associations of mental reflection and the ability to weigh down, without the heaviness (pun intended) of terms such as “suppressive” or “oppressive.”

¹⁴ Namgyal, 2009, p. 100: *sems phyogs sems smad sde dgu byung ba la/ gab pa dgu skor/ gser gyi lung non/ lung chung sems kyi cog bzhag /rig pa sems kyi khu byug/ rig pa rgyun thag/ lung rgyun thag /lhug 'jug lta sgom shog gcig ma/*.

Bon Dialectic School (*gSang ba bsen thub*, 2004). In Chapter 29 of the *gSang ba bsen thub*, entitled *Teaching the Branches of Practice*, we find (formatted for visual clarity):

“As for the mirrors of the immutable enlightened body:

- The mirror of methods, activity (*spyod pa*) in the The Single (*rkyang*) and Combined (*sbag*) *Thigle*
 - The mirror of apprehending, The Greater Golden Weighty Scripture
 - The mirror of abiding, apprehending the root, the Minor Scripture
 - The mirror of speech, the playfully resounding (*sgrogs*) Cuckoo
 - The mirror of mind, the state of equality, Resting Freely,
 - The mirror of clarity, prolonging the Continuity of Awareness
 - The mirror of meditation (*sgoms*), sustaining (*skyong*) the Continuity of Transmission
 - The mirror of the phases¹⁵ (*bskal pa*), splicing together the rope of the Continuity of State
 - Resting Loosely, pointing to the insubstantiality of appearances.
- Practice these as the principles (*don*) of the branches of the primordial Shen (*ye gshen*).¹⁶

Note also that this direct quote immediately above classifies the texts referred to as “the nine mirrors” in the 8th Vehicle of the Primordial *gShen* and not the 9th Vehicle of Dzogchen. Kapstein gives a concise presentation of the Nine Vehicles according to the system of the Southern Treasures of *gShen chen kLu dga'* in Kapstein, 2009. His translation indicates that according to the *The Commentary of the Four Clever Men*¹⁷ the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is classified as belonging to the 9th or Highest Vehicle. One of the principle distinguishing features between the 8th and 9th Vehicles is that there is no conceptual activity in the entrance to the 9th Vehicle. Unfortunately, a resolution between the tri-partition of Bon Dzogchen by Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen as briefly discussed in the Introduction, and the classification scheme of the Nine Vehicles, is beyond the scope of this article.

¹⁵ The *gSang ba bsen thub* and its commentary use *bskal pa* in a highly technical way. Geshe Chaphur Lhundup explains the *bskal pa bzhi* as birth/generation (*skye*), abiding/sustaining (*gnas*), declining (*'jig*), and empty (*stong ba*). These four phases can be on the scale of a single individual life or an entire eon. Compare with the archaic use of *bskal ba* as “bar chod” meaning “interruption” as defined in *Bod yig brda rnying tshig mdzod*, p. 39.

¹⁶ *gSang ba bsen thub*, 2004, page 76: /'gyur ba med pa'i sku yi me long du/ /thabs kyi me long thig le rkyang sbags spyod/ /'dzin pa'i me long gser gyi long non che/ /gnas pa'i me long lung phran rtsa bar zungs/ /gsung gi me long khu byug rol bar sgrogs/ /thugs kyi me long cog bzhas mnyam pa'i ngang / /gsal ba'i me long rig pa'i rgyun thag bsring / /sgom pa'i me long lung gi rgyun thag skyongs/ /bskal pa'i me long sems kyi ngang thag mthud/ /snang la dngos med mdzub tshugs lhug par zhog /ye gshen yan lag don du 'di spyod cig/.

¹⁷ Another name for the *Sems lung gab pa dgu skor gyi 'grel ba rgya cher bshad pa*, *Tengyur* 216-5.

1.3 The Enumeration of the Works on Mind in the *yid bzhin bkod pa'i rgyan*

Significant help in the identification of variant names is given by the *bKod pa'i rgyan*,¹⁸ a commentary to the *gSang ba bsen thub* written by 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan (1198–1263).¹⁹ A full list of the names of texts that constitute the “nine mirrors” as in the *bKod pa'i rgyan*²⁰ is shown in Part 1 of Appendix B and will not be repeated here. We find in the *bKod pa'i rgyan* a number of useful minor variants of names relative to the other four sources we consider in this Section; however, two variants will be particularly important. First we should note that since the *bKod pa'i rgyan* is a commentary on the *gSang ba bsen thub*, we can be confident that the names in the commentary that refer to the texts of the “nine mirrors” should correspond with the names of the texts of the “nine mirrors” in the root. With this we can obviate two potential sources of confusion. The first is the confirmation of a correspondence of a single text entitled *lung phran* in the *gSang ba bsen thub* with the text entitled *lung non chung* in the *bKod pa'i rgyan*. The meaning of the Tibetan words “*phran*” and “*chung*” is similar; however, as in the case of gShen Chen Klu dGa's discoveries, the phrase *sems phran* is periodically used to refer to an entire family of Smaller (*phran*) [Texts on] Mind. Another potential point of confusion is obviated by the establishment of equivalence between the text entitled *sems kyi ngang thag mthud* and the text entitled *ngang thag*. Given the difficulty of finding even a single legitimate instance of a text by either name, were it not for the mention of these variants in the discussion of the nine mirrors in 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan's commentary, we might be forever wondering whether these two titles reference the same text.

1.4 Description and Enumeration of the Titles of Minor Texts on Mind by Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen

Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen's two Volumes of *The Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness* contain his masterwork on the theory and practice of Dzogchen. Shardza puts himself to the task of enumerating the *sems sde* literature in the first volume of the *Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness* where he writes:

The nature of the sections of the tantras to be explained ... has three parts: the *Smaller [Texts on] Mind* (*sems phran*), the *Cycles of Propagation*, and the *Cycles of Scriptural Tradition*.²¹

Enumerating the first of these three Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen continues:

¹⁸ *bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2004.

¹⁹ Dates in the biography of Blo gros rgyal mtshan by Jean-Luc Achard at the website <http://www.treasuryoflives.org/biographies/view/Azha-Lodro-Gyeltsen/13092>.

²⁰ *bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2004, p. 485.

²¹ *dByings rig mdzod*, vol. 1, p. 46ff: *bshad bya rgyud sde'i rang bzhin/ go rim so so'i nges pa'o/ dang po la gsum ste/ sems phran gyi skor dang / bsgrags pa'i skor dang / bka' brgyud kyi skor ro/ dang po la gsum ste/ grangs nges/ dgos ched/ go rim mo/*.

As for the first, the root is the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* (*gab pa dgu skor*) and the branches are the *Nine Minor [Texts] on Mind* (*sems smad dgu*) or the nine mirrors of minor tantras (*rgyud phran me long dgu*).²²

Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen then goes on to quote the *gSang ba bsen thub* to give his full enumeration of the Nine Mirrors. As we have just quoted the *gSang ba bsen thub* directly in the previous section we will not reiterate Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen's version here but only add Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen's quotation of the titles to our growing list of variants of titles of the Minor Texts on Mind in Appendix B: Part 1. We will treat Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen's discussion of *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* and *The Nine Small Texts on Mind* in detail later in Section 3.3, but for now we only wish to note a few pieces of additional information that will be useful in identifying the texts. First, Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen gives us the number of chapters of several of these texts. *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is noted as having thirty-seven chapters, and this information is added to Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen's titles of the texts in Appendix B: Part 1. Second Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen gives us a sensible enumeration of the texts. He identifies the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* as the root text and then goes on to enumerate nine minor texts as synonymous with the Nine Mirrors; however, we can see that sGa ston's list of the Nine Minor Texts on Mind in Section 1.1 doesn't fully reconcile with the Nine Mirrors of the *gSang ba bsen thub* in Section 1.2. Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen warns us that the *Continuity of Bodhicitta* (*Byang chub sems kyi nyag thag*), which the *bKod pa'i rgyan* enabled us to associate with *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*),²³ was already lost in his time. Finally, although he includes the mention of *The Single and Combined Thigle* (*Thig le rkyang sbag*) in his quote from the *gSang ba bsen thub*, he never mentions this text again in the entire two volumes of his *Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness*.

1.5 Mind Section Titles from the Lineage of Transmission, the *brGyud rim*

Another helpful text is a description of lineage transmission by Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen's disciple and biographer, dBra ston Ngag dbang sKal bzang bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan, referred to as the "*brgyud rim*" in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*.²⁴ We quote this text indirectly from *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*. (We have added line-breaks to facilitate grouping the texts.)

bla ma gshen chen klu dgas dngos grub tu rnyed pa'i byang sems gab pa dgu skor la / byang sems gab pa'i gzhung lung gi yi ge dgu pa / yan lag bcu pa'i le tshan / zur rdeg (?) [sic] yan lag lnga pa / mde'u thung yan lag bzhi pa'am sum cu rtsa bdun pa /

²² *Ibid.*, p. 46ff: *dang po la rtsa ba gab pa dgu bskor dang / yan lag sems smad sde dgu 'am rgyud phran me long dgu yod de/*.

²³ See the discussion of Section 1.3.

²⁴ The full title of the text is: *sKu gsum ston pa'i gsung rab bka' 'gyur rin po che'i lung rgyun ji snyed pa phyogs gcig tu bsdus pa'i bzhugs byang brgyud rim bcas pa dri med shel gyi phreng ba*.

'bru tig gi 'grel ye shes drug cu rtsa gnyis 'bru la bcar te bshad pa / mde'u
thung gi yan lag the tshom yang khol du bstan pa / bchings tshad kyi le'u /
byang sems gab pa'i gzhung gi sa bcad / mkhas bzhis [illeg. mchan] gab
'grel / [343] [illeg. mchan]

sems phran gyi skor la / gser gyi lung non che chung gnyis dbu 'chad le'u
bcas / rig pa khu byug gi rtsa 'grel sa bcad bcas / cog bzhag gi rtsa 'grel sa
bcad bcas / rig pa'i rgyun thag gi gzhung 'grel pa sa bcad bcas / lung gi
rgyun thig gi rtsa ba / 'grel pa / sems kyi ngang thag gi gzhung 'grel pa sa
bcad / snang la dngos med mdzub tshug lhug pa bzhag pa'i le'u bcas.²⁵

With the list of Mind Section texts in the quotation above, we now feel ready to make some adjudication of the titles of the principal works of the Mind Section of Bon, and in particular on what works constitute the Minor Texts on Mind.

1.6 Initial Conclusion: A List of the Principle Early Works on the Mind Section in Bon

We are thankful for Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen's identification (see Section 1.4) of the root text of *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* as having thirty-seven chapters. This indicates that the particular root text is *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta* (*Byang sems gab pa dgu skor*) in thirty-seven chapters. This will be more fully explained in Section 2.1.

As for what constitutes the Minor Texts on Mind, the situation is not quite as straightforward. The results of our inventory of titles associated with the Minor Texts on Mind are assembled in Part I of Appendix B. The obvious similarity of titles from among the variants we have gathered has naturally built our confidence. In addition, Blo gros rgyal mtshan's commentary to the *gSang ba bsen thub*, the *bKod pa'i rgyan*, has helped us to gain confidence to find equivalents among the various titles for *The Lesser Golden Weighty Scripture* (*gSer gyi lung non chung*) and *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*). In the end we identify the following nine texts as the Nine Mirrors:

1. *The Single and Combined Thigle* (*Thig le rkyang sbag*)
2. *The Greater Golden Weighty Scripture* (*gSer gyi lung non che*)
3. *The Lesser Golden Weighty Scripture* (*gSer gyi lung non chung*)
4. *The Cuckoo of Awareness* (*Rig pa'i khu byug*)
5. *Resting Freely* (*Cog bzhag*)
6. *The Continuity of Awareness* (*Rig pa rgyun thag*)
7. *The Continuity of Transmission* (*Lung thag*)
8. *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*)
9. *Resting Loosely* (*Lhug par bzhag*).

²⁵ *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*, p. 438. This corresponds to pp. 342–343 of the *brGyud rim*. Regrettably, in *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* this volume has no number and as a result it was not properly cataloged in the *Handlist*.

We may now finally give full meaning to Karmay's famous footnote in *The Treasury of Good Sayings*.²⁶ Following Tshul khrim rgyal mtshan's enumeration in *A Commentary on the Complete Discernment of the Secret Principles*²⁷ if we subtract the work *The Single and Combined Thigle* and remove, as Karmay did, *The Cuckoo of Awareness* from the list above, then we do indeed get *Seven Smaller Texts on Mind* (*Sems phran sde bdun*).

Alternatively, we can identify a different list of the *Seven Smaller Texts on Mind* (*Sems phran sde bdun*) by simply following third paragraph of the *brGyud rim* as quoted above. Among the list of minor texts we should not forget *View and Meditation in One Page* or that some also include *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* as a minor text on mind. Adding these to the list of nine titles above gives us eleven different titles. As a result we will use *Minor Texts on Mind* to generally refer to any subset of this complete list of eleven titles. We now turn to locate the texts associated with these titles.

2.0 Identifying Editions of Texts Associated with these Titles

We now locate the texts associated with the titles identified in Section 1 as distilled into Appendix B, Part 1. We will review published editions of the *Bon Kangyur*, *Tengyur*, as well as other independent publications.²⁸

2.1 *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden in the Bon Kangyur and Tengyur*

A volume entitled *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden Sprout, Bodhicitta* (*Byang chub sems kyi myu gu gab pa dgu skor*) is described as number 74 (running number 99) in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*. Six independent texts are identified in this volume and the best candidate for the root text we are seeking is entitled *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta* (*Byang sems gab pa dgu skor*). The associated running entry for this text, numbered 99.2, carefully identifies a list of eighteen "chapter titles", but is unable to relate them to the nine chapters that they anticipate from the *Kangyur* catalogs (*dkar chags*) at the

²⁶ *The Treasury of Good Sayings*, p. 51, n.8.: "They [(the *sems smad sde dgu*)] are the *byang sems gab pa dgu skor* ... then the *khu-byug*, and lastly the seven small texts called *sems-phran sde-bdun* making nine in all."

²⁷ *gSang don rnam 'byed 'grel*, p. 38 (*Tengyur* 227-1 as cataloged in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*). This text also has meaningful descriptions of the names of the texts of the Nine Mirrors. Unfortunately we discovered this text too late to fully integrate its contents in this paper; however, we will use it later to identify *The Single and Combined Thigle*.

²⁸ For those most familiar with the *Kangyur* and *Tengyur* of the New Translation Schools, the notion of looking for the title of a text in both the *Kangyur* and *Tengyur* may be puzzling. The Introduction in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur* and the Introduction in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts* provide good context for what constitute the canonical collections of the *Bonpo Kangyur* and *Tengyur* respectively. Probably the most pertinent information is that the collection of texts cataloged in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts* and in the *Handlist* has a number of duplicates with elements of the *Bon Kangyur*.

catalogers' disposal. It is also hard to reconcile the eighteen chapter titles listed for this work in a *Catalog of the Bon Kanjur* to dBra ston's enumeration of titles associated with the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* that we reproduced in Section 1.5.

A volume of the *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Bon Kangyur* entitled *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden: the Sprout of Bodhicitta* (*byang chub sems kyi myu gu gab pa dgu skor*) is identified as Volume 172 in the *Handlist*. An investigation of the natural "chapter headings" of this volume doesn't clearly indicate any text with nine chapters either.

While absent from Volume 172 of *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Bon Kangyur*, the *Bon Tengyur* as described in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts* contains a text entitled *Outline of the Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta: (Byang chub gyi sems gab pa dbu skor gyi dgu'i sa gcod kyi le'u)*.²⁹ This short text describes the contents of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* as thirty-seven branches (*yan lag*) distributed over four sections:

- 1) byang chub sems kyi myu gu gab pa dgu skor (18 branches)
- 2) yan lag bcu ba (10 branches)
- 3) zur rdeg yan lag lnga pa (5 branches)
- 4) gab pa mde'u thung gi yan lag bzhi (4 branches)

These thirty-seven branches correspond well with Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen's identification of the thirty-seven "chapters" of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* mentioned in Volume 1 of the *Treasury of Space and Awareness* (See Section 1.4). These four divisions numbered above also correspond with the first four section titles in Volume 172 of *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Bon Kangyur*. We provide the entire table of contents for that volume in Appendix A. Finally, we may now see the correspondence with the titles in the first paragraph of the fragment of the dBra ston's *brGyud rim* presented in Section 1.5. Thus we can say with some confidence that these four texts (or sections or chapters) constitute the root text of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*. Moreover, we can shed light on the title "zur rdeg" which apparently puzzled the catalogers of *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*. Reading the *Outline of the Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta* we discover that the five branches (*yan lag lnga pa*) are five corners (*zur*) that are staked down (*rdeg*) by the great view (*lta ba chen pos*), hence the title *zur rdeg yan lag lnga pa*.

Another edition of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* may be found in volume 216-2 as described in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*. This edition corresponds exactly to the text with running number 99.2 in *Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*, and it has the same eighteen sections (or chapter) divisions noted in that latter catalog. Unfortunately, time has not permitted a reconciliation of this set of eighteen sections with the four texts and thirty-seven branches named above. There still remains the question: If there are not nine chapters in the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*, then what is "nine" about the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*? We will finally resolve this question in Section 3.1.

There are a number of commentaries on the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*. An extensive commentary known as *The Commentary of Four Sagacious Men*

²⁹ *Tengyur* 216-2.

(*mKhas pa'i bzhi 'grel ba*) or as *The Very Extensive Commentary on the Nine Cycles of the Hidden: Mind and Scripture* is found as 216-5 in the *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*. This commentary is the focus of a paper by Kapstein (Kapstein, 2009) and his article serves as one of the few investigations of the Bon Mind Section literature in the English language. Unfortunately, a broader consideration of the numerous commentaries and supplemental literature of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is beyond the scope of this article.

We now turn to identify the various editions of the Minor Texts on Mind.

2.2 *The Minor Texts on Mind in the Bon Kangyur and Tengyur*

Although they are hidden behind a single title and entry — *Tengyur* 164-6 *gser gyi lung non che chung* — in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*, seven of the Minor Texts on Mind listed in Section 1.6, together with their commentaries, may be found in the *Tengyur* volume 164. In addition, following a brief colophon at the end of the *Commentary on Resting Freely* (*cog bzhas gi 'grel ba*) is a text that begins with “from the scripture of generalities on meditation” (*spyi sgom pa'i lung las*) and ends with a title “view and meditation [in] one [page]” (*lta sgom cig pa*) and a statement that indicates that this text is from the *terma* system of sGom chen gShen chen klu dga'.³⁰ Here “hiding in plain sight” is an edition of *View and Meditation in One Page* (see Section 1.1). This publication of the minor texts ends on page 501 with a sobering note, echoed by Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen, that the *Byang chub sems kyi nyag thag*, which we associate with the minor text entitled *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*), has been lost.

While the titles of the Minor Texts on Mind listed in Section 1.6 cannot be found in the first two editions of the *Kangyur* as described in *A Catalogue of the Bon Kanjur*, we will apparently find eight of them in volume 172 of *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* as described in the *Handlist*. The six texts found in the *Tengyur* all have counterparts in this edition of the *Bon Kangyur*. The *Cuckoo of Awareness* may also be found here together with an outline (*sa gcod*), and commentary (*'grel*). Most exciting is the fact that we find even the *Continuity of State*, an *Outline*, and a *Commentary* (*Ngang thag gi gzhung 'grel pa sa bcad*) with the title just as we would expect from dBra' ston's *brGyud rim* quoted in Section 1.5, although these texts were indicated as lost by Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen as well as by the compilers of the *Tengyur*.

Unfortunately, the edition of the *Continuity of State* found in the *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* does not bear up to careful scrutiny. An independent title page is given for the outline of the text, *Sems kyi ngang thag 'thud*,³¹ however, the brief colophon at the end of the text gives the name of the text as the *Rig pa sems kyi rgyun thag gi sa gcod*. This is not among the variants of the title of the *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*) that we have found. The core text is entitled the *Ngang thag gzhung*,³² but the colophon gives the

³⁰ *Tengyur* 164, pages 439 -444. Thanks go to to Jean-Luc Achard for alerting us to this text.

³¹ *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Bon Kangyur*, vol. 172, p. 547.

³² *Ibid.*, p. 545.

title as the *Sems lung gi rgyun thag gis rkyus*. So, in fact, we find that the text itself is merely a variant edition of the *Continuity of Transmission of Mind* (*Sems lung gyi rgyun thag*) that appears only a few pages before in the same edition of the *Kangyur*.³³ Similarly, the commentarial text entitled *Commentary on the Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag gis 'grel ba*) is merely a variant edition of the *Lung gyi rgyun thag 'grel* that appears only a few pages before.³⁴ Thus, while *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* indicates that it contains the outline, root text, and commentary of *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*), in fact it only presents variant editions of the *The Continuity of Transmission* (*Sems lung gi rgyun thag*) with erroneous titles. While it is unsettling to find such an error in the third edition of a canonical collection, perhaps this inaccuracy justifies to some extent the efforts of this article. This volume of the *Kangyur* does not appear to have an edition of *View and Meditation in One Page*.

2.4 Triten Norbutse Edition of the Minor Texts on Mind

A book entitled *The Cycle of Nine Minor Texts on Mind: Scriptures of the Highest Tradition of Dzogchen* (*Bla med rdzogs pa chen po'i bka' sems smad sde dgu'i skor bzhuks so*)³⁵ has been published by the library of the Bon monastery Triten Norbutse. The introduction of the work expresses the humble goal of producing a convenient and easy to use (*spyod bde*) book, relative to the hard to obtain and bulky volumes of the canonical works. To identify their list of the minor texts on mind the compilers use the "Nine Mirrors" as described in 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan's commentary on the *gSang ba bsen thub* much as we used them in Section 1.3, but no mention is made of sGa ston's list of Minor Works on Mind (Section 1.1). No specific editions of the minor texts on mind that are used to produce the book are mentioned. The compilers apparently discovered, as we did, that the versions of root text (*gzhung*) and commentary (*'grel ba*) of the *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*)³⁶ in *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* are in fact none other than *The Continuity of Transmission* (*Lung gi rgyun thag*), and as a result they did not reprint those texts. This book does contain an edition of *View and Meditation in One Page*³⁷, but it is included, without so much as a linespace, with the colophon for *Resting Freely* and before the outline of *Continuity of Awareness*. The text here in these pages differs from the Tengyur edition discussed in Section 2.3, so it seems that they were likely working from another edition than that compiled in the Tengyur.

2.5 Identifying the Missing *ngang thag*

In the introduction to *The Cycle of Nine Minor Texts on Mind: Scriptures of the Highest Tradition of Dzogchen* (*Sems smad dgu*, 2005) the compilers indicate

³³ *Ibid.*, p. 533.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 533.

³⁵ *Sems smad sde dgu*, 2005.

³⁶ Although they quote the *Kangyur* title as *ngang thag le'u*.

³⁷ *Sems smad sde dgu*, 2005. pp. 140-142.

that they do set themselves to the task of finding a version of the *Ngang thag*, and they look to *gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spungs sgron ma gsal ba'i tantra* where they find the text entitled *Ngang thag bskal pa'i sgron ma*. They leave the reader to ascertain whether this is or is not the missing *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*).

We could not find the title "*sgron ma gsal ba'i tantra*" using any of the catalogs at our disposal, but at the suggestion of Jean-Luc Achard³⁸ we looked to an Indian reprint of the *Drwa ba nag po'i rgyud skor*.³⁹ The initial text of that bound volume is indeed entitled *gSas 'khar rin po che spyi spung sgron ma gsal ba'i tan tra las ngang thag bskal pa'i sgron ma ston*. We find in the colophon of this first work the title *bsKal pa'i me long sems kyi ngang thag mthud* and in the following pages we find a commentary entitled *sams ngang thag don 'grel*. This edition, together with its archaic spellings, seems to be the edition reprinted in *The Cycle of Nine Minor Texts on Mind: Scriptures of the Highest Tradition of Dzogchen*.⁴⁰

Is this work, together with its commentary, the missing *Continuity of State* (*ngang thag*) indicated as lost by the compilers of the *Bon Tengyur* as well as Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen? The self-reference of this work as the mirror of the phases (*bskal pa'i me long*), echoing the *gSang ba bsen thub* and its commentary, is encouraging. For further evidence we note that, aside from its mention during the enumeration of the Nine Mirrors, the *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*) is mentioned in 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan's *bKod pa'i rgyan* two times. First there is a direct quote from the *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*):

bKod pa'i rgyan: Second, as for conduct of wisdom: "Being free from cause to act and object of action, conduct is totally unceasing." As this is stated in the *Ngang thag* [it has] three [parts].⁴¹

This quote is found exactly in the text, *Sems kyi ngang thag mthud*, from the *drwa ba nag po* (the identical passage is underlined):

Ngang thag: "The lion as an exemplar of power: Being free from cause to act and object of action, conduct is totally unceasing. As that conduct is without attachment, it is pure conduct. It is the principle of skillful action that transcends everything."⁴²

Later 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan's *bKod pa'i rgyan* states:

³⁸ Jean-Luc Achard: personal communication.

³⁹ Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974.

⁴⁰ *Sems smad dgu*, 2005.

⁴¹ *bKod pa'i rgyan*, etext, p. 219: *gnyis pa shes rab kyi spyod pa la bya rgyu bya yul med pa la spyod pa gar yang ma 'gag te zhes ngang thag las gsung pas na gsum ste/*.

⁴² *Drwa wa nag po* (Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974), p. 3: *seng ge stobs kyi dpe mtshan cing / bya rgyu bya yul myed pa la/ spyod pa gar yang ma 'gags ste/ spyod la ma chags rnam dag spyod/ bya rtsal kun las 'das pa'i don/*.

Through skillful training in the *bardos* of the four phases⁴³ (*bskal pa bzhi*) [and] through the [teachings of the] *Ngang thag* the interfaces of the past and future lives are stitched together.⁴⁴

Indeed, in our text under consideration, the *Sems kyi ngang thag mthud*, training regarding the *bardos* of the four phases is a significant topic. In the absence of further quotations or other evidence it is difficult to make a final judgment regarding this candidate for the *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*), but everything we have learned about this text supports its identification as an edition of the *Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*) of the Nine Mirrors (See Section 1.2).

2.7 Editions of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* and Minor Texts on Mind, a Summary

A summary of our efforts in identifying editions of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* and Minor Texts on Mind, together with a table of contents for most of the texts, is given in Part 2 of Appendix B. Briefly, for the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* we have editions in both *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* (volume 172) and the *Bon Tengyur* (volume 216-2). For six of the Minor Texts on Mind – *The Greater Golden Weighty Scripture*, *The Lesser Golden Weighty Scripture*, *Resting Freely*, *The Continuity of Awareness*, *The Continuity of Transmission*, and *Resting Loosely* – we have editions in the *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* (volume 172), and in the *Bon Tengyur* (volume 164). In *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* (volume 172), we have an edition of the *Cuckoo of Awareness* and an additional edition of the *Continuity of Transmission* incorrectly labeled as the *Continuity of State*. In the *Bon Tengyur* (volume 164) we have an edition of gShen chen Klu dga's *View and Meditation in One Page*. All of these texts have been reprinted in an edition that was recently published at Triten Norbutse Monastery (*Sems smad sde dgu*, 2005), although *View and Meditation in One Page* is quite hard to find there. We had to look beyond the *Kangyur* and *Tengyur* for sources for an edition of the *Continuity of State*; however, we did find a promising candidate for this text in a book entitled *gSas 'khar rin po che spyi spung sgron ma gsal ba'i tan tra las ngang thag bskal pa'i sgron ma ston* (Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974), and a modern edition as well (*Sems smad sde dgu*, 2005). Identifying an edition of the *Single and Combined Thigle* (*thig le rkyan sbag*) has not been straightforward and we will revisit this topic again in Section 3.5 and Appendix C.

Briefly reviewing the sizes of the root texts of this literature may also be useful. *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is approximately 94 manuscript pages (See Appendix A.) *The Greater Weighty Scripture* is comparably sized. The

⁴³ As mentioned before, the *gSang ba bsen thub* and the *bKod pa'i rgyan* use *bskal pa* in an archaic way to mean "bar chod" or interruption or phase. Compare with *bskal ba* in *Bod yig brda rnying tshig mdzod*, p. 39.

⁴⁴ *bKod pa'i rgyan*, etext, p. 219: *bskal pa bzhi'i bar do la rtsal sbyong bas ngang thag gis tshe snga phyi mtshams mthud pa*.

Continuity of State is 30 manuscript pages. The remaining root texts are all relatively small – under 20 pages of manuscript each.

Having established our universe of discourse, we now turn to say something about the subject matter of these texts.

3. The Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta and the Minor Texts on Mind as a System

In this section we now consider the content of the early literature of Bon Mind Section, beginning with the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta*.

3.1 *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta*

Because of its size, influence, and diversity of commentaries, the *Nine Hidden* (*Gab pa dgu*) must be considered the principal work on the Mind Section among gShen chen Klu dga's treasures. There still remains the question: If there are not nine chapters in the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*, then what is "nine" about the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*? Fortunately, our question has been anticipated by the authors of the *Outline of the Nine Cycles of the Hidden* (Tengyur 216-1) mentioned in Section 2.1. This short text gives a folk-etymology of the title of *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta*:

It is known as the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta*. Why is that?

In the ultimate sense, it is pure (*byang*) because the nature of the mind is primordially unborn;

It is perfect (*chub*) because it does not die;

It is a mind (*sems*) because it contemplates the non-dual principle.

It is hidden (*gab pa*) because it is difficult to realize and rare to understand.

It has nine cycles (*dgu skor*) because this pure and perfect mind (*byang chub sems*) is shown to be enveloped (*skor*) by nine principles from its beginning to its end.

This is the way to apply its name.⁴⁵

Among the literature associated with *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is a text known by the name *The Nine Letters of Scripture*. In the extensive commentary on the *Nine Hidden* (Tengyur 216-5) this name is also explained:

As for the *Nine Letters of Scripture*: The scripture of the *yung drung* mind is taught by nine principles from its beginning to its end.⁴⁶

⁴⁵ Tengyur 216-1, p. 6: byang chub kyi sems gab pa dgu bskor zhes bya ste/ de ci'i phyir zhe na/ don dam par sems kyi rang bzhin ye nas ma skyes pas ni byang / mi 'chi bas ni chub/ gnyis su med pa'i don la sems pas sems so/ / rtogs par dka' zhing rig par dkon pas gab pa/ mgo mjug tu don dgu dgus bskor nas byang chub kyi sems ston pas na dgu bskor ro/ / de ni mtshan gyi gdags lugs so/ / .

⁴⁶ Tengyur 216-5, p. 201 (pdf page 333): /lung gi yi ge dgu dang ldan pa ni/ g.yung drung sems kyi lung dgu skor mgo mjug tu don dgu dgu'i ston pa 'di'o/ / .

These descriptions of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta* indicate that the primary focus of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is the demonstration of *bodhicitta* or, by another name, *g.yung drung* mind. The term *bodhicitta* is used in its manner, characteristic of Mind Section literature, as synonymous with the nature of mind (*sems nyid*). Throughout the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* we will find numerous synonyms expressing different facets of *bodhicitta*. This point is also discussed in Kapstein's article on *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden*.⁴⁷ In fact, for reasons that will become clearer in Section 3.2 below, a significant portion of the root text of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is devoted to contrasting different synonyms of *bodhicitta* with facets of ordinary conceptual mind.

So what are the above-mentioned nine principles by which *bodhicitta* is taught? Given the diversity of systems of enumeration of principles, paths, *thigle*, branches, sections, systems and so forth as given in the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* and its commentaries, it is hard to be absolutely certain; however, we were able to determine only one passage which enumerates *exactly* nine principles (*don*) in the *Extensive Commentary on the Nine Cycles of the Hidden*. Quoting from that commentary:

Again, with regard to that, the condensed meaning is taught by nine principles:

It is taught as space [that is like an] unmoving ocean.

It is taught as primordial wisdom [that is like] an immutable fish.

It is taught as a condition that is free of movement or delusion.

It is taught as a dormancy that equalizes two extremes.

It is taught as a conclusion that is latent.

It is taught as an example that epitomizes the single *thigle*.

It is taught as a [pair of] metaphor and meaning regarding the non-duality of space and primordial wisdom.

It is taught as obtaining the result of the non-dual.

Ninthly, it is taught as the *bodhicitta* of the primordial itself.⁴⁸

We now wish to examine the teachings of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* in a broader context of practice.

3.2 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan on the Nine Cycles of the Hidden and the Minor Texts on Mind as a System

One of the most interesting questions we wish to understand is the relationship between the practice of these Mind Section works and the

⁴⁷ Kapstein, 2009, p. 109.

⁴⁸ *Sems lung gab pa dgu skor gyi 'grel ba rgya cher bshad pa in* (Byang sems gab pa dgu skor, etext), p. 367: *de la yang bsdus pa'i don dgu yis bstan te/ g.yo ba med pa'i rgya mtsho dbyings su bstan pa dang / 'gyur ba med pa'i nya ye shes su bstan pa dang / g.yo zhing 'khrul ba med pa'i rkyen bstan pa dang / mtha' gnyis mnyam pa'i bag la nyal ba bstan pa dang / bag la nyal pa'i mjug sdud bstan pa dang / thig le gcig la 'dus pa'i dpe bstan pa dang / dbyings dang ye shes gnyis su med pa'i dpe don bstan pa dang / gnyis med kyi 'bras bu thob par bstan pa dang / ye nyid kyi byang chub sems bstan pa dang dgu'o/.*

tantric practices that apparently served as their foundation. In his commentary on the *gSang ba bsen thub* 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtsan presents the Nine Mirrors (see Section 1.2) as working integrally with generation and completion stage practices.

What is the cycle of the nine *thigle*? As for the manner in which what is without distinctions (*mtshan ma med*) is discovered through [practices that use] distinctions (*mtshan ma*): It is through each of the nine cycles of principles (*don*) of three channels (*rtsa*), the three winds (*rlung*), and the three *thigle* (*thig le*) together with the nine cycles of the principles (*don*) of the Nine Mirrors ...⁴⁹

The three channels are surely the left, right and central (*dbu ma*) channels. In other words, they are the three principle channels of the subtle body. A broader reading of this commentary indicates that the three winds in this context refers to the three intensities of force used in practicing with the winds: gentle (*'jam rlung*), neutral (*ma ning*), or rough (*rtsub rlung*). The three *thigle* are associated with the wheels (*'khor lo*) of the subtle body: the white (associated with the crown wheel), the red (associated with the navel wheel) and the blue (associated with the heart wheel). In brief, to realize “that which is without distinction” the completion stage practices of channels, winds, and *thigle* are performed in conjunction with the Nine Mirrors that he also seems to consider equivalent to Nine Minor [Texts on] Mind (*sems smad dgu*).⁵⁰

'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan further nuances the uses of the Nine Mirrors a few pages later in his commentary, the *bKod pa'i rgyan*:

As for the method of practicing the principle (*don*) of bliss (*bde ba*): It is the union of father and mother, bliss and emptiness. As for the method: it is the Magical Display (*sgyu 'phrul*)⁵¹; through the generation stage of the peaceful and wrathful [deities] and the completion stage of the *thigles* one [obtains] the primordial Buddhahood that is the self-liberated effortless essence of *bodhicitta*.

The branches are the mirrors:

- the supreme one which clarifies the mind is the mirror of the enlightened body, namely (*ste*) The Single and Combined Thigle (*Thig le rkyang sbag*) which reveals the immutable principle of the the nature of mind (*sems nyid*); it occurs [similarly] in the *sGron ma* or in the present [text];

⁴⁹ *bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2004, p. 482: *gang yin na thig le dgu skor te mtshan mas mtshan med btsal ba ni rtsa gsum rlung gsum thig le gsum dang rnam me lo nga dgu dang bcas pa rnam don dgu dgu yis ...[bskor nas snod med la gsang zhing snod ldan la ston pas gsang ba de lam gzhan las 'phags pas mchog dang]...*

⁵⁰ *bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2004, p. 104: *cha lag me long dgu bskor ni sems smad dgu ste/ thabs kyi me long thig le rkyang sbrag spyod dol ...*

⁵¹ Presumably this is the set of practices given in the Chapter 9: the Magical Display—Secret Conduct (*sgyu 'phrul gsang spyod kyi le'u*) from the root tantra of the *gSang ba bsen thub*. This chapter occupies pp. 29–33 of *gSang ba bsen thub*, 2004.

- the apprehension (*'dzin*) of the [nature of] mind is the Greater Weighty Scripture (*Lung non che ba*) and the abiding in the recognized (*zin*) mind is the Lesser Weighty Scripture (*Lung non chung ba*);
- the mirror of speech, which generates inspiration and faith is the Cuckoo (*Khu byug*);
- the mirror of the mind, is the Resting Freely (*Cog bzhag*);
- the one which clarifies the principles of equality is the Continuity of Awareness (*Rig pa rgyun thag*);
- the one which prolongs clarity, without meditation and without distraction, is the Continuity of Transmission (*Lung rgyun thag*);
- the one through which one trains skillfully during the *bardo* of the four phases (*bskal pa*) is the Continuity of State (*Ngang thag*) and through that [training] the demarcation between past and future births is joined (*mthud*);
- the ultimate meaning of those [past and future births] and their resolution (*la zlo bas*) is Resting Loosely (*lhug par zhog*) directly pointing [to appearances as lacking substantial reality].⁵²

Through these, the Nine *Thigles* are revealed as the root-teachings of the volume (*mchong*).⁵³

In these two quotes 'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan describes a system of practice in which the practices of these Mind Section texts are highly integrated into a system of practice grounded in the tantric practices of the

⁵² Jean-Luc Achard suggests an alternative translation of the portions associated with the last two mirrors:

- the one through which one trains skillfully during the Bardo of the four Ages, is the *Ngang thag*;
- the demarcation between past and future births, as well as their ultimate meaning and their transcendence is directly pointed as being "the *Lhug-pa*."

We translated as we did because of the manner in which the more extensive titles of the texts associated with the Nine Mirrors (See Appendix B: Part I) are cleverly woven into the text. Thus we associate the phrase "*tshe snga phyi mtshams mthud pa*" with *The Continuity of State* and we complete "*mdzub tshugs lhug par zhog*" with "[*snang la dngos med*] *mdzub tshug lhug par bzhag*."

⁵³ *bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2004, pp. 484–485: *bde ba'i don nyams su len pa'i tshul ni bde stong yab yum gnyis med snyoms par 'jug ste/ tshul ni sgyu 'phrul te zhi khro'i bskyed rim dang thig le'i rdzogs rim kyi byang chub sems kyi ngo bo 'bad med rang grol du ye sangs rgyas pa'ol / de'i yan lag ni me long ste sems nyid gsal bar byed pa'i mchog la sku yi me long ste sems nyid mi 'gyur ba'i don ston pa thig le rkyang sbag ste sgron mar 'byung ba'am 'di nyid do / / sems 'dzin pa lung non che ba dang sems bzung ba gnas par byed pa lung non chung ba dang / spro zhing dang ba bskyed pa la gsung gi me long khu byug dang / thugs kyi me long cog bzhag gis mnyam pa'i don gsal bar byed pas rig pa rgyun thag dang / gsal ba la bsgom med yengs med du goms par byed pas lung rgyun thag dang / bskal pa bzhi'i bar do la rtсал sbyong bas ngang thag gis tshe snga phyi mtshams mthud pa dang de'i don mthar thug cing la zlo bas mdzub tshugs lhug par zhog ces bya'ol / des thig le dgu pa dngos pa'i mchong gi rtсал sdom du bstan pa'ol /.*

generation and completion stages. We will learn more of the practical application of this immediately below.

3.3 *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden in Contemporary Geshe Training at sMan ri Monastery*

Geshe Chaphur Lhundrup, a recent graduate of the Geshe degree program at sMan ri Monastery in Dolanji, India, was kind enough to share his experiences with training in the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* during his Geshe program. Questioned about the role of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* in his training, the Geshe brought out a text entitled *gSang don rnam 'byed 'phrul gyi lde mig*.⁵⁴ This text by mNyam med Shes rab rgyal mtshan is one of a number of texts memorized in the Geshe training. This particular text serves as the outline of the key topics of the Secret Principles (*gsang don*). The first few pages of this text describe the root practice of the assembled deities (*spyi spungs*) and its branches. The root is based on the *gSang ba bsen thub*. In this text are enumerated three branches: the Six Principles (*don drug*), the [Nine] Mirrors, and the two points. Among the Six Principles our text, *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden*, is associated with the principle of meditation. The [nine] mirrors are then auxiliaries (*cha lag*). The particular texts associated with the Nine Mirrors follows the *gSang ba bsen thub* as quoted in Section 1.2 with the minor exception that the title of the mirror of method is given as simply *Single and Combined* (*rKyang sbrag*) rather than *The Single and Combined Thigle* (*Thig le rkyang sbag*), as we saw it earlier in this paper.

In practice, our Geshe indicates that the emphasis is on the tantric practices of the *gSang ba bsen thub* and these practices are augmented by meditation on the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*. As the Nine Mirrors were merely auxiliaries, they received relatively little attention. In brief, it appears that the contemporary system of training at sMan ri monastery follows the general framework of practice described in the *gSang ba bsen thub* and its commentary the *bKod pa'i rgyan*.

3.4 *Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen on the Nine Cycles of the Hidden and the Minor Texts on Mind as an Integral System*

The final source we will use to understand how *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden* and the *Minor Texts on Mind* function in an integral system of practice is the works of Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen. In volume 1 of *The Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness* Shardza discusses these texts, their enumeration, value (*dgos ched*), and sequence of practice (*go rim*). His comments on the sequence of practice are translated and discussed below:

Third, as for the sequence of practice: Through the *Cuckoo* [of *Awareness*] inspiration is generated. Through the *Greater Weighty Scripture* the [nature of] mind is recognized. Through the *Lesser*

⁵⁴ *'Phrul gyi lde mig*, sMan ri.

[*Weighty Scripture*] that very recognition is made firm. These are the three branches of the preliminaries.

Through the root, *The Nine Cycles of the Hidden*, the principle (*don*) of the distinction between mind and primordial wisdom (*ye shes*) [is understood]. Through *Resting Freely* confidence in the immutable is generated. Through the two *Continuities [of Awareness and Transmission]* one cultivates familiarity [with the nature of mind], and through these one [engages in] the three branches of the real basic [practice]. Through the quintessential instruction on [*Resting Freely*] one cultivates habituation [with the nature of mind] without engaging in effort, and through that one becomes allied with the three branches of the basic (*gzhi*) [practice].⁵⁵

A review of the contents of the Minor Texts on Mind enables us to slightly elaborate Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen's descriptions: First, enthusiasm for practice is cultivated in the student through methods such as the twenty-one examples of generating hope and inspiration in the *Cuckoo of Awareness*. The student is then guided through a series of nine analytical meditations in the *Greater Weighty Scripture* aimed at enabling the student to analytically investigate, and eventually to recognize, the nature of his mind. This recognition of the nature of mind is stabilized by the *Lesser Weighty Scripture*.

Having recognized the nature of mind the student must gain facility in discriminating between everyday conceptual thought and primordial wisdom. To demonstrate the particular ability of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* to make distinctions between conceptual thought and primordial wisdom Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen quotes that text as follows:

Through the miraculous key of primordial wisdom (*ye shes*)
The bright green (*sngon po*) weed of delusion (*gti mug*) is separated
[out] (*dbye*).⁵⁶

In the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden*, this formula is repeated with dozens of various expressions of primordial wisdom paired with dozens of various expressions of conceptual thought.

The *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* continues to make its point through another poetic formula. One example of the formula is below:

The angry mind is like a demon (*bdud*).
The mind of loving kindness gives [it] a varnish (*rtsi*).
Nevertheless, that makes "nectar" (*bdud rtsi*).

⁵⁵ *dByings rig mdzod*, vol. 1, p. 48ff.: *gsum pa go rim ni khu byug gis spro ba bskyed/ lung non che bas sems bzung / chung ngus zin pa de nyid brtan par byed de sngon du 'gro ba'i yan lag gsum/ rtsa ba gab pa dgu bskor gyis sems dang ye shes phyed pa'i don la/ cog gzhas gis 'gyur med kyi gdengs bskyed/ rgyun thag gnyis kyis goms pa bskyed pas dngos gzhi 'gro ba'i yan lag gsum/ man ngag lhug pas goms pa bskyed pa la rtsol ba 'jug pa med pas gzhi'i yan lag gsum gyi grogs su 'gro ba'ol.*

⁵⁶ *dByings rig mdzod*, vol. 1, page 487: *ye shes 'phrul gyi lde mig gis gti mug tha ram sngon po dbye/.*

Equalizing the non-dual loving kindness and anger, [and]
 Sprinkling it with the dew of bodhicitta,
 Likewise, that makes “sprinkled dew.”⁵⁷

This formula continues with substitutions of each of the five mental afflictions, and over twenty other types of conceptual mind including analytical mind (*dpyod pa'i blo*), deluded mind (*'khrul pa'i blo*), clairvoyant mind (*mngon shes pa'i blo*) and so forth.⁵⁸

After gaining stability in discriminating between conceptual mind and the nature of mind, the student proceeds with the instruction of *Resting Freely*. In marked contrast to the directed investigations of the *Greater Weighty Scriptures*, *Resting Freely* guides the student on the manner of resting in that state using a series of terse quintessential instructions on topics such as gazes (*blta stangs*) and principles of the understanding (*shes don*). The emphasis throughout is on non-effort and resting, rather than willful effort. Through the instructions of the *Continuities of Awareness and The Continuity of Transmission* the student sustains familiarity with the nature of mind. Finally, in *Resting Loosely*, a teaching is given that is free from explanation (*shad du myed par bstan pa*) and the principle of non-meditation is demonstrated (*sgom du med pa'i don stan pa*).

3.5 Identifying the *Thig le rkyang sbag*

In the same bound volume in which we found *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*) we find a text with the title *Thig le dbyings ('chad) bsdus pa*.⁵⁹ In the same handwriting, in the pages that immediately follow appears a commentary entitled *Thig le dbyings kyi ti ga*.⁶⁰ In Appendix C we argue that this two are our best candidates for the *The Single and Combined Thigle* (*Thig le rkyang bag*) and its commentary. Our most important argument in Appendix C is based on a brief discussion of the Nine Mirrors in the *Commentary on Complete Discernment of the Secret Principles* (*gSang don rnam 'byed 'grel*, Tengyur 227-1)

⁵⁷ *Gab pa dgu skor*, e-text, p. 6ff.: */zhe sdang blo ni bdud 'dra la/ /byams pa'i sems ni rtsi 'dra gtong //bdud rtsi zhes kyang de la bya/ /byams sdang gnyis med mnyam pa la//byang chub sems kyi zil par thigs/ /zil thigs zhes kyang de la bya/*.

⁵⁸ This approach would be completely incomprehensible to the author had he not been exposed to a somewhat similar formula by the Karma Kagyu Mahāmudrā and Dzogchen master Khenpo Tsultrim Gyamtso (mKhan po Tshul khriṃs rgya mtsho). The Khenpo would have his students recite a formula that went, for example: “Anger is perfectly pure and therefore feelings are perfectly pure. Feelings are perfectly pure and therefore anger is perfectly pure. Thus anger, perfectly pure, and feelings, perfectly pure, are not dual, cannot be made dual, are not separate and are not different” (*zhe sdang rnam par dag pas/ tshor ba rnam par dag pa/ tshor ba rnam par dag pas/ zhen sdang rnam par dag pa ste/ de ltar na zhe sdang rnam par dag pa dang/ tshor ba rnam par dag pa 'di la gnyis su med de gnyis su byar med so so ma yin ta mi dad do/*). There were 110 different states of mind and states of realization that could be substituted in the formula and the resulting formulas would be repeated by some students for thousands of recitations. In this apparently childish exercise there was a surprisingly profound and lasting effect.

⁵⁹ Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974, pp. 78–95.

⁶⁰ Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974, pp. 97–138.

by Tshul khrims rgyal mtshan.⁶¹ In this the [*Thig le*] *dbyings 'chad* appears to be given as a variant title of the [*Thig le*] *rkyang sbag*.⁶² Moreover, the essential teaching of *The Single and Combined Thigle* (*Thig le rkyang sbag*) is described as the process of spreading out from the *Single Thigle* (*Thig le nyag gcig*) (corresponding to *rkyang*) to forty-five *thigle* that are associated with the peaceful deities of the *maṇḍala*, and then gathering this all back (corresponding to *sbag* or *sbrag*) into the *Single Thigle*. As this process of emanation and gathering of the forty-five deities is common to many practices associated with the *Maṇḍala of Peaceful and Wrathful deities* in Bon, we may never be able to conclusively prove that we have identified the exact text of *The Single and Combined Thigle*; however, we do believe that this is a viable candidate for that text. Equally important for us, with Tshul khrims rgyal mtshan's brief description of the practice of *The Single and Combined Thigle*, our Faustian anxiety regarding the existence of a lost text with unknown secret teachings has been mollified.

4. Summary and Conclusions

The objectives of this paper have been to clearly identify the titles of these texts that would, over time, constitute the early literature of the Mind Section of Bon, to identify the various editions in which they are available, and to begin to understand how they work together with other tantric elements to form a holistic system of training. Our approach has been to "assume nothing," and that approach has served us well. Our most trusted resource for Bon literature, *A Handbook for the Bon Kanjur*, was hampered by missing texts in the editions that it cataloged. *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts* was found to incompletely catalog texts that it did have at its disposal — cataloging only one of *The Minor Texts on Mind* when the edition it was cataloging actually contained six. Even our own *Handlist* failed us when it was posed with the modest challenge of cataloging an unnumbered volume.

The canon itself proved less than fully reliable. While *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur* indicates that it contains the outline, root text, and commentary of *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*), in fact it only presented variant editions of the *The Continuity of Transmission* (*Sems lung gi rgyun thag*) with the wrong titles.

Although we had some good reasons to doubt it,⁶³ in the end a small book, *The Cycle of Nine Minor Texts on Mind: Scriptures of the Highest Tradition of Dzogchen* (*Bla med rdzogs pa chen po'i bka' sems smad sde dgu'i skor*)⁶⁴ published with the modest ambition of creating a convenient and easy to use edition, proved to be our best single source of the literature of the Minor

⁶¹ Geshe Chaphur Lhundup suggests that this is a recent scholar at g.Yung drung gling monastery in Tibet, and that Tshul khrims rgyal mtshan was one of the teachers of the contemporary Bon scholar Yongs 'dzin bsTan 'dzin rnam dag (personal communication).

⁶² Tshul khrims rgyal mtshan deletes "*thig le*" from each of these titles.

⁶³ For examples see Achard, 2010.

⁶⁴ *Sems smad dgu*, 2005.

Texts on Mind. From our current perspective, that work has three deficiencies. The first is its failure, which we share, to provide a root text of *The Single and Combined Thigle (Thig le rkyang sbag)*. The second is the book's lack of clarity regarding the relevance of the *Commentary on the Space of the Thigle (Thig le dbyings kyi ti ka)* to the Nine Minor Texts on Mind. The final pervasive deficiency is that the precise sources of the texts that it assembles are unnamed and the criteria for the selection of these particular editions is not at all clear.

While we cannot claim to have discovered entirely new manuscripts or editions of any of the texts we consider, we have boosted confidence in the prior discovery of a candidate text for *The Continuity of State (Ngang thag)* that has long been thought lost. Altogether, we have identified and located all of sGa ston's Nine Minor Texts (Section 1.1)⁶⁵ and all but one of the *gSang ba bsen thub's* Nine Mirrors.⁶⁶ The failure to produce a compelling candidate for the "missing mirror," *The Single and Combined Thigle (Thig le rkyang sbag)*, does give a sense of a missing piece of a jigsaw puzzle. We just can't find a piece that fits the right spot; however, in Appendix C we identify texts that cover much the same semantic ground as *The Single and Combined Thigle*, and as a result we are confident we can at least cover the spot in the jigsaw puzzle left otherwise vacant by the missing piece.

In the process of writing this article we have come to question the correspondence between the *Nine Minor Texts on Mind* and the Nine Mirrors that 'A zha blo gros rgyal mtshan (Section 3.2), Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen (Section 1.4), and Tshul khriims blo gros rgyal mtshan (Appendix C) all seem to take for granted. Specifically, we do not find *View and Meditation (lta sgom shog cig ma)* among the Nine Mirrors and we do not find either *The Single and Combined Thigle (thig le rkyang sbag)* or *The Continuity of State (ngang thag)* among sGa ston's list of Nine Minor Texts on Mind (Section 1.1).

Unfortunately the labors entailed in achieving the first two objectives of this article have left us with little time or printed space to address the third. Nevertheless, we hope to have shed some light on the content of these texts and contextualized their role in practice. In particular we have observed two ways in which this early Mind Section literature has been used. The first is based on the tantric work of the *gSang ba bsen thub* and its commentary the *bKod pa'i rgyan*. In this the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is used as a principal text for meditation at the end of the culmination of the completion stage practices, and the Minor Texts on Mind are used as auxiliaries. This approach is continued today in the Geshe training program of sMan ri monastery in Dolanji, India.

The second approach is as described by Shardza Tashi Gyaltsen. In this approach the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* is used integrally with the other Minor Texts on Mind in a manner that describes a Dzogchen practice that is less tightly interwoven with a particular tantric cycle.

⁶⁵ With thanks to Jean-Luc Achard for help in identifying *View and Meditation in One Page (lta sgom shog gcig ma)*.

⁶⁶ With thanks also to Jean-Luc Achard for pointing us to the bound volume of the *drwa ba nag po*. Sang rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974. Jean-Luc Achard in turn directs all thanks to Slob dpon bsTan 'dzin nam dag who first pointed out this fact to Jean-Luc.

In this article we believe we have increased our understanding of this literature beyond Samten Karmay's footnote in *The Treasury of Good Sayings*, but our work has many shortcomings as well. Nevertheless, we are excited that as we have expanded the bounds of our understanding of this literature, an exciting frontier of research directions stands before us. These will be detailed in the section below.

5. Shortcomings of this Article and Directions for Future Research

This article has a number of significant shortcomings:

- The evolving relationship in Bon between the classification scheme of the Nine Vehicles of the Southern Treasures and the classification scheme of the Three Sections of Dzogchen deserves a more thorough investigation than we have been able to provide.
- We believe strongly that one can never get a real understanding of a Tibetan soteriological system until one thoroughly understands the line of human transmission through which we come to know of the system; however, we have not addressed this issue at all in this article. The best we can do at this point is simply to point to Shardza's description of the lineage of these teachings in *The Treasury of Good Sayings*.⁶⁷

In addition to addressing the shortcomings, we see a number of promising avenues for future research:

- Having identified a number of variant editions for all but a couple of the texts we are well poised to create a varorium edition, if not critical edition, of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* and *Nine Minor Texts on Mind*.
- With the existence of critical editions of these texts we will be well situated to translate them.
- Finally we are also well situated to make comparisons of the *Cycles of the Nine Hidden* and *Nine Minor Texts on Mind* with early works of the Nyingma literature from the Mind Section.

Acknowledgements

Geshe Chaphur Lhundup, a recent graduate of Geshe training at Menri (sMan ri) Monastery in Dolanji, patiently read and explained the *Greater Weighty Scripture* with this author and also shared his first-hand experience with the literature of the *Nine Cycles of the Hidden* and *Nine Mirrors* that he gained during his Geshe training at Menri. While only a few "personal communications" are formally noted in the paper, extraordinary thanks go to Jean-Luc Achard for his innumerable helpful references, comments, and suggestions that pervasively improved both the nature and content of this

⁶⁷ Karmay 1972, pp. 57ff.

article. Dan Martin read an early draft of this article very thoroughly and kindly pointed out forty-nine corrections. Jacob Dalton read the article equally carefully, but with very different sensibilities, and requested that I clarify the paper in over two-dozen places. Lisa Brughera read three drafts carefully and helped to identify many inconsistencies with regard to titles, terminology, section numbering, language, as well as aberrant juxtapositions of titles from the Kangyur and Tengyur. Using a newly developed optical-character recognition system for Tibetan, Zach Rowinski was able to recognize computer-printed editions of a number of the texts used as references in this article. Kevin O'Neill edited this computer output and manually input other texts. Kevin deserves special credit and thanks for his ability to decrypt even the most concentrated *dbu med* script. Access to the resulting etext editions was invaluable in many ways – such as locating quotations from the *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*).



Appendix A: Table of Contents of Bon Kangyur Volume 172

Table of Contents of Volume 172 of *Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur*

gab pa dgu skor

ka/ byang chub sems kyi myu gu gab pa dgu skor/ 5 – 50

kha/ yan lag bcu ba/ 51—70

ga/ zur rdeg yan lag lnga pa/ 71—86

nga/ gab pa mde'u thung gi yan lag bzhi/ 87—94

[supplementary texts to the Nine Cycles of the Hidden Bodhicitta]

ca/ 'bru tig gis 'grel ba/ 95—130

cha/ sems gab pa dgu skor/ 131 --158

ja/ byang chub kyi sems gab pa dgu skor gyis nang nas bcings tshad gyis le'u/
159—224

[*sems phran* These works are cataloged in more detail in detail in Appendix B, Part 2]

nya/ gser gyi lung non che ba/ 225 - 246

ta/ man ngag gser gyis lung non/ 247 – 322

tha/ lung non chung ba/ 323 – 340

da/ sems phran rigs pa khu byug gi sa bcad/ 341 -348

na/ rigs pa khu byug gis gzhung/ 349 - 364

pa/ rig pa khu byug gis 'grel 365 – 474

pha/ cog bzhags gis sa gcod/ 475 - 502

ba/ rgyun thag gzhung sa gcod dang 'grel ba/ 503- 536

ma/ sems lung gis rgyun thag/ 537 – 540

tsa/ lung gi rgyun thag gis 'grel ba/ 541- 550

tsha/ sems kyis ngang thag 'thud kyi sa gcod/ 551 – 558 [mislabelled]

dza/ ngang thag gis gzhung/ 559 – 560 [mislabelled]

wa/ ngang thag gis 'grel ba/ 561 – 570 [mislabelled]

zha/ snang la dngos med 'dzugs tshugs lhug par bzhag pa'i le'u/ 571 - 584

**Appendix B, Part 1:
A Comparison of Titles of the Nine Mirrors**

| Number/English | sGa ston's gter gyi kha byang | gSang ba bsen thub de kho na nyid nges pa'i rgyud, p. 76 | Blo gros rgyal mtshan's commentary to the bSen thub p. 485 | Shardza's dByings rig mdzod vol. 1 | brGyud rim |
|---|--|---|--|--|---|
| 1 The Single and Combined <i>Thigle</i> | sngags nang la zhi ba yongs rdzogs/ Thig le chad | Thig le rkyang sbags | Thig le rkyang sbag | Thig le rkyang sbag | |
| 2 The Greater Weighty Golden Scripture | gSer gyi lung non | gSer gyi lung non che | Lung non che ba | gSer gyi lung non che ba 13 chapters | gSer gyi lung non che chung gnyis dbu 'chad le'u bcas |
| 3 The Lesser Weighty Golden Scripture | Lung chung | Lung phran | Lung non chung ba | Lung non chung | gSer gyi lung non che chung gnyis dbu 'chad le'u bcas/ |
| 4 The Cuckoo of Awareness | Rig pa sems kyi khu byug | Khu byug | Khu byug | Khu byug 9 chapters | Rig pa khu byug gi rtsa 'grel sa bcad bcas/ |
| 5 Resting Freely | Sems kyi cog bzhag | Cog bzhag | Cog bzhag | Sems nyid cog bzhag 3 chapters | Cog bzhag gi rtsa 'grel sa bcad bcas/ |
| 6 The Continuity of Awareness | Rig pa rgyun thag | rGyun thag | Rig pa rgyun thag | Rig pa'i rgyun thag 9 chapters | Rig pa'i rgyun thag gi gzhung 'grel pa sa bcad bcas / |
| 7 The Continuity Of Transmission | Lung gyun thag | Lung gi rgyun thag | Lung rgyun thag | Lung gi rgyun thag 9 chapters | Lung gi rgyun thig gi rtsa ba/'grel pa / |
| 8 The Continuity of State | | Sems kyi ngang thag thud | Ngang thag | Sems kyi nyag thag | Sems kyi ngang thag gi gzhung 'grel pa sa bcad / |
| 9 Resting Loosely | Lhug 'jug | sNang la dngos med mdzub tshugs lhug par bzhag pa'i le'u | mDzub tshugs lhug par zhog | Man ngag lhug pa 8 chapters | nang la dngos med mDzub tshug lhug pa bzhag pa'i le'u bcas/ |

Appendix B, Part 2: Editions of Eight of the Nine Mirrors

| Number/ English | Kangyur Volume 172 | Tengyur Volume 164 | Sems smad sde dgu Khri brtan nor bu rtse |
|--|--|---|--|
| 2 The Greater Weighty Golden Scripture | gSer gyi lung non che ba 221–242 gSer gyi lung non 243–318 | gSer gyi lung non che 315–334 gSer gyi lung non 335–398 | gSer gyi lung non che ba 1–51 [gSer gyi lung non 11–51] |
| 3 The Lesser Weighty Golden Scripture | Lung non chung ba 319–336 | man ngag 'di gSer gyi lung non chung 399–415 | gSer gyi lung non chung ba 52–60 |
| 4 The Cuckoo of Awareness | Sems phran rig pa khu byug gi sa bcad 337–344 Rig pa khu byug gi gzhung 345–360 rig pa khu gyug gi 'grel 361–470 | | Rig pa khu byug gi sa gcod 61–63 Rig pa khu byug gi gzhung 64–70 Rig pa khu byug gi 'grel ba 71–127 |
| 5 Resting Freely | Cog gzhas gi sa gcod 471–474 Cog bzhag gis gzhung 474–476 Cog bzhag gi 'grel ba 476–498 | Cog gzhas gi sa gcod 415–417 Cog bzhag ma'i dpe rkyus 417–419 Cog bzhag gi 'grel ba 419–444 | Cog bzhag gi sa gcod 128 Cog bzhag gi gzhung 129 Cog bzhag gi 'grel ba 130–140 |
| 6 The Continuity of Awareness | rGyun thag gis sa gcod dkyus 499–506 Byang chub sems rig pa rgyun thag gi dpe rkyus 506–509 Rig pa sems kyis rgyun thag gis 'grel pa 509– 532 | rGyun thag gi sa gcod 469–473 Byang chub sems rig pa rgyun thag gi dpe rkyus 473–478 rRg pa sems rgyun thag gi 'grel ba 479–501 | rgyun thag gi sa gcod 143–145 rGyun thag gi gzhung 145–147 Rig pa sems kyis rgyun thag gi 'grel ba 147–160 |
| 7 The Continuity Of Transmission | Sems lung gi rgyun thag 533–536 Lung gi rgyun thag 'grel ba 537–546 Sems lung gi rgyun thag gis rkyus 555–556 Byang chub sems lung gi rgyun thag gis dkyus las bkrol 557–566 | Sems lung gi rgyun thag gi rkyus 457–459 Byang chub sems lung gi rgyun thag gi rkyus 459–468 | Sems lung gi rgyun thag 161–162/ Lung gi rgyun thag 'grel ba 163–167/ 459–468 |
| 8 The Continuity of State | Sems kyi ngang thag 'thud kyi sa gcod 547– 554 Ngang thag gis gzhung 555–556 Ngang thag gis 'grel ba 557–566 all of these are mislabeled. They are properly associated with the Lung gi rgyun thag immediately above | Byang chub sems kyi nyag thag is noted as lost in the colophon on page 501 | Ngang thag bskal pa'I sgron ma 175–195 |
| 9 Resting Loosely | sNang la dngos med mdzub tshugs lhug par bzhag pa'i le'u 567–580 | Man ngag lhug pa'I rkyus tshig 445–446 mDzub tshugs 446 – 454 ... 454–456 | sNang la dngos med mdzub tshugs lhug par bzhag pa'i le'u 168–174 |

Appendix C: Identifying the *Thig le rkyang sbag*

(This appendix presumes the rest of this article, particularly Section 3, as context.)

Despite our best efforts we have been unable to identify an edition of the first of the Nine Mirrors, *The Single and Combined Thigle* (*Thig le rkyang sbag*). The purpose of this appendix is to understand as best as we can what is the content of the *The Single and Combined Thigle*. This will help us in two ways. It will help us to understand “what we are missing,” and it will establish clear criteria by which we may evaluate future candidates for editions of this text. To begin with, we are perhaps overdue to consider the meaning of “*sbag*.” From an examination of other usages in the *gSang ba bsen thub* and its commentary, “*sbag*” seems to be an archaic variant of “*sbrags*”, meaning combined. Thus, our translation of *Thig le rkyang sbag* as *The Single and Combined Thigle*.

In the same bound volume in which we found *The Continuity of State* (*Ngang thag*) we find a text with the title *Thig le dbyings bsdus pa* and in the colophon: *gSas mkhar rin po che'i spyi spungs/ thig le dbyings kyi gsang thus*.⁶⁸ This text appears to be an abbreviated description of the manifestation of the *maṇḍala* of peaceful deities and we can find a corresponding abbreviated description of the *maṇḍala* of wrathful deities in Tengyur 114-8.⁶⁹ In the pages of the *Drwa ba nag po* that immediately follow, and in the same handwriting, there is a text with the colophon that states that it explains (i.e. it is a commentary on) the root text of the *thig le dbyings 'chad*.⁷⁰ On the title page of the volume these texts are called *Thig le dbyings ('chad) bsdus pa* and *Thig le byings gyi ti ka* respectively. These titles vary widely from the titles we presented for *The Single and Combined Thigle* (*Thig le rkyang sbag*) in Appendix B: Part 1, and there is no reason to presume that these particular texts are the editions of *The Single and Combined Thigle* together with a commentary that we seek. Nevertheless, as we will see they contain the material that we are looking for in *The Single and Combined Thigle* and thus help us to complete our understanding of the Nine Mirrors as a system. Let us begin by making an inventory of what we know about *The Single and Combined Thigle*.⁷¹

In the quote from the *gSang ba bsen thub* in Section 1.2 we learned that this text:

- 1) Corresponds to the mirror of methods, activities (*spyod pa*) in *The Single and Combined Thigle*.

In the quote from the *bKod pa'i rgyan* in Section 3.2 we learned that:

- 2) This text corresponds to the mirror of the enlightened body (*sku*).

⁶⁸ Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974, pp. 78–95. We find another edition of the same text under the title *gSas mkhar rin po che zhi ba dbyings kyi gsang thus* in Tengyur 114—7.

⁶⁹ Compare with: *bsdud bar gzhung dang cha lag dang/ ... bzhung la zhi khro gsang thus sogsl. 'Phrul gyi lde mig*, p. 500.

⁷⁰ Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974, pp. 97–138.

⁷¹ While some of what follows is redundant, we include everything we have learned to ensure to the reader that nothing of what we learned will contradict our conclusions.

- 3) This text reveals the immutable principle of the nature of mind (*sems nyid mi 'gyur ba'i don ston pa*).
- 4) Similar teachings may be found in the *sGron ma* or in the present [text] (i.e. the *bKod pa'i rgyan*).

Furthermore, from the *Commentary on Complete Discernment of the Secret Principles* we learn that it:

- 5) Bears the title *dbyings 'chad*⁷² at least as a variant and, when combined with the Cuckoo (*khu byug*), and together with *The Seven Smaller Texts on Mind* makes a cycle of nine minor texts on mind which correspond to the [nine] mirrors.⁷³
- 6) Is a scripture of activities that consist of alternately spreading out the forty-five [thigle] [and then] collecting (*sbrag*) [them together] with the one (*rkyang*) Single *Thigle* (*thig le nyag gcig*) of *bodhicitta*: a mirror of clarifying the practical application (*lag len*) of methods that make the mind pliable.⁷⁴

First we will reiterate that Tshul khrim rgyal mtshan appears to be implicitly describing an equivalence between the *Single and Combined* (*rkyang sbrag*) and [*Thig le*] *dbyings 'chad*.⁷⁵ The title *Thig le dbyings 'chad* is mentioned in numerous places; however an instance of that text, other than the *Thig le dbyings bsdus* that we consider here, has so far also eluded us. Note that the *Thig le dbyings 'chad* is also a discovery of gShen chen Klu dga'. Quoting sGa ston again: "With regard to Inner Tantra: *The Completely Peaceful; The Explanation of the Thigle* (*thig le dbyings 'chad*)."⁷⁶ See *Unearthing Bon*

⁷² As we note in the Conclusions, we have come to question the equivalence between the Nine Mirrors (Section 1.2) and the Nine Minor Texts on Mind (Section 1.1). Nevertheless, what is relevant here is that Tshul khrim blo gros rgyal mtshan apparently thought of them as equivalent, and as a result we can conclude that he is associating the *dByings 'chad* and *rKyang sbrag* for the same text.

⁷³ *gSang don rnam 'byed*, p. 38: *don drug las sgom don gyi cha ru gtong ba'i yan lag ni me long dang mthun pa'i sems phran sde bdun khu byug dbyings 'chad gnyis bcas dgu yis bskor ba de/*. To reiterate: with this statement the most natural interpretation is that he believes that the [*Thig le*] *dbyings 'chad* corresponds with the [*Thig le*] *rkyang sbrag*.

⁷⁴ *gSang don rnam 'byed*, p. 38 (underlining in the following attempts to emulate the original): [*gsal ba ming gis rgyas bar bshad pa ni*] *sems las su rung bar bya ba'i thabs kyi lag len gsal ba'i me long byang chub sems kyi thig le nyag gcig rkyang dril dang zhe lnga dgram ste sbrag res mos su spyod pa'i lung dang/* ... continues on to the other eight mirrors.

⁷⁵ We do not feel that this single mention of the [*Thig le*] *dbyings 'chad* is enough to establish, without doubt, the equivalence between the *Thig le rkyang sbrag* and the *Thig le dbyings 'chad*. One objection to this equivalence is that both the *gSang ba bsen thub* and its commentary, the *bKod pa'i rgyan*, refer to a *Thig le dbyings 'chad* as among the Six Principles (*don drug*). It does seem unlikely that the same text would be counted among the Six Principles and the Nine Mirrors, as the Nine Mirrors are mere auxiliaries to the Six Principles. On the other hand, in both the *Phrul gyi lde mig* of mNyam med Shes rab rgyal mtshan and in the *gSang don rnam 'byed kyi 'grel ba* of Tshul khrim rgyal mtshan, it is not the *Thig le dbyings 'chad* but the *Thig le gsum sgril* that is listed among the Six principles. See for example *gSang don rnam 'byed*, p. 37.

⁷⁶ Namgyal, 2009, p. 100: *sngags nang la zhi ba yongs rdzogs/ thig le dbyings chad/*.

*Treasures*⁷⁷ for a good summary of various other references to the *Thig le dbyings 'chad*. In the absence of an edition of either the *thig le dbyings 'chad* or the *thig le rkyang sbrag*, Tshul khrim rgyal mtshan's statements only tell us that we should consider the two texts as highly related.

Second, the *Single and Combined Thigle* is associated with two different mirrors: the mirror of methods (1) and the mirror of the enlightened body (2).

We may also note some reinforced points: Both (1) and (6) associate the text with methods (*thabs*) and activities (*spyod*). Our candidate must not be an instruction manual on non-action and non-meditation.

Let us now systematically consider other elements that should belong to a candidate for *The Single and Combined Thigle* beginning with (3). While we find various references to the nature of mind (*sems nyid*) and immutability (*mi 'gyur ba*) in *Thig le dbyings bsdu pa*, we do not find in the root a pithy teaching that "reveals the immutable principle of the nature of mind." However, in its commentary, the *Thig le dbyings gi ti ga* we find:

As it is the nature of mind that is immutable in the three times, it is "thig."

As it abides entirely pervading the aggregates and sense bases, it is "le."⁷⁸

With regard to (6): Brief as it is, this is the most detailed and specific description of the content of the *Thig le rkyang sbrag* that we have. Specifically, it indicates that the text describes a practice of spreading out from the *Single Thigle* (*Thig le nyag gcig*) to forty-five *thigle* and then gathering back into the *Single Thigle*. First, let us remember that the *Single Thigle* is used as one of the numerous synonyms for the nature of mind. Second, we may immediately recognize that the forty-five *thigle* are associated with the forty-five peaceful deities in the *maṇḍala* of peaceful and wrathful deities. Finally, the process of spreading out and gathering back in is tersely referred to in tantric literature (of all Tibetan Buddhist schools) as emanating (*'phro*) and collecting (*'dus*). Can this practice of emanating out from the *Single Thigle* to the forty-five peaceful deities and then collecting back into the *Single Thigle* be found in the root text of the *Thig le dbyings 'chad*? Indeed, it can. While it's difficult to capture all these elements in a brief quote, we can see the key elements of this process unfold in the following:

Bodhicitta, the *thigle*, the non-duality of emanation and collection. [...]
In the *maṇḍala* that is complete with forty-five,
Through the emanation and collection of the essence mantra and the
emanation and collection (*'dzab*)⁷⁹,
Count!⁸⁰

⁷⁷ *Unearthing Bon Treasures*, 2001, p. 252.

⁷⁸ Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974, p. 114: *sems nyid dus gsum du mi 'gyur ba ni thig yin la/ phung po 'kham dang skye mched la khyab bdal du gnas pa ni le yin/*.

⁷⁹ In fact *'dzab* here may imply the entire process of emanation and collection. Compare, *'Phrul gyi lde mig*: p. 518: *'dzab ni bye brag 'pho 'du dang/*

This process of emanation and collection is described in a variety of ways in this text. We feel that this is good evidence that this text at least embodies very similar teachings to *The Single and Combined Thigle*.

Finally, we consider (4): To reiterate, similar teachings may be found in the *sGron ma* or in the present [text] (i.e. the *bKod pa'i rgyan*). We cannot be certain which text the "*sGron ma*" refers to, but it is easy to check to see whether the teachings described in (6), and in more detail immediately above, can be found in the *bKod pa'i rgyan*, and, in fact, the practice of emanation and collection is explained very clearly in the *bKod pa'i rgyan*. Moreover, it is explained much more clearly than in the *Thig le dbyings bsdus*.⁸¹ While we only aimed to simply show that the teachings described in our copy of the *Thig le dbyings 'chad* could be found in the *bKod pa'i rgyan*, we may have shown why it has been so hard to find an instance of *The Single and Combined Thigle*. Any individual wishing to actually engage in the practice of emanating and gathering of the forty-five deities of the *maṅḍala* could find other texts which avoided the many idiosyncracies of the *Thig le dbyings bsdus* — the challenging *dbu med* penmanship of our manuscript, the archaic spellings, and the terse explanations — by simply using another more extensive and "modern" text.

We should note that the *Thig le dbyings gyi ti ka*, apparently based on the same manuscript as appears in the *Drwa ba nag po*,⁸² is included in *The Cycle of the Nine Minor Texts on Mind: Scriptures of the Highest Dzogchen*.⁸³ In the introduction of this book from Triten Norbutse it states that this work is not included in the *Nine Minor Texts on Mind* but it is included because it is a rare text and for the consideration of the learned. Unfortunately, the root text associated with this commentary is not included there.

All of these references to the function and content of the *Thig le rkyang sbag* that we have found are in harmony with the *Thig le dbyings ('chad) bsdus pa*. Thus we believe that the *Thig le dbyings ('chad) bsdus pa* and the *Thig le dbyings gyi ti ga* in the *Drwa ba nag po*⁸⁴ are very useful texts for understanding the most important elements of the *Thig le rkyang sbag* of the Nine Mirrors. We fall short of offering these as candidates for the *Thig le rkyang sbag* and its commentary because we have no basis for choosing these two texts from among a large collection of *zhi khro* literature that also describes the emanation and collection of the *maṅḍala* of peaceful deities.



⁸⁰ 'phro 'du gnyis myed thig le byang chub sems/ ... bzhi bcu rtsa lnga rdzogs pa'i dkyil 'khor du/ 'dzab dang snying po sngags kyi 'phro 'du yis/ gran no/.

⁸¹ For example see "meditation on emanation and gathering", *bKod pa'i rgyan*, 2005, p. 367.

⁸² Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974, pp. 97–138.

⁸³ *Sems smad sde dgu*, 2005, pp. 196–221.

⁸⁴ Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974, pp. 78–95.

Bibliography

Catalogs of the Bon Kangyur and Tengyur

A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts

Samten Karmay, *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*, Senri Ethnological Reports 24. National Museum of Ethnology, Osaka, 2003.

A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur

Dan Martin, Per Kvaerne, and Yasuhiko Nagano, editors; *A Catalogue of the Bon Kanjur*, Senri Ethnological Reports 40. National Museum of Ethnology, Osaka, 2003.

Handlist

Kurt Keutzer and Kevin O'Neill, *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*, *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines*, Number 17, October 2009.

The Bon Kangyur

Mongyal Lhasé's Edition of the Kangyur

smon rgyal lha sras, Editor. theg chen g.yung drung bon gyi bka' 'gyur in 179 volumes. Published by si khron zhing chen par khrun lte gnas par 'debs khang, published in khreng tu'u, 1999. *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur* corresponds to this edition which is widely available in the electronic (pdf) format due to the efforts of the Bon Foundation.

The Bon Tengyur and its Individual Works

We will reference individual *Tengyur* works using the numbering system of *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*. This edition of the *Tengyur* is also available in the electronic (pdf) format due to the efforts of the Bon Foundation.

Individual Works from the Bon Kangyur

bKa' rgyud skor bzhi

rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan rgyud bka' rgyud skor bzhi, pages 131-644 in *History and doctrine of Bon-po Niṣpanna-yoga: original Tibetan texts on the transmission, teaching, rites, and deities of the Rdzogs chen Zhan Zhun school of the Bon-po's*, Collected by Tenzin Namdak and Lokesh Chandra, Sata-pitaka series; Volume 73, International Academy of Indian Culture, New Delhi 1968.12 pages.

Also, Kangyur Volume 171 in *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*.

sGrags pa skor gsum

bZhod sTon dNgos Grub, rdzogs pa chen po sgrags pa skor gsum. Kangyur volume 174 in *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*. Another edition is cataloged as text number 207 in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*.

Byang chub sems kyi smyu gu gab pa dgu skor

gShen chen Klu dga', rdzogs pa chen po byang chub sems kyi smyu gu gab pa dgu skor. Kangyur Volume 172 as cataloged in *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*. See Appendix A for a table of contents. A related, though not identical, volume that contains the root text as well as other texts related to the *Gab pa dgu skor* is also cataloged as running text 99 in *A Catalog of the Bon Kanjur*.

(*Byang sems gab pa dgu skor gyi rtsa 'grel, etext*)

As of this writing, the *Byang sems gab pa dgu skor* together with two commentaries may be found on-line as a pdf file at: <http://himalayabon.gotoip2.com/article/book/books/20100707218.html>

http://himalayabon.gotoip2.com/up_files/2010-7-9/2010070920251113.pdf

We will name individual sections as follows. Page numbers refer to pages in the pdf:

(*Byang sems gab pa dgu skor, etext*)

This is the root text, pages 1—80.

(*Sems lung gab pa dgu skor gyi 'grel ba rgya cher bshad pa, etext*)

This is the extensive commentary, pages 81—488.

(*Byang sems gab pa sa bcad, etext*)

This is the root text, pages 489—498.

(*Byang sems gab pa'i 'grel ba kun bzang gi dgongs pa gsal byed nyi ma'i dkyil 'khor, etext*)

This is the commentary by mNyam med Shes rab rgyal mtshan, pages 499—748.

gSang ba bsen thub

Gab pa thugs kyi brnag pa, khro rgyud gsang ba bsen thub. Volume 145 as cataloged in *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*.

Also: volume 193-7 of the *Bon Tengyur* as cataloged in *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*.

gSang ba bsen thub (2004)

gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spungs gsang ba bsen thub kyi rgyud dang 'grel b yid bzhin rnam par bkod pa'i rgyan. Bon Dialectic School, Solan, H.P., 2004. References throughout this paper are to this convenient edition written in *dbu can* script.

bKod pa'i rgyan (2004)

gSang ba bsen thub rgyud dang 'grel pa yid bzhin rnam par bkod pa'i rgyan. Gyung drung bongyi bshad sgrub 'dus-sde, Solan, H.P., 2004.

gSang ba bsen thub (1973)

'A zha Blo gros rgyal mtshan, *rTsa rgyud chen po gsang ba bsen thub kyi 'grel pa rin po che yid bzhin rnam par bkod pa'i rgyan dang bcas pa*, Tibetan Bonpo Monastic Centre, H.P., 1973.

gSang ba bsen thub (etext)

As of this writing, the *gSang ba bsen thub* and the *bKod pa'i rgyan* may be found on-line as a pdf file at:

<http://himalayabon.gotoip2.com/article/book/books/20100707218.html>

http://himalayabon.gotoip2.com/up_files/2010-7-9/2010070920021576.pdf

Works by or related to Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen

Enlightened Rainbows

Jean-Luc Achard, *Enlightened Rainbows*, Brill, Leiden-Boston, 2008. 496 pages.

This work gives a useful numbering of every text in Shardza's writings. These numbers will be applied below with the usage "ER number(s) X-Y" indicates texts X through Y of *Enlightened Rainbows*.

The Treasury of Good Sayings

Samten G. Karmay, *The Treasury of Good Sayings: A Tibetan History of Bon*, London Oriental Series volume 26, Oxford University Press, London, 1972.

We had two editions of Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen's collected works at our disposal. One is an edition printed from blocks carved at sDe dge rdza steng chen dgon. The second is a modern typeset edition that follows page for page the woodblock edition but with different page numbers (e.g. 001 rather than 301). This edition is cataloged in *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*.

dByings rig mdzod, volume 1

Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen, *dByings rig rin po che'i mdzod (stod cha)*, Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness, volume 1 of Shardza's collected works. ER1. Also, *Tengyur* volume 278 as cataloged in *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*.

dByings rig mdzod, volume 2

Shardza Tashi Gyaltzen, *dByings rig rin po che'i mdzod (smad cha)*, Precious Treasury of Space and Awareness, volume 2 of Shardza's collected works. ER2. Also, *Tengyur* volume 279 as cataloged in *A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur*.

Other Tibetan Language Texts

Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, 1974)

Sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, editor. *sPyi spungs rin po che a dkar gsang sngags kyi bka' srung drwa ba nag po'i rgyud skor*, Tibetan Buddhist Monastic Center, Solan, HP, 1974.

A text entitled *gSas 'khar rin po che spyi spung sgron ma gsal ba'i tan tra las ngang thag bskal pa'i sgron ma ston* is somewhat incongruously included on pages 1–30 of this book. This book also includes: *Zhi ba rin po che thig le dbyings kyi 'phrin las* (pages 31–75), *Thig le dyings ('chad) bsdus pa* (pages 78–95), and *Thig le dbyings gyi ti ga* (pages 97–138).

brGyud rim:

dBra ston Ngag dbang sKal bzang bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan, sKu gsum ston pa'i gsung rab bka' 'gyur rin po che'i lung rgyun ji snyed pa phyogs gcig tu bsdus pa'i bzhugs byang brgyud rim bcas pa dri med shel gyi phreng ba, contained in second edition of *Bon Kanjur*, vol. 103, pp. 1–369 (*A Catalogue of the Bon Kanjur* catalogs this under running number 91).

Namgyal, 2009

Dangson Namgyal, Editor. *Collection of Rare Bonpo Texts*, Vajra Publications, Kathmandu, Nepal. 2009.

Sems smad sde dgu, 2005

gShen chen Klu dga', *Bla med rdzogs pa chen po'i bka' sems smad sde dgu'i skor*, Library of Triten Norbu Tse Monastery, Kathmandu, Nepal, 2005.

'Phrul gyi lde mig, sMan ri

mNyam med Shes rab rgyal mtshan, gSang don rnam 'byed 'phrul gyi lde mig, sMan ri'i tshigs 'don, Dolanji, India.

gSang don rnam 'byed 'grel

Tshul khrims rgyal mtshan, gSang don rnam 'byed kyi 'grel ba tar lam gsal ba'I sgron ma. Tengyur 227-1.

Secondary Sources

Unearthing Bon Treasures

Dan Martin, *Unearthing Bon Treasures: Life and Legacy of a Tibetan Scripture Revealer*, Brill, Leiden, 2001.

The Commentaries of the Four Clever Men

Matthew Kapstein, *The Commentaries of the Four Clever Men: A Doctrinal and Philosophical Corpus in the Bon po rDzogs chen Tradition*, East and West, Vol. 59, Nos. 1-5 (December 2009), pages 107–130.

The A Khrid System of Meditation

Per Kvaerne, *The A Khrid System of Meditation, Kailash*, Volume 1, Number 1, 1973. Pages 19–50.

Achard, 2010

Jean-Luc Achard, "Mesmerizing with the Useless?", *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines*, no. 19, Octobre 2010, pp. 133-143.

