

SHORT REVIEWS

SERTA TIBETO-MONGOLICA Festschrift für Walther Heissig zum 60. Geburtstag am 5.12.1973. Edited by Rudolf Kaschewsky, Klaus Sagaster and Michael Weiers. Published by Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden 1973. Price not indicated.

As the bibliography at the beginning of this volume (p. 1—14) bears witness, Walther Heissig has been strenuously active in the field of Mongolian studies since 1940. His most considerable work is doubtless the astonishing *Geschichte der mongolischen Literatur* of 969 pages published at Wiesbaden in 1972. As Professor Charles Bawden said of these two massive volumes: "nowhere, not even in Mongolia itself, is there any connected account of Mongol literature which approaches this one in comprehensiveness, thoroughness, and, one must say, in insight and imaginative interpretation. Little enough of the raw material lay conveniently to hand in anthologies and text editions. Most has had to be found, identified, and classified, the hard way, without too much guidance. Behind the skilful narrative and the smooth-running translations we glimpse, in the bulky apparatus, the years of hard work whose results will be familiar to those readers who have followed Heissig's learned research, and above all, his painstaking Catalogues of the Mongol collections of many libraries." (B.S.O.A.S. vol XXXVI Part 2, 1973, p. 484). So it was most fitting that this energetic pioneer's sixtieth birthday be honoured worthily by his colleagues and admirers. The contents of this fine volume are as follows : C.R. Bawden, A Tibetan-Mongol bilingual text of Popular Religion (p. 15-32); F.A. Bischoff, The first chapter of the legend of Padmasambhava - a translation (p. 33-46) ; Helmut Eimer and Pema Tsering, *Theu rañ mdo ma* (p. 47-96); Herbert Franke, Ein mongolisch-chinesisches Buchfragment der Yüan-Zeit' (p. 97-103); Matthew M. Haltod and Klaus Sagaster, "Der Siebzügliger". Ein mongolisches Lustspiel von Tsch. Oidow (p. 105); Rudolf Kaschewsky, Die Lehr-worte des Pha dam-pa (p. 171-204); R.O. Meisezahl, Zwei alttibetische Ratna-gunasam-caygāthā-Handschriften und andere Prajnparamita- Texte im Victoria and Albert Museum, London, (p. 205-236); Nikolaus Poppe, Zwei mongolische übersetzungen des Kütâgara-Sûtra, (p. 237-254); Hans Roth, Zur Erfassung mongolischer und tibetischer Sachkultur in europäischen Museen und Sammlungen (p. 255-294); Dieter Schuh, Die Darlegungen des tibetischen Enzyklopadisten Koñ-sprul Blo-gros mtha'-yas über osttibetische Hochzeitsbrauche, (p. 295-350); Veronika Veit, Die Ermordung Dambijžancans, (p. 351-364); Michael Weiers, Das Verhältnis des Ligdan Khan zu seinen Völkerschaften (p. 365-379).

GEMS FROM THE GITA: vii 128 pp. (IRs. 6/—). MYSTIC APPROACH TO THE VEDA AND THE UPANISHAD, ii 125 pp (IRs. 10/—) By M.P. Pandit. Published by Ganesh and Company, Madras, 1974.

The above two books fall outside the scope of reviews in Kailash, but some of our readers may be interested to know of their existence and availability.

SOCIAL SCIENCE IN NEPAL. Edited by Prayag Raj Sharma. xiv, 218 pp. Published by the Institute of Nepal and Asian Studies, Tribhuvan University, Kathmandu, 1974. Price : n.a.

Just before this issue of Kailash went to the press, the above book was released, and we wish to bring it to the attention of our readers. It is a report on a Seminar in Social Sciences held at the Institute of Nepal and Asian Studies in October 1974, and covers the following : Geography, Anthropology, Sociology, History, Political Science, Public Administration and Economics. The content consists of the papers presented in each of the above fields, one or two critiques of each paper, and the "Seminar Rapporteurs' Report" of the discussions following the presentation of the papers. This is a most interesting panorama of contemporary scholarship and thinking in the field of social sciences in Nepal,

EARLY SINO--TIBETAN ART. By Heather Karmay.

×vi+128 pages, incl. 69 ill. in b/w, and frontispiece in colour.

Published by Aris & Phillips, Warminster Price: £12 (U. S. \$ 27/--)

A major obstacle to the systematic study of the history of Tibetan art, is the rarity of pieces which can be dated with absolute precision. Thus analysis of style and origin is still largely a matter of subjective impression. The author puts the matter succinctly (p.1): "the severe lack of available dated pieces ... has led to a neglect of the question of stylistic developments in the study of Tibetan art history".

The present volume represents an important contribution towards a surer foundation for the diachronic study of Tibetan art. A limited number of paintings, woodcuts, and bronzes are examined, all of which may be dated precisely. It thus becomes possible to establish certain definite chronological *points d'appui* which, in their turn, may be connected with characteristic elements of style.

The author has mainly utilised material originating from China. "Chronologically the most ancient Tibetan paintings... that can be dated with any certainty are among the famous "banners" from Dunhuang... Some of these bear Tibetan inscriptions which give a clear indication of their origin" (p 8). For example, a mandala of the Thousand-armed Avalokiteśvara, painted on silk, in the British Museum (Stein Coll. No. 32), is carefully analysed, and the Tibetan-Chinese bilingual inscription, made legible by means of infra-red photography has permitted the author to date it precisely, viz. to 836 A. D. Not only has this painting—interesting through its combination of two very distinct styles, Chinese and Tibeto—Nepalese—been dated, but the artist, too, is mentioned in the inscription as a certain *dPal—dbyans* who may well be identical with a *dPal—dbyans* referred to in other Dunhuang documents.

Several paintings from Kharakhoto, a frontier town in the Xixia ('Tangut') empire (1032—1226) destroyed in 1227 by Jenghiz Khan, are also examined, and the author concludes that stylistically they are derived from "the style of the Pala-Sena dynasty in its Nepalese expression, carried to Xixia by Tibetans, with whom they had close cultural ties" (p.20).

The author then passes on to discuss certain monuments in Beijing (Peking) and Hangzhou dating from the Yuan (Mongol) dynasty (1280—1368), all of which clearly witness Tibetan influence. This influence was indeed—at least as far as

the ruling Mongol classes were concerned—massive, and much material is assembled illustrating this.

Four chapters are devoted to woodcut illustrations from various sources: (1) The Xixia Tripitaka (compiled in 1302). Although the majority of illustrations are in Chinese style, a certain number are in a style which is clearly Tibetan. Ten of these are discussed in detail, three being hitherto unpublished woodcuts from the Institute of Oriental Studies in Leningrad. (2) The Jisha edition of the Chinese Buddhist Canon (engraved 1231—1322) in which certain woodcuts are executed in the same Tibeto—Nepalese style, including figures of monks dressed in distinctive garments which can only be Tibetan (p. 49—50). (3) The 1410 A. D. edition of the Tibetan Kanjur, “the first xylographic edition of the Tibetan canon to be printed in Beijing” (p. 55). (4) The “Marvellous Images, Namesü Sutras and Dharanis” (*Zhufopusa miaoxiang minghao jingzhou*) printed in Beijing in 1431, a collection of popular Buddhist texts and illustrations of the Mahayana pantheon as transmitted by 5th Black Hat Karma—pa De-bzhin-gshegs-pa (1384—1415). This text, a copy of which is kept in the Musée Guimet (Paris), has not been published before, but is, for several reasons, of great interest; its iconographic and stylistic importance for history of lamaist art as an early, dated document, and the evidence it supplies for continued Tibetan religious influence in China, the donor who had it printed apparently having been Chinese.

Finally, there is a fine study of lamaist bronzes from the Yongle reign period (1403—1424), and the years immediately following, “probably the earliest known dated lamaist bronzes” (p. 1). As the nether time limit is chosen the period of the construction of the Gyantse *sku-'bum*, i. e. the early 15th century (the *sku-'bum* was consecrated in 1427 A. D.).

The author's selection of material has been dictated by two considerations: firstly, all the objects and illustrations discussed may be accurately dated; and secondly, they all reflect strong Tibetan influence, often to the extent of reproducing small but significant details characteristic of the contemporary Tibetan art. The author is consequently led to examine and discuss a number of Tibetan paintings, particularly the frescoes of the Gyantse *sku-'bum* described by Tucci in *Indo-Tibetica*, as well as numerous other pieces which, while published elsewhere, are unfortunately not reproduced in the present volume, thus somewhat limiting the reader's possibility of appreciating all the comparisons made by the author.

The Tibetan influence on Xixia, Yuan, and Ming art, covering a period

of six hundred years, is shown to have been both enduring and profound, thus fully justifying the statement (p.1) that "in Central Asia and China . . . there was a two-way process, for Tibet, whilst absorbing foreign influences, left its own cultural imprint". Thus "the woodcuts and Yongle bronzes presented here, although produced in Xixia and China, should be visualised within the context of the lamaist tradition and being executed far from the Tibet itself, the centre of activity, demonstrate the widespread influence of Tibetan Buddhism" (p. 3.). Hence the interchange of cultural impulses which is studied by the author testifies in almost tangible manner to the exuberant vitality and innate dynamism of Tibetan civilization, a civilization which may still perhaps play a significant role as a cultural factor both in Asia and the West.

In an interesting sub chapter, the author discusses the existence of a Tibetan style at the time of the introduction of Buddhism in Tibet, i. e. the 7th-8th century A. D. The author examines both Chinese and Tibetan sources, showing that plastic arts, at least, were well developed at that time, and a passage from the 12th (or 14th ?) century *sBa—bžed*, dealing with the construction of the temple of *bSam—yas*, is translated, indicating that "live Tibetan models were used in the making of images of Buddhist divinities" (p.4).

Another interesting aspect of the present volume are the numerous documents—translated by the author from Chinese and Tibetan—illustrating the various aspects of the commissioning and execution of this 'Sino-Tibetan' art, as well as certain passages from Tibetan sources analysing the various schools and styles of Tibetan art. The present reviewer cannot judge the Chinese translations; the Tibetan translations appear to be careful and accurate. In translating a Sanskrit invocation (p 69), however, the author makes a mistake: *om nama sri gu--ru--be sarba buddha bo--dhi--sa--tve--bhya* (Sanskrit: *om namah śri-gurave sarva-buddha-bodhisattvebhyah*) should be translated "Om! Salutation to the glorious Guru and to all the Buddhas and Bodhisattvas!" —*bhyah* being the dative plural ending, and not, as the author translates, a mantra.

Early Sino-Tibetan Art has secured for the author the position as an eminent authority on Tibetan art. Her mastery of a wide range of sources, many of them of extremely difficult access, is impressive indeed. In certain respects one may perhaps feel that the present volume has been assembled somewhat hastily; in particular, it is difficult to see what significant relationship there is between the excursus on the 21 Taras in Appendix I and the rest of the book. But this in no way alters the impression of careful scholarship which characterizes the entire work. The book is truly indispensable for any student of Tibetan art; it may well serve as a model for future work, and the author as well as the publishers are to be warmly congratulated.

ANGAMI VYAKARAN (Angami Grammar). By Radheshyam Singh Gautam. In Hindi. 118 pages. Published by Nagaland Bhasha Parisad, Kohima, Paice: I. Rs. 5/-

ANGAMI--HINDI--ENGLISH DICTIONARY. Edited by Braj Bihari Kumar. 152 pages. Published by Nagaland Phasha Parishad, Kohima. Price: I. Rs. 5/-

ANGAMI PHONETIC READER. By N. Ravindran. xii+66 pages. Published by Central Institute of Indian Languages, Mysore 1974. Price: I. Rs. 7/-

Over the past several years the Tibeto--Burman languages of India have received a good deal of attention from Indian scholars. The three books under review here are studies of the Angami Naga language, which this reviewer has had some opportunity to study; each, however, may be taken as representative of the series in which it appears. Other works in each series will be mentioned below.

Angami Naga is spoken by some 40,000 people concentrated in the Kohima district of the state of Nagaland. It is one of the many languages making up the Kukish (or Kuki--Naga) division of the Tibeto-Burman family of languages. Until 1970, the only significant studies of Angami by non-Angamis were a brief grammar and vocabulary by R. B. McCabe (1887) and a short phonemic summary and word-list by Robbins Burling (1960). Between these two studies, a most important event was the standardization of Angami orthography by a committee of Angami scholars in 1939. The standard orthography represents a great advance on McCabe's imprecise notation (even allowing for dialectal differences), and it has made the work of later scholars easier. However, it has one glaring deficiency for the linguist or language-learner seeking a guide to Angami pronunciation: it totally disregards the tonal distinctions, which had at least been remarked upon, if not transcribed, by McCabe. The tonal system of Angami plays a most important functional role in the phonology, since the morphemes of the language are largely monosyllabic, and the repertory of syllables is reduced by the absence of final consonants. As in Mandarin Chinese, homonyms abound even if the tones are taken into account. Although the Angamis themselves are apparently not inconvenienced by their toneless written language, they are clearly taken aback and confused by toneless spoken Angami (which of course is never really 'toneless' but rather has incorrect tones). The first attempt to indicate Angami tones in writing was made by the editors of a fragment of a dictionary by an Angami named Haralu (1933). Tonal indications were given for about 10 per cent of the entries, where

they were needed to distinguish otherwise homonymous words. The first systematic modern treatment was Burling's brief description of the five-tone system and his use of diacritical marks to indicate the tone of every word in his short Angami vocabulary.

The grammar and dictionary of Angami under review are published by the Nagaland Bhasha Parishad, whose goals are the propagation of Hindi in Nagaland and the development of local languages. The Parishad has made itself the most prolific source of information on Naga and related languages, with at least 14 grammars in Hindi and 15 trilingual dictionaries to date. The Parishad uses both the standard Angami orthography, and a devanagari transcription which is essentially a transliteration of the standard orthography, but which corrects its main segmental defect, namely its use of the graph 'ch' for both an aspirate and an unaspirate affricated consonant. Thus it is useful to refer to the devanagari as well as the roman transcription. (The Parishad has also set a good precedent in not hesitating to add symbols to the devanagari syllabary where necessary for the transcription of Angami.) But it is disappointing that neither of the Parishad's books, coming ten years after Burling's study, makes any reference whatsoever to the tones. The grammar notes (on p. 11) that although the Angami pronouns 'we (inclusive)' and 'they' are spelled identically (*uko*), they can be distinguished by their pronunciation. This is the only hint of the tonal system.

The Parishad's Angami grammar is far more complete than McCabe, and covers in one way or another most of the Angami constructions and most words that have grammatical functions. The preface attempts to demonstrate a non-existent genetic relationship between Angami, Indo-Aryan, and English. The grammar itself is divided into 23 chapters. There is one chapter for each of 8 loosely defined parts of speech, and then there are chapters for semantic notions like gender, number, case, and voice (in which it is reported that Angami has no distinction of voice), and for formal categories like prefixes, suffixes, etc. Each chapter is further subdivided either semantically or by lexical item discussed, and each grammatical point is illustrated, usually by a verse from the Angami version of the New Testament with its translation into Hindi. This is the standard form of a translation grammar, certain of whose categories (e. g. voice) may not be relevant directly to the language under study, but will be helpful to the student who is accustomed to them. A defect of this type of organization is that the same Angami construction or particle may be treated in several different places according to

its Hindi translations, obscuring its underlying general meaning, or, worse, it may be ignored if it has no obvious Hindi translation. An example of the latter danger is the failure of the grammar to recognize the important definite article *u* of Angami. Another example of the dangers of the translation format may be taken from the treatment of the 'eight cases' in the grammar. The marker of the 'subject case' is said to be the postposed particle *a*, even though most of the example sentences throughout the grammar have subjects without any marker. Several pages later, *a* is also identified as the marker of the 'genitive case', but it is noted this *a* is most often omitted. Actually, if all the occurrences of *a* had been considered together, it might have been possible to reach correct conclusion, which is that *a* is not a syntactic case marker at all, but a rhetorical topicalizer, which may mark subjects, possessor nouns, temporal expressions, etc. It is especially frequent where a new subject is introduced in discourse. In fact, the syntactic functions of subject and possessor nouns in Angami are marked only by word order. In spite of these problems, however, the Parishad's grammar remains a useful book, especially for its hundreds of classified examples illustrating the use of Angami words and constructions. In this it complements the Parishad's dictionary, which gives no examples of the use of words.

The Parishad's Angami-Hindi-English dictionary is the first Angami dictionary ever published. It will certainly be useful to Angami speakers as a guide to orthography, and may help them with Hindi and English as well. It will also be useful to students of Angami, whose needs will be considered in more detail here. The dictionary consists of some 3500 entries arranged in A to Z alphabetical order according to the first letter of the Angami word in the standard orthography. The entries, which rarely exceed one line, consist of the Angami word in both standard and devanagari transcriptions, its part of speech, a Hindi gloss, and an English gloss. Nouns are generally listed only in their full prefixed form e.g. *thedze* 'story', *mithu* 'cow'. This will not inconvenience Angami speakers, but it may give difficulty to students of the language, since the prefixes are often dropped. For example, the student reading a text who runs into the syntagm *a-dze* ('my story') will know that *a* is the first person singular pronoun (or he can look it up), but he will have no way of knowing that he must look up *dze* under *thedze*. A related problem arises from the listing of items like *mhathodzekethuleshü* 'record' as single words without analysis. The student, mindful of the fact that Angami morpheme are most often monosyllabic

and rarely more than disyllabic, will be tempted to analyse such an item by looking up its elements. He will find six entries spelled *mhatho*, all glossed 'work', more or less, but again no *dze*. (The item glossed 'record' is in fact made up of a noun, *leshü* 'paper', with a three-word relative clause 'work story writing'.) Thus in a language like Angami it would be useful to have the nouns alphabetized by their roots in cases where the first syllable may be dropped. The fully prefixed form would be given under the root-entry, and then might or might not have a separate alphabetical entry of its own.

The number of entries in the dictionary reflects more accurately the number of Hindi translations than the number of Angami words treated. For example, all 9 entries spelled *meho* are in fact the same Angami word 'to look'. (The nine are glossed 'visit', 'peep', 'care', 'test', 'examine', 'inspect', 'keep', 'look'.) Similarly, *medzi* 'follow' has six entries. On the other hand, the 13 entries spelled *se* include several different lexical items, which would be much easier to sort out if the tones were recorded. Thus, at least the entries 'use', 'three' (from the appendix on numbers), 'plant' and 'very' would all have different tones, reducing the problem of homonymy to manageable proportions. (Another *se*, on still another tone, is the word 'liver' listed in the dictionary with its prefix *u-*, although some body parts, e.g. *ru* 'bone', are listed without the prefix.) The five entries *kra* turn out to represent four different words ('white', 'earn', 'many', 'cry/weep') all, conveniently, on different tones. Perhaps we may hope that the Parishad will give attention to tone in continuing its useful work on Tibeto-Burman languages.

As of 1974, The Nagaland Bhasa Parishad had published the following works on Tibeto-Burman languages:

Grammars (in Hindi): 1.Ao 2.Angami 3.Lotha 4.Sema. Outline Grammars (in Hindi): 5.Konyak 6.Chakhesang 7.Pochury 8,Phom 9.Sangtam 10.Yimchungrü 11.Chang 12.Zeliang 13.Rengma 14.Kuki.

Dictionaries (Tibeto-Burman-Hindi-English): 1.Ao 2.Angami 3.Lotha 4.Sema 5.Liangmai. (Hindi-Tibeto-Burman-English): 6.Chakhesang 7.Konyak 8.Pochury. 9.Kuki 10.Sangtam 11.Yimchungrü 12.Phom 13.Zeliang 14.Rengma 15.Chang.

The CIIL Phonetic Readers are designed to introduce language students to the phonology and correct pronunciation of the languages covered. Each

reader in this well thought-out series has a similar organization of chapters, of which the present volume may be taken as a model:

1. (pp. 5—12) The Speech Organs. A brief introduction to acoustic phonology and terminology.
2. (pp. 13—44) The Speech Sounds of Angami. The articulation of each Angami sound is described. Occurrence or non-occurrence of the sound in word initial, word-medial, and word-final positions is noted. About 10 examples are given for each sound.
3. (pp. 45—54) Phonetic Drill. Further examples, concentrating on the differentiation of closely related sounds by the use of minimally different pairs of words.
4. (pp. 55—60) Angami Phonemic Inventory. Demonstrates the 'phonemic status' of speech sounds by the use of minimal pairs.
5. (pp. 61—66) The Writing System. Describes the standard orthography, proposes alternatives, and illustrates both the standard orthography and a slightly modified version using tone-letters with short texts.

The reader will certainly be very helpful to any student of Angami and to linguists as well. Ravindran gives particular attention to the tonal system, using Burling's diacritical marks to represent the tone of every Angami word cited. An exemplary practical feature of Burling's system is that there is no unmarked tone typographically: thus, when a diacritic is inadvertently omitted, as inevitably happens occasionally, the error is obvious and no confusion can result. Presumably the tonal alternations of Angami will be dealt with in the further, more technical works on Angami phonology, morphology and syntax promised by the author.

One area of Angami phonology that is not covered entirely satisfactorily for the linguist is the distribution of the phonemes. For example, it is not mentioned that /r/ (and only /r/ among consonants) may follow an initial consonant, giving the clusters /pr/, /phr/, /kr/, and /khr/. (Because of the large number of examples, however, words containing each of these clusters may be found in the reader.) In addition, the co-occurrence of initial consonants and vowels, an interesting (if puzzling) study in Angami, is neglected, or perhaps postponed. In Ravindran's system, the vowel /ə/ occurs only after fricative, affricated, or trilled initial consonants (plus the dental and palatal nasals), never after non-affricated

stops. (Two occurrences of /pə/ in the reader appear to be errors: /ruopə/ (low and low-falling tones), p. 17, is given by the Parishad's dictionary as *ruoprü* 'smallpox'; and /pə/, p. 46, is given on p. 21 as /pe/ (low tone) 'slope'.) The labio-dental affricated initials (/pf/ etc.) never occur before the vowels /ie/, /a/, /o/, or /uo/. Such asymmetries will be of interest mainly to linguists, but language learners as well should be relieved to learn that they will not need to distinguish /ts/ from /c/ or /dz/ from /j/ before all vowels.

In the chapter on orthography, Ravindran describes the standard orthography and proposes the one necessary segmental modification. He also proposes an ungainly, but typographically practical and scientifically adequate system of tone letters. However, five tones are rather too many to be represented conveniently by large and small final q's and x's, and Ravindran is wise to use diacritical marks himself. An alternative for scientific purposes could be the use of tone numbers, as in the Wade-Giles Chinese transcription: the advantage would be that the tones could be numbered in order of descending pitch and so more easily remembered. But if the Angamis themselves ever adopt a system of tonal notation perhaps they will follow the Vietnamese and the Chinese *pinyin* (at least in its pedagogical uses) in adopting diacritics and equipping typewriters and printing presses with them. The Burling-Ravindran system would be a good candidate for use. Incidentally, if there must be an unmarked tone, it should be the low tone (which appears on phonologically reduced prefixes) and not the mid tone as in Ravindran's tone-letter system. Ravindran's proposed devanagari transcription is defective in its representation of /ə/ as zero, which seems impractical, e. g., for the word 'to draw water', whose only segment is /ə/. (The devanagari short *a* is used for /a/: perhaps this is a typographical mixup with the short *a* intended for /ə/ and long *a* for /a/, the simplest solution.)

The few inadvertencies mentioned here do not alter the fact that the Angami Phonetic Reader is a book of both practical and scientific value. The prospect of having similar books on a large number of languages is an exciting one for students of Tibeto-Burman. As of 1974, the following had already appeared: Phonetic Reader Series No. 5: Tripuri; 6: Thaadou; 7: Ao-Naga; 10: Angami.

REFERENCES:

- Burling, Robbins. 1960. Angami Naga Phonemics and Word List. *Indian Linguistics* 21:51-60.

Haralu, Dr. 1933. Angami: English Dictionary. Part I. JASB 29.1:117—157.
[A—*kemie* only. Edited by J. H. Hutton and J. E. Tanquist.]

McCabe, R. B. 1887. Outline Grammar of the Angami Naga Language with a
Vocabulary and Illustrative Sentences. Calcutta.

Spelling and Word Divisions in Angami Naga. Fourth Edition. Kohima, 1973.
[Contains the conclusions of the committee that established the Angami
orthography. The first edition was published in 1939.]

B. M.

AMONG THE WANCHOS IN ARUNACHAL PRADESH

By L. R. N. Srivastava. ii+188 pp., 8 plates.

Published by The Research Department of Arunachal Pradesh

Administration, Shillong, 1973. Price: I Rs. 7/50.

The publication of a book on the Wanchos, a Naga tribe of over 23,000 persons living in thirty-eight villages in the southern part of the Tirap District in Arunachal Pradesh, is indeed a welcome event. L. R. N. Srivastava, previously a Research Officer the Research Department in the NEFA Administration, is a not unknown ethnologist who has already written a short monograph on the Gallongs of the Siang District under the guidance of the late Verrier Elwin.

Data concerning the Wanchos have been scarce to date, and based mainly on administrative reports, topographical surveys, tour diaries and explorers' notes written in the last or the beginning of this century. C. von Fürer-Haimendorf, who came here for a three-week tour in the early sixties in the company of the author, has been the only foreign anthropologist to visit the area in recent times.

Among the Wanchos of Arunachal Pradesh is a tour diary written in the style of books like *Naked Nagas* by C. von Fürer-Haimendorf or *Accross the golden heights of Assam and NEFA* by J. D. Baveja. During a period of two years, the author visited and collected information in all the thirty eight Wancho villages situated in the Cis-Patkoi Range on the Indo-Burma border.

The book is divided into twelve chapters which are followed by notes and references. The latter are rather scanty and inconveniently placed at the end of the book. Certain other additions such as an index, a map indicating the location of the villages mentioned in the text, an exact itinerary of the author's journey, and diagrams explaining the interdependency between villages belonging to the various confederations, would have been much appreciated by the informed reader.

Although L. R. N. Srivastava has undoubtedly collected an important mass of information, one feels he is being overambitious in his preface when he claims that "the present book gives an account of the geographical and ecological settings of the Wancho area, the economic condition, social systems, political institutions and religious beliefs and practices of the

people". In fact, this book oscillates between being a monography of the Wanchos and a travel diary. Also the material collected therein, though rich and interesting, suffers somewhat from a lack of organisation.

One would have liked to see the author develop more fully certain aspects of his book, such as inter-village trade, village relations within a confederation, the former custom of head hunting, life in the bachelor dwellings (*morungs*), finally, the reasons why the British did not intervene in inter-village feuds, but allowed the chiefs to settle their problems. One cannot tell from the reading of this book, what differentiates a Wancho from a Tangsa or a Konyak. What is more, the author seems to have paid surprisingly little attention to Nagas and neighbouring populations. Would it not have been more pertinent for most readers if ethnographic comparisons [e.g. the wealth of the paramount chief of Wanu (p 90), or the two main social classes of the Kamnu-am and the Thoakd-am of Thamko (pp. 143-146)], had not systematically been made with examples borrowed from African literature, but rather with examples taken from important works on this part of Asia such as *Political Systems in Highland Burma* by E. R. Leach or *The Structure of Chin Society* by F. K. Lehman? Mr. Srivastava has given several descriptions of important rituals (pp. 14-16; 25-30; 32-37; 42; 58-59; 64; 73; Chapter VII; 164-165; 178-180;) but the roles and functions of the different religious leaders: the *Gampa*; *Dingpa*; *Bapa (Gapa)*; *Napa*; *Dingpa*; are not clearly defined at the outset, which makes it impossible to distinguish one from another. There is no mention, for example, of a shaman but only of a diviner.

One of the most interesting passages (pp. 39-41) concerns a particular example of social change among the Wanchos of Longphong. Some time in the past, a chief of Longphong village decided to allow only the eldest son of every family to marry, in order to check the increasing population and consequent division of land, "the younger sons are to remain in the same house with their eldest brother and land is owned and cultivated jointly", however, "the unmarried sons of the family are allowed sex rights over their eldest brother's wife" and "with the wives of other men also the village". Unmarried girls on the other hand, may marry outside the village or become the wives of younger chiefs or of rich men inside the village: this is only case of polyandry among the Wanchos. The population of Longphong has not noticeably increased since that time. It was also a pleasure to read Mr. Srivastava's criticisms of the intolerance, priggishness or ethno-

centrism of certain officers towards the people among whom they are working (pp. 4-6; 10;).

Despite the author's praiseworthy efforts, more work still needs to be done to further our knowledge of the Wanchos and of other tribes living in the Tirap District. The Research Department of Arunachal Pradesh should publish or encourage publication of complete reports written by Research Officers familiar with this area such as the author, Parul Dutta, or P. N. Luthra, each accompanied where possible with footnotes, maps, a bibliography and a detailed index.

CONSTITUTIONAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE GROWTH OF THE NORTH-EAST FRONTIER AGENCY.

By P. N. Luthra. 173 pp., 5 maps.

Published by the North-East Frontier Agency Administration,
Shillong, 1971. Price: I. Rs. 18/

NAGLAND. FROM A DISTRICT TO A STATE.

By P. N. Luthra. iv + 118 pp., 3 maps.

Published by Shri M. P. Hazarika, Director of Information
and Public Relations, Arunachal Pradesh,
Shillong, n. d. (1975?). Price: I. Rs. 8/25.

The publication of these two books by the North-East Frontier Agency Administration and by Shri M. P. Hazarika greatly increase our knowledge of these two regions of North Eastern India: Arunachal Pradesh which was previously the North-East Frontier Agency and Nagaland. The author, P. N. Luthra, has served in both these territories, first as Political Officer in the Tirap Frontier Division (Arunachal) and later as the first Commissioner of the Nagaland Administration. He is undoubtedly one of the persons best suited to write these works which are outlines of the different phases which have taken place in the transformation of these regions from 'restricted areas' into a territory and a state within the Union of India.

As these two books are set out in much the same manner, the reviewer has not thought it necessary to treat them separately. They are divided into four parts, an Introduction and three Appendices. The first section gives us a brief summary of the political, administrative and constitutional evolution under British and later under Indian rule. Appendix I comprises a glossary of special terms and a tabulated chronological list of events indicating the landmarks of administrative and political change. Appendix II gives the complete texts of all the Rules, Acts, Regulations, Notifications and Orders from 1874 to 1967 in the case of NEFA, and from 1874 to 1962 in case of Nagaland. The last Appendix is composed of maps illustrating the different changes of administration and alterations to the names of the various Tracts, Divisions or Districts. In each book, a welcome map in colour shows the distribution of the diverse ethnic groups.

Useful additions to each book would have been a bibliography and an index. There is however, every reason to congratulate Shri P. N. Luthra as well as the publishers for having produced these two informative little books which give not only students of political science, but also the general public, the possibility of consulting many hitherto inaccessible legal documents and a large number of explanatory maps.

R E S A R U M

Bulletin published by the Research Department,
Arunachal Pradesh Administration, Shillong.

Vol. I, n°—1 (Jan. 1975; n°—2 (Apr. 1975);) n°—3 (Jul. 1975).

In recent years, interest in social change has been stimulated all over the world and particularly in India. It is a pleasure to welcome the publication of a new bulletin devoted to Arunachal Pradesh, previously known as the North-East Frontier Agency, which concentrates on the socio-cultural life—traditional or modern—of several populations inhabiting the Eastern Himalaya and the Cis-Patkoi Range.

The bulletin, printed in cyclo-style, and about fifty pages in length, will be published every quarter. It has been distributed to date, free of charge.

In the first three issues, the contributors are Research Officers, Directors, Deputy Directors and Assistant Directors of Research, District Research Officers, Language Officers, Registering Officers, and the Librarian or Curator of the Central Museum of Arunachal Pradesh: all of whom are continuing the valuable work started by the late Verrier Elwin who created a research department in the NEFA Administration in the mid-fifties.

In the first number are to be found an editorial and five articles:

1. "Malinithan" (description of the ruins of Malinithan in the Siang District).
2. "The Loku Festival (harvesting) of the Nocte",
3. "Two rare ornaments from Lower Siang". (a Badam (adis) amulet and a miniyong (adis) bead necklace with pendant).
4. "Introduction of Buddhism among the Monpas and the Sherdukpens".
5. "Language and Culture". (among the Miju Mishmis, Daflas, Gallongs, Monpas, Tangsa, and Singphos).

In the second number are published:

1. "A note on Mishmi tita". (the cultivation and trade of the *coptes teeta*, a medicinal plant belonging to the *ranunculaceae* family).
2. "The Adis, their origin and migrations".
3. "Evidence of caste-like features in some Arunachal tribes".
4. "Tangsa folk legends" (the origins of the Mol festival and of sacrifice).
5. "Adi invocations, spells and chants".
6. "Burial in a Miniyong Village" (a Miniyong Adi village in Karang).

In the third issue, seven articles have been devoted to the women of Arunachal Pradesh in honour of 'International Womens' Year':

1. "Women of Arunachal and their status in socio-cultural life".
2. "Tsewang Lhamo: Mother of the Sixth Dalai Lama" (a Monpa born in Berkhar, six miles to the south-west of Tawang).
3. "The place of Women in Khawa (Bugun) Society".
4. "From *The Descriptive Ethnology of Bengal* by E. T. Dalton" (a Khamti lady, a hill Miri belle, a Padam woman).
5. "Women artists of Arunachal".
6. "From some Monographs on the Tribes of Arunachal" (V. Elwin, *A philosophy of NEFA*; Raghuvir Sinha, *The Akas*; Shukla, *The Daflas*).
7. "Representation of Laksmi among the female sculptures at Malinithan".

Although these articles are unequal in quality, certain of them are particularly interesting and throw a new light on certain aspects of the different societies living in Arunachal Pradesh. Among those that deserve particular mention are: "Malinithan"; "The Introduction of Buddhism among the Monpas and the Sherdukpen"; "Language and Culture"; "A Note on the Mishmi Tita"; "The Adis, their origin and migrations"; "Evidence of castelike features in some Arunachal tribes"; "Women of Arunachal and their status in socio-cultural life"; "Tsewang Lhamo: the mother of the Sixth Dalai Lama"; "The place of women in Khawa (Bugun) Society".

Certain articles could be discussed in detail, such as "The Adis, their origin and migrations", whose author seems to be ignorant of the writings of Sachin Roy (the T'aos of Cambodia and Vietnam must in fact be the Yaos, who have never entered Cambodia, and only settled in Laos and Thailand in the early nineteenth century). One could argue also with the views of the article "Evidence of caste-like features in some Arunachal tribes" who, victim of his own ethnocentricity, seems to confuse 'social classes' with 'castes'. Perhaps he should have consulted works such as *Political Systems in Highland Burma* or *Structure of Chin Society*. Furthermore, he might have pointed out the division existing between the Hrussos (Akas) and the Kromes) or among the Khamtis and Noctes, see *Democracy in NEFA* by Verrier Elwin.

Finally, it would have been preferable, in the number dedicated to the role of women in Arunachal society, if the reader could have been given the possibility of reading the unpublished notes of Research Officers working among little known ethnic groups like the Bangrus, Membas, Khampas, Meyors, Zakh-rings, Morans, Chutias or Yobins, rather than being obliged to re-read extracts from the works of Dalton, V. Elwin, R. Sinha and B. K. Shukla, pleasant though they are.

If *RESARUM* continues its present trend of publishing issues based on a single theme, perhaps one may hope in the future, for articles on shamanism and useful plants, political systems, religious rituals etc. In the meantime, the Research Department is to be congratulated for their enterprising start. I. M. Simon recalls that twelve years have passed since the publication of the last bulletin. It is to be hoped that this very promising bulletin will have a long life, and that one day it will be printed in offset, and illustrated with photographs, drawings and maps.

GLIMPSES OF THE EARLY HISTORY OF ARUNACHAL

By L. N. Chakravarty, *ii + 167 pp., 16 plates.*

Published by The Research Department of Arunachal Pradesh Administration, Shillong, 1973. Price: I. Rs. 7/25

Glimpses of the Early History of Arunachal by L. N. Chakravarty, at present a Director of Research in the Arunachal Pradesh Administration, fills an important gap in our knowledge of the early history of the North—Eastern part of India. The book records the history of Arunachal Pradesh, better known under the name of NEFA (North-East Frontier Agency), from the inception of British rule in Assam in 1826 up to 1960.

With the exception of the works of A. Mackenzie: *History of the Relations of the Government with the Hill Tribes of the North—East Frontier* (1884); E. Gait *A History of Assam* (1906); L. W. Shakespear: *A History of Upper Assam, Upper Burmah and the North—East Frontier* (1914); and R. Reid: *History of the Frontier Areas bordering on Assam from 1883-1941* (1947); no detailed account of the history of Arunachal Pradesh existed, previously.

As the title suggests, the author reviews, a little too sketchily perhaps, the history of the five districts of Arunachal Pradesh: Kameng, Subansiri, Siang, Lohit, and Tirap, before dwelling in the last three Chapters on the historical ruins, the history of Posa and the raids on the plains.

The book is divided into eight chapters. In the first three chapters, the author speaks of different populations inhabiting Kameng, Subansiri and Siang: the Sherdukpens and Bhutias, Akas (Hrussos), Mijii (Kdammais), Dhawas (Buguns) Daflas (Bagni Nissis) and Monpas in Kameng; the Apa-Tanis, Tagins and Hill Miris in Subansiri; the Adis (Abors) in Siang. Whereas the subject matter is treated fully and methodically in the first three chapters; in chapters four and five, the information given about the diverse populations living in the Lohit and Tirap Districts, is rather meagre. The author mentions the various Mishmi groups such as the Digarus (Taorans), Mijus (Kamans), Chulikatas (Idus) and Rebejiyas as well as the Khamptis, Tibetans, Zakhrings and Singphos living in Lohit; and the Noctes and other Naga groups commonly known as Rangpangs (Tangsas) in Tirap. It is a pity that most of the ethnic names are given in Assamese which only leads to confusion, rather than the names by which they designate themselves in their own languages, accompanied by the various pseudonyms by which they are known. In chapter six, himself a historian and well

known archeologist, the author gives an account of the historical ruins discovered to date in Arun Achal and some legends surrounding them, such as Bhalukpung in Kameng; Ita and Sivalinga in Subansiri; Malinithan in Siang; Tawreswari temple, Brahmakunda and Pasuramkunda, Sivalinga temple and Bhismanagar in Lohit. According to legend, the most ancient temples date from the early Christian era: a more precise historical verification of these dates of construction would have been welcome. The following chapter concerns the history of the *posa*. The *posa* is an "allowance paid to certain hill tribes (Bhutias, Akas, Daflas, Hill Miris, Abors) inhabiting the hills on the northern frontier of Assam.....in consideration of the abandonment of their claims with regards to certain duars". This policy was started by the Ahoms and partially continued by the British till the independence of India. The last chapter is composed of tables enumerating the raids undertaken by different ethnic groups from NEFA, on the Assamese plain, from the time the British occupied Assam until 1951.

Regrettably, there are no supporting maps, bibliography or index. A list in chronological order, of the Commissioners, Officers and Agents responsible for the improvement of relations with the hill tribes, or for the organising of military expeditions or missions, as well as a list of the various journeys made by travellers, missionaries, botanists, officers, surveyors, tea planters etc. stating the time, place and ethnic group visited would have been valuable additions to this book. Nonetheless, Shri L. N. Chakravarty and his publishers are to be thanked for having given us a "glimpse" of the history of this fascinating new states and hopefully we will be given a wider view at a future date.

Alain Fournier.

THE NORTH—EAST FRONTIER OF INDIA (A topographical, political and military Report). Compiled by Capt. John F. Mitchell. [Reprint of "Report (topographical, political and military) on the North—East Frontier of India" published in Calcutta, 1883.] ××+374 pp., 8 maps, 22 illustrations. Published by Vivek Publishing House, Delhi. 1973. I. Rs. 80/-

A welcome reprint indeed. This has been one of the most unobtainable books on the North—Eastern frontier of India. Published on March 21, 1883,

the 250 copies printed were distributed to Government offices and officials dealing with the area, and was never really publicly available. Mitchell's introduction succinctly sums up the content of each report:

- “1. The geographical position and topographical history of each tribe.
2. A chronicle containing all important events connected with each tribe for the last 100 years, showing their military history and political relations.
3. Warlike operations against the tribes.
4. Routes into the territories by occupied the tribes”

This information is divided into three chapters in each report: 1. Topographical, 2. Political, 3. Military.

There are seven reports covering Upper Assam (mainly the present Lakhimpur and Sibsagar districts), Eastern Naga country (North Cachar), Miri areas, and the area inhabited by the Daflas. Although the primary objective of compiling these reports was to provide the military with relevant facts, one must still rely on parts of these reports for historical and anthropological facts due to the inability of many scholars to visit the areas. Unlike most reprint publishers, Vivek has taken care to include all the original illustrations and, more importantly, all the original maps.

A somewhat limited index has been added to the reprint edition. The paper is good, printing is fair, the binding adequate and the price rather high.

HIGHER THAN EVEREST. Memoirs of a Mountaineer.

By H. P. S. Ahluwalia. × +188 p.p., 34 b/w plates, endpaper maps.

Published by Vikas Publishing House, New Delhi, 1973. I. Rs. 20/-

The 1965 Indian Expedition put nine climbers on the summit—a feat not yet repeated. The official account of this expedition was published long ago (“Nine atop Everest”, New Delhi, 1966), and this book is the autobiography

of one of those who reached the summit. It may seem pretentious of a young man in his thirties to write "memoirs of a mountaineer", but shortly after the Everest triumph Maj. Ahluwalia was nearly killed in Kashmir during the Indo-Pakistan war in 1965. He became paralyzed from the hip down, and his career as an active mountaineer ended there and then.

The book is a modest and simple but moving story of the author's fight, not only to the top of Everest, but the much tougher fight to restore his self-confidence and to carry through an extensive rehabilitation programme in England. The book is pleasantly readable.

H,K,K,

TARAP. UNE VALEE DANS L'HIMALAYA. By Corneille Jest.
160 Pages. Published by Seuil, Paris, 1974. Price: Softcover: 40 F.

Beautiful regions, as a rule, produce equally beautiful books, like the Sahara, the Yemen, the Xingu or Nepal. As for Nepal, examples are the table books by Tichy, Hagen, Seemann, Frank, and Peissel. Such products may kindle a momentary sensual thrill: the kick of the picturesque. Naturally, their element is the picture; scarce in their textual parts. They try to attract the reader visually, with blown-up photographs, splendidly displayed over the pages. Their verbal poverty is drowned in retinal loquacity. Quickly, however, these beautiful books become a bore. And the lavish pictures of such showpieces wear out soon after one has thumbed them through. Stolen from a rich sociological context, such pictures have, apart from a colourful make-up, nothing to convey; they are not telling. At most they advertise the personality of their author in the fashion of a snap.

At first sight the work: *tarap. une vallée dans l'himalaya* by C. Jest seems to fall into this category of books. It is, without doubt, a beautiful book. In size and make-up it is a table book. Printed on mat velvet offset and arranged in a harmoniously balanced and generous layout, the book is very rich in pictures. From a total of 80 mostly full size photographs, 28 are in colour and 17 on double pages. A number of Tibetan woodcuts and drawn maps, plus a series of over 30 smaller drawings by the Dolpo painter Chogy

Tondrup add to the visual splendour of the volume. In words, on the other hand, Jest's book is very modest. Besides the constant captions which accompany the lavish photographs, *tarap* contains not more than a 14-page essay by the author on the Tibetan cultural background of the Dolpo region in North West Nepal—Tarap being one of the four valleys of Dolpo—, plus 10 pages of appendix, including a postface by A. Leroi-Gourhan, a glossary of Tibetan terms, a chronological chart on Tibet's history and selected discographies, filmographies and bibliographies on Tibet and Nepal,—all quite useful, but not very telling.

And yet, the present work of Jest differs considerably from the standard picturesque books characterized above. First of all, Jest has lived with the people of Dolpo long enough to be their anthropological witness. He has stayed with them more than a year; he has learnt their language, a Tibetan dialect; he has revisited his hosts on various trips; and he has travelled extensively in other parts of the Himalayas to be able to distinguish the characteristics proper to the Tarap region. This intimacy of the author with his subject comes out in the sequential arrangements of his photographs. The succession of the chosen pictures transforms the book into a visual narrative. This narrative runs along three major threads: along the annual cycle of life amongst the population of the Tarap valley, along the stories of the author's main informant, Kagar Rinpoche, and along a rough display of classical subjects of the monograph type.

The book depicts more or less systematically the course of one year in the community of Tarap. The inhabitants of this high altitude region north of the Dhaulagiri Range recognize basically two annual seasons, a long and heavy winter and a sudden, shortlived summer. As the reader flips through the pages he encounters first the various activities of the winter: the homebound works like spinning, weaving, and stitching done by women; or tanning and cutting, executed by men; the religious ceremonies of the winter like New Year festival and the *nyungne*, the collective fast; and the trade voyages to the south on the grain route. In April activities of the summer start: the preliminary works on the fields, bringing the irrigation system in order, ploughing, dunging and sowing; driving the herds up to the summer pastures; trade voyages to the north, on the salt route to the neighboring Drogpa in Tibet; the religious ceremonies of the summer, like the collective pilgrimage to the holy places of Tarap or the *yartön*, the midsummer ceremony, with its resuscitation of the energies of life; finally, the hard work of the harvest, cutting, threshing and sieving.

The second thread along which the narrative of the book runs is the repeated appearance of the old Lama Kagar Rinpoche, Jest's major informant on the Tarap way of life. The pictures of the book start and end with this sage, with his wise and friendly face. Throughout the book he is seen here and there again, presiding over various ceremonial acts. But he also speaks: One half of the explanatory captions, which accompany the photographs, are transcriptions of his own words. This has been made typographically evident by the author, setting his own annotations in normal roman letters and those of the old Lama in italics. This trick changes the whole text of the captions into a kind of dialogue.

Finally, there is an arrangement of the photographs along the line of ethnographical subjects. Like the table of contents in a classical monograph, the pictures hint at a patterned sequence of material exposure: natural environment first,—the geographical setting,—then the population, its mythical origin, its social stratification and institutions, then various aspects of religion, then astrology, economics, medicine, ergology, and technology, and finally religion again. This principle of presentation is the weakest, naturally, because the different subjects flash by in mere glimpse. For example: A double page picture, showing adorned and dressed up men on horses, photographed in colour; next page: another group of men, squatting on the floor and looking with curiosity into a tent, presented in black and white. The caption in between speaks of the social hierarchy amongst the Tarap people, of the primeval residents, the *shimmi* who are the highest groups in rank; of the *chogmi*, those of the exterior who have a lower social status; of the even lower *gara*, the black smiths; and of the *bera*, those without a lineage, who are lowest. In the adjoining essay one finds an additional specification concerning this social stratification. It is said that the patrilineal clan groups of the Tarap people are divided into three social layers, the *rüche*, the upper bones, the *rü-barma*, the middle bones and the *rü-chung*, the lower bones, just like the upper, middle and lower topographical layers in a valley. I don't find such hints very satisfying for a social anthropologist, nor for a layman whose aspirations surpass the normal level of pop anthropology. One would, for instance, like to know, how the social classification which is built on the model of a topographical one—the threefold stratification—fits into or works parallel to the historical one, the twofold classification of old and new settler groups. At such points the shortness of the explanatory texts becomes a real shortcoming.

What makes Jest's contribution more than a beautiful picture book is the simultaneous interplay of the mentioned three threads of arrangement. By bringing his photo-book into a rather complicated narrative form, he has escaped the arbitrariness of the snap. His book carries the factor of time (a quality of the novel) as perceived by the population of Tarap. And, not to forget, all his pictures remain with this one population, a restriction not found amongst the usual picturesque books, which need to expand their sensations constantly.

The book is an experiment in the visual presentation of ethnographical knowledge. It raises, without mentioning it expressly, the question: How much can photographs tell? Simple as it may sound, this is a question of considerable methodological range. It is not a new one, it is only newly attempted. Ever since G. Bateson and M. Mead published their programmatic visual study of Bali in 1942, *Balinese Character—A Photographic Analysis*, have anthropological writers contemplated the problem of how to translate best their knowledge to their readers in the West, with the help of pictures. Jest's book is an esthetically pleasing, an elegant solution. The central problem, however, has not been touched by it: How to present the invisible reality of mental expressions, the reality that lies behind that of the senses?

For things visible, pictures may be good, even better than long verbal descriptions, more penetrating, more objective, more economical. And one may always start with pictures, as baits. But for things invisible, the *hau*, the picture has to be replaced in the end by verbal explanation. And the more concrete this verbal explanation is in detail, the better for the explanation in general. To return to one example in the Tarap book: On five consecutive pages the author exposes a series of photographs, dealing with a marriage. One can see the bride, the bridegroom and other people, all involved with certain stages of the marriage ceremonies. It is a vivid picture, as if one were there oneself. But the essential thing is missing, both in the pictures and in the verbal captions: Missing is the *spirit of the institution of marriage in Tarap*, the system of exchange it involves, the style of tying together social groups. This cannot be photographed, this can only be understood and then be told. It is a matter of meaning. Understanding and presenting what the visible things actually mean and how they relate to other domains of meaning seems to me the *raison d'être* of anthropological investigation.

But I did not want to knock at a butterfly with a hammer.

Michael Oppitz