

**EUROPEAN BULLETIN  
OF  
HIMALAYAN RESEARCH**

**Number 4, 1992**

---

**Südasiens-Institut  
Heidelberg**

# EUROPEAN BULLETIN OF HIMALAYAN RESEARCH

Number 4

1992

## CONTENTS

### REVIEW ARTICLES

- Ecological Crisis and Social Movements in the Indian Himalayas: Antje Linkenbach ..... 1  
Decline of the Rong-folk: reflexions on A.R. Foning's *Lepcha, my vanishing tribe*:  
R.K. Sprigg ..... 14

### ARCHIVES

- Himalayan Archives in Paris, Part two: Lucette Boulnois ..... 22  
The Collections on Nepal in the Bibliothèque Nationale ..... 22  
The Library of the Centre d'Etudes de l'Inde et de l'Asie du Sud ..... 28  
The Centre de Documentation sur la Chine Contemporaine ..... 30  
The Société Asiatique Library ..... 31  
Early Christian missions in the Himalayas: including a note  
on the location of missionary archives in Italy: Dipak Raj Pant ..... 32

### INTERVIEW

- On The Topicality of History. - An Interview with Mahesh Chandra Regmi:  
Martin Gaenszle ..... 40

### RESEARCH REPORTS

- Individual Project  
Internal and external conceptualization of social change in northeastern Nepal:  
Michael Mühlich ..... 47

### NEWS

- Conferences  
Human Rights Violations in the Himalaya - the Domination of Elites: Ludmilla Tüting ..... 48  
Ladakh History and Culture: Maria Phylactou ..... 49  
SASON Congress in Kathmandu: Joanna Pfaff-Czamecka & Martin Gaenszle ..... 52  
"The Anthropology of Nepal: People, Problems and Processes":  
Charles Ramble ..... 54  
The Himalayan Forum at SOAS: Michael Hutt ..... 55  
Politics, Identity, and Cultural Change in the Himalayan Region,  
University of Oxford: David Gellner ..... 56  
Obituary  
Martin Hoftun & Bill Raep: David Gellner ..... 56

### ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Symposia:  
Bhutan: A traditional order and the forces of change, SOAS: Michael Hutt ..... 57  
Publications:  
The Himalayan Forum at Himalayan Research as Part of a Global Effort for the Mountains:  
Rudolf Högger ..... 58  
Annapurna Sattrek Map, Nepal ..... 60

CORRIGENDA ..... 60

CONTRIBUTORS TO THIS ISSUE ..... 61

NOTES TO CONTRIBUTORS

## Editors:

Richard Burghart  
Martin Gaenszle  
András Höfer  
Südasiens-Institut  
Im Neuenheimer Feld 330  
D - 6900 Heidelberg  
Germany

## Contributing Editors:

**Austria:** Dr. Michael Torsten Much  
Institut für Tibetologie und  
Buddhismuskunde  
Universität Wien  
Maria-Theresien-Str. 3/11  
A-1090 Wien

**France:** Dr. Anne de Sales  
23, rue Montorgueil  
F-75001 Paris

**Great Britain:** Dr. Michael Hutt  
Department of Indology  
School of Oriental & African Studies  
Thornhaugh Street  
GB-London WC1

**Poland:** Dr. Krzysztof Debnicki  
Instytut Orientalistyczny  
Uniwersytetu Warszawskiego  
Krakowskie  
Przedmieście 26/28  
P-Warszawa.

**Switzerland:** Dr. Joanna Pfaff-Czamecka  
Ethnologisches Seminar  
der Universität Zürich  
Freiensteinstr. 35  
CH-8032 Zürich.

**Scandinavia:** Hakan Wahlquist  
The National Museum of Ethnography  
P.O. Box 27140  
S-102 52 Stockholm  
S-Sweden

## REVIEW ARTICLES

### Ecological Crisis and Social Movements in the Indian Himalayas

Antje Linkenbach

AGARWAL Bina 1991. *Engendering the Environment Debate: Lessons from the Indian Subcontinent*. East Lansing, Mich.: Center for Advanced Study of International Development.

BERNDT, Hagen 1987. *Rettet die Bäume im Himalaya: Die Cipro-Bewegung im Spiegel der indischen Presse*. Berlin: Quorum Verlag.

GUHA, Ramachandra 1991 (1989). *The Unquiet Woods: Ecological Change and Peasant Resistance in the Himalaya*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.

IVES, J.D. and Bruno MESSERLI 1989. *The Himalayan Dilemma: Reconciling Development and Conservation*. UN Univ. Press; London and New York: Routledge.

SHIVA, Vandana 1988. *Staying Alive: Women, Ecology and Survival in India*. New Delhi: Kali for Women; London: Zed Books.

\_\_\_\_\_ 1991. *Ecology and the Politics of Survival: Conflicts over Natural Resources in India*. In association with J. Bandyopadhyay et al. UN Univ. Press; New Delhi: Sage Publications.

*State of India's Environment: A Citizens' Report*, 3. Floods, Flood Plains and Environmental Myths. New Delhi: Centre of Science and Environment, 1991

According to the conventional academic division of labour Himalayan ecology was traditionally studied by natural scientists, esp. geographers, who focussed their research on the climatic, geophysical

and hydrological conditions and the flora and fauna of the Himalaya as a mountainous ecosystem. Human beings were seen just as one part of the subject of human ecology. The research of anthropologists and historians, on the other hand, focussed on the culture, economy and history of the hill communities and showed little interest in ecological issues.

In the last few years a critical discourse on environmental problems in the Himalayas has emerged, bringing together natural and social scientists who are now playing a central role in ecological debates in India. In the following review I shall present some stimulating, and occasionally controversial, publications concerning ecological and social change in the western part of the Indian Himalaya (Uttarakhand) as well as peoples' responses to these changes. The focus is on socio-historical approaches, but an important debate on linkages between parts of the natural ecosystem will also be briefly mentioned.

#### The ecological debate in India

In the last decade a steadily growing ecological awareness in all parts of India can be observed, which has to be seen as the result of an intensifying discourse on environmental changes and their impact on the people. In this context special attention has been given to the basic natural resources - forests, soil, water and air. One of the main issues of the environmental debate is not only to identify their state of deterioration or degradation, but also to discover the preconditions and reasons for the degradation, as well as the resultant consequences for man and nature. The discussion, therefore, centers on problems, such as forest decline, soil erosion, decline of soil fertility,

water pollution, falling groundwater levels, etc and takes up the process of "statization", privatization and commercialization of natural resources and their integration into a profit-oriented market economy. Moreover, the debate deals with the linkages between different interface areas (e.g. deforestation and soil erosion, deforestation and floods, water or air pollution and health) and with the question, how far traditional modes of life are seriously affected or even destroyed by changes in the environmental conditions (1).

Since the middle of the eighties the environmental debate has become more action-oriented and sees one of its main objectives in finding solutions for the threatening nation-wide ecological problems. This process is indicated by the still increasing number of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) which are involved with environmental issues at the local level (these issues do not stand in isolation, mostly they are taken up in addition to long-standing concerns for rural development, social justice, the elimination of poverty, etc.). Supported by NGO-activists, local people have to some extent developed a socio-ecological consciousness of their situation and, rising from a position where they are mere victims of overwhelming outside events, have tried to influence and alter their living conditions, a process which sometimes leads to organized resistance (2).

Besides its practical orientation, the environmental debate has prepared the way for ideological discussions, concentrating on two major aspects: the relation between women and environment ("ecofeminist" debate) and reflections on the leading paradigm of development and the search for alternatives. Both topics are discussed heavily in the Indian context but are finding resonance on an international level as well. In the whole ecological debate the Himalayan region plays a crucial role. Compared with other ecologically degraded areas of India, it is gaining more attention. More

individuals and groups seem worried about its fate, possibly because of its cultural and spiritual significance in the Hindu tradition, whereby the "Holy Himalaya" is an object of devotion for millions of Hindus.

There are, however, further reasons for the interest in the Indian Himalayas. The Western Himalaya covers the river catchment areas of the Ganga and Yamuna with their drainage systems leading to the Gangetic plains. Especially Uttarakhand, which was severely affected by environmental and social changes since colonial times, has become an arena of peasant resistance against official forest policy. The first postcolonial social movement with ecological concerns - the Chipko movement - emerged in Uttarakhand, where it gained momentum and became a paradigmatic case for people's resistance towards ecological deterioration. The "ecofeminist" debate as well as the critical discourse on the question of development refer to a great extent to the Himalayan ecological situation and to Chipko events and ideas. Leading Chipko activists and "sympathizers" from the academic circle are main contributors to these debates.

#### **Changes in the Himalayan ecosystem and in traditional modes of life: deforestation as an ecological and social problem**

The main characteristic of the Himalayan ecosystem is its natural richness of water resources and vegetation types. Before the Himalayan mountains were affected by commercial and military interests as well as population pressure the slopes were covered with dense broadleaf and conifer forests (pine, deodar, oak, rhododendron, etc.) from the Siwalik ranges up to an altitude of ca. 3800-4000 m where alpine vegetation starts.

A close forest cover, so the current view of ecologists, does not only benefit the local hill people and their economy but has stabilizing effects for the whole mountain ecosystem and even for the plains: it serves to reduce soil erosion and land slides as it

influences the hydrological cycle by intercepting rainfall, creating soil conditions that allow greater infiltration of water into the ground and modifying runoff precipitation. To the same degree that deforestation progresses, so are the disastrous floods and massive siltation in the plains aggravated as greater quantities of soil and water run down the Himalayan valleys at an even faster rate.

A controversial debate has emerged concerning the wider effects of deforestation. The recently published third *Citizens' Report* of the Centre of Science and Development (1991) highlights the linkages between deforestation and floods by arguing that the Himalaya as the youngest mountain range in the world with still ongoing mountain building activities is highly affected by earthquakes, deep landslides and natural erosion processes so that it naturally constitutes an ecosystem "primed for disaster" (p. 23). Even when the Himalayan mountains were relatively uninhabited and the forest cover intact, major floods occurred in the valleys of Indus, Ganga and Brahmaputra and "disrupted civilizations" (p. 147).

In its essential statements the CSE report bases itself on the elaborate study of Jack Ives and Bruno Messerli (1989) in which the authors examine critically, what they call, the theory of Himalayan environmental degradation (for details see Ives & Messerli 1989:45). In this theory hill people are considered to be responsible for deforestation (3) and the resulting ecological damages because of population pressure leading to extensive forest use and transforming forests into agricultural land (4).

The blaming of hill tribals and subsistence farmers by the government and public for floods in the plains, the report stresses anxiously, may lead to the alarming situation that forest conservation will be pursued *against* the people in the hills: "the result could be extremely repressive legislation like the proposal to ban shifting cultivation by law or to undertake forest

conservation by throwing the people out (CSE Report 1991:149)".

Traditional forms of hill agriculture, including slash and burn cultivation, are seen as ecologically sound modes of subsistence; and subsistence farmers "are highly knowledgeable and intelligent land managers with a wealth of accumulated, traditional wisdom" (p. 63; see also Ives and Messerli 1989:13; 147). Their methods of agricultural terracing and land use changes serve to stabilize the slopes and reduce water run-off. When afforestation is needed, it is for recreating a stable cycle of production and reproduction in the hills, and not for preventing floods in the plains (5). Some effect to prevent *local* soil erosion and shallow landslides is nevertheless not to be denied.

In a recent article the well-known "ecofeminist" Vandana Shiva attacks the CSE argument and blames it not only for its "anti-ecological claims" but also for its not any longer being a "citizens' report on the environment" (6). It is neither called participatory nor ecological; and, she further complains, the authors of the report mainly refer to L.S. Hamilton, a "so-called expert", who gained his knowledge in Hawaii (for details see Shiva 1992:42). Shiva does not deal seriously with the statements of the CSE report, and it seems that she is mainly irritated by the absence of what, for her, is one of the strongest arguments for afforestation. Instead of polemics, an appreciation of the complex and certainly not simply anti-ecological argumentation of the report would have been called for. Such an analysis would reveal that for the case of Uttarakhand there are, indeed, some questions left to answer.

Ives and Messerli refer mainly to the ecological situation in Nepal where population pressure seems to be the most severe problem. Although they claim that their analysis applies as well to Garhwal and Kumaon, the situation is different there insofar as deforestation, as they themselves acknowledge, has taken place to a much



wider extent, due to the large-scale commercial felling and road construction. Immediately the question occurs: if the great floods affecting the plains are not mainly caused by deforestation, what about the recurring floods of Alakananda and Bhagirathi in the mountain region itself? For answering this question the analysis of the Third Report is by no means sufficient. A large section of the report is devoted to the floods in Garhwal and in the Teesta Valley, but what is presented is mainly a documentation of historical and present flood events and a study of the direct release mechanisms. Deforestation is mentioned only in passing as a possible cause for floods.

Here is not the place for deepening the problem of the relationship between floods and deforestation, but it can be said that a profound and unemotional analysis concerning this relationship, which takes into account the regional differences in the Himalayas, is a task that remains to be done.

To analyze the historical background of the environmental crisis in the Himalaya and the emerging social changes one has to concentrate on the studies of B. Agarwal and R. Guha. Both argue that the forest policy of the colonial and the postcolonial state led to severe transformations in the Himalayan ecosystem as well as in the traditional modes of life of hill people.

The traditional subsistence economies who rely on mixed farming are marked by an intensive use of community-controlled forests, whose "biomass" (to put it technically) is needed in the process of production and reproduction (7). These traditional forms of subsistence agriculture are affected by two parallel and interrelated trends: the growing degradation of natural resources in quantity and quality and the increasing appropriation of communal forest resources by the state (Agarwal 1991:17). It is difficult, however, to demonstrate forest degradation by statistical data because of their inconsistency. Official data state that 60% of Uttarakhand are forest-covered, but this refers to land under the control of the

Forest Department, even if their is no single tree. According to satellite data the forest covered areas come to 48%. The authors of the first *Citizens' Report* speak, however, of only 37.45%, in which half the area is degraded with poor tree density (8).

Exploitation of forest resources increasingly took place under colonial rule but did not stop after independence. Likewise the process of "statization" - i.e. the establishment of state control over forests - started in the colonial period but was continued in postcolonial times. When large-scale felling in the early years of railway construction led to the severe destruction of forests, the Forest Department was founded 1864 to exert control over the utilisation of forest wealth. In 1878 the Indian Forest Act established the state monopoly over the forests and divided them into three categories: Reserved or Closed Forest, Protected Forest and Village (Panchayati) Forest. Severe restrictions minimized the customary rights of the local people to the resources: Closed Forests were designated only for commercial timber extraction; in the Protected Forests rights of access were granted to local people under highly restricted conditions and with the prohibition of barter and sale of the forest products, but at the same time the forest officers were allowed to give concessions to all those whom they chose to privilege. For the communities free access was granted only to Village Forests, but these forests (often degraded) made up only a minimum of the area available before.

Parallel to legislating its forest monopoly, the state introduced "scientific forestry", i.e. forest management primarily oriented to commercial interests and neglecting the demands of the local population. R. Guha (1989:59) points out that the silvicultural agenda of the colonial officials was the transformation of mixed forests into pure stands of commercially valuable conifers; and B. Agarwal (1991:23) describes how in Uttarakhand oak trees were systematically lopped to encourage the

spread of chir pine and deodars.

In all, colonial forest policy had a very severe, threefold impact on local communities (Agarwal 1991:20). First, it legally cut off an important source of sustenance for the people. Villagers holding onto their traditional economy which basically relied on forest utilisation lost great parts of their forests and were forced to exhaust their now limited resources by overgrazing and overlopping; in the long run the self-sufficiency of the traditional economies was severely threatened. Secondly, it eroded local systems of forest management and local knowledge systems. Access to the natural forest resources was granted to all members of the community and all of them had to be responsible for their maintenance and reproduction. Evidence is given that women, who traditionally provided fuel and fodder, had elaborate lopping techniques that not only served resource utilisation but also increased the productivity of the forests (9). Such practical knowledge, which was not codified but transferred to the next generation as part of the labour process in the form of implicit rules, was easily lost in situations when the labour process undergoes transformations. The third result of colonial forest policy was that it created a continuing source of tension between forestry officials and local people. The previous access of local people to forest resources became illegal through Legislation Acts. Innumerable "cases of forest crime", when people tried to hold onto their customary rights were registered in the following decades. Guha has shown that deep conflicts and even resistance movements emerged out of this tension. I will come back to this soon.

Following Guha, the whole process of exclusion and loss, which the local communities are facing might be at best grasped with the concept of alienation. The now reserved forest, formerly integrated in the everyday life of the people (economically and culturally) becomes "an entity opposed to the villager", only "harbouring the wild

animals that destroy their crops (Guha 1991:58)".

After independence far-reaching decisions concerning future economic policy were made by the Government of India. Following the path of development through economic growth and industrialization, the pressure on the natural resources increased. But what does that mean for the Himalayan forests?

Firstly, no major changes occurred in the post-colonial forest policy which merely has to be seen as an extension of the policy laid down by the British. Forests are recognized as a renewable commodity serving commercial purposes (10). Primarily they have to supply raw materials for industry, export and defence; only secondarily do they provide local communities with a means of livelihood. Afforestation serves mainly industrial interests (although this policy is being rethought). Secondly, a greater demand for raw material led to an increased extraction of timber which had to be facilitated by the construction of a network of roads even into remote areas. Road building was again intensified after the China-India border conflict in 1962 and the growing military interests in this area. Thirdly, the listing of challenges to the Himalayan forests would be incomplete if one did not mention the mining activities, the expansion of resin-tapping and last but not least the steadily increasing number of pilgrims and tourists.

At the same time the postcolonial economic policy and the increasing environmental degradation has had a great impact on local village communities. Traditional processes of production as well as associated practical knowledge systems and the underlying relation towards nature are further being eroded. The burden of labour for the women who through their activities in the process of production and reproduction are related to the now diminishing forests is immensely increasing. Agricultural productivity has severely declined. Subsistence production is no lon-

ger able to feed the members of the community, they are forced to rely on the market. Dependence on the market has led to male migration on an even larger scale and a dual economy, "based partially on remittances and partially on the eroding basis of subsistence (Guha 1991:147)". More recently the male population has also begun to profit from the local sources of money making (commercial felling, resin-tapping, mining) and so exacerbates the process of environmental degradation. The encounter of two different modes of production in the hills creates further conflicts in the heart of society, bringing women, who are more subsistence-oriented, into opposition with men, who are predominantly oriented to the market economy.

#### Collective resistance in the Himalayas: the Chipko movement in historical perspective

The year 1973 gave birth to the *Chipko andolan*, a social movement in the hills of Garhwal and Kumaon which fights against commercial felling and deforestation relying on Gandhian non-violent resistance (*satyagraha*) and which succeeded in focussing national and international attention on the ecological crisis in the Himalayas.

The question arises how collective actions with a comparatively high level of organisational structure and mobilizing power could emerge in a "remote" area like Uttarakhand. Recent studies show that *Chipko andolan* indeed has not come out of the blue. On the one hand, it has to be seen in the light of the history of peasant resistance in Garhwal and Kumaon, on the other hand a line leads from the Gandhian wing of the Independence movement to the Himalayan hills and to prominent Chipko activists.

It is the main objective of R. Guha's book to explore the tradition of peasant resistance in the British territory of Kumaon and in the princely state of Tehri Garhwal (11) in order to contextualize recent movements like Chipko. Guha points out that

differences in the traditions of resistance in Garhwal and Kumaon stem from differences in the respective political systems.

In Tehri Garhwal the political structure was polarized between the *raja* (king) and his *praja* (subjects), organized in autonomous, comparatively egalitarian village communities. The *raja* possessed the titular property right over the soil, whereas the cultivators enjoyed the privilege of ownership except for the right to alienate land. It was part of the political ideology that the harmonious relationship between *raja* and *praja* could only be troubled by the misuse of power by the officials upon whom the king relied for his local administration. In such cases of conflict the peasantry drew the king's attention to the wrongdoings of his "wicked officials" by means of institutionalized forms of protest legitimized by custom. This form of mostly non-violent protest was known as *dhandak*; it was never directed to the king himself, but was a call to the monarch to restore justice. The *dhandak* normally ended with a new consensus attained between *raja* and *praja* and the restoration of the king's authority.

Forest management was first imposed in those forests leased by the British and led to severe curtailment of customary rights. During the following years the *darbar* itself realized a steadily growing part of its revenue through commercial forest use and the *raja* consequently introduced a policy of strict "forest conservancy" which followed the British model (12). The villagers took to the traditional form of the *dhandak* to complain against the new forest policy and in the beginning were successful in getting moderate relief. But when the forest policy grew harder and the conflict of interests increased, the traditional method of conflict regulation by consensus lost its impact and the *raja* felt forced to consider new methods to contain discontent.

Political tension escalated for the first time with the *dhandak* of Rawain in 1930, when villagers' protest against limitations on the number of cattle, cattle taxes, dis-

allowance of lopping, etc. encountered military force. An undetermined number of people (estimates vary from 4 to 200) were killed. This incident weakened the already badly affected relations between the king and his subjects such that the traditional authority of the monarchy was undermined.

The next resistance campaign took place in the years of 1944-48, when a widespread movement, the *kisan andolan*, was shaking and finally breaking the traditional power of the *darbar*. Guha explicitly mentions that these uprisings differed from the earlier *dhandaks* in two major aspects: first, the nationalist movement had spread into the Tehri state leading to the formation of the *Tehri Rajya Praja Mandal*; and second, this political body worked as an organizational forum so that several local movements against state repression could merge. The political aim of the *kisan andolan* was no longer the restoration but the transformation of the existing political structure. When the heavy conflict came to an end, the *raja* had lost his power and the Tehri state was on the way to merge with Uttar Pradesh.

Guha's study points out that political tension in Tehri Garhwal traditionally were answered via a consensus model of conflict regulation legitimated by custom, which only in the course of increasing pressure on the local communities turned into a confrontation model, but that opposition against the British rulers in Kumaon was basically characterized by confrontation.

In the first centuries of British rule in Kumaon the demands of the state were comparatively light and popular protest was nearly absent (13). Popular resistance in Kumaon started between 1911 and 1917, when the reservation of forests took place and affected the subsistence-based village communities; even the demands for *utar* increased as supervision of forests involved extensive touring by forest officials. The prevailing forms of resistance encompassed mainly denial of forced labour and firing the forests. Reasons for choosing the method of

firing were twofold: on the one hand, the villagers kept up their traditional practices, as in the conifer forests of the Kumaon it was usual to burn the forest floor every year to make room for a fresh crop of grass. On the other hand, it was one of the 'best' ways to violate the British forest regulations.

Already in 1916 the British registered a number of 'malicious' fires in reserved forests which broke out simultaneously over large areas and destroyed resin channels as well as the young saplings. In 1921 large-scale resistance against the British administration took place. The campaigns were partly organized by the Kumaon Parishad, an association of local journalists, lawyers and intellectuals, which had absorbed nationalist ideas and whose leaders were aware of the discontent of the local peasantry.

The first resistance campaign with a high rate of mobilization, was directed against *utar*. It proved to be a total success as in the end the *utar* system was abolished in Kumaon by the British. Encouraged by this success, the leaders of the Kumaon Parishad began to establish local *sabhas*, esp. in the Almora District, and mobilized the villagers for direct action in order to recover their lost forest rights. During the summer of 1921 forests were systematically fired. The areas burnt down were always exclusively chir pine forests, worked for resin and timber, the areas with broad-leaved forests remained untouched since they were useful for the villagers in the scope of their traditional subsistence economy. In the course of the fire-campaign the legitimacy of British rule was questioned by referring to traditional and mythological symbolism: The British Government was called a 'Bania Government' (which sells the forest produce and therefore the wealth of the people), the King Emperor was compared with the demonic Ravana.

In the following years until independence the peasant revolts in Kumaon did not come to an end but, as in Tehri Garhwal, became increasingly linked



with Congress politics. The local interests of the peasantry could no longer be clearly separated from national interests.

The line that leads from Gandhi to the Chipko movement is mentioned by H. Berndt, R. Guha and V. Shiva. Guha seems right in warning not to hallmark Chipko as a Gandhian movement, but certainly Gandhian political ideology and moral conduct has shown a great impact at least on the Chipko activists.

Especially V. Shiva stresses the developmental work of two female European disciples of Gandhi, Mira Bhen and Sarala Bhen, who left for the Himalayan hills in the late forties and concentrated on ecological problems and on the conscientization of women. It is said that most of the later Chipko activists like Vimala and Sunderlal Bahuguna, Chandi Prasad Bhatt, Dhoom Singh Negi emerged from the surrounding of those Gandhian women disciples (14).

Unanimously the work done by the cooperative DGSS (Dasauli Gram Svarajya Sangh) in Gopeshvar and the Uttarakhand prohibition movement in the middle of the sixties are seen as preconditions for the Chipko movement.

In 1960 Chandi Prasad Bhatt founded a workers cooperative in Gopeshvar, Chamoli District (which later developed into the DGSS) to generate local employment by taking up labour contracts and later setting up small-scale forest-based industries. The efforts of the DGSS were often threatened by the Government's denial to grant access to the raw materials from the forest; moreover, holding the resin monopoly the Government supplied them with resin at slightly higher rates than the large industries had to pay. This harassment led to a politization of DGSS members and at this point the story of Chipko movement begins.

Hagen Berndt gives a very detailed picture of the Chipko events basing himself on an analysis of the Indian press from 1971-1983, including the Hindi press (15). Relying on his work but also taking into

consideration Guha's presentation of Chipko, one can identify an internal development of the Chipko movement. Three main stages may be identified.

The first stage of Chipko resistance is characterized by a strong economic impact. The major demands (laid down in a memorandum submitted to the District Magistrate in March 1974) included: abolition of the contractual system of exploiting forest wealth and Erstrnutzungsrecht of forests by the local people; promotion of local forest-based small-scale industries and provision of financial and technical support; involvement of the people (i.e. organizations on District level) in the management of forests. The resistance campaigns were localized in the Chamoli District and organizational leadership rested with the DGSS and C.P. Bhatt; the resistance activities were carried out by men, only in the second line by women. At this time Sunderlal Bahuguna started to spread the idea of Chipko into the villages of Garhwal and Kumaon, undertaking several *padyatra*.

The second stage of the Chipko movement, starting with the events of Reni (upper Alakanda Valley), where village women defended a forest tract, is primarily characterized by a spreading of the movement and by an increasing involvement of women. The demands for abolition of large scale commercial exploitation of forest wealth and for regaining local forest control were strongly articulated. But the women put new emphasis on the significant role of forests as resource basis in the traditional subsistence economy. Referring to the Reni events, R. Guha (1991:160) states: "From now on Chipko was to come into its own as a peasant movement in defence of traditional forest rights, continuing a century-long tradition of resistance to state encroachment."

This second phase of the movement is also marked by an increasing publicity even beyond regional boundaries and by the growing attention it was given by the poli-

ticians. The State Government of UP set up a committee to investigate the connection between deforestation and ecological damage (floods, landslides) in the upper Alakananda Valley. The findings of the committee caused the State Government to ban commercial felling in 1976 for a period of ten years in the upper catchment of the Alakananda and its tributaries.

The beginning of the third stage in the course of the Chipko events can be set around 1977/78. The main characteristic of this new stage is the strong ecological impact of the movement, closely associated with the growing participation of women (16). In their demand for forest protection women underlined the value of forests for subsistence needs but with added force stressed the value especially of mixed forests for ecological balance (Advani/Hemvalghati 1977/78, Bhyundhar Ghati 1978). In this context people started to make use of cultural and religious symbolism. In the Advani forest villagers took the vow of raksabandan (17) and tied consecrated ribbons around the trees marked for felling. With this creation of a personal relationship between human beings and trees they demonstrated their responsibility and willingness for protection. They also met for prayers and recitation of parts of the Bhagavatapurana.

The ecological and subsistence-oriented demands of women led - as the case of Dungri-Paintoli reveals - to conflicts with men. When the Department of Horticulture planned to fell a large area of oak forest to set up a potato farm near Dungri-Paintoli, the Department officials negotiated the sale only with the men of the village. The men agreed, for they were promised employment and even further advantages, such as motorable roads, bus connections, electricity and a health centre. The women opposed the project, stressing the value of oak forests for the ecosystem and as a source of fodder and fuel. After this incident the question arose very clearly, why women, having an intimate relationship with forests,

are not allowed to participate in decision making-processes concerning the utilization of forests.

Local Chipko campaigns came to an end in 1981. In this year the Prime Minister signed a moratorium in which commercial felling in all parts of Uttarakhand at an altitude of more than 1000m and at an angle of more than 30° was to be banned for 15 years. But the end of resistance activities did not mean the end of the Chipko idea.

There are mainly two networks in this idea is perpetuated. The first centres around the DGSS and C.P. Bhatt. For DGSS members the protection of forests is only one part of a wider concept of regional development. They continue their work in the Chamoli District, concentrating on afforestation projects (with broadleaved and fruit trees) and on the installation of appropriate, integrated technology, as biogas plants, low-cost energy-saving stoves, etc. The DGSS supports the participation of women in political decision-making by encouraging them to become members, or even heads, of village panchayats (18).

The second network is closely linked to S. Bahuguna, who devotes his energy to propagate the need for the preservation of forests as a stabilizer of the Himalayan ecosystem. He argues against every form of forest utilisation beyond subsistence economy (19). Bahuguna, supported by the ecofeminist Vandana Shiva, predominantly is responsible for that what is called by R. Guha the "public" face of Chipko (20). He undertook spectacular *padyatras*, participated in national and international seminars, contributed to newspapers and journals: trying to create a narrative of the Chipko movement as a purely ecological and women-based group with a very strong base in Uttarakhand. The persuasiveness of Bahuguna rests not only in his Gandhian mastery of the publicity generating methods of *padyatra*, fasting, etc., but as well in his using modern means of mass communication. Thus in his "advertising

campaigns" he successfully addresses both intellectuals and villagers. Bahuguna recently used his popularity for fighting against the Tehri Dam (Tehri Garhwal) with a more than 40 day's fast, especially drawing attention to the high seismic danger in this area.

Knowing the "private" side of the Chipko movement, the widespread public picture in some way looks like a functionalisation of the movement, its presentation getting modulated according to the theoretical ideas and concepts to which it has to fit. The use of Chipko in the "ecofeminist" debate and in the critical discourse on the concept of development will prove this argument.

#### Chipko andolan as "contributor" to ideological debates

The involvement of women in the Chipko movement and their deep concern for the forests has given a strong impulse to the "ecofeminist" debate, which is critically outlined by B. Agarwal (1991). Agarwal shows that this debate, originating in the West, postulates a close connection between women and nature, both of which are seen as standing in an inferior opposition to men, who are related to culture.

One of Agarwal's main objections against western "ecofeminist" discourse is that it locates gender relations and relations to nature exclusively in ideology, neglecting the material source of dominance as well as the economic and political structures these ideologies are based upon; it also does not say anything regarding the women's lived material relationship with nature. What is needed, according to Agarwal, is a "political economy of ideological construction" and the credit for having taken a first step in this direction has to be given to Vandana Shiva. Referring to her experience with the Chipko movement, Shiva postulates that Third World women (here she is generalizing in an inadequate manner) depend on nature and natural resources for their daily sustenance and that of their families. She further argues

that women, deeply involved with nature in the labour process, have special knowledge of nature and natural processes. The degradation of nature in the name of development destroys women's sources for "staying alive"; modern science and development is seen as excluding women as "experts" as well as ecological and holistic ways of knowing (see also Shiva 1988). From this point of view Shiva presents the *Chipko* movement as a paradigmatic case for women's fight for survival and for the preservation of traditional modes of life.

Agarwal rightly mentions, however, that Shiva similarly tries to root in ideology the intimate relationship between women and nature. She refers to the Indian cosmogony and philosophy, in which nature is conceptualized as *prakriti* and expresses itself as *sakti*, the feminine and creative principle of the cosmos, and in which a special relationship is seen to exist between women and forests. Concentrating on those ideological aspects there is another public picture of *Chipko* movement and of the Chipko women. As a manifestation of nature the women have a special sensitivity and special responsibility for forests and the natural ecosystem. The conflicts arising in respect to resource utilization, emerging in a specific socio-historical constellation and being based on different modes of gaining livelihood become overdetermined by an essentialized gender opposition. Chipko women are used to exemplify the fact that in women qua their female nature a specific pattern of agency is inherent.

B. Agarwal accentuates that Shiva's theoretical framework lacks differentiations on the material as well as on the ideological level. Third World women have to be differentiated according to their geographical, socio-economical and historical situations, which are determining their relationship towards men and towards nature. Even for the Indian context no basic feminine principle can be discovered; the principle Shiva claims to reveal from the Indian philosophy relates only to Hindu discourse.

Therefore she is neglecting (or subsuming) other religious and philosophical systems existing in India; and even the Hindu discourse has to be seen as pluralistic and cannot be reduced to one authoritative strand.

On the basis of women's very noticeable participation in the Chipko movement, it is very easy to label it a feminist or a women's movement. But taking into consideration the organizational structure, objectives and public representation of the resistance, this seems to be an incorrect picture. Additionally, a women's movement is supposed to concentrate on gender relationships. Even though the prohibition campaign in the sixties was a first move in this direction and in the last period of the movement women started to think about their unequal situation (e.g. their exclusion from decision-making processes and from the village panchayats), this should not be overestimated. Agarwal (p. 53) cautiously points out that Chipko "has the potential for becoming a wider movement against gender-related inequalities" and mentions a shift in women's self-perception. The recent development in the Chamoli District may also be seen as a slight proof for her argument. But in my opinion, even then it is not very convincing to draw on the examples of a few islands of women's politization for giving a judgement on the development of the whole movement.

The ecological conflicts and movements emerging all over India have directed public attention to the resource- and energy-intensive national economic policy and led to a critical questioning of the guiding economic model in India. In her most recent book, which was prepared in collaboration with other scholars, Shiva (1991) critically analyzes this model, giving special attention to the question in which way nature is encountered practically and ideologically.

The economic model prevailing in India, Shiva argues, presumes the universalization of the western economic tradition. It

is based on the ideology of development and progress through economic growth and privileges industrialization and the expansion of market economy. Nature is seen as an object of dominance, free for exploitation. Technology and science are the instrumental means to dominate nature and to guarantee freedom from nature's ecological limits. When Indian national leaders took over this "western" model of development, attention was not given to the fact that industrial development in the West was possible only because of the permanent occupation and exploitation of colonies. To favour the resource-intensive model of development after independence was to produce an internal colonization and marginalization of all modes of life depending directly on nature for survival.

Shiva's concept for an alternative economic model remains abstract and inadequately formulated. She claims a paradigm shift in the perception of progress, development and growth and strongly demands a reversal of the weight given to each of the three fundamental "economies" that Shiva (1991:62) identifies in Third World countries: nature's economy of essential ecological processes, the survival economy of basic needs satisfaction of the people (which are both marginalized and secondary) and the (now dominant) market economy of industrial commercial demands. By referring to Gandhi, Shiva (p. 348) pleads to withdraw from the idea of linear progress and to favour a stationary model of society involving "movement and progression within an orbit". The reconciliation of ecology and economy has to be given priority, development should be "sustainable development", growth has to be "green growth". Having formulated this utopia of a world of justice and sustainability, Shiva does not enter into a more concrete discussion of how to achieve these objectives under the prevailing political conditions, and especially how to transform the national market economy according to non-profit oriented imperatives.



In Shiva's argument ecological movements are the focus of change, as they are fighting for resurrection of the two vital economies. In this context the Chipko movement is presented as the most prominent example of ecological protest (p.109), not arising "from a resentment against further encroachment on people's access to forest resources" but as "a response to the alarming signals of rapid ecological destabilisation in the hills" (21). Like Bahuguna, Shiva emphasizes that ecological movements, such as Chipko, recognize the traditional subsistence mode of production as the only promising economic model, since it harmonizes with nature's economy and tends to stabilize it.

For myself, however, Chipko seems to be an example of a social movement with ecological concerns whereby conflicting ideas of economic future and development can be discerned. Against the "conservative" model propagated by Shiva and Bahuguna, stands the model of "regional eco-development" articulated by C. P. Bhatt. He pleads for political and economical decentralization based on technologies promoting self-reliance, social control and ecological stability (see Guha 1991:182). The participation of villagers and especially women is central to his ideas.

With this concept of development Bhatt follows the Gandhian model of self-reliant village republics, which also is propagated by Anil Agarwal and Sunita Narain, main editors of the CSE reports, in a recent publication on village-development (22). They wrote in the preface to this publication: "The supreme irony behind our entire paper is that nearly 15 years after we became conscious of environmental concerns, we are, at the intellectual level, presenting nothing more than an elaboration of Gandhiji's concept of 'village republics' (Agarwal & Narain 1989:vii)". Even government agencies, when in a self-critical mood, come back to Gandhian approaches (23).

From this review of recent literature it

is clear that various alternatives to the prevailing model of development and growth have articulated by prominent activists who have conceptualized the future of the hill communities - speaking and deciding for the others. I want to end with the very simple observation that still little is known about the villager's own perceptions of their social, economic and ecological situation and about the way they conceive "development" and future.

#### Notes:

1. The environmental debate was mainly initiated and later systematically pushed ahead by the publications of the Centre for Science and Environment, New Delhi: *The State of India's Environment 1982: A Citizens' Report* (1985), and *The State of India's Environment 1984-85: The Second Citizens' Report* (1985). The editors explicitly demarcate their endeavour from that of the government: the publication should be a "Citizen Report", i.e. a non-governmental but nevertheless authoritative ("factual") publication which assesses the state of the nation and in which a wide spectrum of individuals and voluntary organizations, who work among the people, should be involved (CSE Report 1982: v).

The Indian Government nevertheless has shown its concern with the environment, e.g. through the establishment of the Department of Environment (1980), through legislative acts and numerous programmes for eco-development. But as pointed out in the second "Citizens' Report", there are many who seem to have no confidence that Government policy will really succeed in protecting the environment and that it takes seriously into account the needs of all those who depend on the natural environment for their survival.

2. For example: the Chipko Movement in Uttarakhand, movements against the building of big dams (Narmada dams, Theri Dam), Appiko Chaluvali in Karnataka and the fishermen's movement in Karnataka.

3. For Ives and Messerli "deforestation" is a

highly emotionalized category meaning "inherently" something bad. They recommend that different purposes of forest use be distinguished: e.g. large scale commercial logging has to be taken different fuelwood cutting and cutting the forest for agricultural terraces.

4. In their study Ives and Messerli mainly refer to Nepal but claim that their findings to some extent apply to other Himalayan regions.

5. The argument of the CSE report says: floods are natural events and people in the plains have "to learn to live with floods" (CSE Report 1991: 152). To discover the reasons for the disastrous results of floods one has to analyse the conditions in the plains (high population density, privatization of land, inequalities, poverty) which are conflicting with ecologically appropriate flood management.

6. Listening to Nature, in *Seminar* 394, June 1992 (Dialogue), pp. 40-44.

7. For animal husbandry the grass-rich areas of the forests and the alpine regions above the tree line are used as temporal pastures. The broad-leaved trees serve as fodder and litter, the manure for the fields is given by the forest in the form of rotten leaves or fermented litter mixed with the excrement of animals. The forest trees provide fuel as well as wood for the manufacturing of agricultural implements and for house construction. The forest is a source of medicinal herbs and also of food in times of scarcity.

8. For the data see Berndt 1978: 35; CSE Report 1982: 39; satellite data for all states of the Indian Union in CSE Report 1985: 80, reprinted in Agarwal 1991: 19.

9. See B. Agarwal 1991: 30 and also V. Shiva 1989: 79; both refer to a study of Marcus Moench, done in Munglori, Garhwal. See: M. Moench & J. Bandyopadhyay, Local needs and forest resource management in the Himalayas, in: Bandyopadhyay et al. (ed.), *India's Environment: crisis and responses*, Dehra Dun: Natraj, 1985.

10. The demand for the "realization of maximum revenue on a continuing basis" is

laid down in the National Forest Act of 1952. 11. From 1825 to 1949 Uttarakhand was divided into the British territory (including Kumaon and the eastern part of Garhwal) and the princely state of Tehri Garhwal. Since 1850 the British had leased large parts of the forests of Tehri Garhwal from the *raja*.

12. The rhetoric of the British forest policy seems ironic, if not cynical: "conservancy" and "protection" factually means: to conserve and protect the forests for commercial feeling.

13. Villagers only opposed (in a moderate form) *utar*, a kind of forced labour where the people are required to provide several services for governmental officials on tour or for white travellers without remuneration (carrying loads, supply of provision).

14. I would like to draw attention to the activities of Gandhian organizations after 1962. After the border conflict with China a number of Gandhian constructive organizations came together and decided "to pool their resources in order to undertake coordinated constructive work in the Himalayan region" (J.P. Narayan). This work was aimed to integrate the isolated border people into the Indian nation and to "build up their defence potential" by making them "enlightened and self-reliant". As yet I have found no information on the linkages between Chipko activists and the *sarvodaya* workers involved in "defence-oriented projects" (V.V. Giri), but definitely, at the seminar which was held on this topic in 1967 S. Bahuguna read a pertinent paper. See Ram Rahul, ed., *Social work in the Himalaya. Proceedings of the Seminar on Social Work in the Himalaya*. Delhi: Delhi School of Social Work, 1969.

15. Among the large number of publications on the Chipko movement the book of H. Berndt is distinguished by the very careful reporting of the events. The other contributions on this subject are mainly articles, scattered over a variety of journals. The literature on the Chipko movement is based, if at all, only short-term visits to the area.

16. Another characteristic of this phase, especially in the eastern part of Uttarakhand, was the conflict between contractors and Chipko members became intensified when police interventions occurred: e.g. the Nainital (1977) armed police proceeded against demonstrating people and during the following struggle violent actions took place in the name of Chipko. In Ghayari (1979) armed police were called to defend felling activities (Ghayatri 1979), but had to retreat when the felling was called off by the local administration. Arrests of leading activists became common events.

17. In the Hindu religious tradition a vow taken at the full moon in the month of Sravana; after the puja the worshipper gets a charm (*raksa*) around his/her wrist which should protect him/her against misfortune in the next year. In northern India an adult may tie a sacred ribbon around the wrist of a younger family member symbolizing that he or she will take special care of that person.

18. See "More Miles to Go for Chipko

Women", in *Down to Earth* Vol.1 No.2, June 15, 1992, S.40-41.

19. Until 1977 Bahuguna was at one with C.P. Bhatt articulating that forests have to serve as resource basis for small-scale industries, but then he changed his mind and took the opposite stance.

20. The public profile of Chipko - "as one of the most celebrated environmental movements in the world" is opposed to the "private" face, "which is that of a quintessential peasant movement" (Guha 1991: 78).

21. It is remarkable that in the economic debate Shiva does not stress the specifically ecological responsibility of women.

22. See A. Agarwal & Sunita Narain, *Towards Green Villages: A Strategy for Environmentally-sound and Participatory Rural Development*, Delhi: CSE, 1989.

23. See, for example, M.L. Dewan, *People's Participation in Himalayan Eco-System Development: A Plan for Action*, New Delhi: Concept Publ. Co., 1990.

### Decline of the Rong-folk: reflexions on A.R. Foning's "Lepcha, my vanishing tribe" (New Delhi: Sterling 1987)

R.K. Sprigg

The Lepcha, or Rong, tribe has been vanishing for more than a hundred years. Writing in 1875 Col. Mainwaring, in his *A Grammar of the Róng (Lepcha) Language*, traces the 'downfall' of the Lepchas to "the advent of the Europeans" (1). The decline in their fortunes began, he writes, in 1839, with the arrival of Dr Campbell as Superintendent of the East India Company's acquired settlement of Darjeeling; and its main cause was the influx of Nepalese and others whom Campbell had invited to settle in the Company's new and, in his opinion, underpopulated territory. The population of Darjeeling was reported as being only about a hundred in 1828-9, an abnormally

low figure because many of its inhabitants had deserted the area on the outbreak of civil war in Sikkim two years earlier; but by 1850 Campbell had succeeded in increasing it to 10,000 (2). Immigration swelled the population even further after 1856, the year in which the tea industry in Darjeeling reached the stage of commercial production, to meet the needs of the tea-gardens for labour. By 1866 thirty-nine tea-gardens had been planted out, with 10,000 acres under cultivation; and by 1869 the population of the Darjeeling tract had more than doubled, to over 22,000 (3). No doubt the Lepcha population of the District had shared in the general increase during this time; for the 1872 census gives

it as 3,952; but by then the total for the Hills area of the District had reached 46,727, and reduced the proportion of Lepchas to hardly more than 8% of that total (4).

In Sikkim, the Lepcha heart-land, too the story was much the same; but the swamping process began about fifty years later than in Darjeeling. Campbell estimated the Lepcha population of Sikkim in 1840 as about 3,000, approximately 60% of the total population of that country (5); and it seems likely that the proportional figure must have remained much the same until the late '70s. The Sikkim Court's policy with regard to immigration from Nepal (and from Bhutan too, for that matter) was the reverse of Campbell's. The 7th and 8th Maharajahs, who occupied the *gaddi* during this period, had good reason to remember the Nepalese invasion of Sikkim in 1788, when General Jahar Singh had succeeded in occupying the greater part of Sikkim, all of the country, in fact, west of the river Teesta, including the Sikkim Terai and the capital, Rabdentse, and had very nearly captured the (6th) Maharajah and his family (6). The Nepalese military occupation of western and southern Sikkim continued until 1817, when the treaty of Titalia brought the Anglo-Nepalese War to an end, and, at the same time, restored to Sikkim a substantial part of the territory that it claimed (7). Such an impression had the Nepalese military occupation made on the Sikkim Durbar that Nepalese were, thereafter, strictly excluded from Sikkim; and in accordance with this policy, when Hooker, the botanist, entered Sikkim from Nepal in 1848 with an escort of "two Ghorka sepoy", he was required to send them back to Nepal at once (8). Sikkim continued to be exclusively inhabited by the three races Lepchas, Bhutiyas (or Sikkimese Tibetans), and Limbus, known in Tibetan as Lho-Mon-Tsong-sum, for the greater part of the last century (9). It was not until 1875 that, in defiance of the official policy, a number of Sikkimese noblemen began to introduce Nepalese into southern Sikkim, in collabora-

tion with Newar merchants in Darjeeling, with some support from the British administration there (10). For a number of years there was resistance to these new colonies; indeed, in 1879 (or 1880) there was a clash at Rhenock, with some loss of life, between the Phodong Lama (patron of some of the immigrants) and his supporters and those who wished to preserve the status quo, especially the monks of Pemiongchi, the senior monastery (11).

All resistance to immigration came to an end with the appointment of Claude White as Political Officer, Sikkim, in 1889. Like Campbell in the infant settlement of Darjeeling fifty years earlier, it was White's policy to enlarge the taxable population of Sikkim in order to finance his road-building, bridge-building, and school-building schemes: "...in about ten years the revenue was raised from Rs. 8000, or little over £500 per annum, to Rs. 2,200,00, or about £150,000. But the country was very sparsely populated, and in order to bring more land under cultivation, it was necessary to encourage immigration, and this was done by giving land on favourable terms to Nepalese, who, as soon as they knew it was to be had, came freely in." (12). His policy was so successful that by the time of the 1891 census 15,925 Nepalese had settled in Sikkim; the Lho-Mon-Tsong-sum, on the other hand, totalled 14,012; so, even before the end of the last century, they had become a minority in Sikkim (13). The proportion of Lepchas, with a population of 5,762, had now declined from an estimated 60% in 1840 to less than 19%.

The British administration had decided that the Lepchas were unsuited to the economic developments of the latter half of the 19th century: "The Lepchas ... claim to be the autochthones of Sikkim Proper ... . They are above all things woodmen of the woods, knowing the ways of birds and beasts, and possessing an extensive zoological and biological nomenclature of their own. Of late years, as the hills have been



stripped of their timber by the European tea-planter and the pushing Nepalese agriculturist, while the Forest Department has set its face against primitive methods of cultivation, the tribe is on the way to being pushed out. The cause of their decline is obscure. There is no lack of employment for them: labour is badly wanted and well paid; and the other races of the Darjeeling hills have flourished exceedingly since European enterprise and capital have made the cultivation of tea the leading industry of the district. The Lepchas alone seem to doubt whether life is worth living under the shadow of advancing civilisation, and there can, we fear, be little question that this interesting and attractive race will soon go the way of the forest which they believe to be their original home"; Risley, writing these words in 1894, clearly believed that the Lepchas had out-lived their time (14).

Very different was the view of Hooker, the botanist, later, as Sir Joseph Hooker, to become Director of Kew Gardens (1865-85); on his first visit to Sikkim, in 1848, before the Lepcha tribe had begun to vanish, he wrote: "it is always interesting to roam with an aboriginal, and especially a mountain people, through their thinly inhabited valleys, over their grand mountains, and to dwell alone with them in their gloomy and forbidding forests, and no thinking man can do so without learning much, however slender be the means at his command for communication. A more interesting and attractive companion than the Lepcha I never lived with: cheerful, kind, and patient with a master to whom he is attached, rude but not savage, ignorant and yet intelligent; with a simple resource of a plain knife he makes his house and furnishes yours, with a speed, alacrity, and ingenuity that wile away that well-known long hour, when the weary pilgrim frets for his couch. Except for drunkenness and carelessness, I never had to complain of any of the merry troop; some of whom, bareheaded and barelegged, possessing little or nothing save a cotton garment and a long knife, followed me for

many months on subsequent occasions, from the scorching plains to the everlasting snows. Ever foremost in the forest or on the bleak mountain, and ever ready to help, to carry, to encamp, collect, or cook, they cheer on the traveller by their unostentatious zeal in his service, and are spurs to his progress" (15).

For comparison with Hooker's commendation of the Lepchas I give the practical view of the administrator towards the typical Lepcha method of cultivation: "When the District was first taken over by the British administration, the hill portion was almost entirely under forest. The only cultivation was that of *jhuming* or burning down the forests, in the interior of the hills by Bhutias and Lepchas and on the foothills by Meches and other aboriginal tribes...

*Jhum* cultivation has now entirely disappeared owing to forest reservation, appropriation of land for tea cultivation and extension of plough cultivation to the remaining land. This last is a far more efficient method of cultivation than *jhuming* but requires the application of considerable hard labour both to render the land suitable for this kind of cultivation (i.e. by terracing, revetting and irrigating it) and in the performance of the various operations of agriculture. The Nepalis were far more assiduous and skilful in this superior method and consequently displaced or speedily outnumbered the original inhabitants" (16).

Since, in its *jhuming* operations, a large section of Sikkim's population was more or less constantly on the move, it is not surprising that the *Gazetteer of Sikkim* should note that "there are no towns or even villages in Sikkim; the nearest approach to the latter is to be found in the collection of houses near the Rajah's palaces at Tumlong and Gantok, round some of the larger monasteries, such as Pemiongchi, Tashiding, Phensung, and a few others at the copper mines of Pache near Dikkeling and the bazaars at Rhenock, Pakhyong, the Rungeet and Rumman" (17). Jungles, in which to pursue their semi-nomadic manner

of life, were to the Lepchas as essential as Highland cattle were to the Highlanders of Scotland before the "Forty-five Rebellion", or the buffalo to the Plains Indians of North America; once they had been deprived of these, the bases of their economy, each of these three peoples was doomed.

My purpose in giving this introductory historical sketch has been to set the stage for the appearance of the principal actor, as it were, the author of this "quasi-autobiography". My brief survey covers roughly the period from 1839 to the year of Mr Arthur Foning's birth, 1913, during which time the status of the Lepcha people changed dramatically. At its beginning they were the most numerous of the three races of Sikkim, with a sizable share in government, having, as members of their own race, the former Prime Minister (*chóng-zât*, Tib. *phyag-mdzod*) Bho-lod, whose assassination, in 1826, led to the Sikkim civil war (and, indirectly, to the Darjeeling grant), his brother Prime Minister Chotheup, alias Satrajeet (from his seventeen victories), the hero of Sikkim's resistance to the Nepalese invasion, and their sister Anyo Gyelyum, married to the 6th Rajah (18); by the end of that period they had been reduced to a minority position among a largely immigrant population in a country where deforestation was making the appearance of their homeland increasingly unfamiliar to them. It was at that time, when the decline of the Lepchas had become abundantly clear, that Mr Foning was born; in *Lepcha, my Vanishing Tribe* his has been the melancholy task of chronicling the reaction of the Lepchas to their diminishing political and social importance and to the threat to their tribal identity. This task his university education, in Calcutta, four hundred miles away from his home and people, has enabled him to do dispassionately and without rancour.

There are two counts on which the author is exceptionally well qualified to give an account of the changing fortunes of his tribe during the 20th century: language and religion. The number of Lepchas who can

speak fluently in their mother tongue is continually decreasing as Nepali, the *lingua franca* of Sikkim and the Darjeeling District of West Bengal, continues to spread. Even smaller is the number of Lepchas who can read and write it in its own script; and they are largely confined to the older generation. The importance of the author's three chapters "Our Rong literature", "Characteristics of our mother-tongue, the Lepcha language", and "Lepcha Buddhist scriptures" is, accordingly, so much the greater.

The second of these chapters for the most part deals with stylistic features of the language, especially "'Tung-bor" or innuendo', the peculiarly Lepcha use of allegorical language; the first and the third deal with the earlier literature, Buddhist, and therefore translated from Tibetan, and the Christian literature that followed it, translations of parts of the Bible together with the Bible stories of Father Stolke, and grammars, dictionaries, and school primers (19).

The author discusses three theories that claim to account for the mysterious origin of the Lepcha script; but I find it difficult to resist the conclusion that it was devised to help in promoting the work of missionaries: Buddhist missionaries representing three different sub-sects of the Nying-ma sect entered Sikkim from Tibet in the middle of the 17th century, and made sure of political support by enthroning Phuntshok Namgyal, a fellow-Tibetan, as 'Chö-gyal (Skt. *Dharma-rajā*) or "religious king" (20); and his grandson Chador, one of the candidates for the honour of having devised the script, came under strong Buddhist influence during the years that he spent in Lhasa as a refugee from the Bhutanesse invasion and occupation of Sikkim (around 1700-1707) (21).

The first people to write the Lepcha script were Buddhists; but the first people to print it were Christians: the Baptist Mission Press, Calcutta, had cast Lepcha fount by 1849 (22). The Christian missionaries were especially attracted to the Lepchas by their docile demeanour; and, besides, their

animism, with a veneer of Buddhism, made them less resistant to conversion than Buddhist Tibetans and Hindu Nepalese. The Christian missionaries were also struck by what they took to be parallels with the Old Testament: "Many of their legends were markedly similar to the Old Testament; they had, for example, their Adam and Eve (Fudong Thing and Nazong Nyu); they too were banished from their mountain home; the Tower of Babel (Tallom Parton) and the Deluge (Tendong Chyu) were familiar to them" (23).

The author's account of these three myths is in his chapter "Lungten Sung". Wisely, in my opinion, he does not try to relate them to the narratives contained in *Genesis* chapters 1-4, 11, and 6-8; for the similarity of the Lepcha myths to the Judaeo-Christian turns out to be fairly superficial. Itbu-mu, in the Lepcha Creation myth, is female, the Great Mother Creator; and her male and female creations inhabited the country of the gods until they were relegated to the earth because they had taken to co-habiting, and were breeding demon offspring (24).

The separation of a single human language into a great diversity of languages that is essential to the *Genesis* legend ("7. Go to, let us go down, and there confound their language, that they may not understand one another's speech") has no place in the Lepcha myth: in their legend it is a particular, and foolish, tribe of Lepchas, the N-ongs, who attempt to build a tower, and hook it to the sky-ceiling, but fail because the instructions of those on the top were misheard by those far below, with the result, in this case, that the tower was brought crashing to the ground (25).

Similarly, Noah's ark is essential to the Biblical legend of the Flood, with the simultaneous preservation of specimens of the animal kingdom; "and every living substance was destroyed which was upon the face of the ground, both man, and cattle, and the creeping things, and the fowl of the heaven"; but there is no Noah's ark in

Foning's account of the flood suffered by the Lepchas. On the contrary, when the rivers Rong-it and Rong-nyu (Rungeet and Teesta) were blocked, giving rise to a great flood, it was a partridge that saved those Lepchas who had managed to take refuge on Mount Tendong, between those two rivers, by making an offering of brewed millet seeds (26).

In his chapter "Ancestors" the author gives an account of the major influence that Christianity has had not only on his family directly but also on his tribe, beginning with the arrival in Kalimpong, in his grandfather's time, of the Rev. Mr W. Macfarlane, in 1880. Macfarlane died there seven years later leaving the work of the Mission to the Rev. Mr Sutherland and the Rev. Mr (later Dr) Graham, who arrived in Kalimpong in 1880 and 1889 respectively (27). In those early days of the Church of Scotland in Kalimpong and Darjeeling the new religion had the effect of maintaining the tribal identity of the Lepchas; this was because there were few converts to Christianity other than Lepchas; so that it was possible to write: "... Graham rarely differentiated between Nepalese and Lepchas. Yet in his early days the word Christian was synonymous with the word Lepcha, and doing anything good for a Christian meant doing good for a Lepcha" (28). Some of the parts of the Bible that the Baptist Mission Press had printed in 1849, *St John* and *The Book of Genesis and part of Exodus in Lepshá*, were re-printed in 1872 and 1874; *The Gospel of Luke in Lepcha*, translated by the Rev. Mr Dyongshi Sada with the help of Graham himself and Mr David Macdonald, was printed in 1908; and a catechism was printed in 1903 (29).

Later, however, as more Nepalis and Tibetans became converts, Christianity had the reverse effect; for marriage partners were now chosen largely for their compatibility in religion; Christians tended to marry Christians regardless of difference in race. Even leaders of the Lepcha community like Anyu Babuni Sahiba (Mrs David Mohan), prominent in the author's list of acknowl-

edgements, and Mr J. Rongong married outside their tribe (30). It was seldom that the children of these mixed marriages learnt to speak Lepcha; and, apart from a re-print of *St Luke* in 1953, translations of the Bible ceased to be printed (31).

Though his upbringing was Christian, Mr Foning has retained his respect for the traditional priesthood of his tribe, *bongthing* and *mun*. He devotes a fairly lengthy chapter, "Keepers and custodians", to a sympathetic study of this characteristic aspect of Lepcha life, which had managed to co-exist with Buddhism. The chapter begins: "We know our gods, we revere and respect them; we also know and are afraid of the malignant spirits and devils that roam and pester our world; yet, being humans, we are unable to do anything to protect ourselves directly. This handicap we mind least, because we know, and are certain, that from the very first days of creation our Itbu Debu Rum, 'the Great Creator', has made necessary arrangements for us to face these difficulties and obstacles. The institution of the Muns and Bongthings is devised and directed to this end. They, as had been originally ordained, have the power to communicate with the gods, as well as with the Mungs or the devils and the demons. On our behalf, they intercede with the gods, and also exhort or appease the different mungs or devils; so that we humans may be left unharmed" (32).

It would appear, from this account of the functions of the *bongthing*, that the Lepchas whom Macfarlane, Sutherland, and Graham set out to convert to Christianity towards the end of the last century would have had little difficulty in accepting Jesus the miracle-worker into their existing scheme of religious concepts, as an exceptionally powerful *bongthing*.

It is not difficult to find parallels, even in the Mediterranean world of the Gospels, for the activities of demons and devils that harass and beset the Lepchas far away in the Himalayas: "When the even was come, they brought unto him many that were possessed with devils; and he cast out the spirits with

his words, and healed all that were sick" (*Matthew*, 8, 16). Foning has described one of the functions of the *bongthing* as being "to appease the different mungs or devils"; a remarkable example from the Gospels of negotiation with devils is that undertaken by Jesus on behalf of "two men possessed with devils, coming out of the tombs, exceeding fierce, so that no man might pass that way" (*Matthew*, 8, 28); the devils prevailed on Jesus to permit them to enter a herd of swine, whereupon the unfortunate creatures, unwilling participants in a miracle, rushed to their destruction in the sea (a congregation of Lepchas, a people remarkable for pig-breeding and pork-eating, would, I suspect, have been too distressed by the thought of so much good meat going to waste to appreciate the curing of the two lunatics).

The author recounts a successful feat of exorcism attributed to his grandmother; she got rid of a devil from an unapproachable cave in Parvong village, near Kalimpong, that was suspected of being responsible for a number of infant deaths. A huge boulder hurtling down the rock face was hailed as proof of his *mun* grandmother's success in exorcising the demon.

Similarities between faith-healing and exorcism in Christianity, on the one hand, and the ministrations of *bongthings* and *muns* in the religious life of the Lepchas, on the other, make it difficult for me to sympathize with the attitude of some Christian Lepchas towards the activities of tribal priests whom their ancestors in the recent past looked up to with respect and awe (33). Fortunately for those of his readers who are anxious to learn something of the formerly influential but now waning role of the tribal priest-hood the author is not one of these: he freely admits to having sought the services of *bongthings* and *muns*; he is aware of degrees of expertise among them in the fields of exorcism and prediction; but even the less effective among them he accepts as worthy of respect. In other words he finds it possible to be a Christian without sacrificing his cultural heritage as a Lepcha; similarly,



in earlier times, when Lepchas first encountered Tibetan Buddhist missionaries, many of them were able to accommodate their traditional religious attitudes and practices to the requirements of the new faith from the north and east.

Nineteenth-century Christian missionaries seem to have been less accommodating in their attitude towards Lepcha animism than their seventeenth-century Buddhist predecessors: "Another powerful obstacle to the missionary is the gross superstition of the heathen. As the preachers move about they find the entrance for the Gospel message hermetically sealed by many customs antagonistic to its spirit, and strong because hoary and respected from ancestral usage. Demonolatry prevails in these mountains among all the races, irrespective of the religious system with which they claim connection. To the aboriginal Lepcha, the rites of religion are chiefly valuable in averting the anger or malice of an evil spirit as shown in the illness of a dear one, and all sickness is caused by such possession" (34). Minto describes Graham's attitude in those days as: "To many he was like a crusading knight, fighting for 'the cause' against the forces of ignorance, evil, and superstition. It was a role that Graham liked and fostered by seeing that his supporters were well fed with statistics which at that time were the concrete signs of a missionary's successful impact on the enemy's ranks" (35).

It would be unfair to Graham to treat the above passage as typical: "Even in his early days of district work it appears that he did not convert by preaching a non-compromising faith, but rather tried to fit the Christian message subtly into the traditions and beliefs of the Lepchas in particular. In other words, on paper for the outside world he conformed to the pattern of the missionary of his day - the pattern expected by the Guild in Scotland - but in fact, perhaps even unknown to himself, there was a broadening of his views through his love of his fellow-men and his sympathy with their creeds regardless of their race" (36).

Possibly, even in their decline, the Lepchas' influence on Graham was as great as his influence on them, replacing certitude by humility.

#### Notes and References

- (1) Mainwaring, Col. G.B., 1876, *A Grammar of the Róng (Lepcha) Language* (Calcutta: Baptist Mission Press), especially pp. xii-xv.
- (2) *Darjeeling, Bengal District Gazetteers*, 1947, A.J. Dash (Ed.) (Alipore: Bengal Government Press), 49.
- (3) *Darjeeling*, 1949, 113, 49.
- (4) *Darjeeling*, 1947, 77, 49, 52.
- (5) *Sikkim, The Gazetteer of*, 1894 (Calcutta: The Bengal Government Secretariat, 259; cf. also Hamilton, F.B., 1819. *An Account of the Kingdom of Nepal* (reprinted New Delhi: Manjusri, 1971): "my informant thinks that of the whole population [of Sikkim] three-tenths were Bhotiyas, five-tenths Lepchas, and two-tenths Limbus" (118).
- (6) *Sikkim*, 1894, 18; cf. also Maharajah (Thutob Namgyal) and Maharani of Sikkim, 1908, *History of Sikkim* (typescript), 49.
- (7) Maharajah, 1908: "But now if the treaty is actually agreed to by your [East India Company] Government, I pray that the boundary between Sikkim and Gurkha territories be laid at Timar Choten if possible. Next best, the Arun river, and least of all Milighu, Dhankote [Dhankuta] as middle, Shangdi-jo[n]g, down to the Kanika [Kankai] Terai rivers" (p. 57); but "the Raja had to be content to see his western boundary thrown back from the Kankayi to the Phalut range and the Mechi river" (*Sikkim*, 1894, 19).
- (8) Hooker, Sir J.D., 1854/1905. *Himalayan Journals* (London: Ward, Lock, and Co.), 204.
- (9) (i) Lho (Tib. *lho*) 'south' distinguishes the Tibetans of Sikkim and Bhutan as southerners (*lho-pa*); (ii) Mon (Tib. *mon*), the general name given to the lower slopes of the

Himalaya, whence *mon-pa*, the Kiranti tribes of eastern Nepal, the Lepchas, and the non-Tibetan tribes of Bhutan, as inhabitants of *mon*; (iii) Tsong: members of the Limbu tribe, possibly from the Tibetan *gtsang*, 'Tsang', one of the central provinces of Tibet, on the supposition that it was from Tsang that the Limbus originated, or, more likely, from the Tibetan *tshong* 'trade', 'commerce', on account of their having been the main cattle merchants and butchers of Sikkim (*Sikkim*, 1894, 37); (iv) sum (Tib. *gsum*) 'three' (cf. Jäschke, H.A., 1881/1934. *A Tibetan-English Dictionary* (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner), 602, 420, 432, 589; cf. also Grünwedel, A., 1898. *A Dictionary of the Lepcha-language* compiled by the late General G.B. Mainwaring, revised and completed by Albert Grünwedel, Berlin (Berlin: Unger Brothers), 381, 312-3.

(10) Maharajah, 1908: "But in the year 1875 (Sing-phag, Wood-boar year) Cheebu Aden Lama acted in direct defiance of the above orders, by allowing Paharias (Gurkhas) to settle in the lands of Chakoong, Rishi, and Ramam rivers" (p. 74).

(11) Maharajah, 1908, 81-2; but *Sikkim*, 1894, gives the year as 1880 for "the disturbances and fight at Rhenock" (p. 25).

(12) White, J.C., 1909. *Sikkim and Bhutan* (London, [re-printed Delhi: Vivek Publishing House, 1971]), 27.

(13) *Sikkim*, 1894, 27.

(14) *Sikkim*, 1894, i-ii.

(15) Hooker, 1854/1905, 123.

(16) *Darjeeling*, 1947, 102.

(17) *Sikkim*, 1894, 4.

(18) *Sikkim*, 1894, 17-19.

(19) Stolke, Fr B., 1977. *sóng-gyó nám-thár sa sung* (*Old Testament Bible history*) (Kalmpong: Mani Printing Works); another contribution to literature on Lepcha by this remarkable German-Lepcha family is a manuscript Lepcha-English dictionary, undated, and possibly earlier than Grünwedel, 1898: School of Oriental and African Studies Library, ms. 173492, attributed to William Stölke (1849-c. 1910), son

of Lutz Stölke, a Moravian missionary, from Gläven, Brandenburg, Prussia, and one of the earliest settlers in Darjeeling (1841), who later planted out Steintal tea estate. (20) *Sikkim*, 1894, 249.

(21) Maharajah, 1908, 26-30. One of the most common, and possibly the oldest, of the Lepcha Buddhist texts, *ta-she sung*, legends of Padma Sambhava, has been published in part, in roman script, by A. Grünwedel: *Ein Kapitel des Ta-she-sung*, (Berlin 1896); "Drei Leptscha Texte, mit Auszügen aus dem Padma-than-yig und Glossar" [sic; *thang*], *Toung-pao*, 7, (1896), 526-61 (cf. R. Shafer, ed., 1957. *Bibliography of Sino-Tibetan languages* (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz), 152); and "Excurs: Das Suppāradschātaka in Padma-sambhava's Legendenbuch", *Veröffentlichungen aus dem Königlichen Museum für Völkerkunde*, 5 (1987), (Berlin: Geographische Verlagshandlung Dietrich Reimer (Ernst Vohsen), 105-26.

R. de Nebesky-Wojkowitz has listed 23 copies of the *ta-she sung* in his catalogue of the van Manen collection (cf. also Richardus, P., 1989. *The Dutch Orientalist Johan van Manen* (Leiden: Kern Institute), 34.

(22) The first work to be printed in the newly devised fount was the Gospel according to St Matthew (Bible Society Library, London, no. (6323) 1031, 1849); the translators, W. Start, formerly an Anglican clergyman, and Carl Gottlieb Niebel, a German Baptist, had earlier (1845) produced a lithographed version, at Takvar, near Darjeeling (Rennie, D.F., 1866. *Bhutan and the story of the Dooar War* (London: Murray [re-printed New Delhi: Bibliotheca Himalayica, 1970]), 367-9, 373-6.

(23) Minto, J.R., 1974. *Graham of Kalimpong* (Edinburgh: Blackwood), 29.

(24) Several rather different accounts are given in Siiger, H., 1967. *The Lepchas*, I (Copenhagen: The National Museum of Denmark), 112-14; cf. also Hermanns, M., 1954. *The Indo-Tibetans* (Bombay: K.L. Fernandes), 33-7.

- (25) Cf. also Mainwaring, 1876, xx, and Hermanns, 1954, 42-4.  
 (26) A version closer to the Bible narrative appears in Mainwaring, 1876, xx; four different versions appear in Hermanns, 1954, 42-4.  
 (27) Manuel, D.G., 1914. *A Gladdening River* (London: A. and C. Black; Edinburgh: R. and R. Clark), 16, 32.  
 (28) Minto, 1974, 29-30.  
 (29) *The Gospel according to Luke* (Calcutta: Calcutta Auxiliary Bible Society) (Lepcha text); *Lepcha catechism* (Calcutta: Church of Scotland Eastern Himalayan Mission) Lepcha text; cf. also Klafkowski, P., 1980. "Rong (Lepcha), the vanishing language and culture of eastern Himalaya", *Lingua Posnaniensis*, XXIII, 105-18, but especially 114-16.

- (30) Klafkowski, 1980, 106, 113-14.  
 (31) *The Gospel according to Luke*, 1953. (Bangalore: The Bible Society of India, Pakistan, and Ceylon) [Lepcha text]; another religious book, *Lepcha hymn book*, was printed in 1958 (Calcutta: E.H. Church Board of the Eastern Himalayan Church Council) [Lepcha text].  
 (32) cf. Siiger, 1967, I, 143-7.  
 (33) Darjeeling, 1947 gives the number of Christian Lepchas in Darjeeling District as 2,559, a proportion of 35% of a total of 7,269 (1941 census).  
 (34) Graham, Rev. J.A., 1897. *On the Threshold of Three Closed Lands* (Edinburgh: R. and R. Clark; London: A. and C. Black) 76.  
 (35) Minto, 1974, 27.  
 (36) Minto, 1974, 193-4.

## ARCHIVES

### Himalayan Archives in Paris

#### Part two

Lucette Boulnois

#### THE COLLECTIONS ON NEPAL IN BIBLIOTHEQUE NATIONALE

The Bibliothèque Nationale (National Library) in Paris, rightful heir to the Royal Library of French kings, has as its first duty to keep copies of anything published in France (the Dépôt Légal system, founded in XVIth century by the French king François Ier); consequently all French books and periodicals are automatically available there; it is also rich with manuscripts, from the Middle Ages to nowadays, French and foreign; but the Library may also be considered as a good international library, having bought the best foreign books, covering a vast range of topics in various languages. Among others: it has a

collection, not insignificant, on Nepal and a rich collection on Tibet.

The Bibliothèque Nationale is situated 58 rue de Richelieu in a historical building. Access is limited to people fulfilling certain conditions. No loans are allowed.

Collections on Nepal are found in two of its departments: the Département des Manuscrits Orientaux and the Département des Imprimés (Department of Oriental Manuscripts and Department of Printed Material). Readers should go to both. The Département des Manuscrits Orientaux holds oriental manuscripts and most of the printed production in vernacular languages. It also holds a part of the printed production in Western languages on Asian countries.

The Département des Imprimés, although essentially keeping publications in Western languages, also holds important oriental collections including works on Nepal and the Himalayan states.

The Département des Manuscrits Orientaux holds some marvellous manuscripts: one of them, a copy in Newari script, as old as 1743, the title of which is Pujavidhi. (See Catalogue sommaire des manuscrits indiens ... by A. Cabaton, Paris, 1912). It also holds 66 original prints stamped from engraved inscriptions, including the 21 inscriptions which have been published by Sylvain Lévi in *Le Népal*. (As the Bibliothèque Nationale is preparing a printed catalogue of its oriental manuscripts, we shall not say more about the Nepalese manuscripts and let our readers wait for the future aforesaid printed catalogue.)

Oriental collections go back to 18th century, a period when there existed a strong attraction to, and curiosity for, Asian civilisations and their fundamental values.

To meet scholars' growing interest in Asia, the Library started acquiring oriental works in the fields of religion, philosophy, history, classical texts and sciences; it systematically and extensively developed such a practice during 19th century, when oriental studies ("L'orientalisme") were in full blossom in France.

Following this tradition of oriental acquisitions, the Library has continued adding new titles to its permanently growing collection; without losing sight at the necessity both to preserve its heritage and to make it available to readers in the most proper conditions.

The Dépôt Légal system is responsible for the availability of all French works, as aforesaid; so Sylvain Lévi's *Le Népal* is there, and all his other works - Sylvain Lévi (1863-1935) was the first French Indologist to go to Nepal, as early as 1898, to collect material on the spot, and his work,

of great scientific significance, is at the root of French research on Nepal.

Foreign publications on Nepal are bought from Great Britain, USA, Germany, India; they deal with history, ancient and modern, social anthropology, linguistics; sacred and profane literature, philosophy and religions, covering an extensive range of knowledge in diverse fields.

The first available works on Nepal have been kept in the Department of Printed Material, according to a subject classification traditionally labelled by "letters", which follows an encyclopaedic systematic classification. Thus under the letter "X", "linguistics and rhetoric", which includes grammar books, vocabularies and dictionaries in the various languages written all over the world, will be found A.D. Molony's "Gurkha Beginner" (1923) along with E. Chazot's and Soma Pant's "Dictionnaire français-népal" published in 1984.

In the field of Nepali literature will be found M.-C. Cabaud's "Le rossignol en cage", 1983, a collection of folk tales and fables which she translated from Nepali into French. In the field of economy, many titles also are to be found on development, agriculture planning and land tenure systems. In social anthropology, one of the most favoured fields of research in Nepal, one will find well-known monographs on the Nepalese people, such as Dor Bahadur Bista's and Marc Gaborieau's works, and monographs on Nepalese castes, tribes, or localities: Limbu, Gurung, Tamang, Sherpa, Panauti, etc.

While it has been a long-established tradition to buy books on Himalayan arts, it is only recently that works on ecology, fauna and flora, geology and alpinism have been bought (more recent of all: alpinism).

As to books on history and geography, they make the bulk of the collection. This section includes historical works, chronologies, travel reports (often old



ones); tourism guides, often reprinted. They are kept under the letter "02" which stands for "History of Asia" and its geographical subdivisions, one of which is "02 K", for India, established in the 19th century. This section of the printed material Collection has been recorded very early in

a Catalogue, handwritten, completed in Paris in 1842: "Histoire de l'Asie", 647 p. in quarto, available at the Département des Manuscrits Orientaux.

It was followed by the traditional cards system.

Under letter "02 K" are to be found books by Hamilton, Hodgson, Kirkpatrick, Landon, Oldfield, Wright, L. Dubeux, L. Feer, G. Le Bon, S. Lévi, M. C. Regmi, D. R. Uprety and many others. The whole collection on Nepal, French and foreign titles, includes about 1,000 titles, less than a score of them being books in Nepali or any other Nepalese language.

The cataloguing of French and foreign books on Nepal is now done electronically, using BN-OPALE which stores all bibliographical data of printed material since 1970. The author's name entry follows a name authority file in which authors' names - Nepalese names for instance - appear under the adopted form, transliterated and transcribed according to the Washington Library of Congress system, other forms of the same name, and bio-graphical data helping to identify the concerned author. This authority file has been issued in microcard form in 1991.

As to subject classification, it has been produced on cards from 1882 to circa 1984. It is now produced on-line on BN-OPALE, according to an encyclopaedic subject authority file.

This short paper will give, it is hoped, a first evaluation of the printed collection on Nepal in the Bibliothèque Nationale, a collection to which are regularly added new titles.

Inquiry: *Elizabeth Vernier, Librarian.*

## BIBLIOTHEQUE NATIONALE

### Resources on Tibet

Resources on Tibet may be found in the General Collections (Département des Imprimés, main reading room), in the Division Orientale du Département des Manuscrits, in the Département des Cartes et Plans (Map Department) for old and modern maps, and in the Cabinet des Médailles (Medals and Coins Department) for Tibetan coins (of which some are kept there, several brought by Père Huc about 1848).

### Division Orientale du Département des Manuscrits

This inquiry was completed by Mme Berthier, now in office, and was largely based on the notes and professional heritage left by A. Silburn. Miss Silburn was in charge of the Tibetan section for many years before retiring in 1988. Mme Cohen, Conservateur, is Chief Librarian of the Oriental Division. The material on books printed in Western languages was compiled by L. Boulnois.

### The Tibetan collections

The Department holds two collections of Tibetan books: the *Fonds Tibétain* and the *Fonds Pelliot-Tibétain*.

The following data on these collections are extracted from a manuscript by Mme Berthier, which is to be published in the near future in: *Le Guide du Lecteur* (The Reader's Guide) by Division Orientale du Département des Manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Nationale.

### The Fonds Tibétain

Holds 1506 xylograph volumes and 333 Manuscripts (note that one volume may include several texts).

The first volume in Tibétain which ever entered the Bibliothèque du Roi (now Bibliothèque Nationale) was offered to it by Clère, a physician who had served in the Russian army: this happened in 1777; it was

an isolated arrival; it is during 19th century that a collection of xylographs and manuscripts in the Tibetan language was actually started in the Bibliothèque Nationale, through gifts or purchases from Orientalists, bookshops, from the Desgodins mission in Tibet and other travellers. In 1835 the Royal Asiatic Society of Bengal presented the Paris new-born Société Asiatique with a complete set of the Narthang Kanjur, which in 1840 entered the Bibliothèque Nationale. A letter by B.H. Hodgson, then in Kathmandu, dated 1833, deals with this gift. The Société Asiatique in Paris had no room for such a collection and had to transfer it to the B.N., where it has remained since.

First Mongol and Tibetan works were kept together in a *Fonds Tibéto-Mongol*; in 1914 the Tibetan works were separated in a *Fonds Tibétain* as it is presently. Then it included 520 works; later on, in 1932, the Tibetan books belonging to Palmyr Cordier (a French military surgeon who collected between 1898 and 1902) were included in the *Fonds Tibétain*, and later on it received a collection from Musée Guimet.

The Tibetan works are of two kinds: religious and secular. Among the religious works are the 100 and more volumes of the Kanjur (the Library holds two sets: a "red" one from Peking and a "black" Narthang set), the 223 volumes of the Tanjur; the Rinchen gter mjad, the Mdo-man treatises, Bonpo texts, the Tibetan Tripitaka, Prajñāpāramitā, propitiation rituals, and also Tibetan translations from the Christian Gospels by St Matthews and St Luke.

Among the secular works will be found the Gesar saga, geography books and pilgrimage guides, music and poetry works, royal genealogies, historical annals and chronicles, administrative correspondence, practical manuals on agriculture, statue casting, chinaware, tea; commercial, accountancy, legal writings; customary law papers; and many books of lexicography, vocabulary, and dictionaries.

The "fonds tibétain" includes books in

different Tibetan scripts and also some books in languages other than Tibetan: Chinese, Turkish, Mongol, Sanskrit, Zan Zan, Manchu, Tanguit, as well as Latin, Italian, English.

There is no catalogue on cards of the Tibetan collection; it has been described in hand-written registers or printed books or articles, some as early as 1909: see by Palmyr Cordier, *Catalogue du Fonds Tibétain de la Bibliothèque Nationale, Deuxième Partie*, 1909, et *Troisième Partie*, 1915 (which are descriptions of the 223 tomes of the Tanjur, based on the Peking, "red" set); it deals with items "Tibétain No 108" to "332". The author explains that the "Part I", describing the Kanjur set, Items 1 to 108, will be published later on.

Cordier's catalogue was published; so were the following volumes by Marcelle Lalou: *Catalogue du Fonds Tibétain de la Bibliothèque Nationale, Quatrième Partie, I, Les Mdo-man*, Paris, 1931 and *Répertoire du Tanjur d'après le Catalogue de P. Cordier* published in 1933, which is an index of Cordier's work.

After its arrival in the B.N. Cordier's own collection was catalogued by Jean Filliozat in *Etat des manuscrits sanscrits, bengalis et tibétains de la collection Palmyr Cordier*, in *Journal Asiatique*, 1934, January-March issue.

The Division keeps an old manuscript catalogue, possibly handwritten by P.E. Foucaux, corresponding to the Narthang "black" Tanjur kept in B.N.: *Index du Gangdjour imprimé dans le couvent de Goumboum dans le Tibet, composé par le Baron Schilling de Canstadt*, without date.

The complete "brief" catalogue of the Tibetan collection was started in 1936 by Jean Filliozat and was continued by Mme Guignard and then Miss A. Silburn; it is composed of several bound registers, hand-written, kept in the reading-room of Division orientale; the first register (items 1 to 780) is by J. Filliozat; the second, started in 1941 by the same, was continued in Mme

Guignard's handwriting (items 821 to 875) and then Miss Silburn's handwriting (876 to 1136). Later on it was Miss Silburn only who was in charge of the cataloguing. The continuation of the register, a Kanjur reprint (a Delhi edition of the manuscript from Tog Palace; item 1137, 109 volumes); items 1138 to 1165 list mostly editions or reprints issued between 1960 and 1981. The 1970ies were years of a new start for Tibetan acquisitions, now in modern forms; and the next and last register, from item 1166 to item 1262, stopped at the time of Miss Silburn's retirement and lists publications issued between 1980 and 1988. In these two last registers are listed reprints of works on history, royal genealogies, history of Buddhism, archives, religious works, philosophy, divination, alchemy, rituals, grammars, lamas' biographies, etc. One item may include a great number of volumes, as for the Kanjur for instance. The modern editions come from Delhi, from Peking, from Dharmasala, and elsewhere. Specially worthy of notice is the important amount of works on Bon-po religion: religious and canonical texts, rituals, reproductions from manuscripts coming from Nepal, historical texts; many of them issued by the Tibetan Bon-po Monastic Centre in Ochghat, Solan district, Himachal Pradesh; Item 1175 describes a Bon-po treatise in Žaň-žun language.

The last register includes another Kanjur (reproduction from a Lhasa edition xylograph kept in Dharmasala), and also works issued in Bhutan.

A. Silburn has also compiled an unpublished *Tib. 886 (1-63)*. *Rin Chen gter mjad* (Collection de textes tibétains concernant le lamaïsme de la secte non réformée), Paris, without date, in 198 sheets, describing the 63 volumes of this text.

#### The Fonds Pelliot-Tibétain

This comprises 4450 manuscripts (no xylographs), written before the 11th century A.D., brought back by Paul Pelliot (along with Chinese and other manuscripts) from

the Dunhuang grottoes in Gansu, between 1908 and 1910. Among them are some of the oldest written works in Tibetan, extremely interesting for the study of ancient Tibetan civilization, and for comparison with Chinese sources.

These manuscripts are almost all written on paper (often hemp cloth paper) with a wooden pen; they are either religious Buddhist texts or secular texts of interest for the study of life in Tibetan society during 9-10th centuries, especially life in monasteries; or chronicles, annals, administrative treatises, law and economy papers, accountancy, letters, reports, deeds; they include books on hippiatry and hunting, drawings and paintings, mandalas, invocations, astrology, calendars, divination, demonology works; and also grammars and library catalogues. The origin of these manuscripts, the famous cave where they were hidden, the history of their arrival in France, are well known. A preliminary sorting out was interrupted by war; the collection was stored in B.N. with a handwritten list by J. Bacot. Evacuated far from Paris at the beginning of World War II, it was re-installed in the precincts of the B.N. in 1946.

The cataloguing was completed in 1939: here we find again the name of Marcelle Lalou and her more than twenty years *Inventaire* work: the volumes I to III of her *Inventaire des manuscrits tibétains de Touen-Houang conservés à la Bibliothèque Nationale, Fonds Pelliot-tibétain*, were published between 1939 and 1961. She has also written articles on this collection. Later on, Ariane Macdonald and Yoshiro Imaeda edited, in 1978, *Choix de documents tibétains conservés à la Bibliothèque Nationale, complété par quelques manuscrits de l'India Office et du British Museum (réunis par la mission Paul Pelliot)*.

It should be added that in addition to the manuscripts in Tibetan, the Pelliot-tibétain collection includes 245 bilingual or trilingual manuscripts (Chinese, Uigur, Runic

turkish, Khotanese, Sanskrit).

#### Books in Chinese on Tibet

The Division Orientale holds an important and old collection of works in Chinese that has to do with geography and history of Tibet, its social life, religion, natural history etc. The catalogue (on cards) is by author and title. There is no subject classification.

#### Printed Material in Western Languages

Readers should go to two different places: the main reading room where the general collection of printed works is available, and the Division Orientale du Département des Manuscrits, where are kept not only manuscripts but also many printed books and periodicals on Asian subjects. Let us begin by this one.

The oldest catalogue to look for is *Histoire de l'Asie*, a hand-written register-catalogue including the oldest printed material; it was compiled about 1900; Tibet is on pp. 485-497; the oldest title is *Relation de la nouvelle découverte du grand Catay ou bien du royaume de Tibet* by Father Andrada, 1627 (with Italian and Spanish editions of the same); and the Parraud et Billecoq edition of An IV (1796) with extracts from Andrada; Samuel Turner in French and in German; Reuilly's *Description du Tibet ...*, Paris, Bossange, Masson et Besson, 1808, which is actually a translation from P.S. Pallas; and an *Opisanie Tibeta*, translated from Chinese into Russian, published in St Petersburg in 1828. It is obvious that in all fields the Bibliothèque Nationale not only holds everything published in France (as has been explained in the chapter "Resources on Nepal" in the Bulletin No. 3) but managed to require important works from major countries in Orientalist fields. Particularly worthy of note is the fact that Russian works, as well as English and German works, are available for this period; even English and German editions that already existed when this old Catalogue was written, Klaproth, Foucaux,

J.J. Schmidt, Schilling von Canstadt had already written most of their work; J.J. Schmidt had already compiled *Der Index des Kanjur*, published in 1845 in St Petersburg. All are kept in B.N.

Next to the old *Histoire de l'Asie* come five full drawers of cards, mostly books, including also some important articles. It makes between 4000 and 5000 different titles, up to 1985. From 1985 on, the catalogue is computerized (on line) and cards are no longer used.

It is impossible to give the names of all authors. Of course, all important works, all important authors are to be found there, French, English, German, Italian, Russian and others; also the visiting scholar will find all the printed catalogues of important collections on Tibet kept in the most important libraries in the world, including what has been published in the French library catalogues themselves. Innumerable are the titles about Kanjur; dictionaries and grammars go by dozens. Starting from the time when Latin was used throughout Europe, we find the *Alphabetum Tangutanum sive Tibetanum* of 1773 (the *Alphabetum Tibetanum* by Giorgii or Georgi, 1762, is catalogued in the main reading room); and the *Bharatae responsa tibetice cum versione latina ab Antonio Schiefner edita*, Petropoli (St Petersburg), 1875 and other works by A. Schiefner ... to the latest contemporary works by living authors from A.-M. Blondeau to H.E. Richardson and R. Stein, with Samten Karmay, P. Kvaerne, B. Le Calloch, A. Macdonald and L. Petech. Many titles go under the names of David-Néel, Bacot, Körösi Csoma (Csoma de Körös), L. Feer, A.H. Francke, A. Grünwedel, S. Hedin, M. Hermanns, S. Hummel, Desgodins, H. Eimer, Jäschke, De Jong, M. Lalou, D.I. Lauf, B. Laufer, La Vallée Poussin, R.O. Meisezahl, A. Róna-Tas, Nebesky-Wojkowitz, G. Tucci, Géza Uray. We have to stop listing names, there are too many of them. Let us add only that the Russian literature is represented by I. Bičurin, N.D. Boļšoeva,



Bogoslovskij, Cybikov, Dandaron, A.I. Ivanov, A.O. Ivanovskij, V.I. Kozlov, N.V. Kjuner, E.I. Kyčanov, N.A. Nevskij, S.F. Oldenburg, M.V. Pevcov, G.N. Potanin, A.M. Pozdnev, G. and N. Roerich, B.V. Semičov. Of course, the Satapitaka series, edited by Lokesh Chandra in Delhi, are to be added. Of old and new books, one may consider that anything important has a chance to be found in Bibliothèque Nationale; whatever you are looking for, do try it.

A part of the titles listed in Division Orientale may also be obtained through the main reading room; both are accessible only on certain conditions; but it must be noted that the reader will wait a considerably longer time for his book in the main reading room (at least one hour) while the Division Orientale reading room, less crowded, offers better facilities.

The subject classification catalogues in the Département des Imprimés, main reading room, offer a smaller number of books than the Division Orientale on Tibet: maybe 400 titles in Western languages, including travel reports, general descriptions and, generally speaking, books somewhat less academic than in Département des Manuscrits. But not only, as Bacot, Petech, Tucci, Hedin etc. are also listed there.

In the main reading room in the underground hall "Salle des Catalogues" stands the impressive complex of card-indexes and printed catalogues and hand-written registers covering the walls or standing in long lines in the middle. The reader will either use the author catalogue (divided in several chronological sections) or the subject classification catalogue, also divided in sections according to the time of arrival of the book in the library.

The 1894-1925 section offers Bacot, Legendre, Grenard, Hedin, French missionaries; the 1925-1935 section, Bell, David-Néel, Teichmann, Segalen, N. Roerich, Hackin, Dawasamdud Kazi; the 1936-59 section, about 100 titles with many travel

relations and political studies; the section 1960-1979, about 100 titles on the political situation, memoirs, essays, religion, books by Tibetans in exile, reprints of David-Néel; more recently religion, language manuals and the political situation are the chief subjects.

Needless to say, many important periodicals in Asian fields are also available in B.N., either in the main reading room or in Département des Périodiques, depending on the dates of publication. A part of the periodicals collection is now kept in Versailles in the Annex of Bibliothèque Nationale.

#### Maps of Tibet in Département des Cartes et Plans

Situated in the same building, the Département des Cartes et Plans (Map Department) holds a very considerable collection of maps. Tibet, of course, is not a major subject there, but it holds current maps found in all important universal map libraries. What is especially interesting is that the Bibliothèque Nationale is rich in old European maps of Asia and holds the *Collection d'Anville*: maps belonging to or compiled by Jean Baptiste Bourguignon d'Anville, "Géographe ordinaire du Roi". D'Anville is famous among Tibetologists for his *Carte générale du Tibet ou Bou-tan* of 1733; in his collection will be found also many manuscript maps and drafts which were used for his own maps. Maps by Guillaume de l'Isle, also Géographe du Roi, and generally speaking maps of 18th century, when our knowledge of Tibetan geography started developing, are also very interesting.

#### THE LIBRARY OF THE CENTRE D'ETUDES DE L'INDE ET DE L'ASIE DU SUD

Founded in 1955 as Centre d'Etudes Indiennes as a part of the Chaire de Sociologie de l'Inde, Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes (VIe section), this Centre d'Etudes de l'Inde et de l'Asie du Sud is since 1968 associated ("Laboratoire associé") to Centre

National de la Recherche Scientifique. It stands in the building of Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, 54 boulevard Raspail, Paris 75006, same building as Centre de Documentation sur la Chine Contemporaine.

It is a research centre including a library.

#### The Library

The Librarian in charge, Mme B. Pelissier, who also compiled this information, will be in charge until the end of 1992; then Mme Arnaud will take over.

On the Library and on other libraries and generally South Asian studies and library resources in France see: *South Asian Studies and South Asian Library Resources in France*, by Beatrice Pelissier, in: *South Asian Studies*, edited by Albertine Gaur, the British Library, 1986 (British Library Occasional Papers 7).

#### The Collections

The Library presently holds about 22,000 books, 3,000 offprints, 300 maps, and receives currently 120 periodicals. Coverage: the whole of South Asia: India, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Nepal.

As to Nepal, the collection is limited as it had been settled between different librarians in Paris that it was rather left to the Centre d'Etudes Himalayennes to buy materials in the Nepalese field. But for the other part of the Subcontinent, and consequently for the Himalayan districts of India and Pakistan, the Centre d'Etudes de l'Inde is one of the best places in Paris for the modern period, and also the British Raj period. Mostly it is post-1960 materials, this including of course the numerous reprints of old books which have been published these last 40 years. Old books, such as a copy of Volume V of La Harpe's *Histoire des Voyages*, are the exception.

All fields of social sciences are covered; natural history is present in a limited scale, especially Botany and Medi-

cine. The collection is especially rich in the fields of history (all periods), social anthropology, religions; ecology is a developing sector. Books are chiefly in the English language, then in French and German; very few publications in Indian languages are available (they are chiefly classical texts in Sanskrit); but dictionaries, grammars, manuals for all languages of India and other parts of the Subcontinent area, are available. The reader will easily find out, through a good geographical classification by regions, what deals with the Himalayan districts; and also what he needs about the selected area, in general statistical books, general atlases, reference books etc.

It is one of the few places in Paris where the Population Census series may be found: the Census of India for 1961 (chiefly for monographs); some issues of the 1971 and 1981 Indian censuses; the complete, or almost complete, 1971 and 1981 Censuses of Pakistan and of Bangladesh, are kept there. Statistical abstracts, statistical periodicals for the whole of India are available.

It is impossible to sort out altogether how many books deal with Himalayan areas: it could only be done for the last four years, 1988-92, by computersearch: during that period something between 180 and 220 different titles, dealing with the Himalayan region, were added to the collections, only for India proper.

The Library has a good collection of modern periodicals on Indian studies, mostly in English: *Bengal Past and Present*, *Indian Historical and Social History Review*, or *Man in India*, where very often articles on Himalayan regions appear.

The catalogue is on card-files up to 1988; in addition to the author and title classification, it has a detailed subject index. The cards also include a Paris union catalogue, a listing of books kept in other libraries in Paris. This union catalogue was continued until computerization took place. The computerized data bank started in 1988

with a Portable Computer Olivetti with software Texto. In 1988 the union catalogue was stopped as were the subject classification card files.

#### THE CENTRE DE DOCUMENTATION SUR LA CHINE CONTEMPORAINE

The Documentation Centre on Modern China is situated in the building of Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, 54 Boulevard Raspail, 75006 Paris. Founded in 1958 as a department of Ecole Pratique des Hautes études, VI<sup>e</sup> section it is now Laboratoire associé URA 1018 (associated laboratory) to Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique.

#### The Library

*Inquiry: Librarians: Mme Monique Abud; Mme Aubert (books in Chinese); Mme Peh.*

This Library is one of the best places in France to study the political and economic history of modern China, with a very good collection of books, periodicals and newspapers in Chinese.

It holds about 30,000 books and 1600 titles of periodicals, in Chinese and Western languages. The Library is open to research workers, students and people with a serious motivation. No loan is allowed.

Period covered: modern China from the second half of Ch'ing dynasty period. Although Tibet is not in itself a very important item in the bulk of the collection, this Library is very important for Himalayan studies in three ways: first, the foreign relations of China with Himalayan countries, including Nepal, Pakistan, Bhutan, India etc.; second, the history of Sino-Tibetan relations; and third, contemporary Tibet as politically a part of China.

Although most of the collection deals with the post-1950 period, some old rare books are available in the Tibetan field: classical books by Bonvalot, Legendre, Grenard, S. Turner and the collection of the

*Eastern miscellany* (in Chinese) from 1905 to 1973. But what is especially valuable is the possibility to follow day to day political and economic history of all parts of China through current newspapers and news agency reports and a lot of periodicals, through which much information on Tibet and on Chinese foreign relations may be picked out.

On paper or on microfilm, the Centre holds the *Survey of China Mainland Press* and *Survey of China Mainland Magazines*, issued for more than 25 years after the communist take over, by the American Consulate in Hong Kong: these series are translations into English of important news from continental Chinese newspapers, periodicals, New China News Agency bulletins etc; when this collection stopped, the Centre started buying the *BBC Summary of World Reports* (daily, and economic weekly, reports) for Far East - a capital source of information which may be used by people not reading Chinese.

Some current periodicals specifically on Tibet are received: *Xizang Yanjiu*, *Tibetan Review*, *Tibet Studies* (from Lhasa); often articles on Tibet also appear in *Minzu yanjiu*, a well-known periodical on Chinese national minorities.

Very useful for following current events are the Chinese daily newspapers (like *Renmin Ribao*) and important periodicals, in Chinese and Western languages, in the fields of political and economic affairs of the Far East.

As to books specifically on Tibet since 1950, their number is limited (two or three scores in Western languages and ten or fifteen volumes in Chinese). The collection will be more useful in the field of Sino-Tibetan relations, or for a chapter on Tibet in books on China in general the data on Tibet in yearbooks, statistical publications etc. Maps and atlases (many in Chinese) of China in general, are available, but not specifically maps of Tibet.

#### THE SOCIÉTÉ ASIATIQUE LIBRARY

*Inquiry: Mme Allier; Mme Karunatileke*

The *Société Asiatique*, a private institution, was founded in 1822; it has moved several times to different places in Paris. The Library is presently in the precincts of Collège de France, 52 rue du Cardinal Lemoine, 75005 Paris.

The Library never had any budget to buy books; the collections consist exclusively of gifts and legacies. As it is very old, it holds publications practically from the middle of the 19th century, but somewhat at random. It has however a complete collection of the *Journal Asiatique*, the journal of the *Société*.

Members of the *Société* are allowed to borrow books.

As the buildings of 22 avenue du Président Wilson, where the Centre d'Etudes sur les Religions Tibétaines and the Ecole Française d'Extrême Orient (EFEO) Library have been until now are being renovated for the next two years, the collections there have to be packed and will not be available for a time. The *Bacot Collection*, which belongs to *Société Asiatique* but was kept - as was

written in Bulletin No.3 - in Centre d'Etudes sur les Religions Tibétaines, is to be returned to the *Société Asiatique* library at the end of this summer.

#### Additions and Corrections:

1. The EFEO library and Centre d'Etudes sur les religions tibétaines, have been removed from the avenue du Président Wilson for about two years because of restauration work. With the exception of the Fonds Bacot (see *Société Asiatique* library) and the index files of the photographic collection these collections are not available. The temporary office for both institutions is: 29 rue Daviel, 75013 Paris.

2. the Bacot collection, which was previously kept in Centre d'Etudes sur les religions tibétaines, but actually belongs to the *Société Asiatique*, has now been returned to the *Société Asiatique*.

3. In Part I, p. 29, right hand column, after line 7, should read: "...and about 40 dictionaries, grammars and essays on the language; religion comes next, with 30 titles published between 1940 and 1960 and about 10 since 1960; then next in importance comes history with 20 titles; in other fields..."



## Early Christian missions in the Himalayas: including a note on the location of missionary archives in Italy

Dipak Raj Pant

Christian missionaries were one of the most important channels through which the European world received historical and ethnographic information about the Orient. The exactitude, impartiality and truthfulness of their observations -- and indeed their missionary aim itself -- may be questionable for many today, but no one can deny that ethnologists and historians today owe much to the works of the early Christian missionaries.

The Himalayas, one of the regions of the world most difficult of access, was first approached by missionaries in the early 17th century. Over the next two hundred years many missionaries visited the region, some of whom remained for a considerable period of time, studying the local languages and cultures. The documents relating to their activities (circulars, decrees, letters, memoirs, etc.) form a huge corpus of literature scattered in various ecclesiastical and civil archives in Italy. Parts of that literature have been edited by scholars, the most important of which for the missionary activities in Nepal and Tibet being Prof. Luciano Petech's massive *I missionari italiani nel Tibet e nel Nepal*. The more modest aim of the present report is to summarize these missionary activities and to bring to the attention of scholars, both from Europe and the Himalayan region itself, the extent and location of the missionary archives in Italy.

### Early Expeditions to the Himalayas

Muslim traders were already active and geographically mobile in western and central Asia during the centuries preceding the European Renaissance. Their role in bridging the gap between East and West and

in stimulating the Renaissance is well-known. Petech (1952-56: 1, 18) stresses how the story attributed to Muslim traders of "...remote, forgotten and degenerated Messiah-following communities" somewhere inside the highlands and valleys of the Asia Interior fuelled European curiosity and later stimulated missionary expeditions to the region. Most probably the Muslim traders confused the Buddha-image with that of the Messiah. The Persian term for idolatry *bût-parastî* (bût = statue, idol) might be related to the term Buddha (*Buddha* > *Budd* > *Bût*) whose images and statues were abundantly found in Central Asia when Muslims began to convert local peoples.

Christian missionaries were already in the process of consolidating their bases in China and India by the beginning of the 17th century. Goa, Macao and other Portuguese colonies served as base-camps for explorative ventures. The sea-way between China and India became increasingly dangerous due to the attacks of local pirates and Dutch corsairs around Macao, the south Chinese waters and Indochinese coasts. The need for a new route between the Chinese mainland and the Indian subcontinent, *via terra*, was felt as an utmost priority by missionary authorities. The missionaries were not always escorted or assisted by the European powers so they sought to establish their own routes and support centres. Many of the early travellers, and especially the Jesuits, used to operate autonomously, but they did not hesitate to take full advantage of the facilities intentionally or unintentionally provided by the European powers.

The earliest missionary explorations of the Himalayan region were undertaken with

the aim of opening new channels of communication between China-based and India-based missionaries. The first western missionary to cross the Himalayan passes and visit the Tibetan plateau was a Portuguese Jesuit, Father Antonio de Andrade (1580-1634). In 1624 he reached Tibet from India, via Garhwal, and one year later established a residence and chapel at Tsaparang (or Tsabrañ) in south-western Tibet. A further visit to India enabled him to return to Tsaparang with additional resources and manpower. Father Antonio de Andrade wrote two reports on his travels and missionary operations, which were published under the title *Novo descobrimento do Gram Cathayo ou reinon de Thibet, pello padre Antonio de Andrade de Companhia de Jesu, Portuguez, anno de 1626* (see Peireiro, 1921). His reports aroused much curiosity and were soon translated into Spanish, French, Italian and Polish. Called back to India by his superiors in Goa, Fr. de Andrade left the Tsaparang mission to his assistants. About a decade later the centre was closed due to political upheavals and the subsequent Ladakhi forces, who did not view the presence of Christian missionaries as a positive influence in the region.

During the same period two other Portuguese Jesuits, Fathers Estevão Cacella (1585-1630) and João Cabral (1599-1669), arrived in the region. Fr. Estevão Cacella went to Goa as a Jesuit missionary around 1614, and worked for some time on the Malabar coast in southwestern India. In 1626 he and Fr. João Cabral went to explore Tibet via Bengal and Bhutan, but they did not remain there for long. Fr. Cabral is said to have returned to India passing through Nepal in the year 1628 (B.C. Sharma 1975: 195).

In 1629 Fr. Cacella received a mandate to open a permanent missionary centre in the area previously visited by him and Fr. Cabral. He left for Shigatse (south-eastern Tibet) with a clear mandate and a long-term project. Soon after his arrival in Shigatse he fell sick and died there in 1630. After his death the Shigatse mission was abandoned,

and the Jesuits remained inactive in the region for almost three decades. Fr. Cacella's memoirs contain interesting historical and ethnographic accounts of the area around Shigatse (cf. C. Wessels 1924: 120-63).

At this time another Portuguese Jesuit, Fr. Manoel Dias, was sent to the eastern Himalayas by the Jesuit authorities at Cochin. Very little is known about his travels. Fr. Dias is supposed to have died in the Morang (Terai) of Nepal on his way to Tibet.

Two Jesuit fathers, Johann Grueber and Albert d'Orville, are said to have reached Lhasa in 1661, thereby becoming the first westerners to reach the political and cultural centre of Tibet. Fr. Johann Grueber (1623-1680), an Austrian Jesuit, travelled as a missionary to Macao in 1658 and then went on to Peking, where he remained for a couple of years. He was entrusted to explore the land-route from China to India. In 1661 he passed through Tibet and Nepal in the company of the Belgian Jesuit, Fr. Albert d'Orville. In the winter of 1661-62 the two Jesuits halted at Kathmandu for a month or so, where they were received by the then King, Pratap Malla. The fathers presented the Malla ruler with a telescope. The king was an author of verses in Sanskrit and a great admirer of learned persons; so he was pleased to meet the two erudite and experienced Jesuit travellers. In one of the inscriptions found inside Hanuman-Dhoka words in Roman letters have been found; the inscriptions belonged to Pratap Malla. It is supposed that the King learned Roman letters from these Jesuits. The king was fond of learning many languages and he used to invite many scholars from different parts of the Indian subcontinent (B.C. Sharma: 168).

Fr. d'Orville died after reaching Agra, and Fr. Grueber went back to Europe via Persia and Turkey. Many of the letters, reports and memoirs of Fr. Grueber are still unedited. Wessels (1924) and Petech (1952-56) note that some were published by A. Kircher in Amsterdam (1667) and M. Thévenot in Paris (1672).

In 1679, another Jesuit, Fr. Marcanonio Santucci, is said to have visited the Nepal valley. Fr. Santucci was an Italian missionary resident at the Patna quarters of the Jesuits. Neither Grueber and d'Orville nor Santucci tried to use their foot-hold in the Nepal valley for the evangelization, but they did collect accurate information and building good rapport with the local authorities.

#### Missions to Nepal

After the explorative phase of the Jesuits, Europeans with a more zealous temperament and a clear religious goal started to appear on the Himalayan scene. In 1707, a group of Capuchin fathers ventured to Nepal and Tibet. The Capuchin fathers halted in the Nepal Valley for a couple of months without revealing their true identities and goals, presenting themselves instead as medical practitioners. In those two months they did nothing to consolidate their base: Petech notes that they left no significant report or memoir behind, except for some personal letters containing superficial observations and remarks regarding the life in the Valley.

In 1715, again on its way to Tibet, the Capuchin expedition passed through Nepal. Unlike the previous expedition, some of the Capuchin fathers remained and sought to establish links with local society with a view to evangelization. The Head of the Capuchin expedition was Fr. Francesco Orazio da Pennabilli (1680-1745). He was perhaps the brightest of all the Capuchins. His *Breve raguaglio dell' operato da Cappuccini nella missione del Thibet*, Rome, 1738 (cf. *Analecta Ordinis Min. Cappuccinorum* - 37, 1921) and *Relazione sul principio e stato presente della missione del Gran Thibet*, Rome, 1722 (cf. *Analecta Ord. Min. Cap.* - 4, 1888) are accounts of the difficulties and problems related to the "evangelization" of the Nepalese and Tibetan peoples. It also contains many other details of the missionary expeditions and operations and

some valuable information about local conditions. Fr. da Pennabilli was the first to translate Christian writings in Tibetan and to prepare Italian-Tibetan vocabulary (cf. F. d'Anvers 1934; also Petech op. cit.).

Unlike the Jesuits, the Capuchin fathers were less interested in learning about local society through a study of local language and culture. Instead, they were mainly interested in evangelization, the task for which they had dedicated their lives. The Capuchin mission had a mandate from the Church of Rome. The *Santa Congregazione de Propaganda Fide* (a huge section of the Church of Rome presiding over the missionary affairs of all Catholics) had already given the charge of evangelizing the Himalayas to the provincial capuchin authorities in Ascoli-Piceno (Le Marche, central Italy).

The Capuchin missionaries are said to have established bases in Patan and Kathmandu with the disciples of Fr. Orazio da Pennabilli remaining in the Valley to launch their mission. Their medical practices were continued along with the effort to "evangelize" the people. The local élite grew uneasy with the Capuchin fathers; and in 1735, the Capuchin transferred their centre to Bhadgaon because the authorities of Kathmandu and Patan were no longer friendly to them. Bhadgaon was relatively smaller and less influential than Kathmandu or Patan, it was basically a quiet agrarian place. But the difficulties pertaining to the mission's resources and man-power and their contact and communication with other Capuchin bases in India and Tibet rendered the operations problematic. The locals were not openly hostile but stubborn and confident. Evangelizing such people was not an easy job. Frustrated with the difficulties and meagre results, the Capuchin fathers gradually retreated from Tibet and Nepal to their Indian base at Patna.

After three years from their retreat to Patna, the Capuchins -- already well-known to the authorities of Kathmandu, Patan and

Bhaktapur -- were approached by the emissaries of the Malla rulers. The rulers of the Nepal Valley and central midhills were notorious for their rivalry and shifting alliances amongst themselves. By that period the presence of westerners in various parts of the Indian sub-continent was already well-known to the Nepalese feudal lords. Many of them were quite eager to build good relations with the Europeans, which in their eyes, were replacing the Muslims as the dominant power. By courting and favouring the missionaries they wanted to establish closer contact with the Indian-based European colonizers. They wanted to use the missionaries as strategic bridges to win sympathy and, eventually, military assistance for their own territorial ambition and to settle their scores with internal rivals. Of course, the reality was quite different; the missionaries were not so close or directly related to the colonial powers.

Utilizing fully the nice opportunity, two Italian Capuchin missionaries, Fathers Joachim da S. Anatolia and Vito da Recanati left Patna immediately. King Ranajit Malla of Bhaktapur offered the best opportunities, and so the missionaries opted to open their base there. They were lavishly helped by the King. After some time, they were lured to open another centre in Kathmandu. It is said that the then King, Jaya Prakash Malla, did his best to please the missionaries, (B. C. Sharma 1975: 195-6)

The Capuchin mission continued without any perturbation until 1769 at which time the Gorkhali conquerors, who had been planning the capture of the valley for some time, succeeded in their aim. Soon after the Gorkhali conquest the missionaries were expelled from Nepal along with their neo-converts, altogether 62 persons. Gorkhals still repeat the saying: "Traders come with Bible and then the Bible comes with the sword" (*vyâpâr-ko sâth Bible ra Bible-ko sâth tarvâr*). They had witnessed the subjugation of many Indian rulers and associated the European traders and colonizers with the missionaries. When the Gorkhali were

completing their take-over, they did not want a single missionary or even a single neo-convert to remain. But nobody was physically harassed or killed for this reason. The Nepalese neo-converts went to Bettiah (Bihar) and settled as an exiled community.

According to Petech (1952: 1, 68) the Capuchin had been able to establish good contacts with the coterie of Prithvi Narayan, the Gorkhali king; i.e. before the Gorkhali take-over of the valley (cf. Petech, ... op. vol. I, p. LXVIII). In 1767, some of the Capuchins are said to have visited Nuwakot (north-west of Kathmandu, then under Gorkhali command) on the explicit request of the Gorkhals themselves (Petech 1952, 2, 294-97). But nothing regarding this is to be found in the history narrated by the native scholars.

After the death of Prithvi Narayan, the Gorkhali king who unified the numerous principalities of the central Himalayas and laid the foundations of present-day Nepal, his son and successor Singh Pratap is said to have invited the Capuchins to resume their mission. Singh Pratap, who is considered a weak, meak and insignificant ruler by native historians, was held to be a polite and benevolent king by the missionaries who were watching the Nepalese scenario carefully.

Prince Bahadur Shah, Singh Pratap's brother who was at odds with the queen for power, is said to have had a very cordial relationship with the Capuchin fathers at Bettiah. The prince was in exile there for some time. After the end of his exile, he is said to have invited the fathers to come and resume their mission in Kathmandu, (Petech 1952-56: 1, 69; 187, n. 75). Fr. Guiseppa da S. Marcello, an Italian Capuchin, went to Kathmandu following the invitation in 1786. In 1787, another Italian Capuchin, Fr. Carlo Maria da Alatri, joined Fr. da S. Marcello, but soon after his arrival he was called back to Patna for another assignment. Then Fr. da S. Marcello was also called by the Capuchin authorities in India to cover a post in Varanasi. The scarcity of missionary manpower in several parts of India affected adversely the



missions in the Himalayan region.

In 1794, Fr. Romualdo da Senegallia was sent to Nepal. He too left soon due to serious health problems. In 1796 or 1797 Fr. Guiseppe da S. Marcello, already familiar with Nepal, was sent back to Nepal from Varanasi by the Capuchin authorities. He is said to have taken his job too "lightly" - mixing with local people, forgetting to "evangelize" them and keeping a local woman as a concubine. In 1803 he was ex-communicated by his superiors. At that point the Capuchin mission in Kathmandu was over. The 'missionary', however, did not leave. Fr. da S. Marcello remained in Nepal till the end of his life -- without any missionary mandate and living on his own. In 1810, the missionary chapter was closed in Nepal with the death of Guiseppe da San Marcello (Petech 1952-56, 70-1).

#### Missions to Tibet

The first phase of missionary activities relating to the evangelization of Tibet was initiated by the Capuchins after the explorative ventures of the Jesuits. In the early days of the Capuchin mission to Tibet (1707-1711) the missionaries accomplished very little. The beginning itself was problematic due to the difficult terrain, the distances involved, the insufficient manpower and the strangeness of the local environment. These problems were compounded by their failure to maintain contact and secure reinforcements from their Indian bases.

After a pause of a half-decade, the Capuchin fathers renewed their effort. In 1716 a few Capuchin missionaries reached Lhasa. To their surprise, they found an Italian Jesuit, Fr. Ippolito Desideri, who was already there learning the local language and culture. The accounts of Fr. Ippolito Desideri, S.J. (1684-1733), native of Pistoia (Italy), constitute the most precious source of information regarding Tibet. He remained in Tibet for five consecutive years (1716-1722). The rivalry between the two societies resulted in a series of disputes and contro-

versy for years. Upon leaving Lhasa, Fr. Ippolito Desideri travelled to other parts of the trans-Himalayas. In November 1721 he reached Kathmandu on his way to the Jesuit bases in India. After a month-long sojourn in Nepal, he proceeded towards India. His accounts of Tibet constitute an excellent ethnographic work. Even the memoirs of a short stay in Nepal is a very interesting work. His mastery over the local languages and his good rapport with the natives gave him an edge over the Capuchin fathers. His inclination to knowledge rather than "evangelization" contrasted with the Capuchin's naive self-righteousness and zeal for "evangelization".

The second phase of the Capuchin mission to Tibet (1716-1733) was a more fruitful in converts than the previous one. The Capuchins had acquired more knowledge of the language and slightly better rapport with the locals. But this phase also could not last long due to the lack of new reinforcements and regular contacts with other bases in India. The problems in adapting to the local food, climate and customs were equally pressurizing. Notwithstanding the formerly tolerant and indifferent attitude shown by the Tibetans, the missionary fathers were not viewed with good eyes by the local élites and authorities.

In 1741, for the third time, the Capuchin tried to establish themselves in Tibet. Soon after their arrival hostilities from the Tibetans surfaced more clearly. The local neo-converts were socially marginalized. Some of them were even prosecuted by the local authorities. Harassments and hostilities to the Capuchins increased. Three out of the six missionaries left Tibet. Day by day, the other missionaries found it hard to continue. Having sensed the futility and hopelessness of their efforts, all the remaining Capuchin fathers left Tibet for good. In 1745, the mission in Tibet was abandoned. Immediately after their departure, a mob (most probably, incited by their preachers) is said to have demolished the

Capuchin establishment (residence and chapel) - a symbolic action marking the end of the Christian presence.

The missionaries did not succeed in their efforts to evangelize the Himalayas but their expeditions left a wealth of information for historians and ethnologists.

#### Reflections

Christianity originated as a spiritual movement in the Middle East, a region criss-crossed by many civilizational and religious-philosophical currents. Politically it was a part of the Roman empire. The Christian movement grew in a relatively cosmopolitan environment and its message was imbued with transcultural and universalistic outlook. Among many other favourable circumstances, the spread of Christianity in other parts of the Roman empire was facilitated by two novelties: a deep ethico-existential concern and a radical universalism.

With the official adoption of Christianity by the Roman emperor Constantine (three centuries after Christ), Christianity ceased to be a spiritual movement and became an established religion operating from the urban centre-stages. The initial Christian urge to spread the spiritual message was an immediate and natural consequence of the "prophetic eruption". With the institutionalization of Christianity "universalism" and "movementism" acquired new significances. When the urge to spread the spiritual message was forcefully stretched beyond the contextual and temporal range of the "prophetic eruption" (i.e. Christ event) it transformed into an official campaign of converting the non-Christians living beyond the shores of the eastern Mediterranean.

The advent of Islam, another universalistic religion from the same Abrahamic (Semitic) roots, stopped the eastward expansion of the Christianity for a long time. The Islamized Asians, especially the Turks and the Mongols, became strong bulwarks against the Christian march into Asia Interior. Nevertheless, in a sporadic way, Christian missionaries kept on trying.

During the 16th, 17th and 18th centuries numerous missionary expeditions in the Asian hinterlands were attempted. The Himalayas were also approached in that particular period.

Western man has always been, since the times of the ancient Greeks, curious and practical-minded. The combination of religious zeal in the Judaic-Christian tradition, the curiosity and passion for unknown horizons (Greek element) and the practically and expansionism (Roman characters) produced what we may call the western activism. As long as the religious vision dominated, the quest was for the unknown "skies" (as in medieval Christian and Islamic cosmology) through intense inward movements. As soon as the religious vision was diluted with social and material aspirations, the quest turned towards the unknown "surfaces". With the Renaissance, western man "lost" the paradise but gained "freedom" from absolutist theocentric vision. The quest for adventure, a psychic residue of the mystique of the wilderness, exploded during the transitional period from the Middle Ages through the Renaissance and beyond. Since that period western activism has manifested itself in great artistic, intellectual and material achievements. On the other hand, it has also been reflected in the westerners' restless, trouble-shooting and encroaching behaviour throughout the transitional and modern periods. Christian missionaries, as westerners, are no exception; they reflect both aspects of the western activism.

Meanwhile the Gorkhali campaign to unite the central Himalayan principalities gathered momentum and swept across the southern flank of the Himalayas. The campaign was imbued with a pronounced anti-colonial sentiment. In the mean time, the Capuchin were in their most crucial phase of mission in Nepal. The mission in Tibet depended heavily upon the mission bases in Nepal and India since the way to China from Tibet was longer and much more arduous. The Gorkhali élites (Brahmins and Kshatriyas, orthodox Saiva Hindus) were

quite suspicious of the western missionaries' presence in the Valley, whom they linked with the politico-military network of European powers. Even to this date many people in Nepal think in the same way. With the Gorkhali take-over of the valley the mission was destined to fail.

The attempt to evangelize the Himalayas failed. The harsh topography, the long distances and the lack of political support (for Nepal and Tibet were never colonized by western powers) determined the outcome of the missionary attempts. The apparently tolerant but quite stiff and stubborn attitude of the locals also contributed to the mission's lack of success. The predominantly *Saivite* Nepalese and *Mahâyâni* Buddhist Tibetans have a permissive, flexible and polyhedric religiosity. So they did not mind the presence of Christianity among them, which was just one more cult and *avatâra* in an archipelago of uncountable cults and *avatâra*.

In fact, the Christian missionaries were welcomed by the locals in the beginning. Soon they realized that the newcomers were overbearing in their insistence in making the people accept their "their" religion (a very disgusting behaviour as per Oriental standards) and abandon their own old "things" (e.g. polygamy or polyandry; rites and ceremonies, polytheism, etc.) as well as disobeying their traditional authorities (i.e. Brahmins, Lama etc). Such exclusivism was unknown to Himalayan people. The combination of insistence to convert and exclusivist preaching came to be seen as the "danger" of Christian proselytism. The concept and practice of conversion is absent in local traditions. *Dharma-parivartana* (change, or 'reversal', of dharma sounds negative to local ears).

In the same way, the modern fashion of adopting Oriental religion or mysticism by a section of the westerners is not appreciated at all by the authentically traditional Hindus and Buddhists. A westerner is disrespected or suspected as soon as he/she pretends to convert or induce behavioural changes, or, for the same reason, behaves in a self-

denying, "converted" way (e.g. *Hare Krishna*, Rajneesh-followers, the "white Lamas" etc.). Even, too much insistence from western churches in the "dialogue" could provoke uneasiness. For them the all-pervading and self-evident (i.e. *Dharma*) must not be abstracted, extrapolated and made the object of formal discourses. The different ways (*mârga*) to conceive and sustain the Order (*Dharma*) should be equally respected (*Sarva-dharma sama-bhâva*)

#### A note on missionary archives in Italy

*ARCHIVIO GENERALE dei FRATI MINORI CAPPUCINI*, Rome. *Analecta Ordinis Minorum Cappuccinorum*, Rome

*ARCHIVIO della SANTA CONGREGAZIONE de PROPAGANDA FIDE*, Rome. This archive is the one which contains the hugest part of the missionary activities abroad. See two sections within this archive: (i) *Scritture riferite nelle congregazioni generali* (ii) *Scritture riferite nelle congregazioni particolari per la Cina e per le Indie orientali* (this section contains most of the documents related to the missionary activities in eastern Asia).

*NECROLOGIO dei FRATI MINORI CAPPUCINI della PROVINCIA PICENA*, ed. by Giuseppe da Fermo, to be found in Ancona (central Italy). This is a succinct biographical list of all the dead Capuchin Fathers and contains some information about the Capuchin missionaries.

*ARCHIVIO della CURIA PROVINCIA-LIZIA dei CAPPUCINI*, Ancona. This contains most of the information on those Capuchin missionaries who organized the first substantial and established missions in Kathmandu valley and Lhasa.

*ARCHIVIO VATICANO*, Vatican City, Rome. It contains many of the edited and

unedited documents on the missionaries to all directions.

*ARCHIVIO STORICO ITALIANO*, Florence, contains materials on Italian travellers and explorers including the missionaries (e.g. the Jesuit father Ippolito Desideri).

*BIBLIOTECA APOSTOLICA VATICANA*, Vatican City. It contains edited materials by and on the missionaries.

*BIBLIOTECA NAZIONALE VITTORIO EMANUELE II*, Rome. It contains some materials regarding the Italian explorers abroad (e.g. Ippolito Desideri's *IL MANUALE MISSIONARIO DI P. DESIDERI*)

*ARCHIVUM HISTORICUM SOCIETATIS JESU*, Rome. Most of the materials and notes on the Jesuit missionaries are to be found in this archive (e.g. Andrade and other early Portuguese missionaries).

There is a huge documentation by C. Sommervogel, *BIBLIOTHEQUE DE LA COMPAGNIE DE JESUS* (10 volumes), Bruxelles-Paris, 1890-1900, which is to be found in many important libraries of the Jesuit institutions.

#### References

Andrade, Fr. Antonio de *Novo descobrimento do Gram Cathayo ou reinon de Thibet, pello padre Antonio de Andrade da Companhia de Jesu, Portoguez, anno de 1626* (republished together with other writings of Fr. de Andrade and edited by F.M. Pereira, *O descobrimento do Tibet pelo padre Antonio de Andrade*, Coimbra, 1921.

d'Anvers, F., 1934. *Missionaires Capucins et civilisation thibétaine*. In *Etudes Franciscaines*.

Archarya, B.R. 1968. *Śrī Barâmahârâjâd-hirâj Pṛthvinârâyaṇ Śâh*, 4 vols. Kathmandu: HMG,

Desideri, I., *Notizie storiche del Thibet e memorie dei viaggi e missioni ivi fatte dal padre Ippolito Desideri della Compagna de Gesù. Dal medesimo scritte e dedicate 1712-23*; parts of it have been edited and published by F. de Filippi, *An Account of Tibet; the Travels of Ippolito Desideri of Pistoia, S.J. 1712-1727*, London: Routledge.)

Gyanwali, S.B., *Pṛithvī Nârâyaṇ Śâh*. Darjeeling: Ne. Bha. Pra. Sa., 1946.

Hamilton, F., *An Account of the Kingdom of Nepal*, Edinburgh: A. Constable, 1819.

Kirkpatrick, W., *An Account of the Kingdom of Nepal*, London: W. Miller, 1811.

Luca, A., *Nel Tibet ignoto. Lo straordinario viaggio di Ippolito Desideri, S.J. (1684-1733)*, Bologna: EMI, 1987.

Norothy, W.B. & Morris, C.J., *The Gurkhas: Their Manners, Customs and Country*, Delhi: Cosmo, 1974.

Petech, L., *I missionari italiani nel Tibet e nel Nepal* (in ser. *IL NUOVO RAMUSIO II*, under the scientific direction of G. Tucci), 7 vol., Rome: IsMEO, 1952-56.

Petech, L., *Medieval History of Nepal*, Rome: IsMEO, 1984 (2nd ed.).

Puini, C., *Il Tibet (geografia, storia, religione, costumi) secondo la relazione del viaggio di Ippolito Desideri, 1715-21*, in *MEMORIE della SOCIETA GEOGRAFICA ITALIANA - 10*, Rome, 1904.

Regmi, D.R., *Medieval Nepal*, 3 vols., Calcutta: Mukhopadhyaya, 1966.



---- *Modern Nepal*, Calcutta: Mukhopadhyaya, 1961.

Sharma, B.C. 1975. *Nepal-ko Aiti-hasik Rupa-rekha* Varanasi: B. Mahadev Pd. Sharma.

Snellgrove, D., *Buddhist Himalaya: Travels and Studies in Quest of the Origins and Nature of Tibetan Religion*, Oxford: Bruno Cassirer, 1957.

Stein, R.A., *Tibetan Civilization*, (Eng. trans. by J.E.S. Driver), London: Faber & Faber, 1972.

Stiller, L., *The Rise of the House of Gorkha*, New Delhi: Manjushree, 1973.

Toscano, G.M., *Alla scoperta del Tibet*, E.M.I., Bologna, 1977.

Wessels, C. 1924. *Early Jesuit Travellers in Central Asia*. The Hague.

## INTERVIEW

### On the Topicality of History: An Interview with Mahesh Chandra Regmi

Martin Gaenzle

Having been tutored by his father he "never saw the inside of a school", and as he had to discontinue his university education after a B.A. at the age of eighteen, Mahesh Chandra Regmi, today the unquestioned authority on Nepal's economic history, started his academic career - as he says - "with hands tied behind the back". After four years at Trichandra College in Kathmandu the Rana government sent him to Patna University, where he stayed for two months to prepare for his B.A. examinations. He then tried to run a book shop, later a cloth shop, in Calcutta, but eventually returned to Kathmandu just before the changes in 1950.

It was only around 1956, when he met a Ford Foundation scholar who was doing research on the agricultural system of Nepal and asked him to translate some documents, that M.C. Regmi started to get interested in doing research on Nepal's economic history. In 1960 he received support from the University of California and in the following years he wrote the four volume study *Land*

*Tenure and Taxation in Nepal*, which still stands as the authoritative source on the subject. This was followed by several books on the economic history of Nepal: among others *A Study in Nepali Economic History* (1971), *Thatched Huts and Stucco Palaces: Peasants and Landlords in 19th Century Nepal* (1979), *The State and Economic Surplus: Production, Trade and Resource Mobilization in Early 19th Century Nepal* (1985).

Rather than striving for a university career, he set up his own private Regmi Research Institute, which provides several regular publications that are valuable sources for scholars on Nepal, such as the Nepal Press Digest, the Nepal Recorder, and - until recently - the Regmi Research Series. In 1977, Mahesh Chandra Regmi received the Ramon Magsaysay Award for Journalism, Literature, and Creative Communication Arts. Though he usually prefers to stay away from the academic arena of seminars, conferences and workshops, he still

continues his studies, the latest product of which I had the opportunity to read in a draft version. This was one of the things we talked about during the interview, which was held on August 19, 1992 at his house in Lajim-path.

Q: The Regmi Research Series, which was much valued by scholars, has been suspended since 1990.

A: In 1989 December. I kept it up for twenty years. I started in November 1969, and finally gave it up in December 1989, because I couldn't keep it up.

Q: What were the reasons?

A: Well, the first thing was that it was selling only about forty copies, forty subscriptions. It did not generate enough resources to hire people, assistants, things like that. This was the main problem. Another problem was that I couldn't find anybody with the competence to translate the old documents in the style I used. So it was a one-man-show.

Q: So you did all the translations all yourself?

A: Of course. Do you think I could get easily somebody else to do that, to understand and interpret the old documents and translate them in good English language?

Q: You didn't want to do it yourself any longer?

A: The point is: there is a limit to everything. After crossing the age of sixty I don't want to work nine hours a day. That's not the goal of life. And then I decided to concentrate on my own writing, not just to give up the Regmi Research Series and sit quietly, playing with my grandchildren. What I want to do is spend more time on my own work.

Q: So it was also not the reason that you ran out of materials?

A: Well, I could keep it up for the next fifty years. There are tremendous volumes of materials now with me in this room, they are still untapped. And materials are coming in, you see, every day something new, documents, books, things like that. And you can always go to the Government Offices and procure more documents. Materials were not the problem. (...) The point is that I'm

glad that this publication has been used and appreciated by the academic world. (...) So my purpose is served, I have shown what I can do.

Q: Now as far as I know, your collection of manuscripts has been microfilmed by the Nepal German Manuscript Preservation Project.

A: That's right. I am glad because I can't handle it. The paper is getting brittle, the ink is fading, nobody is able to use it. Now this is all a part of mankind's corpus of knowledge. Now it is safe.

Q: Has everything been microfilmed in your collection?

A: The only thing I wonder is who will look at these microfilms and when.

Q: Well, now there is this new microfilm house, you may have heard...

A: Yes but people, people... You know the manuscripts I have given include a copy of a transcript of the *Ekadasi Mahatmya*. You know, the eleventh day of each fortnight is a very sacred day, *ekādaśī*. So one of my ancestors made a copy of that *Ekādaśī Mahātmya* and in that he has written a verse: *bhagna-prīṣṭha-kaṭi-grīva-baddha-muṣṭir-adho-mukhaṁ // kaṣṭhena likhitaṁ grantham yatnena paripālayet*, "With my back bent, my head bent, my fingers squeezed, holding a pen, I have written this book with great difficulty, and please preserve it carefully." That has gone to the microfilms.

Q: That could well be a motto over the entrance of the archives.

A: And it's a fact. Now I am glad that what I collected during the period of nearly twenty years is now safe, even if these actual paper volumes perish. I'm very glad.

Q: How do you judge the general state of archivization in Nepal. What are the most urgent tasks?

A: Well I don't know if you have gone to the *Lagat Phāt*. I have stopped working there nearly ten years ago. Has anybody gone and microfilmed those manuscripts?

Q: I think not, so far. That would probably be the most necessary...

A: Not only necessary but urgent. When, ten years ago, I sometimes went myself and made copies, some rolls were actually falling into pieces. I had to (make) copies with blank spaces where the insects had been earlier than I. So they are perishing. And the other thing is that beyond preserving something must be done to use them.

Q: Let me turn now to your most recent book which you have just sent for publication...

A: *Kings and Political Leaders in the Gorkhali Empire 1768-1814*.

Q: Could you roughly outline the idea of the book?

A: I have written quite a lot on the condition of the peasantry during the Gorkhali period, over-taxation, labour services, like that. I have discussed that in great detail, as a matter of fact most of my work has been devoted to a study of the conditions of the peasantry, workers and peasants. Now the question that came up before my mind after I finished this: Now why this? Suppose there is a traffic accident, a hit-and-run accident, the driver of a vehicle runs over a man and escapes from the site of the accident. Now everybody looks at the victim, he is bleeding and suffering, but nobody thinks of why this happened. The driver has fled. So in the same way, now if the peasant in the Gorkhali period or Rana period or maybe even now suffers, it is not due to his decision. Somebody made the decisions which shaped the course of his life. Now who made that decision? What was the catalytic factor that shaped the course of Nepali social and economic history? So I finally came to the point that (it was) the political leadership of Gorkha which decided that the state should expand. Once you make that decision the rest follows. You have to use the peoples' labour services, taxes, lots of things, so the rest follows. So the main catalytic factor is the decision of the political leadership of the Gorkhali state to expand their territories - that affected the life of the people.

Q: So as far as I see, you have shifted somewhat from your previous focus on economics, now you also include political

aspects.

A: I have made it rounder, I have seen it in a proper perspective. As I said, you look at the victim, that is part of the reality. The reality is that the political elites made the decision which affected the period and made the condition what it was. So I have not shifted the ground, I only want to study it in a broader perspective.

Q: Previously you have mainly described the Gorkha conquests in term of economic enrichment and exploitation. Now you also speak of the vision of the leadership, the vision to build a Himalayan Empire. Do you regard these early leaders primarily as Empire-builders or primarily as conquerors for their own personal benefits?

A: Both, the reality is both. Now what happened was that the leaders of Gorkha created a Himalayan state which still exists. And that is an achievement. Among all the social groups of what is now Nepal it appears that only the leaders of Gorkha had the vision to create a state, a state in the abstract sense, in a secular sense, not in the sense of tribe, or region or community, like that. Anything that has created this state, the unified state of Nepal now, must be regarded as a vision. It must be appreciated, shouldn't it be? But beyond, or rather beneath, that broad reality, it is a question of personal ambition. And then you have to make a distinction between the Empire-building phase and the phase of destructive conflict. What happened after 1804 was absolutely uncalled for.

Q: But wasn't it even before that that there was a shift away from a more visionary kind of Empire-building and, as you show in your book, that there was a mechanism that had its own dynamic, that called for that enlargement.

A: I bring it out more clearly in this study which was not contained in the earlier draft I gave you. The point is that by 1790 the Gorkhali state had probably reached the viable limits of its expansion. It had occupied Kumaon and made a vassal state of Garhwal. Between 1792 and 1804 there was no mili-

tary activity of any kind. It stopped. And after 1804, what did they do? They went beyond Kumaon to Garhwal, I called that a Quixotic enterprise. Now granted that they wanted to build an independent Empire, but within what limits?

Q: So what was this decision like?

A: This decision was due to the fact that in Kathmandu you had a leadership, there was a big coup, lots of people were massacred and Bhimsen Thapa came to power. Now he was a very junior member of the Gorkhali elite who had never had any experience with actual fighting, and there were lots of people who were more senior, more experienced than him, but by chance, by these fortuitous circumstances he was catapulted to power, after the assassination of Rana Bahadur, and he used this programme of expansion to strengthen his own political position in the Gorkhali state.

Q: So that was a political decision rather than a decision of just trying for economic advancement?

A: Certainly. So there are two phases of expansion. Incidentally, what was acquired after 1804 was all lost, Kumaon, Garhwal, Kangra... was all lost. Whereas what was gained after 1792 was more or less retained with the exception of Kumaon. You know the British signed a treaty with Nepal in 1801, a friendship treaty. It remained valid for nearly two years. In that treaty they accepted Nepal's territories with provisions for adjustments of border disputes, but that means they had accepted Nepal's ownership of Kumaon. But the post-1804 adventurers, Bhimsen Thapa and his group, and before that the political elites of Kathmandu, the *bhardārs*, were so interested in only their own petty designs that they missed the opportunity to gain acceptance from the East India Company Government in Calcutta. So the rest followed. Can you imagine Kathmandu fighting a war in Kangra?

Q: That's quite a difficult thing.

A: Quite difficult, logistics was a big problem, and the other thing, the Gorkhali were experts in mountain warfare. They

never fought a pitched battle with any enemy, but now they went into Kangra ... battles (with the) Sikhs and all this. After 1804, if you study their careers in detail, they don't come out in good light. Amar Singh Thapa, the hero of Kangra, for example, he was such an obtruse person. You know he went up to Kangra and crossed the Sutlej and - I have used the word - played imperial war games in the Sutlej region. Did Gorkha have the capacity to do that?

Q: But wasn't this expansion also due to the fact that the political elite was becoming larger and larger?

A: That comes later. When you imagine the situation, Bhimsen Thapa and his group are in power, now they have much more senior people around them. Now you have to find work for them. Or they will compete with you in Kathmandu. So they were all sent out.

Now let me add one thing. Historical reality is a complex thing. However deep your interpretation may be, there is always a "maybe, if it had not been so". So I don't say that what I have written is the absolute truth, it is one way of looking at things. I don't know the truth, do you? Does anybody? But your explanation must fit in with the facts. So how else can you explain this old man Amar Singh Thapa going to Kangra and fighting with Ranjit Singh and all that. (...) Q: You mentioned earlier your next project of writing will be something on Kumaon. Will that be more in a political vein?

A: My next project... no, it is mainly political, administrative, agrarian. You see, what I want to do is to analyse the nature of Gorkhali administration in Kumaon. And what burden did it impose on the people of Kumaon, and other areas. Because what happened was that Kumaon was on the way toward Garhwal and Kangra, it lay on the route. So up to 1804, between 1790 when it was annexed by Gorkha and 1804, Kumaon was just a frontier province. But after 1804, it lay on the route, its borders on all four sides became dynamic, active borders. So people, troops, soldiers were travelling through the Kumaon territory all the time. This created



burdens for the local people, taxes, provisions, forced labour, slavery, etc. So now don't ask me what I am going to write because I don't know myself [laughs]. But beyond that it is not a study of political history, it will be a study what should be called rather political economy or something like that. You know these narrow confines of economic history are or political history is not satisfying any more. (...)

The main thing is that the people of Nepal have a history. It is a big thing to have a history, lots of communities don't have it. They don't have written records. Now Nepal is a nation in the making, or a state, because it has a definite history. Otherwise there is no difference between the Karens of Burma or the Gorkhals of Nepal. (...) You have developed in definite way, you have a definite historical experience behind you, that has made you what you (are). (...) So this colonial experience, now can you tell me where this Gorkhali swagger and bluster come from? Despising *madesis* and all this blabber: Nepal *bīr*, Gorkhali brave, this bluff and bluster and swagger come from? I think this comes from the Nepali colonial experience. So can you understand the people of Nepal and forget their colonial experience? You shouldn't.

Q: What do you mean by colonial experience?

A: Kumaon was a colony, a colony of the Gorkhali state. Gorkhali imperialism was in control of a subject population, the population has no voice in anything. You were geographically connected, physically connected, (...) for example Moscow controlled the central Asian republics as colonies, didn't it? In the former Soviet Union all the central Asian republics were virtual colonies of Moscow, despite the geographical proximity. So I should say there was definitely a Gorkhali Empire and that the Gorkhali Empire had acquired colonies. Maybe even the entire territory west of the Bheri river were colonies, Doti, Jumla, ...

Q: That's what I was wondering, then how do you distinguish between colonies and non-

colonies, was the East of Nepal also a colony?

A: Definitely, the Gorkhali heartland, as I think I have written in this draft, was the area between Dudh Kosi and Kali Gandaki, or Bheri. You can probably go up to Bheri, certainly up to Marsyandi. They didn't have provinces, they didn't have definite administrative units, you can see the difference very (clearly) ... Now the Limbus of Pallo Kirat, didn't they suffer colonial domination under the Gorkhals?

Q: You can call it that way...

A: At this stage I avoid making this definition. I concentrate on Kumaon. Because Kumaon, there are certain advantages. One is that there is definite space, there is a definite time-limit, twenty-five years, a definite geographical area. And to be more banal, when I write about the Gorkhali rule in Kumaon, which is now a part of India, I believe I will sell some copies of my book to Indians [laughs]. Well that's not serious of course. (...)

Q: You often emphasize the importance of history for understanding the present. Where do you see the major difficulties now in the new multi-party democracy.

A: The multi-party democracy seems to think that 1990 is the year one. Not only now, but even in 1959/60 when the Nepali Congress was in power they didn't know many things and they committed very serious mistakes.

Q: So what do you see as the major mistakes?

A: For example in 1959 they passed the *birā* abolition law, and they abolished something without abolishing it... They only taxed it. They divided *birā* into two categories: one belonging to big Ranas, what they called A category, and the B category owned by other people. What they did was simply to tax it, and let the owners remain in possession. But they called it abolition, which raised everybody's hackles. That confrontation was not necessary.

We had a long tradition for example of homestead taxes, now they abolished homestead taxes and reintroduced it under a

different name. They abolished *kipaṭ* control of land and forests, and now they say community control of forests. I think one could build up on the traditional institutions, and not throw all of them over board.

Q: The same with the *guthi* system. I think now there are many people who realize that actually the *guthi* system was important for conserving the temples, but now it all has gone to the Guthi Corporation...

A: It has been not nationalized, stateized - or something like that. Well they could have build on... I hope you remember my small article. [During a seminar in 1990 "From Town to City and Beyond" Mr. egmi contributed a paper titled "Kathmandu City and the *guthi* system today".]

Q: I think it should be published, because this is really what many people feel. That came also out in the discussion during that seminar: that many people realized that for saving *bāhās* and all these different temples the *guthi* system was important.

A: Not only that. Creating new institutions. Do you realize that at present there is no law under which you can reinstate a *guthi*? Now suppose I want to create a *guthi*, there is no law under which I can register it. (...)

There is a registration of associations act which is completely different. There is one law in the Muluki Ain which provides for *duniyā guthi*, but no provision for registration officially. So this is another example of what could be done by building on traditional institutions. Now here Putali Sadak has become Ram Shah Path in the name of progress, whereas in London you can still visit Threadneedle Street. .... Nobody has changed the name. Nobody changed it to Queen Victoria Street or... Now poor Ram Shah has nothing to do with this Putali Sadak. So you don't (have to) kick out everything in the name of modernity. Change and reform are all right, but I don't think you can bring it in chunks of more than a bit at a time, ten percent for example. Major changes have always been disastrous. So in the same way a lack of knowledge of history and tradition.... You have studied in Eastern

Nepal, this *kipaṭ*, now why do you kick out this *kipaṭ* system of controlling forest resources? Can you substitute anything more effective for that? Why should you abolish *kipaṭ* tenure? You write off the land tax for small holdings, you bring *kipaṭ* land under tax system, then abolish the tax on certain categories of holdings, so what does it come to? An entire administrative effort gone waste.

Q: It is all in the process of changing now, up to the present day in the area where I was doing research, taxes are still collected by the old *jimmāwāl*. But now this will all be completely abolished, they will have to start from the scratch. They still have to rely somehow on the old documents.

A: Nobody is going to collect them. ... And then the cost of collection. Maybe it is cheaper to collect it through traditional channels.

Q: Yes, that's why they have so far still done it. But the idea now is to send someone from the district headquarters, who has no idea about the local situation.

A: This is what I mean by saying you have to study history and you have to have a sense of history in order to develop. Now, everybody wants to modernize and develop, but there is no magic formula which is applicable. (...) So that's why I don't want to change things. My only objective is to widen the frontiers of human knowledge in the field I am writing. And from that point of view I think I have been more or less successful. Nobody has studied these things before. I don't want to change the world. I can't.

Q: So all this brings me to a more personal question. How did you get interested in economic history?

A: I started in 1956-57, I was out of work, I had been dismissed by the government, I was in the Industry Department and one day I was dismissed. Then I met a Ford Foundation scholar who was doing some research on the agricultural system of Nepal and he gave me some documents to translate. These were mainly reports of the land reforms commission of 1952-53. I tried to translate

them and then I got interested in this thing, one thing led to another and in 1957 I started this thing. In 1960 I got some help from the University of California through Leo Rose, and in eight or nine years I wrote *Land Tenure and Taxation*. It's more than thirty years old now, but I am glad that the basic definitions I devised at that time are still valid. I don't have any reason to change them. (...) What you do sometimes doesn't have any logical reasons. It's only what you want to do. I have to explain maybe at some point why I want to do it, but that's not important, is it? You want to do it.

Q: What about this Himalayan Border Country Research Project?

A: That was Dr. Leo Rose in 1964 or 65. There was a controversy there; they had got a research grant from the Defense Department of the United States. There was a clamour that it was CIA funded. I said: look, I don't know, I get payed for doing research on Nepal, I don't care where the money comes from. But I didn't have to explain. And all of a sudden the project was discontinued in 1969.

Q: So you were involved as translator?

A: They gave me a grant, they never told me what to do. They said: You (can) do what you want to do. And I said I want to do land tenure and taxation in Nepal. It started with a one volume project, one became two, two became three, three became four. So they financed all that.

Q: Let me come to my last question: Which historic period do you find most fascinating? You have been writing on the early Shaha period of Prthvi Narayan Shah and on the

Rana period...

A: From my point of view the most interesting period is from 1768 to 1815. The Gorkhali Empire period. Because things happened. Things happened, achievements were made, despite lapses and failures, but something was created. And when you create it is not all the way a linear one-way process, you get setbacks also. Isn't it a surprising thing that the state of Gorkha became Nepal? Just think of it like a Nepali, as I do. They created it. You see, before that, I told you just a short time ago, there was no idea of a state. It was just the King's personal possessions, tribal organization. Look at the Limbus, they never went beyond the confines of their tribal organization. Now, ... a state formation is much more progressive than a tribal formation. It has a secular base. They never developed beyond tribes. But here Prthivi Narayan Shah comes and says: Look, we are *dhuṅgo*. [lit. 'stone', but here as a metaphor for the state.]

Q: That's the concept which made the difference...

A: It made a difference, this is *dhuṅgo* where everybody has equal rights. Now this concept is completely unknown in this part of the world. (...) I think I am the first person to have brought this out. I haven't seen it anywhere. Others just described what it did. But here it comes out: *dhuṅgo* is different from and beyond the king's personality. You are not loyal to the King but to the *dhuṅgo*, which is a very progressive idea and ideal. (...) And they did it. Now you have a state from the Mechi to the Mahakali, 54,000 square miles.

## RESEARCH REPORTS

### Individual Project

Project: Internal and external conceptualization of social change in North-East Nepal: the study of individuality in a traditional community.

Researcher: Michael Mühlich, South Asia Institut, Heidelberg University  
Sponsor: German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD)

This study primarily concerns the individual's perspective in cognizing and handling his own culture. The focus of research is the Sherpa in three different contexts: a village in Solu, where tradition does not necessarily exclude social change (see Ortner 1990), various educational and development projects and Sherpas in Kathmandu who had migrated from the region of Solu.

A few remarks on terminology are necessary, since current usage of the concepts "internal" versus "external" might lead to a sociological bias. Internal in the cognitive sense of this study means "normative", that is a judgement as to the relative value of an object, event or attitude, putting it on a value-scale in relation to an absolute value. External refers to "substantial", that is a perspective not free of judgement but pointing to the qualities of an object, an event or an attitude as to their relationships, connectedness and transformability (see also the discussion between Dumont and Marriott). It remains to be asked whether this distinction is only the concern of anthropologists, or whether it is also found in the concepts of people themselves, reflected in the way individuality finds expression.

It was found initially that individuality has an important cultural value in oral traditions (molla, sh.), including a variety of stories (pe, sh.) of the origin of the world, of man's place in it and of social behaviour. Such oral traditions are found not only among the Sherpa but among other groups as

well (see Aziz 1985, Jackson 1984, Macdonald 1965) and thus open a way for further comparison. On a deeper level such distinctions can also be found by asking the double question (why is this present, why is that absent). For example, is the concept of the "evil" in traditional societies really something which is conceived as being outside of man? Or, could it just as well be another discourse on the same problem, a change from a normative to a substantial perspective in what (e.g. responsibility, attitude etc.) we attribute to others and ourselves? And, if it is just a different perspective, what is left aside then and how will this conceptualization be effected through social change?

Having tried to indicate that recognizing the possibility of a variety of individual perspectives also includes a setting of priorities and leaving aside other knowledge, it remains necessary to include in this "analysis from both sides" the Sherpas' concept of social units and their norms of behaviour, that are the focus of cognition and social action. For example, the conceptual division of power and purity that is found within the brahmanical cultural sphere and the division of power and purity that was also a fact in the Buddhist community of the Sherpa might seem to be equal in character, since the latter could be thought of as an effect of, or counter-part or structural adaptation to the process of Hinduization (see Barth 1969). Thus it is traceable in the history of the Sherpas that there was, as in the epoch of the formation of the Nepalese state, a series of temple foundings connected with the rise of local power-centres, whose area of influence was, as in the dominant example, not identical with that of the influence of the clerical sphere. Bringing into mind the individuals' perspectives, it has to be noted, however, that the concept of power among Buddhist communities is differently conceptualized from that of the Hindus.



There seems to be not so much an encompassment of the opposite of purity but a more direct and at the same time more inde-

pendent, reciprocal balancing relationship between the two. For example, how is modern education influencing the perspective on traditional knowledge?

## NEWS

### Conferences

#### Human Rights Violations in the Himalaya - The Domination of Elites 6-10 December 1991, Kathmandu

As a result of democratisation in Nepal and the newly gained freedom of speech, it is now permitted to discuss potentially explosive topics in public. Between the 6th and 10th December 1991 in the Hotel Vajra (Kathmandu), about 100 human-rights activists, environmentalists, politicians, journalists and scientists from all over Nepal, as well as from Ladakh, Garhwal, Sikkim, Bhutan (refugees), Tibet (refugees), Germany, England and the Netherlands met to examine critically human rights problems and the dominance of elites: the meeting was organized by NGOs, such as Nepal Watch (Berlin) and the Peace Movement Nepal, Lalitpur.

In an unusually free atmosphere there were discussions on human rights and human rights violations connected with the following topics: environment, health, peace, education, language, access to information, freedom of speech, political participation, women, children, bonded labour, religion, culture, rights of ethnic minorities, land conflicts, racism, foreign aid, foreign media and tourism. From the discussion it became obvious, how much ethnic minorities (who in some cases are not 'minorities' at all) in the Himalaya feel politically, economically and culturally oppressed. Above all, religious elites and centralist governments in Delhi, Kathmandu, Timphu and Beijing were held responsible for trans-

forming ethnic groups into aliens. As to Nepal, it is not even known how many ethnic groups there are exactly, and what percentage of the total national population the members of these groups represent. Tamang spokesmen, for example, estimated that they represented 17% of the whole population, and non-Hindus altogether about 75%. In the conference they stressed that as long as the Nepalese constitution proclaimed Hinduism a state-religion, many people would not reveal that they actually belonged to another religion: the disadvantages would be too great.

Massive human rights violations were reported anew from Tibet and Bhutan. In both cases there was no reaction from India or Nepal. In the case of Bhutan there has even been no reaction worldwide. About 70,000 Nepalese Bhutanese people here had to flee Bhutan, and it is said that 300 come each day to seek help in the refugee-camps in eastern Nepal. From Tibet also about 300 people escape monthly to Nepal, there often being maltreated, extorted and robbed.

The participants at the meeting agreed upon the following statement (interestingly the demands in connection with the situation in Tibet were not reported on by the government media).

We call on the Governments concerned to ensure equality of all ethnic, social, religious and linguistic groups, and to take appropriate measures to enable members of all these groups to participate fully in society and in decision-making processes. Surveys should be conducted to determine the size and living conditions of the various ethnic groups in the region.

The constitution of any country should not promote, safeguard, or grant preferential treatment to any particular religion.

The right to a healthy environment is the most fundamental of human rights. Governments concerned should take appropriate measures to prevent the further destruction of the environment. We strongly urge Governments to set up environmental courts.

Governments should ensure that education is available in the mother tongue of different ethnic groups, at least at primary level. They should make available existing resources, including teachers and materials, to enable this to take place.

Governments in the Himalayan region that do not have a language policy and planning should initiate such measures.

The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child should be implemented. Special measures should be taken to improve the lives of women and to prevent their continued exploitation.

Communication through the media of announcements, reports and official Government statements should be in the languages of the people.

We call for the increased awareness of, and support for, the plight of the Tibetan people in their struggle for the restoration of their human rights, including the right to self-determination.

The world community should extend support and solidarity to the ongoing movement for human rights, justice and democracy in Bhutan, and should provide relief measures and protection to the refugees in India and Nepal.

The protection and rights of all refugees in the region should be guaranteed under the international laws concerned.

Finally, it was proposed and accepted that a Himalayan Network be established to monitor, promote and document the human rights situation in the Himalayan region. It will be called "Peace Himalaya" with its headquarters in Kathmandu

Ludmilla Tüting

#### SOAS Conference Review Ladakh-History and Culture. Conference at SOAS, June 1-2, 1992.

Since 1981, four meetings on Ladakh have been held in Europe, more recently in connection with the International Association for Ladakh Studies. The fifth, to have been held in Ladakh, was postponed, but another opportunity for a meeting of Ladakh scholars was recently provided by a commemorative event to mark the 150th anniversary of the death of the Hungarian scholar Alexander Csoma de Körös. Csoma compiled a Tibetan-English dictionary, a Tibetan grammar and a Tibetan-Sanskrit dictionary of Buddhist terminology, and he is considered to be one of the early founders of Tibetan studies in the west. Some of his work was carried out during the 1820s from the monasteries of Zangla and Phuktal in Zanskar.

The two-day conference held at SOAS and organised by Philip Denwood, drew scholars from several countries in Europe including Hungary, Csoma's homeland. The theme of Csoma's life and work provided a focus for examining anew Ladakhi history and its sources, and it was this fresh, yet critical, historical perspective that characterised the spirit of the conference.

In 1819 Csoma, with 14 languages already at his command, set out on an epic journey across Asia with hopes of discovering the ancient homeland of the Hungarian people and the origins of their language. This he failed to achieve, but by 1822 he had reached Ladakh. At Dras he encountered William Moorcroft, a veterinary surgeon working for the East India Company, whose official mission it then was to procure horses from Central Asia and improve the Company stud. Moorcroft was concerned to further scholarship in the field of Tibetan language and literature because of its potential value in establishing commercial and political relations, and he recommended that Csoma study Tibetan and secured him financial assistance for this task.

In 1823 Csoma set off for Zaskar, equipped with a gift of Moorcroft's copy of the *Alphabetum Tibetanum*, a voluminous work compiled in 1762 by the Augustinian, A Giorgi. This important work which was to form one of Csoma's few sources, was discussed in a paper by Elisabeth Toth (Budapest). With the assistance of Sangye Phuntsog, the head lama of Zangla monastery, Csoma thus began his study of Tibetan language and literature.

Two conference papers highlighted the significance of Moorcroft's contribution to Tibetan scholarship, and to Ladakh studies in particular. In a colourful account of some of the rivalries among the scholars engaged in Tibetan studies at that time, Geza Bethlenfalvy (Budapest) suggested that Moorcroft's role has been generally underestimated.

HH Wilson, secretary of the Asiatic Society of Bengal, edited Moorcroft's journals and letters, and these were published in 1837 as *Travels in the Himalayan Provinces of Hindustan and the Panjab; in Ladakh and Kashmir; in Peshawar, Kabul, Kunduz, and Bokhara*. Nicola Grist (London) concentrated on Moorcroft's *Travels*, as a historical source. Its value derives from being one of the only accounts of Ladakh as it was prior to the Dogra invasions of the 1830s, but also from a genuine interest in the local economy, agricultural practices, and political relations. This interest emerges in the attention to detail: the account abounds in rich anecdotal material gleaned from encounters with named individuals.

However, an examination of the style in which the book is written, reveals an 'orientalist' discourse which underlies much 19th century writing. Moorcroft's fondness for Ladakhis is expressed in familiar stereotypes. He is sympathetic to the Buddhists but is more condescending about the Muslims and this anticipates the prejudiced and uncritical attitudes of some later western writers on Ladakh.

The emergence of the Sikh power in the Punjab in the early part of the 19th century and the extension of British rule after the

Anglo-Nepalese war of 1814-6, brought about a period of upheaval and change in the North West Himalaya. The political allegiances of petty chiefdoms and kingdoms were shifting. In 1820 the Dogras from Jammu had conquered Kishtwar and reached Ladakh's southern border, whilst in the upper Sulej valley there was a British presence. Moorcroft's arrival in Ladakh was believed to be linked to an attempt to divert the trade in shawl wool from Ladakh to British territories. In fact Moorcroft tried, unsuccessfully, to obtain British protection for Ladakh.

The fragile weave of political allegiance and tension linking and dividing neighbouring territories at that time is described in a paper by Bernhard Le Calloc'h (Paris). He traces the footsteps of Csoma's journey through Ladakh and into Zaskar, where he stayed for a year, and graphically describes the political situation of the various regions Csoma traversed when he left Zaskar in 1824. Csoma had agreed to pass the winter in Kulu with his teacher Sangye Puntsog. When the lama failed to appear, he proceeded through Mandi to British-Indian territory at Sabathu.

With Moorcroft's letters of recommendation he hoped to be well received, but was only treated with suspicion and delayed further. Once he had obtained the monthly allowance he needed to continue his work, he journeyed back to Zaskar and resumed his studies at Phuktal monastery.

The Dogras of Jammu were a feudatory of the Sikh rulers of the Punjab. Their eventual penetration of Ladakh was partly linked to the control of important trade routes. By 1842, they had established a decisive presence in the region which formed a watershed in Ladakhi history. The power of the monasteries weakened, trade underwent a short period of upheaval, the king was deposed, and Ladakh lost its independence once and for all. What we know of Ladakh dates largely from that time.

Accounts of the Dogra campaigns of the 1830s are few and not wholly reliable. By

combining the three main existing accounts, and drawing on additional source material which has made it possible to fill in some of the gaps, Neil Howard (Warwick) presented a fuller and more coherent account of the Dogra campaign into Ladakh between 1834-39, illustrating the routes and strategies used. One of the points to emerge from his researches, is that Ladakhi resistance to the Dogra invasions was probably greater than previously thought.

In 1842 the Dogras finally annexed Ladakh and signed a treaty with the Tibetans concerning the border between Ladakh and West Tibet, which the Dogras had tried, unsuccessfully, to invade. The border was restored to its previous position and old trading arrangements were resumed. From 1846, Ladakh's external relations were supervised by the British. Whilst no large-scale confrontations over the border were to occur for more than 100 years, the uncertainties surrounding it were evident at a local level, and disputes flared up from time to time. Some of the disputes that occurred between 1890 and 1940 formed the subject of a paper by John Bray (London). These concerned the boundary near Pangong lake; the grazing rights of the communities living nearby; the status of Tibetan subjects in Ladakhi territory; and entitlements in trade. The British, Kashmiri and Tibetan authorities failed to properly settle these disputes because of ignorance of local custom, and also because of cultural differences which led to different expectations of diplomacy.

Most accounts of Ladakh date from sometime after the Dogra invasion. One of the most prolific writers on Ladakhi culture was the Moravian missionary, AH Francke, described in a paper by Gudrun Meier (Dresden) as "a brother in spirit to Csoma". In the late 19th century work on the *Chronicles of the Ladakhi kings* had already begun, but was still incomplete. Interested as he was in Ladakhi history and literature Francke translated the *Chronicles* and carried out extensive work on the folk tradition; collecting and translating songs and stories.

He also worked on the documentation of rock carvings and other antiquities, commissioned by the Archaeological Survey of India.

As Gudrun Meier suggests, Ladakhi rock carvings are 'an open history book'. To read them correctly, however, is a another matter. Among the more problematic legacies of Francke's work are his speculations about the early history of Ladakh, and its aboriginal population. Here, Philip Denwood (London) suggests in his paper on 'The Tibetanisation of Ladakh', we are in a realm of shadowy populations and languages. The *Chronicles* trace the history of the Ladakhi kings to the westward migration of descendants of the Tibetan monarchy and aristocracy in the 10th century. The Tibetanisation of Ladakh's culture is assumed to date from then. Recent work by Philip Denwood and Neil Howard on the very inscriptions that Francke examined, indicate a much earlier Tibetan influence, possibly as far back as the 7th century. Thus whilst the fact of Tibetanisation is uncontroversial, its dating and a precise understanding of the process that actually occurred, have yet to be firmly established. Another contribution relating to Ladakh's early history was the paper by Rohit Vohra (Luxembourg) on the Arabic inscriptions of the late first millennium engraved on boulders at Tangtse in east Ladakh.

A number of presentations about contemporary Ladakh illustrated its regional and ethnic diversity and some of the changes it is currently undergoing. Visitors will be aware of the deepening Buddhist-Muslim polarisation of recent years, but like some of the writers of the 19th century, their perceptions of this rift - and of the communities it separates - may be overly simple and objectifying. Pascale Dollfus (Paris) gave an account of the ethnohistory of Ladakhi Muslims, which provided a valuable corrective to some existing stereotypes, and highlighted the diversity of the Muslim communities of Ladakh, and their histories.

Kim Gutschow (Harvard) presented an



analysis of idioms and practices of residence and descent in Zanskar. James Crowden (UK) portrayed two very different aspects of contemporary Zanskar. He showed examples of its rich artistic heritage; ranging from early rock carvings to traditional Buddhist wall paintings. He also discussed some of the changes that have occurred in the region since the building of the road, a project which began in the 1960s. Its completion has made possible the supply of government food rations and reduced the likelihood of food shortages. At the same time it has increased surpluses in local produce that can be traded and generated other sources of income, especially tourism.

However tourism and development can also take their toll. Over the last ten years the art and architecture of the temple complex at Alchi have begun to show signs of serious decay. With the help of the Archaeological Survey of India, 'Projekt Save Alchi' led by Professor Roger Goepfer and Professor Jaroslav Poncar aims to preserve the murals of Alchi by weather-proofing the building and fixing the flaking paint surface. Professor Goepfer (Köln) talked about the Great Stupa at Alchi, an important but neglected monument with a remarkable interior which evokes the image of a stupa suspended above the ground.

In his paper on variants of Ladakhi song, Mark Trewin (London) discussed the elements of continuity and change which form part of the ongoing process of cultural life. Focusing on a song about the last independent pre-Dogra king of Ladakh, he was able to show that whilst the texts of certain categories of song display an extraordinary continuity thereby preserving central cultural values, there is a greater tendency to variation in the music through which such songs are interpreted, indicating changes in the emotional meanings attached to those values.

To return, finally, to the theme of Csoma's life. Whilst his work and its value, remain undisputed, how that is expressed and what meanings are attached to it, is a

more complex matter. In his fascinating paper Peter Marczell (Geneva) discussed the issue of Csoma's bodhisattva status. In February 1933, the Hungarian Oriental Society presented Tokyo's Taisho University with a small statue of Alexander Csoma de Koros. The statue, made by the Hungarian Géza Csorba, represented the scholar sitting like an Amitabha Buddha and it was inscribed with the words, 'Körösi Csoma Sandor, Bodhisattva of the Western world'. It was on this occasion that the Japanese, according to the representative of the Hungarian Oriental Society, embarked on a rite of sanctification of the statue itself. Peter Marczell addressed the intriguing question of how this might have been understood at the time by the various parties concerned, and in doing so shed new light on Csoma's 'canonisation'.

#### *Maria Phylactou*

#### **Structure and Transition: Society, Poverty and Politics in Nepal 4 - 6 September 1992, Kathmandu**

After a break of several years this was the first time after the democratic changes that the Sociological/Antropological Society of Nepal (founded in 1985) met "to show their potential in contributing to nation-building" (as pointed out by the president Kailash Nath Pyakurel) and discuss their role in society. It became clear that most of the researchers conceived their role as that of "social engineers" whose studies supply information for the planning of social and economic development, but there were also other more sceptical voices.

In his key note address on the first day Gopal Singh Nepali stressed that poverty, inequality, discrimination etc. have to be studied as social processes within their specific cultural contexts. The process of modernization dominated the first panel on "Gender, Age and Identity", where a whole range of problems arising from the down-break and transformation of traditional sys-

tems was discussed: Meena Acharya's paper, for example, outlined the various consequences which the increasing participation in a free labour market has for women. The issue of old age security in a changing context was raised by Rishikeshab Regmi. On the other hand the question of identity was brought up: Gérard Toffin in his paper on Newar concepts of social space stressed that Nepal is not a secular society and that religious ideas should not be ignored by development researchers. Another paper on Thangka painting (Sharon Hepburn) also emphasized the need to include the "native's point of view", but warned that ethnic politics may lead to an overemphasis of ethnic difference.

That issues such as "Poverty and Inequality" can be dealt with from very different perspectives became apparent during the afternoon session. Martin Gaenzle in his presentation on social and economic inequality between two Rai groups in the Sankhuwa Valley drew the attention to the ways in which their interrelationship is depicted in the mythic self-image of the people concerned. Kailash Nath Pyakurel concentrated on the general issue of poverty in Nepal in relation to the destruction of forests. In conclusion to his pessimistic prognosis he stressed that the Nepalese poor will not change their environmental attitudes unless structural changes within the society take place which will allow members of poor households to participate in all societal decisions. The session was concluded by Bihari Krishna Shrestha's vivid account on poor, mainly low-caste, households in a Jumla village. Also in his paper the outlook was pessimistic: with growing pressures on the population, the economic polarization increases, leaving the poor with few options and "even worse prospects in store for them".

On the second day Gunnar Haaland "set the key note" by pointing out the complex problem of sustainability in development and suggested that social scientists in Nepal

should play a more critical role in a "counter-expertise." In the following panel on "The Social Organisation of Labour and Services", which turned out to be on labour and foreign aid, some such critical - and self-critical - voices were heard. In his paper on domestic child workers Saubhagya Shah gave a sharp description of the daily life of a *kam garne* (servant) child, and at the end urged researchers "not only to objectively observe social reality but also to act as vehicles for positive social change." Two other papers discussed labour migration between Nepal and India: that by Chaitanya Mishra and his team focussed on seasonal farm workers who come from the Indian side of the Terai, whereas Joanna Pfaff-Czamecka's study dealt with people from Bajhang (Far West Nepal) who go to Bangalore to work as watchmen. The heavy reliance on foreign advice was the target of Ivan Somlais criticism. He pointed to communication gaps between experts with different cultural backgrounds and proposed to draw more on indigenous capacities and structures.

The afternoon session on "Politics and State" was somewhat disparate. Véronique Bouillier presented an interesting case study from the 18th and 19th century on the relationship between the Kanphata Yogi monastery of Dang-Caughera and the Nepalese State. Stephen Mikesell warned that voices of minorities are prevented from coming up by stressing that the social anthropology of Nepal has been coined by high class, high caste, high status men. M. Calavan spoke about the local bases for democratic transition in the Nepalese society.

Dor Bahadur Bista, when giving his key note speech on the third day, for his part defined the role of anthropologists in present day Nepal in terms of "action anthropology." Talking about his own research among a low-caste community in Jumla, he pointed to the necessity that the anthropologist involves himself and supports the people he studies in strengthening

their identity, and he thus criticized those who thought that they could "remain dry above the water." The following panel on indigenous management of resources was largely descriptive, presenting local systems of forest, water, and land distribution from different parts of Nepal. It was stressed that such systems were grafted on the social structure (e.g. Olivia Aubriot), and were dependent on historical and political circumstances (e.g. L.P. Upreti).

With "Development and Change" in focus, some papers of the last session were addressing pertinent issues of the contemporary process in Nepalese society (social change in the Terai; urban development in the Kathmandu Valley; forms of adaptation among Tibetan refugees in Pokhara), as well as the role of social anthropology in observing societal changes. In his well-argued note on "State, Development and Transformation" Chaitanya Mishra pointed to the overwhelming "dominance of global affairs over state affairs, and of state affairs over societal affairs". As a counter-current, he advocated the emergence of various voices "effected collaboratively by scattered, small-scale, non-state end non-capitalist and, therefore, relatively powerless individuals and groups." Two contributions directly focussed on the role of social anthropology in view of the crucial changes and problems within contemporary Nepalese society: Padam Lal Devkota presented an interesting and witty paper in which he critically dealt with the current state of social anthropology involved in development issues in Nepal at the "grass-root"-level. His verdict on the "state of the art" was harsh: instead of being used to facilitate the process of development, anthropology in Nepal is stagnating, as Nepalese anthropologists have no time to do field-work because there is too much work for them as well-paid consultants. Devkota addressed his critical remarks basically to his own colleagues; Dilli Ram Dahal, on the other hand, made Western

anthropologists the target of his critical remarks, accusing them of concentrating on remote, "exotic tribes" and their culture, instead of paying sufficient attention to pertinent problems.

On the whole, SASON's conference was a successful presentation of the scope of issues to be dealt with by the social sciences in Nepal. It is one of the important achievements of the conference that the relationship between the social sciences and the development process was repeatedly brought into discussion, showing deficiencies in the present orientation and discourse. By and large, the conference was well-organized. One may ask, however, whether the chosen form of plenary sessions, without a division into more specialised panels, was best suited to initiate thorough debate. Still, it is hoped that SASON's effort will be repeated and such gatherings will become a more regular institution.

*Joanna Pfaff-Czarnecka,  
Martin Gaenszle*

**The Anthropology of Nepal: People,  
Problems and Processes  
7-14 September 1992, Kathmandu.**

The conference was the sequel to the seminar on the anthropology of Tibet and the Himalaya held in Zürich in 1990. The meeting was sponsored jointly by the Centre for Nepal and Asian Studies, Kirtipur, and by the Department of Anthropology, University of Sydney. Financial support was provided by CNAS and by the Wenner-Gren Foundation, and the task of organisation was admirably handled by Michael Allen and Nirmal Tuladhar.

Sessions were held concurrently in two theatres, but a number of late cancellations made it possible to reorganise presentations into plenary gatherings. As it was, the generous length of time allotted to speakers and the organisers' idea of arranging tea-breaks between papers permitted ample time

for questions and discussion.

Of the 68 papers scheduled, 51 were presented, under the following six rubrics: urbanism in Nepal (10 papers), general anthropology (10), women and development (4), medical anthropology (6), the state and the people (5) and the anthropology of resource management (16). The last category contained the largest number of papers scheduled, cancelled and actually presented. However, the imaginative treatment of the subject by several speakers, as well as the wide range of other categories, provided welcome assurance that the anthropology of Nepal is not synonymous with resource management research.

A major difference between this conference and its Swiss antecedent was the near-absence of presentations concerning Tibet (and even Tibetan-speaking groups) and Himalayan regions outside Nepal. If (as the popular vote inclined) the sequel to this colloquium is also held in Nepal, the geographical scope might be widened again to include these other regions. However, just as Nepal is not identical with the Himalaya, the Himalaya does not cover Nepal in its entirety. A designation along the lines of "Nepal, Tibet and the Himalaya" might allow sufficient geographical latitude without becoming too unwieldy.

The political changes that have taken place in Nepal within the last two years permitted both papers and discussions of a freedom that probably has few precedents in scholarly gatherings in the kingdom. As an anthropological conference, the meeting provided a natural forum for exchanges concerning the oppression and aspirations of Nepal's ethnic groups. A discussion of Nepalese nationality in which all contributors stand on an equal footing is certainly overdue, but some may regret the tendency for the debate to be stretched between two opposed poles: on the one hand, the condemnation of Nepal's high-caste rulers for their long oppression

of the nation's ethnic groups and, on the other, accusations that the vindication of ethnic identity is a divisive trend in modern Nepal. Thus a reference in the welcome address by Prof. D.P. Bhandari, executive director of CNAS, to "nascent ethnic egotism", elicited a sharply-worded circular from the (unfortunately anonymous) Nepal Editors Forum.

Foreigners tend easily to side with oppressed groups in search of a voice, and one sometimes feels - especially, perhaps, since the publication of D.B. Bista's *Fatalism and Development* - that an open season has been declared on Brahmins. It is certainly encouraging to see the anthropology of Nepal occupying a corner of the international "market-place of ideas"; it should not be too much to hope that this particular market will gradually cease to be characterised by the barter of invective between individuals, and mature into a commerce where exchanges are regulated by the forces of the national - if not the international - economy.

*Charles Ramble*

**The Himalayan Forum at the London  
School of Oriental & African Studies,  
Autumn Term, 1992**

In the autumn seminar series the following papers were presented and discussed.

October 19 - Jane Carter (ODA): "Indigenous environmental knowledge: a case-study from Dolakha district, Nepal."

November 2 - Lobsang Delek (China Centre for Tibetan Studies, Beijing): "The social organisation of nomads in eastern Tibet."

November 9 - Joanna Pfaff-Czarnecka (Zürich): "Lotteries as social order: Nepalese peasants as night watchmen in Bangalore, South India."

November 23 - Michael Hutt (SOAS):



"Mohan Koirala and the Nepali literature of transition, 1950-1965."

November 30 - Axel Michaels (Bern):

"The ban on cow-slaughter in Nepal: its legal and political significance."

December 7 - Ben Campbell (University of East Anglia): "Change and continuity in a vertical economy: perspectives from a Tamang village in north central Nepal."

*Michael Hutt*

**Politics, Identity and Cultural Change in the Himalayan Region**  
Michaelmas term, 1992, Oxford

A weekly seminar at the Institute of Social and Cultural Anthropology (ISCA), University of Oxford was convened during Michaelmas term 1992 by David Gellner, Joanna Pfaff-Czarnicka and Graham Clarke on the theme of Politics, Identity, and Cultural Change in the Himalayan Region. There were eight meetings, the first on 15th October and the last on 3rd December, and the speakers included Alan Macfarlane, Joanna Pfaff-Czarnicka, Lobsang Gelek, Peter Parkes, Ben Campbell, Michael Hutt, Axel Michaels and Graham Clarke.

A one-day conference on the same theme, but with special reference to Nepal, was also held on November 7th. Speakers included Anne de Sales, David Gellner, Tamara Kohn, Charles Ramble, Andrew Russell, and Denis Vidal.-274688.

*David Gellner*

## Obituary

It is with great sadness that we record the deaths of Martin Hoftun and his collaborator Bill Raeper in the 'Thai Airways' Airbus crash in Langtang, Nepal, on Friday 31st July 1992. Martin was completing his doctorate on Nepalese politics in the 1950s and 60s at the University of Oxford under Terence Ranger. The book he and Bill had written together on recent events in Nepal, entitled *Spring Awakening: the Nepali Revolution of 1990*, is currently in press with Penguin in Delhi. They planned further books on events in Bhutan and on the Shangri-la syndrome. Martin, a quadriplegic, never allowed his disability to impede his travel or his research. A Martin Hoftun Fund has been set up by his friends, which his family hope will be used to help disabled students at his college and in Nepal. Anyone wishing to contribute should send cheques, made payable to Wadham College, to The Bursar, Wadham College, Oxford OX1 3PN, UK.

*David Gellner*

## ANNOUNCEMENTS

### SYMPOSIA

#### Bhutan:

#### A traditional order and the forces of change

A Conference at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, 22 - 23 March 1993

Bhutan is still one of the world's most secretive and least accessible countries. Although the Bhutanese government has taken various steps to modernize and develop the kingdom's economy and liberalize its administrative system, Bhutan remains cautious and somewhat aloof from the rest of the world. The only foreigners permitted into the country are a small number of aid personnel and a small quota of high-paying tourists. As a consequence, Bhutan's history, culture, demography and politics are still poorly documented. Even the size of the total population has not been established satisfactorily: up until 1988 the official government figure was over 1 million. The national census of 1988 came up with a figure of 600,000. There can be few countries where such uncertainty surrounds such basic matters.

As a remote Himalayan kingdom, Bhutan has inevitably been characterized in most westerners' accounts as 'the last Shangri-la'. But its reputation has been tarnished during the past three years by reports of human rights abuses committed among the substantial community of Nepali origin which resides in the southern foothills. According to official statistics, Bhutanese citizens of Nepali origin constitute about one third of the total population. The Bhutanese government therefore appears to believe that its unique cultural heritage is under threat. During the late 1980s, it revised its attitude to the Nepali

minority and introduced a series of controversial integrative measures, while expelling large numbers of Nepalis whom it had identified as illegal immigrants. The Nepalis launched a movement which rapidly became politicized, calling not only for recognition of their communal rights, but also for radical changes in Bhutan's political system.

Views on this issue have become highly polarized and facts are hard to come by. There is a serious need for dispassionate analysis and constructive discussion, not just of the southern issue, but of every aspect of the traditional order of Bhutan which is currently under pressure from various forces of change. This conference is intended to provide a forum for such discussions. Each contributor to the conference will address him or herself to a description and analysis of some aspects of Bhutanese culture and society and to an assessment of the ways in which this is changing or might change in the future. The topics covered will include: Buddhist values and institutions; the status and role of the monarchy; nationalism and national values; relations with the outside world; the effects of tourism; views on conservation; language and literature; inter-ethnic-relations; traditional political processes; the role of national and international media; art and architecture, etc.

Probable and confirmed contributors, as of 1st October 1992, include:

Leo Rose (University of California): international aspects of the pressure on cultural policy OR the status and role of monarchy

Nick Nugent (BBC World Service): on the difficulties of reporting Bhutan (provisional)

Françoise Pommaret (CNRS, Paris): the impact of Western ideas of tourism and conservation

Michael Hutt (SOAS, London): an attempt at an objective assessment of the 'Southern problem'

Michael Aris (Harvard University): traditional Bhutanese historiography OR the rise and development of the monarchy

George van Driem (University of Leiden): languages and language policy  
Thierry Mathou (CNRS, Paris): the growth of diplomacy in Bhutan 1961-91.

Other contributors, whose topics will be announced later, are: Kinley Dorji (Editor, Kuensel), Kanak Mani Dixit (Editor, Himal), Brian C. Shaw (Hong Kong), Corneille Jest (CNRS, Paris), Yoshiro Imaeda (CNRS, Paris), Fredrik Barth (University of Oslo) and Judith Justice (University of California).  
Offers of papers are invited.

Contributors are asked to send papers to the convener about a month before the conference. These will then be printed and circulated to all those attending. The conference will be spread over two days, and it will be assumed that everyone has read all the papers prior to the event. Contributors will be asked to speak for 15-20 minutes, summarizing their papers, and presentations will be followed by discussion and debate. I hope that the conference will yield a published volume on contemporary Bhutan, which will follow a volume on contemporary Nepal which is currently being prepared for publication.

This will be the first conference on Bhutan ever organized at SOAS or, indeed, anywhere in Europe so far as I am aware, and is sure to attract considerable interest.

Michael Hutt

## PUBLICATIONS

### Himalayan Research as Part of a Global Effort for the Mountains - A Note on "Mountain Agenda"

Whether or not the UN conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) of 1992 was a (partial) success may be subject to debate. What is sure, however, is the fact that worldwide concerns and international research about Mountains have received greater attention at UNCED than in any international conference held hitherto.

This new development is mainly due to the efforts of the so-called "Mountain Agenda", a small, informal group of individuals originating from three institutions: the United Nations University (UNU), the International Mountain Society (IMS) and the International Center for Integrated Mountain Development (ICIMOD) in Kathmandu. The efforts of the group were generously financed by the Government of Switzerland.

In the context of UNCED 1992, "Mountain Agenda" succeeded to achieve the following:

1. To draw the attention of the Third and the Fourth Preparatory Conferences for UNCED (held in Geneva and New York respectively) to the world-wide problems of mountain environment and development. This attention was substantiated finally in a specific chapter on the mountains within UNCED's AGENDA 21.

2. To publish two important documents concerning the mountain problematique:

- *An Appeal for the Mountains*. This 50 page brochure with ample illustrations is intended to appeal to a broad public as well as busy executives and to inform them about the major issues of present mountain ecology and development. It can be ordered at the Institute of Geography, University of Berne (Switzerland).

- *The State of the World's Mountains: A Global Report*. This is a 400 page overview covering the major mountain systems on all

continents of the globe, but dealing also with general issues like global warming and its effects on the mountains. The Report was edited by Peter B. Stone and comprises the contributions of several dozen authors. The coordination of the team was assured by Bruno Messerli and Rudolf Högger. The book was published by Zed Books Ltd in London. It can also be ordered at the Geographical Institute of the University of Berne.

Especially this second document will be of great interest to the readers of the European Bulletin of Himalayan Research. It contains a substantial chapter (written by Jayanta Bandhyopadhyaya) on the Himalaya, focussing on

- Mountain building, climate influences and natural resources
- Environmental constraints on natural resource use
- The people - environment - development - relationship.

To grasp the main spirit, in which "The State of the World's Mountains" is written, the following passage from the Preface might serve as an illustration:

"Can we now attempt to answer the questions posed at the beginning of this Preface? Is complacency, because of the supposed indestructibility of the mountains of the world, warranted, or do we give up in despair because mountain topsoil will all be washed into the oceans shortly after the turn of the century and mountain desertification will prevail? Obviously, there is no one problem and therefore no one answer. Neither complacency nor despair is in order. The answer lies somewhere between the two extremes of childhood folklore and conservationist alarm. Our overarching concern must lie with the uncertainty. While we can make many informed guesses, we simply cannot make stringent predictions. Even the informed guesses, based upon a great deal of accumulated mountain research and acquired experience and wisdom, do not reach the decision makers with sufficient force or regularity. Dams continue to be built

in ridiculously unsafe places and reservoirs are rapidly silted, generators destroyed, or the entire infrastructure swept away; mountain roads are engineered without adequate knowledge

of slope stability, let alone consideration of indirect effects; and the numerous indirect costs, especially cultural and environmental ones, are ignored. Yet bilateral and international millions continue to be put into major projects that do not have the benefit of critical and holistic evaluation. One aspect of sustainable development should be to ensure compromises such that large-scale infrastructures on mountains are placed in the safest possible localities, least impair the local environment and achieve maximum benefits for the investors and the mountain people alike.

Despair is not called for; mountain environments and mountain peoples are far more resilient than is often credited. The word *fragile* can be overused and counter-productive. Mountain forests do grow back on their own and mountain farmers, without government or international aid, do plant trees and tend them. Perhaps one of the most important needs is to recognize that mountain people have much they can do for themselves and much to offer world society at large. After all, the mountain peoples of the world have already provided us with the potato, coffee, maize, teff and many domesticated animals; and there are numerous indigenous food crops that are untapped - quinoa, amaranth, literally hundreds of species and varieties of tubers and chenopods, to mention only a few. And there is the great range of developed and undeveloped medicinal plants, including opium and coca, whether used for good or ill.

Mountain people are also of two genders, and if the role of the subsistence woman farmer, or pastoralist, or person in general, is not recognized and understood, any development effort will likely be confounded. This involves recognizing the humanity of the mountain farmer and the need to support and strengthen existing local



institutions. It is reasonable to conclude that the future for some mountain areas is bleak, for others it is rather more secure. We need greatly to improve our ability to predict, distinguish and differentiate.

Rudolf Högger

### Annapurna Sattrek Map, Nepal Satellite Image Trekking Map

Scale 1:250 000 meters  
eight-colour print, format 60 x 36,5 cm, 2  
sidemaps

Published by CARTOCONSULT Austria, Univ.-Doz. Dr. Robert Kostka, Felix-Dahn-Platz 4, A-8010 Graz, Austria  
Compilation, design and supervision by: R. Kostka, Institute for Applied Geodesy and Photogrammetry, University of Technology, Graz, Austria; E. Jiresch, H. Krotendorfer, Vienna, Austria; P. Pohle, Department of Geography, University of Giessen, Germany.

Based on uncontrolled LANDSAT-MSS scenes No. E-2 789-03545-7, MARCH 21, 1977 and No. E-2 790-04003-7, MARCH 22, 1977. Collateral map data derived from different available map sources. According to the production process of the LANDSAT image mosaic the accuracies obtained are confined.

Since the first ascent of Annapurna I by the Frenchman Herzog and Lachenal in June 1950, the mountain range of the Annapurna Himal has attracted more and more tourists from all over the world. The trip around Annapurna is considered to be one of the most scenic trekking tours of the Himalaya. It leads from the rice-growing areas in the monsoon-tropical region through steep gorges and over more than 5000 m high mountain passes into dry, almost Tibetan-like high mountain valleys. On this satellite map the contrast in landforms is clearly shown even for less proficient map users. Nowadays, with the help of remote sensing it is also possible to gain a pictorial view of

extremely high mountain areas. With the help of the satellite image the difference between valleys and mountain ridges is expressed three-dimensionally using a colour-coded relief representation.

For the map user spaceborne image information alone is not sufficient. Additional information about settlements, place names and trails round Annapurna are the result of extensive field surveys. Village and other names on the map are presented using accepted rules of transliteration. As a result a satellite image trekking map has been published, combining vividness and legibility with rich content.

The Annapurna map is the first sheet of a planned series of satellite image maps from the Himalaya. In Austria it is distributed by Freytag and Berndt Company, Vienna (AS 125,--) and internationally through ILH, the International Map House in Stuttgart (DM 17,0).

### Corrigenda

Corrections to Six Proposals for an "Ethnography of the Performed Word" by András Höfer, European Bulletin of Himalayan Research No. 3, 1992:

- p. 17, left col., line 40:  
read "quotes" from a naive past
- p. 17, left col., line 41:  
read murmuring of the "es spricht"
- p. 18, left col., line 46:  
read a close scrutiny
- p. 19, left col., line 10:  
read unusual reduplication
- p. 19, right col., line 26:  
read that the laymen
- p. 21, left col., line 44:  
read Maskarinc's (1990: 160)

In the same number of the Bulletin, the names of the authors Prayag Raj Sharma and Ludmilla Tüting have been misspelt. The editors apologize.

### Contributors to this issue

Lucette Boulnois retires this year as Librarian at the Centre d'Etudes himalayennes at Meudon. She compiled the *Bibliographie du Nepal* (1969-1975) and published, in 1983, a book on 18th century coinage in Tibet. The Accessions List she released annually has been a useful bibliographical source for all scientists specializing in the Himalayas.

Martin Gaenszle is "wissenschaftlicher Angestellter" at the South Asia Institut, University of Heidelberg and Director of the Institut's branch office in Kathmandu. He is currently researching ritual texts and oral tradition among the Mewahang Rai.

Rudolf Högger, former head of the Swiss Association for Technical Assistance (SATA) in Nepal and, until 1988, Vice Director of the Swiss Development Corporation, is now lecturer at the Federal Institute of Technology in Zürich.

Antje Linkenbach completed her doctorate in sociology at the University of Frankfurt with a thesis on *Vom Mythos zur Moderne: Zur Kritik der Theorie sozialer Evolution von Jürgen Habermas*. From January 1993 she is engaged in a research project, funded by the German Research Council, on public and private solutions to environmental degradation in Uttarkhand.

Dipak Raj Pant was until 1991 Lecturer in Social Anthropology at Tribhuvan University. He is the author of *Il mondo della maschera: saggio antropologico sul simbolismo magico-religioso della maschera* and *Heidegger e il pensiero orientale* and the editor of *Aspects of Rural Communication in Nepal* and *Rastriya Jan-andolan: Vivan ra Vislesan*. He currently lives in Ghemme, Italy.

R.K. Sprigg was formerly Reader in Phonetics in the University of London (1968-80) and a member of the staff of the School of Oriental and African Studies (1948-80); he now lives in retirement in Kalimpong, in the Darjeeling District of India, where it is possible for him to continue his research interests in Tibetan, Limbu, and Lepcha. His publications include phonological analysis of these languages, and the Newari, Tamang, Sherpa, and Bantawa Rai languages of Nepal, published mainly in 'BSOAS' and 'Linguistics of the Tibeto-Burman area'. He is on the point of completing a dictionary of the Balti dialect of Tibetan into English, cross-referenced to Bielmeier's "Untersuchung der historischen Entwicklung der schrifttibetischen Konsonantencluster in den westtibetischen Dialekten" and "Das Märchen vom Prinzen Cobzan", with a short English-Balti appendix.

Ludmilla Tüting is journalist and edited with K. Dixit Bikas-Binash 'Development-Destruction'. She is currently in Kathmandu, where she works for the human rights organization, Nepal Watch.

The Editors wish to thank Brigitte Merz and Anna Margarete Cole for their assistance in publishing the Bulletin.

### Notes to Contributors

The European Bulletin of Himalayan Research welcomes for consideration manuscripts and short notices dealing with any of the following topics.

1. Topical reports on ongoing, or recently completed, research projects.
2. Information about archives with literary, historical, archaeological, ethnographic, botanical, etc. materials collected in the Himalayan region.
3. Reviews of books on the Himalayas, including books published in Nepal, India, Pakistan and China which because of poor distribution may be inadequately known in Europe.
4. Current political developments in Nepal, India, Pakistan and China and the implications of these developments for research carried out by European scholars.
5. News about recent or forthcoming conferences, and on funding opportunities for European scholars working in the Himalayas as well as for scholars from the Himalayan region itself to visit Europe.

Manuscripts should not exceed 5,000 words (ca. 20 pages) in length. All contributions will be published in English. Copy can be submitted in German or French with the understanding that the editors in Heidelberg will arrange for its translation. Anything submitted in English by a non-native speaker will be copy-edited in Heidelberg by a native speaker.

The deadline for submissions for our fifth issue is 1. April 1993. Anything received after that date will go into the sixth issue, expected in autumn, 1993.

The views expressed by individual contributors are their own and do not represent those of the Editorial Board. All correspondence to The Editors, European Bulletin of Himalayan Research, Südasiens-Institut der Universität Heidelberg, Im Neuenheimer Feld 330, 6900 Heidelberg, Federal Republic of Germany.